

✓ A00-376

~~SECRET~~

Report of the Commission on the Civil Services of the
East African Territories and the East Africa High Commission,

1953 - 54

VOLUME 1

30th April, 1954.

To:-

His Excellency the Chairman,
East Africa High Commission.

His Excellency the Governor,
Colony and Protectorate of Kenya.

His Excellency the Governor,
Trust Territory of Tanganyika.

His Excellency the Governor,
Uganda Protectorate.

His Excellency the British Resident,
Zanzibar Protectorate.

Your Excellencies,

We were appointed in February, 1953, by Your Excellencies
to be a Commission with the following terms of reference:-

"To review the whole range of salaries and conditions of the Civil Services, excluding casual and daily paid staff, of the East African Territories and of the East Africa High Commission and to make recommendations paying particular regard to:-

- (i) the rise in the cost of living;
- (ii) anomalies which have become apparent since the Holmes' revision in 1948;
- (iii) individual and piecemeal revisions which have been made since the Holmes' revision;
- (iv) the telescoping effect of the temporary allowance 'ceiling' on salaries of £1,000 and over;
- (v) changes in responsibility during the post-war development period;
- (vi) the method of providing for further changes in the cost of living;
- (vii) superannuation arrangements;
- (viii) the method of conversion to any new salary scales recommended;
- (ix) the date from which any new salary scales or other conditions of service should take effect."

We now have the honour to submit our Report.

We have the honour to be,
Your Excellencies' obedient servants,

D.J.LIDBURY	Chairman
W.D.GODSALL	Member
L.H.GORSUCH	Member

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXPLANATORY NOTES

Paragraph
numbers

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTORY

Terms of reference		1-4
Procedure		5-11
Acknowledgments		12-16

CHAPTER II

COURSE OF EVENTS SINCE THE 1947-48 COMMISSION	17-23
---	-------

CHAPTER III

STRUCTURE AND SOURCES OF RECRUITMENT OF THE EAST AFRICAN CIVIL SERVICES

Structure of the Services		24-27
Sources of recruitment to the East African Services		28-34
Size and average intake of the Services		35-36
Present output of the East African educational system		37-38
Present position of higher education		39-41
Conclusions on the staffing problem		42

CHAPTER IV

GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF THE RECOMMENDED SALARY STRUCTURE

General		43
Need for uniformity		44-45
Balance of the recommendations		46
Ultimate objective and method of approach		47-49

CHAPTER V

THE THREE-PINNES RULE

History of the Rule		50-51
Basis of an alternative		52-53
Local and external market values		54-55
Principle of inducement		56-58

CHAPTER VI

THE APPLICATION OF THE INDUCEMENT PRINCIPLE

General		59
Policy of Her Majesty's Government on recruitment		60
Devolution of the Secretary of State's control		61
Rules for the operation of the inducement principle		62-65
Recruitment to the B & C Grades and the creation of Training Grade		66-72
Pensionability of inducement addition and cost of living allowance on inducement addition		73-74

CHAPTER VII

OTHER STRUCTURAL PRINCIPLES OF THE NEW SCALES

General	75
Question of long versus broken scales ..	76-79
Incremental jumps in scales	80-82
Standstill during probationary period ..	83
Promotion and Efficiency Bars	84-89
Accelerated promotion within a long scale	90-92
Pay of women	93-96
Application of the inducement principle	
to women's scales	97
His Highness's Zanzibar Service	98-99

CHAPTER VIII

THE COST OF LIVING FACTOR IN SALARIES

Rise in cost of living since the Report of the 1947-48 Commission	100-101
Cost of living indices maintained for High Commission territories	102-104
Cost of living in Zanzibar Protectorate	105
Special considerations relating to cost of living in Pemba Island, Zanzibar Protectorate . . .	106-107
History of cost of living allowances paid by the East African territories since the 1947-48 Commission	108-110
General assumptions in the matter of level of emoluments	111-112
Question of consolidation of existing cost of living allowances	113-114
Ceiling on cost of living allowances ..	115
Method of providing for future changes in the cost of living	116-119

CHAPTER IX

THE SUBORDINATE SERVICES

Present position	120-126
General policy	127
Housing of subordinate employees . . .	128-130
Minimum salary of the Subordinate Service ..	131-132
Minimum in very remote areas	133
Maximum salary for the Subordinate Service l	134
Proposed basic salary ranges for the Subordinate Service. ..	135
Treatment of ranges for purpose of superannuation	136
Treatment of ranges for purposes of rent or housing allowance ..	137
Segmenting of proposed ranges	138
Treatment of urban and other special areas, if any	139-141
The Carpenter Committee in Kenya . . .	142
Minimum of the scale of proposed local allowance	143-145
Maximum of the scale of proposed local allowance and proposals for tapering etc..	146
Proposals for the remuneration of the Subordinate Service in tabular form . . .	147
Proposed local allowance - general 11 1	148-149
Application of proposals to the Zanzibar Protectorate	150
Abolition of existing allowances	151
Local Allowance not to apply to uniformed staff of Police, Prisons and Customs ..	152
Conversion of existing employees to proposed ranges	153

CHAPTER X

THE CLERICAL AND ANALOGOUS SERVICES

Present salary scales	154
Comments on the present scales	155
Basis of the new scales.	156
Range covered by the new scales	157-158
Duties of the new grades	159
Entry points according to educational standards	160-162
Regulation of establishments in the grades	163-164
Prospects in the new structure	165-167
Application of the E scales to the analogous grades	168-174
Use of examinations at bars in the scales .	175

CHAPTER XI

THE EXECUTIVE AND TECHNICAL SERVICES

Comments on the present scales	176-179
New pattern of C Scales	180
Comments on the new pattern	181-185
Application of the new pattern	
Superior posts in the present clerical structure	188-193
Superior posts in the present analogous structure	194
Uniformity in regrading and in titles of posts	195
Stenographers and secretaries	196-203
Salary Scale of the Training Grade	204
Points of entry into C Scales	205-213
Assistant District Officer Class	214
Entrants on salary fixed by market value	215
General effect of recommendations on present structure	216-220

CHAPTER XII

THE ADMINISTRATIVE AND PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

Present scales	221-226
New B Scale	227
Inclusion of other services in the B scale	228-229
Relative position of the Administrative Service	230-232
Women Administrative Assistants	233
Present administrative and professional long scale	234
Proposed new Scale A	235
Abolition of the Administrative jump	236-238
Position of the District Commissioner	239-241
Position of Provincial Heads of professional departments	242-247
Extension of the Medical Scale	248-249
Application of the extension to other posts	250-252
Restricted use of the A Scale	253-254
Posts in the Colonial Research Service	255

CHAPTER XIII

NOTES ON CLASSES COMMON TO SEVERAL DEPARTMENTS

Accountants	256-260
Draughtsmen	261-263
Laboratory Technicians or Technologists	264-266
Librarians	267-269
Storekeepers	270-271
Surveyors	272-276
Computers	277

CHAPTER XIV

THE EDUCATION DEPARTMENTS

Education Officers, and Teaching Staff with United Kingdom Qualifications or the equivalent	278-281
The Basis of uniformity	282-283
Education Officers	284
Teaching staff	285-286
Asian and African Education Officers.	287
Technical teaching staff	288-295
Graduates of Indian or Pakistani Universities and teachers with Makerere College qualifications ..	294-298
Other teachers (African, Arab or Asian)	299-307

CHAPTER XIV

THE MEDICAL DEPARTMENTS

Application of the A Scale	308-314
Private Practice	315-316
Non-European Medical Officers . . .	317-322
Nursing and allied services	323-329
Other medical staff	330-336

CHAPTER XVI

POLICE, PRISONS AND CUSTOMS

General	337
Kenya Police Commission and Kenya Scales	338-344
Application of Kenya Scales to Police Forces of other territories ..	345
Proposals for Tanganyika Police Force	346-347
Proposals for Uganda Police Force .	348-350
Proposals for Zanzibar Police ..	351
Allowances	352
Notes regarding Police Gazetted ranks	353-354
Application of Police salaries and conditions of service to Prisons and Customs Department.	355-357
Proposals for Kenya Prisons Department under present structure	358
Proposals for Tanganyika Prisons Department under present structure.	359
Proposals for Uganda Prisons Depart- ment under present structure . . .	360
Proposals for Zanzibar Prisons Dept.	361
Rent on quarters in Police and Prisons Departments	362
Treatment of Recruits in Police and Prisons Department	363
Application of Police salaries and conditions of service to Customs Dept	364
East African Customs & Excise Dept.	367
Zanzibar Customs Department.. ..	368

CHAPTER XVII

THE PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENTS

The Professional Grades	369
The Technical Grades	370-378

CHAPTER XVIII

COMMENTS ON OTHER DEPARTMENTS.	379-415
--------------------------------------	---------

CHAPTER XIX

SUPERSCALE SALARIES

The existing position	414
Broad-banding	415-416
Incremental superscales versus fixed salaries	417
The inducement principle in the superscale range . ..	418
Superscales for women officers	419
Grading of posts by responsibility ..	420-421
General level of superscale salaries ..	422-424
Detailed proposals for the salaries of superscale posts	425
Notes on individual superscale grading	426

CHAPTER XX

COMMENTS ON SOME GENERAL POINTS AFFECTING SALARIES

Incremental Credit for War Service on Military Service	427-429
Initial entry points in the Professional Scale .	430-434
Increments for experience beyond the minimum standard ..	435-438
Cost of education of children outside East Africa. ..	439-440

CHAPTER XXI

TRAINING

General	441
The Present Position	442-443
Administrative and Professional Divisions	444
Executive and Technical Divisions .	445-446
Clerical and Analogous Divisions ..	447
Operation of the Training Grade ..	448-449
Planning of Training for the future ..	450
Standing Committee on Training ..	451-454
Needs of the Local Government Services .	455
Organisation and Method . ..	456
Future of Establishment Branches ..	457
Training in the United Kingdom Civil Service . ..	458

CHAPTER XXII

SUPERANNUATION ARRANGEMENTS

General	459-462
Computation of pensions in respect of service on present salaries	463
Death Gratuities in respect of pensionable officers	464
Mixed service pensions	465-469
Inclusion of war service and periods of courses of training in computation of pensions	470-472
Provident Funds	473-480
Gratuities	481-486
Emplacement on the pensionable establishment	487-488
Retiring benefits for Police, Prisons and Customs	489-498
Widows' and Orphans' pensions	499-505
Age of retirement	506-512

CHAPTER XXIII

HOUSING

General	513-514
Rent of Government Quarters	515-520
Rent allowance for officers occupying private quarters.	521-522
Rent of furniture	523-531

CHAPTER XXIV

LEAVE AND PASSAGES

General	532-534
Present leave regulations for locally born or domiciled staff	535-543
Future leave regulations for locally born or domiciled staff	544
Sabbatical leave for local officers	545
Retention of existing privileges .	546-548
Present leave regulations for European officers	549-551
Proposed leave regulations for officers from scheduled territories	552-553
Local or casual leave	554-557
Short tours	558-562
Passages	563-570
Other assistance towards travel on leave	571-572

CHAPTER XXV

ALLOWANCES AND OTHER CONDITIONS OF SERVICE

General	574
Entertainment allowance	575-576
Expenses on transfer	577-578
Travelling and subsistence allowances	579-581
Acting allowance	582-590
Medical benefits	591-594

CHAPTER XXVI

POSTS AND TELECOMMUNICATIONS ADMINISTRATION

Superscale posts	595
Present salary position below the superscale level	596
Sources of recruitment	597
Cost of living allowances	598-600
Principles of proposed salary structure	601
A and B Scale posts	602-603
C and E Scale posts	604-605

CHAPTER XXVII

EAST AFRICAN RAILWAYS AND HARBOURS ADMINISTRATION

General	606
Cost of living allowances	607-608
General principles of the recommended salary structure.. ..	609
Present structure of salary scales ..	610
Proposed structure of salary scales ..	611-613
Superscale posts	
Group A (formerly Senior Service) ..	614-615
Group B (formerly Junior Service) ..	616-625
Group C (Subordinate Service)	626
Retiring benefits, leave and other conditions of service.. .. .	627-629
Leave and passages	630
Value of free quarters	631

CHAPTER XXVIII

CONVERSION ARRANGEMENTS

General	632-633
General rules for conversion . . .	634-637
Special rules for conversion	
Contract appointments	638
Conversion of present "expatriate" scales	639-640
Conversion of officers on three-fifths salaries	641-642
Conversion of women's scales	643
Conversion to the B Scale	644
Conversion of the Scale £340-520 or beyond	645
Operation of bars	646
Incremental dates	647
Lay-out of Appendices	648

CHAPTER XXIX

DATE OF IMPLEMENTATION AND FINANCIAL IMPLICATION.	649-659
---	---------

CHAPTER XXX

SUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

APPENDICES

- I Copy of part of circular despatch
number 833/33 of the 31st August, 1953,
from the Secretary of State for the Colonies
- II Section A-Statement of Basic Scales A, B and C.
Section B-Inducement formula.
Section C-Tables of Scales A, B and C showing
inducement additions
Section D-Statement of Scales D, E, N, P & T
Section E-Operation of bars within all scales
- III Entry points into the E Scales for the Clerical
and Analogous Services.

VOLUME II WILL CONTAIN:-

The Commission's itinerary, lists of oral
and written evidence;
Detailed schedules giving present and proposed
salary scales for posts in the estimates;
Conversion tables.

4

A

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

4

EXPLANATORY NOTES

(i) This Report deals with two sets of salaries; those existing at present, which carry the rate of cost of living allowance current in the administrations concerned, and the proposed salaries, on which a cost of living allowance of 10% is recommended. In places where it may be useful to know what the gross emoluments are when a salary figure in either category is mentioned, there has been inserted in brackets after the salary figure the total of salary plus cost of living allowance. For instance, a present salary of £240 is quoted (where the current rate of cost of living allowance is 35%) as £240(324); a proposed salary of £240 is quoted as £240(264).

(ii) The Commission on the Civil Services of Kenya, Tanganyika, Uganda and Zanzibar, 1947 - 48, of which the Chairman was Sir Maurice Holmes, G.B.E., K.C.B. is referred to in this Report as "the 1947-48 Commission."

(iii) The terms "the East African Administrations" or "the administrations" when used in this Report are intended to comprise the Governments of Kenya, Tanganyika, Uganda and Zanzibar and the East Africa High Commission unless the context requires otherwise. The term "territorial Governments" refers to the Governments of Kenya, Tanganyika, Uganda and Zanzibar unless otherwise stated. The terms "mainland Governments" or "mainland administrations" are intended to exclude Zanzibar.

REPORT OF THE COMMISSION ON THE CIVIL SERVICES
OF THE EAST AFRICAN TERRITORIES AND THE
EAST AFRICA HIGH COMMISSION, 1953-54

- - - - -

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTORY

Terms of Reference

1. Under our terms of reference we were asked to report on the Civil Services of the "East African Territories and of the East Africa High Commission." These services comprise the Civil Services of:-

- (a) The Colony and Protectorate of Kenya,
- (b) The Trust Territory of Tanganyika,
- (c) The Protectorate of Uganda,
- (d) The Protectorate of Zanzibar,
- and (e) The East Africa High Commission (including the East African Railways and Harbours Administration, and the East African Posts and Telecommunications Administration).

2. The term "Civil Service" is normally taken to relate to "those servants of the Crown, other than holders of political or judicial offices, who are employed in a civil capacity, and whose remuneration is paid wholly and directly out of moneys voted by Parliament" (a). We have followed this definition to the extent of excluding from our Report recommendations regarding the salaries of:-

- (a) Governors and the Resident of Zanzibar,
- (b) Speakers of the Legislatures as such, and
- (c) Unofficial Members of the Executive Councils and Legislatures.

We were specifically asked by the territorial Governments to make recommendations regarding the Judiciary, and we have accordingly done so; we have, however, submitted a separate report on the Court of Appeal for Eastern Africa in view of the fact that its jurisdiction extends to other territories not included in our terms of reference.

3. Subject to the above, our Report follows the pattern of that of the 1947-8 Commission. We have interpreted our terms of reference as applying to the permanent members of the East African Civil Services apart from casual and daily-paid staff, which is specifically excluded from our terms of reference; we have also not dealt with:-

- (a) Officers whose employment is temporary whether or not it is governed by formal contract;
- (b) Members of the Colonial Research Service. +

We have, however, covered in our recommendations the non-established subordinate grades known as Minor Employees in Kenya, the Subordinate Service in Tanganyika, the Employees Division in Uganda, and Ranges I to VI in Zanzibar.

/4. We are not

- (a) Report of the Royal Commission on the Civil Service, 1929-31 (Cmd. 3909).

+ See paragraph 255

4. We are not specifically required under our terms of reference to make recommendations regarding the structure of the public services, but for the reasons given in Chapter II of this Report we have, at the request of the administrations concerned, made certain recommendations with a view to the removal of racial differentiations in salary structure.

Procedure

5. The Chairman, Sir David Lidbury, and Mr. Godsall left the United Kingdom in the m.v. Durban Castle on the 11th March, 1953, and arrived at Mombasa on the 3rd April, and in Nairobi on the 5th April. Mr. Gorsuch arrived in Nairobi by air on the 2nd April. We began work in offices provided for us by the Kenya Government on the 7th April.

6. The East African Administrations were good enough to appoint liaison officers from each administration to assist us with information and advice. A preliminary meeting was held with them in Nairobi on the 9th April, 1953, at which our programme of work and the itineraries of our tours in each territory were arranged as far as could then be foreseen. Subsequently these liaison officers travelled with us where necessary during our tours of their respective territories; they attended on us at our interviews with witnesses from their respective administrations; they met us in a body for discussion at the stage of formulation of our recommendations in Nairobi from the 21st to 26th September, 1953, before we left East Africa; and finally they worked with us in London from 4th January to 5th February, 1954. Our work was greatly facilitated by these arrangements, and we are much indebted to the administrations for lending us the services of these experienced officers.

7. The appointment of the Commission and their terms of reference had been announced by public notices and circulars issued by the East African Administrations before we arrived in East Africa. The general public, heads of departments and other members of the public services had been invited to submit memoranda and give oral evidence, if they wished to do so, on matters which fell within our terms of reference. On our arrival we decided to extend the closing date for the submission of written evidence until the end of April. We stipulated that oral evidence would only be taken provided that written memoranda had been submitted in advance on the subjects on which witnesses wished to give evidence, and also that evidence would not be taken on subjects relating to particular grievances and claims which did not touch upon the general issues covered by our terms of reference. In the event, a large number of letters and memoranda dealing with individual claims were submitted to us, and in such cases the writers were informed that the matters dealt with in their submissions were outside our functions. All such papers were, however, brought to our notice in case there were any points in them which had any general bearing on our terms of reference, and in some such cases interviews were in fact arranged. Subject to the limitations indicated in this paragraph, we offered interviews to everyone who had submitted a memorandum to us and wished to give oral evidence on subjects covered by our terms of reference.

8. During our tours we took the opportunity of visiting a number of Government offices, housing estates, educational and other institutions, in order that we might better understand certain of the points and problems that have been put to us by witnesses.

9. A statement of the memoranda submitted to us is in Appendix and a statement of interviews in Appendix

10. The full Commission were in Kenya from April to the 1st June, from the 12th to the 15th June, and from the 5th September until October; Mr.Godsall was also there from the 23rd July to the 21st August. Our headquarters in Kenya were in Nairobi and we visited and took evidence at Nyeri, Nakuru, Kisumu, Kakamega, Eldoret and Mombasa. The period from the 1st to the 12th June was spent in Zanzibar, and Mr.Gorsuch and the Secretary visited Pemba from the 8th to the 10th June. The period from the 15th June to the 23rd July was spent in Uganda, where our headquarters were at Entebbe; from there we visited and took evidence at Fort Portal, Gulu, Soroti, Tororo, Jinja and Kampala. The Chairman and Mr.Gorsuch left Uganda for Tanganyika by the Lake Victoria steamer service on the 23rd July and arrived at Mwanza on the 25th July; Mr.Godsall left for Nairobi on the 22nd July to undertake a detailed study of certain terms and conditions of service. In Tanganyika the Chairman and Mr.Gorsuch visited and took evidence at Mwanza, Tabora, Dodoma, Arusha, Moshi, and Tanga and arrived at Dar es Salaam, which was to be their headquarters in Tanganyika, on the 13th August; Mr.Godsall rejoined them there on the 21st August. The Commission returned to Nairobi on the 5th September and resumed work in offices kindly provided by the Postmaster General. A detailed itinerary of the Commission's tours in East Africa will be found in Appendix

11. Mr.Gorsuch left Nairobi for the United Kingdom by air on the 5th October, and Mr.Godsall left by air for the Somaliland Protectorate on the 8th October to undertake an enquiry into the salaries and conditions of service of the Civil Service of that territory. The Chairman and the Secretary sailed from Mombasa for the United Kingdom in the m.v.Kenya on the 23rd October; the Assistant Secretary left by air on the 6th November. The Commission reassembled in London in the Colonial Office on the 17th November.

Acknowledgements

12. We thank everyone who assisted us in our consideration of the matters covered by our terms of reference, and in particular the Governors of the mainland territories, the Resident of Zanzibar and the Administrator of the East Africa High Commission, who made themselves freely available to us for advice and discussion. Our thanks are also due to those Unofficial Members of the Legislatures, members of the Secretariats and Treasuries, heads of departments, individual public servants, and representatives of staff associations and unofficial bodies who assisted us by the submission of written and oral evidence. They presented their cases in a helpful and co-operative manner, and their views and representations have been of great assistance and value to us in the preparation of this Report.

13. We must record our deep appreciation of the invaluable services rendered to us throughout by the liaison officers, who met all our requests for information and advice with cordial co-operation and promptitude - often at no small inconvenience to themselves. It was a constant pleasure to work with them, and we are greatly indebted to them for their help. These officers were Mr.J.M.Stow, C.M.G., Director of Establishments, Kenya; Mr.W.Wenban-Smith, Director of Establishments, Tanganyika; Mr.J.V.Wild, Establishment Secretary, and Mr.E.W.Williams, Assistant Accountant General, Uganda; Mr.P.H.Nightingale, Financial Secretary and Mr.S.R.Tubbs, Administrative Secretary, Zanzibar;

/Mr.W.R.Paterson,

Mr.W.R.Paterson, Establishment Officer, Administrator's Office, East Africa High Commission; Mr.R.M.L.Lemon, Chief Establishment Officer, East African Railways and Harbours Administration; and Mr.J.S.Nelson, M.B.E., Establishment Officer, East African Posts and Telecommunications Administration.

14. We found it necessary to seek confidential information from representatives of banks and business undertakings as to rates of remuneration and other conditions of employment prevailing in extra-governmental service in East Africa. Our requests for help were met with ready co-operation for which we are most grateful.

15. It is not possible fully to express our sincere appreciation of the kindness and hospitality with which we were received by members of all races alike wherever we went in East Africa. We have brought away many happy memories.

16. Finally we desire to record our indebtedness to Mr.J.B.Gould, our Secretary, and Mrs.M.Ryley, O.B.E., our Assistant Secretary, for the services rendered to us. Mr.Gould's encyclopaedic knowledge of establishment matters in East Africa, his assiduity, his devotion to duty and wise counsel have been invaluable. We are sincerely grateful to him. Mrs.Ryley has managed efficiently the business side of our Commission and has also assisted with great competence in the setting out of our Report and the complicated appendices. We acknowledge with gratitude the great help which she has given us. We must also record our grateful thanks to the following ladies who rendered us secretarial assistance in the places named:-

Mrs. N.Hayden in Nairobi,
Mrs.K.P.Whittle in Entebbe,
Mrs. E.Gibbs in London.

CHAPTER IICOURSE OF EVENTS SINCE THE 1947-48 COMMISSION

17. The 1947-48 Commission were required by their terms of reference "to review the structure, remuneration and superannuation arrangements of the Civil Services". We think it necessary, in view of political developments in this field since the Commission reported, to refer briefly to some of their structural recommendations, and to explain how far the present structure of the East African Services rests on those recommendations.

18. The Commission came to the conclusion that the time was "not ripe for the introduction of common scales of salary for Europeans, Asians and Africans engaged in similar work" (paragraph 86 of Report). They decided to deal separately with those posts which were normally filled by recruits from overseas and those normally filled locally (paragraph 89). In respect of the former category, it seemed to them that the only practical course was to determine what remuneration was required to attract and retain recruits from overseas of the requisite qualifications and experience, and then to consider the basis of remuneration of "the non-European who has acquired the same qualifications and experience" (paragraph 91). It was from this procedure that there emerged the recommendation which, on adoption by the administrations concerned, came to be known as the Three-Fifths Rule, i.e. "that the salary paid to a non-European occupant of a higher post should be three-fifths of that which we recommend for the officer recruited from the United Kingdom or the Dominions" (paragraph 92).

19. With regard to posts normally filled locally, the Commission acted on the principle that the salaries of posts in the lower ranges which were mostly, or to an increasing extent, filled by Africans, should be determined on an African basis, with such additions for non-Africans as were necessary to secure their services for as long as they were needed (paragraph 93). For posts in the higher ranges of this category, which "could be filled by Europeans, Asians or Africans who either acquire the necessary qualifications for work of a specialised character or exhibit the requisite qualities for work of a non-specialised character," the Commission recommended separate scales of salary for Europeans, Asians and Africans respectively (paragraph 94).

20. The Commission emphasised that they had rejected the system of three separate racial services in favour of a single service with differential rates of salary for the three races, and that there could be "no finality in the relativity of the salaries which we have recommended for Africans vis-a-vis the other races" (paragraph 96). With the development in the capacity and living standards of the Africans which might be expected, the salary scales recommended would need review (paragraph 97).

21. It should be made clear that these recommendations have not been adopted or maintained in toto by all East African Administrations. In so far as non-Europeans have found their way into posts of "unified"

/Colonial Service

Colonial Service level the Three-Fifths Rule has been generally applied except in Zanzibar. In Kenya and the High Commission Services the clerical and analogous grades have salary scales labelled A, B & C which are, in effect if not in name, based on racial divisions. (It should be noted in passing that in Kenya selected officers were regraded, shortly before we were appointed, in a way which resulted in their salaries being paid on the B scale instead of the C scale, or on the A scale instead of the B scale). In the other territories, however, the clerical and analogous scales are common to all races, though methods of entry or re-grading are provided to attract an adequate inflow of the non-African of higher qualification. To provide for Africans and Asians who are emerging from Makerere College or training institutions with qualifications for the varied middle range of public appointments, some Governments have created special salary scales, such as the "Makerere Scales" in Kenya and the Professional Division in Uganda. The Tanganyika Service is divided into two parts, Senior and Junior; the divisions overlap, but are in the main synonymous with European and non-European. Generally speaking, therefore, the extent to which racial differentiation is exhibited in the East African salary structure varies, and is in no case so clear-cut as was implicit in the recommendations of the 1947-48 Commission.

22. Speaking in the House of Commons on the 16th December, 1952, the present Secretary of State for the Colonies made the following reference to the Three-Fifths Rule -

"The second subject which I wish to mention, which has some relation to the colour bar, is the system by which Africans and Asians in the senior civil service, with similar qualifications, receive only three-fifths of the salaries paid to their European counterparts I dislike the system, and I hope to live to see it abolished. But it does not mean - I must be quite candid - that we can get exact equality of pay between those who are resident in the country and those who have special obligations outside it".

23. Before we left the United Kingdom the present Commission were officially informed that it was the intention of the mainland administrations to abolish the Three-Fifths Rule. Shortly after we had arrived in East Africa, the Governor of Kenya stated in an address to the African Civil Service Association on the 13th April, 1953, that it was an aim of policy that the clerical scales should in future have a non-racial structure. Subsequent discussions made it clear that the removal of racial differentiations in salary structure, in so far as they existed, was the common objective of all the East African Administrations. These developments radically affected our task, and as our terms of reference did not expressly provide for a review of the structure of the public service we asked for guidance on our approach to this part of our work. If the administrations intended to lay down in detail the lines on which these aims of policy were to be implemented the Commission's responsibility would be limited to assigning new salary scales on those lines. Alternatively, the Commission could themselves propound a new salary structure for consideration, after study of the problems arising from the expressed aims followed by consultation with each administration. It became clear after discussions that the administrations preferred the latter alternative, and this has determined the form of our Report. The

7.

understanding thus reached made it unnecessary to ask for an alteration of our terms of reference, and explains what might otherwise be thought to be an over-liberal interpretation of them. We are grateful to the East African Administrations for according us this liberty of action. Whichever alternative had been adopted, a close study of structure would have been unavoidable; by reposing this confidence in us they made a very complicated task easier of fulfilment.

CHAPTER III

STRUCTURE AND SOURCES OF RECRUITMENT OF THE EAST AFRICAN SERVICES

Structure of the Services

24. In Chapter II of their Report the Commission of 1947-48 gave a very full account of the ways in which the structure of the East African public services had been built up over the past years. Their careful and painstaking work has relieved us of the necessity of going over the same ground. It is, however, necessary for an understanding of the pattern of our Report to give a brief description of the structure as we have found it.

25. The public services throughout the East African Administrations may be classified generally into five main divisions:-

- I. The subordinate services which are paid at monthly rates but which are not "established" in the technical sense of that word. The nomenclature varies; in Kenya and the High Commission they are known as Minor Employees, in Tanganyika as the Subordinate Service, and in Uganda as the Employees Division. In Zanzibar there are scales called Ranges I to VI within which these services fall. In the self-contained services of the High Commission (i.e. the Railways and Harbours and the Posts and Telecommunications) posts in this division generally have specific grade-names.
- II. The Clerical Services, and the grades which are analogous in status and salary. The latter cover a very wide range; some instances are Agricultural Instructors, Field and Laboratory Assistants, Forest Rangers, Veterinary Assistants and Instructors, Medical Assistants and Dressers, and various field or office grades in the Public Works Departments.
- III. A large and varied middle group of services which require specialised experience or qualifications but are not of full professional status. In their differing ranges they comprise in Government offices most of the executive, office management and accounting grades; in hospitals and institutions such posts as Pharmacist, Laboratory Technologist and Hospital Superintendent, and in the field such posts as Agricultural Field Officer, Forester, Livestock Officer, and Game Ranger. There are a number of grades of this class in the Public Works Departments. We include in this Division certain services which are not professional, but the salary scales of which fall at present within the professional range, e.g. Police and Customs.

/IV. The

IV. The administrative and professional services.

V. The superscale appointments.

26. The classification outlined above is not, of course, fully comprehensive, nor does the pattern fit with complete regularity onto all departments or grades; but these five divisions form the main framework of the structure of the public services, and our Report must of necessity be built round it. In later chapters each division is examined in turn and recommendations are made on it; subsequently the departments, or the grades in general use, which need separate consideration are dealt with; and finally each Department is examined in detail where necessary in order to ensure that no particular post or grade is still left without a specific recommendation on our part.

27. Even on the broad interpretation of our terms of reference explained in the preceding chapter we are not charged with a general overhaul of the present organisational structure of the public services. But whatever changes in structure may in fact result from our recommendations, it is essential that there shall be a proper progression in status and remuneration from bottom to top in the public service, and that promotion links shall be carefully balanced between the needs of the service and the reasonable expectations of the individual. Moreover, if anomalies are to be eradicated without sowing a fresh crop we must at least endeavour to do away with one of their most fruitful breeding places - the multiplicity of varying, fragmentary and overlapping scales which has grown up in some places. We hope that the method of approach which we have adopted may take us as near success in this as is humanly possible.

Sources of Recruitment to the
East African Services

28. In all the East African administrations the public services are recruited from three racial groups - the African, the Asian and the European; the Arab, though ethnically distinct, is generally treated as though in the Asian group. The proportion of each group varies as between one branch of the service and another, and as between one administration and another. It may be helpful at this point to make a brief general survey of the position held by each race and of the trends in recruitment and staffing.

Africans

29. Under this head are included Africans of the mainland, whether born in any of the three mainland territories or immigrants, and a relatively small number of Seychellois, Mauritians and Comorians. From these sources are provided almost the whole of the subordinate services, and of the lower grades of the clerical services for which the educational qualification for entry is inferior to the Cambridge School Certificate. The same position exists generally in what are described in Division II of paragraph 25 above as the analogous services. With the fostering of African education which is the policy of all East African Governments there is an increasing appointment of Africans to higher posts. As more Africans attain the School Certificate level their numbers in the senior grades of the clerical and analogous services tend to increase; and with the

output from Makerere College and the technical training institutions which exist or are in process of creation the Africans are knocking in rising numbers at the door of the wide middle range of services described in Division III of paragraph . . . Moreover, the development of Makerere, and the award of scholarships from local resources or under the Colonial Development and Welfare Acts for education to graduate level within or outside Africa, are beginning to provide men qualified for the administrative and professional ranges.

30. The position in Zanzibar requires special mention. In this Protectorate it is the settled policy of the Government that preference shall be given to subjects of His Highness the Sultan in appointments to the public service, and the service is multi-racial only to the extent that existing circumstances dictate. There is no difference in conditions of service between African, Arab and Asian.

Asians

31. Asian craftsmen are found in some numbers among the higher daily-paid employees of Government. In the established grades the Asian is not normally attracted to appointments below the School Certificate level of entry. He holds a large share of the clerical posts above this point, and is preponderant at present in the higher clerical ranges and in some of the analogous grades. His comparatively higher general level of education makes him a candidate also for many grades of Division III.

32. A distinction is drawn by the East African Governments, and should be noted, between the Asian of East African birth or family domicile and the immigrant Asian. While it is still necessary in some cases to recruit in India or Pakistan and to bring accepted candidates over for service in Africa, the East African Governments regard this as an expedient which should give way as early as possible to employment of Africans or of the Asians who have made East Africa their home.

Europeans

33. The system of recruitment of Europeans is complex. In general there is a double channel - external and local. Recruitment from external sources is in the main effected through the machinery of the Secretary of State for the Colonies or the Crown Agents for the Colonies; the former provides recruits for the administrative and professional services and the Crown Agents for some posts in Division IV and many in Division III. Local recruitment by East African administrations is largely to Division III and to some posts in Division II. There is in Kenya, and to a smaller extent in Tanganyika, a domiciled European population on which to draw for this purpose. But it may sometimes happen that a candidate of East African domicile is recruited through the Secretary of State or the Crown Agents for service in East Africa; and conversely the local administration may engage a candidate not of East African domicile who is offering himself for employment in the local market. An East African administration may also recruit from another territory on the African continent, such as the Union of South Africa or one of the Rhodesias.

34. To complete this general picture a word is necessary on the recruitment of European women. There are a number of women in professional grades. Specialised grades such as Women Administrative Assistants, the Queen Elizabeth's Colonial Nursing Service and other medical services and some of the higher secretarial posts are recruited largely from the United Kingdom. Apart from these, locally recruited women are employed extensively in posts of higher clerical or executive type in Government offices, on pensionable terms if single and generally on a temporary basis if married. European women fill many of the stenographers' posts also.

Size and average intake of the Services

35. In order to give some indication of the size of the services with which this Report deals we have collected certain figures. Our object is to enable a broad comparison to be made between the requirements of the services by way of normal annual intake and the present output of the East African educational system; but in publishing these figures we must make the reservation that for various reasons they should not be taken as more than approximate. We have not thought it necessary to collate the figures for the enormous and varied subordinate services comprised in Division I, as the educational requirement is a humble one and rarely arises above the primary. In Division II we begin at the School Certificate points of entry, i.e. a full secondary education; but it must be remembered that a fair number of posts above the present entry points are held (and will continue for some time to be held) by persons who are not direct entrants, but have come up from the grades below. The figures given to us as the number of clerical and analogous posts requiring the School Certificate as a qualification for entry can thus only be approximations. Another point that makes absolute accuracy difficult is that, as will appear later in this Report, the dividing line between Divisions II and III is not easy to lay down. Our figures are based on the line which we adopt later in the Report, but the possibility of some degree of variation in present figures is obvious. We make these points because it would not be fair to hold the Establishment branches to account for the exact accuracy of figures which they have been at some trouble to furnish. As quoted below, the figures give, in our opinion, a basis reliable enough for general deductions to be drawn.

36. Subject to these reservations the sizes of the respective services at present are as follows:-

	<u>KENYA</u>	<u>TANGANYIKA</u>	<u>UGANDA</u>	<u>ZANZIBAR</u>
Division II (from School Certificate point of entry)	2875	3000	1700	530
Divisions III	2200	1950	1400	205
Total	5075	4950	3100	735
Division IV & V	2040	1100	600	72
Grand Total	7115	6050	3700	807

In estimating the annual intake required we decided that it would be preferable to work on the basis of normal length of career rather than on actual records of intake; to obtain an accurate average by the latter method would have meant covering a considerable number of past years and throwing an inordinate burden of work on the Establishment branches. We have therefore reckoned on the assumption that a serving member requires replacement after 20 years of service. As allowance has to be made in developing territories for expansion of services as well as maintenance, this figure seems to us reasonably conservative. On this basis the requirements for annual intake are:-

	<u>KENYA</u>	<u>TANGANYIKA</u>	<u>UGANDA</u>	<u>ZANZIBAR</u>
Division II	144	150	85	27
Division III	110	100	70	10
Totals	254	250	155	37
Divisions IV & V	102	55	30	4
Grand Total	356	305	185	41

Present output of the East African educational system

37. The latest figures available for Cambridge School Certificate and Higher School Certificate are provided by the results of the Examinations held in 1953. They are as follows:-

School Certificate.

	<u>KENYA</u>		<u>TANGANYIKA</u>		<u>UGANDA</u>		<u>ZANZIBAR</u>	
	<u>Boys</u>	<u>Girls</u>	<u>Boys</u>	<u>Girls</u>	<u>Boys</u>	<u>Girls</u>	<u>Boys</u>	<u>Girls</u>
African	139	5	94	3	186	6	1	-
Asian	217	69	87	18	40	13	29	13
Arab	7	-	-	-	-	-	2	1
European	157	131	1	-	-	-	-	-

Higher School Certificate

Asian	9	-	-	-	-	-	-	-
European	21	23	-	-	-	-	-	-

38. In comparing these figures of output of the schools with the intake requirements of the public services certain points have to be borne in mind:-

(a) In considering the comparative figures for the four territories, it should be remembered that an appreciable number of pupils in the Kenya Secondary Schools come from the other three territories.

(b) The School Certificate, as well as being the requirement for Division II, is the minimum requirement for

Division III. In the latter case the requirement may also include a qualification obtainable only by further years of post-secondary education. An appreciable number of School Certificate holders do in fact go on to Makerere College or one of the post-secondary training institutions if their resources allow.

(c) The intake requirements given above do not include requirements of the High Commission, which extend over all three of the mainland territories. The total requirements of the High Commission, which includes such large employers as Railways & Harbours, Posts & Telecommunications and Customs, are probably not far short of the average of the mainland territories.

(d) We are considering here the needs of the public services only. But in the whole field of non-Government activities - commerce, industry, banking and the professions - there is great and growing competition for the output of the schools and post-secondary institutions.

The present position of higher education

39. The University College of Makerere now maintains courses for degrees of the University of London in Arts or Science. The first graduates are expected to emerge in 1954; in either faculty the examination is at present normally for a pass degree. The other courses offered in 1954 are for the Diploma in Fine Art or for the Art Teachers' Certificate, and the Diploma courses in Medicine, Agriculture, Veterinary Science, and Education. None of these courses attains at present to the minimum qualification required for the respective professional grades in the public service, nor has Makerere yet reached the honours degree standard which is generally a requirement in other professional services.

40. The position at present, therefore, is that the locally born boy or girl who aspires to the administrative or professional grades must go outside East Africa for the higher education which will provide the qualifications required. Many of them are in fact studying abroad in this way in the United Kingdom or other of the Commonwealth countries; a considerable proportion of Asians and a smaller number of Africans go to India or Pakistan. It would require considerable analysis over a period to determine how many of these aim at or obtain a degree or qualification fitting them for the administrative or professional services. We are, however, indebted to the Kenya Education Department for some interesting details of Kenya students of all races who are studying abroad at present. The total number at the time (May, 1953) was about six hundred which, of course, forms part of several years' output of the secondary schools. From these must be deducted many, especially in India, who were taking education at secondary level. Next come those who are taking post-secondary courses which may be either for a technical qualification or in subjects such as Local Government or Public Administration. Of the remainder who are reading for degrees, the majority of the Africans in the United Kingdom and of the Asians in India or Pakistan are aiming either at pass degrees or degrees whose standing is not high.

/Very

Very few of the six hundred are likely to obtain the qualification which would make them eligible for the administrative and professional services. The proportion is probably highest among the Europeans, but the number of all races so qualifying would fall considerably short in total (quite apart from distribution) of satisfying the requirement of the Kenya public services alone; and as already pointed out, that is by no means the only, or indeed the major field of employment open to them. It is interesting to note that of 130 Asian students from Kenya in the United Kingdom at that time, about one third were studying medicine, another third were reading for the bar and eleven were studying for a dental qualification. It is safe to assume that in these cases a career in the public service is, with possibly a few exceptions, not the primary objective.

41. We have not investigated in detail the position regarding overseas students from the other territories, but it is unlikely to differ greatly from that of Kenya or to be more favourable to the prospects of recruitment for the professional grades of the public service.

Conclusions on the staffing problem

42. The conclusion which is apparent from this cursory analysis is that the East African territories are not yet in sight of being able to staff their public services entirely from their own resources. The inferences which we draw are:-

(a) If present standards are maintained (which we regard as essential) a large proportion of the recruitment for the administrative and professional services must continue to be from external sources for some time yet to come;

(b) the output of pupils with full secondary education (i.e. with the School Certificate) is still far from meeting the needs of the East African territories as a whole. In the meantime the public services must make the best use possible of the material which they obtain; the entrants with School Certificate must be given opportunities to train on for employment in the grades in Division III of paragraph 25 and entrants whose education has included only a few years beyond the primary must similarly have the opportunity and the training to move up into the gaps above their grades of entry in the clerical and analogous classes. We shall revert to this subject at greater length in the subsequent chapter on Training.

CHAPTER IVGENERAL PRINCIPLES OF THE RECOMMENDED SALARY STRUCTURE

43. Having outlined in the preceding Chapters the nature of the problems with which the Commission are faced, we think that our recommendations will appear in a clearer light if we begin by stating the general principles of revision of salaries which appear to us to emerge after six months of examination and discussion on the ground. Before doing this, however, there are two comments to be made on the shape of our recommendations as a whole.

The need for uniformity

44. No one would gainsay the right of the administration to order its salary structure and scales according to its own needs. But where, as in East Africa, there are contiguous territories which recruit in many cases from the same market, and throughout which the common services of the High Commission permeate, the independent exercise of this right can only lead to continuous anomalies and friction. To the High Commission in particular divergent salary scales and conditions of service in the territories are a nightmare, presenting problems which may defy satisfactory solution. The evidence which we have received in proof of this is clear and compelling. We are glad to have found the mainland administrations at one in agreeing that the form in which the machinery of government has developed in East Africa demands the greatest possible degree of uniformity between them in salaries and conditions of service. Conformity by Zanzibar is, of course, limited by the extent to which it has to go outside the Protectorate for its staffing requirements, or to keep its local conditions of employment in economic relation with those on the mainland.

45. Our recommendations are framed, therefore, on the understanding that uniformity is generally desired, and that administrations will be chary of modifying them before acceptance in such a way as to perpetuate the difficulties which we have tried to remove. Further, we assume that if our proposals are generally accepted, no administration will depart from them in future in any particular without previous consultation with its neighbours and the High Commission, through the respective Establishment branches, on the effect of such action. We can see no way, other than this reciprocal limitation of liberty of action, by which the resurgence of anomalies can be avoided.

The balance of the recommendations

46. The second general comment which we make on our recommendations is that they are a carefully balanced whole. In fixing a fair salary for a public servant account has to be taken of deductions which are payable from it by law or Government regulation, and of allowances (other than reimbursement of expenses) which have the effect of increasing the total of his pay. In recording that we have arrived at our recommendations on salaries after giving due weight to these opposing factors, our object is to emphasise that rejection of some part of our recommendations may result in the balance being disturbed. If, for instance, a Government, while accepting our recommendation on a salary scale, retained the present percentage deduction for house rent instead of adopting the alternative method

/which

which we advocate, it should be understood that the salary scale itself might also have to be altered if the level of remuneration which we regard as fitting is to be maintained. The final decision lies with the Government; but unless in such a case the balance were restored the award would differ from our recommendation.

Ultimate objective and method of approach

47. It may be taken for granted that it is the ultimate objective of the East African Governments, as they move towards self-government, to staff their public services as far as possible from their own resources. It is axiomatic also that a public service in any territory should be a reflection of the community; in a multi-racial territory a healthy and balanced service must be multi-racial. Enough has been said in Chapter II of this Report to show that it is a settled aim of policy in East Africa that there shall be equality of opportunity for every indigenous community in the public services. Stated in those terms the objective is simple. The ways of achieving it are by no means so clear. In the minds of all who have a share in the conduct of government in East Africa there is an acute awareness of the importance at this stage of their affairs of choosing the right approach to the objective. This feeling has overhung all our discussions, both with officials and with representatives of the general public; and within the services the representatives of Staff Associations and individuals of all ranks and vocations have shown their concern as freely as the advisers and senior officers of the Governments.

48. Having received this mass of evidence we feel that an obligation rests on us, towards the Governments to which we are making this Report and the members of the services and the public who may read it, to set out as best we can the principles which have governed our approach to this main part of our task. Bearing in mind that, apart from any political implications, the efficiency, economy and contentedness of the services may alike depend on the decisions now to be taken on their future structure, we are agreed on certain conclusions which seem to us equitable, practicable and likely to command the greatest measure of general agreement. They are as follows:-

- (i) So far as the public service is multi-racial each race must make its full contribution, and the avenues of entry and advancement must be so arranged as to give full scope for the qualities and aptitudes of each race.
- (ii) The essential principle is that for the future there shall be no barrier in any part of the service which is in fact (even though not in name) one of race. Grading by race rather than by responsibility, where it exists at present, should disappear. The limit of advance of any serving member of a service must be set solely by his qualifications and proved ability; and ability must be held to include the qualities of integrity, character and leadership. Selection for appointment shall be based on qualifications, experience and character as so far revealed.

/In no case

In no case shall race be a differentiating factor between candidates except where an appointment is necessarily in a mono-racial category, and that shall be determined solely by the duties of the post.

- (iii) The machinery of the public service cannot be stopped and taken to pieces; the day-to-day business of government must go on. We do not recommend any sudden and spectacular changes, and no one should expect them; given the intention that racial differentiation, where it exists, is to be removed, its complete achievement is only possible over an interval of time.
- (iv) Any temptation to lower standards in the services must be firmly rejected; the growing complexity of Government business in developing territories will not permit of it. The men must come up to the standards, and not the standards down to the men.

49. By the application of these principles we have endeavoured to fulfil the task of revising the salary structure in such a way that racial distinctions shall disappear. We have worked on the assumption that we are to provide in its broad foundations for a public service which will ultimately be recruited wholly within the East African territories. The Three-Fifths Rule, however, has been applied hitherto to the higher appointments which have been filled in the main from overseas. For that reason we have reserved until the next Chapter discussion of what is to follow upon its abolition.

CHAPTER VTHE THREE-FIFTHS RULEHistory of the Rule

50. In our reference to the Three-Fifths Rule in paragraph 18 above we gave a brief extract from the relevant paragraph in the Report of the 1947-48 Commission in order to quote the Rule as then formulated. A fuller quotation is required to illustrate the arguments by which the Rule was arrived at. After pointing out that at the time of writing all posts in the unified Services (i.e. Division IV of paragraph 25 above) were occupied by officers recruited from overseas, and that for many years to come the majority of these posts must be staffed in the same way, the Report goes on:-

"91. This being so, it has seemed to us that the only practical course, in framing our recommendations for revised salaries for the higher posts, is to determine what remuneration is needed to attract to, and retain in, the services recruits from overseas of the requisite qualifications and experience. But that, of course, is only half our task. There remains to be considered what should be the basis of remuneration of the non-European recruit who has acquired the same qualifications and experience"

"92. The remuneration of a non-European should, in our opinion, be such as to mark the status of the officer as a professional man and to enable him to uphold his position with dignity. On the other hand, in determining his salary, account need not be taken of the additional expenditure to which the expatriate officer is put, whereas account should be taken of the ruling income levels in those classes of the community from which he comes. This latter consideration will become progressively more important as more Africans find their way into the higher ranges of the services. The disadvantages of so remunerating any class of Africans as to create a Mandarin caste, divorced in income and interests from their fellows, would not be confined to the economic field. In the light of these considerations we have reached the conclusion that the salary paid to a non-European occupant of a higher post should be three-fifths of that which we recommend for the officer recruited from the United Kingdom or the Dominions. It will be observed that the proportionate salary which we recommend is applicable to the Asian and the African alike, since we hold the view that where an African has secured the qualifications needed for a superior post and has satisfied the appointing body of his suitability for it, the occasion for any differentiation of salary as between him and the Asian disappears."

51. Since these words were written there has begun an infusion into the higher ranks of the public services of locally-born candidates of academic or professional standards equal to those demanded from overseas. This process, inspired by the policy of the East African Governments, will undoubtedly quicken until the stage is reached at some time in the future when the scales will tip and recruitment from overseas will provide the minor

/instead

instead of the major element. The position still remains, however, and must be accepted as beyond doubt, that for a long time to come a major, though decreasing, proportion of the higher posts must continue to be filled from overseas. However strenuous the efforts of the Governments, there must be an inevitable time-lag before the educational system can be developed to the point of meeting in full the demands of these classes of the public service and of openings of similar status in industry, commerce and the professions. Nevertheless a period lies ahead in which local officers of all races will be serving in increasing numbers side by side with overseas colleagues in the higher ranks of the services. That is the background against which the abolition of the Three-Fifths Rule has to be considered.

The basis of an alternative

52. The obvious alternative to the differential scales which resulted from the Rule is that there should be a common scale applicable to all without distinction. But on what basis is such a scale to be fixed? It is a long established principle that the pay of public servants must be related to the remuneration earned in other comparable occupations, and it has been laid down that among the criteria applicable to Colonial appointments are "the relevant local circumstances such as ruling income levels in those classes of the community from which the public service is or will be recruited" (a). In the conditions then prevailing the 1947-48 Commission had no practical alternative but to take as its yardstick for the higher classes of appointment the salary necessary to attract a candidate from overseas. The ratio of three-fifths allocated to the local candidate was, however, a fixed one; and although the Report attributed the difference to "the additional expenditure to which the expatriate officer is put", the local officer came to read into this fixed ratio an implied comparison of worth, liable to be permanent and therefore an object of resentment.

53. The truth of the matter, as we see it, is that we are dealing here with two separate sets of market values. The prospective candidate from the United Kingdom or elsewhere in the Commonwealth outside East Africa looks first at the salary which he would expect to earn for comparable employment in his own country. He then considers the special conditions of overseas employment, such as the breaking of ties with his home country, climatic risk and loss of amenities, the additional cost of living and of bringing up a family - and we must add in these days of rapid political development, an element of doubt about security of career. These are the relevant circumstances which determine the level of remuneration which has to be offered to attract a candidate from overseas. But the locally-born candidate takes stock of local conditions; for him the parallel is not what is paid in the United Kingdom, but what he may hope to earn in the kind of career to which his qualifications enable him to aspire in his own country. It is with this standard that the material conditions offered by the local public service must compete if they are to attract him. In this respect East Africa is no different from other countries;

/but

(a) Organisation of the Colonial Service (Colonial No.197)

but in the peculiar condition in which local and imported officers are serving side by side the effect is that two distinct sets of relevant circumstances are operating on a single salary structure. We do not suggest that two different scales of salary must inevitably or perpetually emerge, but of two things we are convinced. In the first place, if the administrations were to adopt for that part of the service where imported and local officers serve side by side a common rate of pay based on what is necessary in present conditions to attract the former - that is to say, a rate which is dictated by external market values - they would be laying an unjustifiably heavy burden on their revenues both now and in the future and would be placing themselves in a position from which, once taken up, it would be almost impossible to retreat. Secondly, if there are to be differing rates of pay, we are sure that any system which permanently gears the one scale to the other in a fixed ratio is illogical in principle and will be untenable in practice. For this latter reason the decision to abolish the Three-Fifths Rule is a welcome one. The conclusion to which we have come is that in recommending new salary scales for this part of the service we must be guided by the assumption made in paragraph 51 above that we are to provide for a service ultimately to be recruited wholly within East Africa. The time has come, in our view, to put the whole structure of the public services on this basis.

Local and external market values

54. In consequence the basic salary scales which we are recommending for the classes of appointment which may be filled either locally or from external sources are based on the assumption that they are intended for local candidates. It must be admitted that our estimate of these scales is empirical to the extent that some of the data necessary for a close evaluation have not yet emerged. We do not regard it as a major difficulty that we are providing for a multi-racial class, as experience in other Colonial territories has shown that the market value of professional men of a similar standard of attainment is not markedly influenced by their race. But among the locally-born communities in East Africa there has not yet grown up in any great numbers the element from which the professions and the higher ranks of commerce and industry as well as the public services draw their strength in other countries, so that this essential comparative factor is not strongly in evidence. There is, however, another useful cross-bearing, in that in the United Kingdom and all other countries which follow the British type of administration there is an ordered progression in status and emoluments from bottom to top which, adapted to present East African conditions, gives a broad structural pattern. We have looked to all these sources for evidence in framing our recommendations; but our proposed scales must undergo the test of time, and we have no doubt that the administrations, if they adopt them, will keep them under review to ensure that they fulfil the purpose of obtaining for the public services a fair share of the material offering in the local employment market.

55. Having thus arrived at the basic salary scales, we have had next to consider their suitability for prevailing conditions in the external recruitment fields. As has already been said, the need for recruitment in these fields for some time to come, and in considerable numbers, is inescapable. The need for a high quality

/of recruit

of recruit is equally evident. The total cost of an overseas officer, with his passages, leave and housing, is considerable, and the administrations naturally expect good value for their outlay. But apart from this, the complexities of political and economic development in East Africa now and in the coming years demand the services of men of the highest calibre - of the type that can both exercise and teach administrative and professional expertise and tradition. Our study of present trends in overseas recruitment leads us to advise that the level of basic scales which we recommend will not be attractive enough in the highly competitive external markets of today. If East Africa wishes to recruit its fill in these markets some further inducement must be offered.

The principle of inducement

56. We emphasise the term 'inducement'. The sole justification for offering different emoluments or other terms of service to recruits from external sources lies in the necessity for bowing to the laws of supply and demand in the markets to which the East African Administrations are obliged to turn. But as we have said, there can be no immutable ratio between employment values within East Africa and outside it; where a difference exists, it may be widened or narrowed at any time, and the influences which bring about the change may be short-term or long-term. There may, for instance, be a temporary shortage of or sudden increase in demand for men of some particular calling; or, to quote a long-term possibility, the development of an indigenous professional class in East Africa will tend to bring with it a standard of living which may be little different from that of the same class elsewhere. The conclusion to which all this points is that any inducement factor which has to take the form of an addition to salary must be susceptible of movement up or down quite independently of movement in the level of the basic salary. A further point which seems to us essential is that the receipt of such an inducement addition to his salary should not confer on the recipient any superiority in status or any seniority within a grade. The position taken by a recruit to the service should be determined by his date of appointment on the basic salary. The local candidate and the overseas candidate start at this point level; the fact that the latter may receive an inducement addition to salary is irrelevant.

57. Subject to these two conditions, our enquiries have given us reason to believe that the payment of such inducement addition to basic salary as conditions may require, and differential treatment over such matters as leave and passages (which are in themselves another form of inducement), will be accepted by opinion both in the services and among the public as a necessary phase in the evolution of an indigenous service. It has been interesting to note during interviews that individuals and representatives of Staff Associations have spontaneously recognised and accepted the need not merely to recruit from outside the territories but also to offer some extra inducement to obtain men of the quality required. The assurance for which they look is that this is not a static state of affairs creating a preserve from which the local man is permanently excluded. If they are satisfied that recruitment from outside is a phase which will pass, and that the Governments are committed to a sincere and intensive policy of fitting the locally-born or domiciled for the highest
/posts

posts to which their ability will take them, we have strong hopes that our proposals may be implemented in an atmosphere of confidence and co-operation.

58. It will be seen later in this Report that the scale of inducement pay which we are recommending is a common one for all grades in which it is applicable. It seems to us that this is a necessary phase in the change from the fixed ratio system to the new conception set out above, since there must clearly be some definite starting point on which to convert from one to the other. But we do not envisage that this will always be so; on the contrary, we foresee that the time may well come when the inducement rate may have to vary for different classes of appointment in accordance with well-established changes in market conditions of recruitment. This principle is tacitly recognised already, in that the scale offered at present to Medical Officers recruited from overseas (which is superior to that for administrative and the other professional classes) does in fact contain a large element of inducement. On the other hand it may not be necessary in future to offer any inducement in some grades, and it will in fact be seen later in this Report that in the case of women in the C Scales we have suggested that, with some exceptions, the inducement addition need not be offered. Admittedly the task of deciding whether conditions warrant the alteration of the inducement in a particular class will not be easy; there is a strong practical objection to frequent changes in an element of salary which is pensionable, and such changes would be upsetting to the service in other ways. But the administrations will have the help of advice from the recruitment divisions of the Colonial Office and the Crown Agents for the Colonies in coming to a decision, and will bear these difficulties in mind while at the same time endeavouring to avoid the offer of inducement rates of a greater amount or for a longer period than is inevitable.

CHAPTER VITHE APPLICATION OF THE INDUCEMENT PRINCIPLE

59. The Three-Fifths Rule has applied in the past mainly to appointments in the administrative and professional grades. The inducement principle which we recommend should logically apply to all grades to which overseas officers have to be recruited to supplement local resources, except where the basic salary offered is clearly enough to attract overseas recruits. It must, therefore, cover the numerous and varied classes falling within Division III of paragraph 25 above, as well as the administrative and professional classes in Division IV, as long as the former are recruited in any part from overseas.

Policy of Her Majesty's Government on recruitment

60. We must turn at this point to summarise current trends in the policy of Her Majesty's Government on recruitment for the Colonial territories as a whole. In the introduction to the 1953 edition of Appointments in Her Majesty's Colonial Service (C.S.R.I. 1953) it is stated:-

"It is the declared policy of Her Majesty's Government to encourage the progress of the peoples of the Colonies towards control of their own affairs. If this policy is to be a reality the public services of the Colonies must be adapted to local conditions and be staffed to the greatest possible extent by local people. Overseas staff, therefore, are in general recruited only for those posts in the Colonial Service for which sufficient, suitable and qualified local candidates are not available ..."

Paragraph 21 (ix) of Organisation of the Colonial Service (Colonial No. 197) reads as follows:-

"In order to ensure that the standard of qualification required for the higher posts is maintained, and that the resources of the Service as a whole are utilised to the best advantage in the general interest, the Secretary of State will continue to control the appointment of persons to the higher administrative and professional posts in the Colonial Service, in accordance with the provisions laid down in the Colonial Regulations. Further, while membership of the various functional branches of the Service will be open to all officers without distinction of race or domicile, the Secretary of State will continue to specify such professional or educational qualifications as he may think proper as a condition of his approval of a candidate for appointment to certain designated posts. The Secretary of State will naturally exercise his control solely in the best interests of the Colonies, in order to provide them with the best and most suitable staff possible, the fullest regard being paid to the claims of local candidates. It will also continue to be a part of the understanding between the Secretary of State and candidates whom he selects for appointment to the Colonial Service that the latter accept an obligation to serve in any post in the Colonies to which the Secretary of State may assign them, provided that an officer will not be expected to accept compulsory transfer to a post which in the opinion of the Secretary of State is inferior (due regard being had to climatic and other conditions) to that which he already holds. Opportunities of promotion on transfer

/will of course

"will of course be open to locally appointed officers of proved merit who desire them, but they will not be liable to compulsory transfer from their home countries."

Devolution of the Secretary of State's control

61. In a Circular Despatch dated 31st August, 1953, the Secretary of State for the Colonies notified Colonial Governments of his intention to relax his control over appointments in the public services of their territories in furtherance of the policy implicit in the quotations in the preceding paragraph. This Despatch is of such importance to our purpose that the relevant part is reproduced in full in Appendix I to this Report. In brief, the position now reached in East Africa is as follows:-

(a) the authority to recruit for posts in a Colonial territory carrying an initial salary of up to £1000 a year (in Zanzibar £900) lies in the first place with the Governor (on the advice of his Public Service Commission when created); only if there is no suitable local candidate, or if it is in the public interest that recruitment should be from an external source, is recourse to be had to the Secretary of State or the Crown Agents for the Colonies (the Colonial Audit Service is excepted).

(b) the limit of £1000 is designedly fixed to bring within the authority of the Governor under (a) appointment to the lower ranges of the administrative and professional services. Hitherto appointment to these services has been reserved to the Secretary of State (paragraph 12 of the Despatch);

(c) recruitment by the Governor may include persons resident in another part of the Commonwealth who are recruited by a Colonial Government under arrangements approved by the Secretary of State. It is laid down that such recruitment must be through the Secretary of State's approved machinery in the country of recruitment, where it exists, and that any dispensation to recruit outside the Colony should not in practice be exercised in the case of the Administrative, Audit, and (gazetted) Police Services. In other words, a Colonial Government must not compete with the Secretary of State in an external Commonwealth recruitment field by using machinery of its own, and recruitment to the three specified services in fields outside the Colony remains in the Secretary of State's hands.

Rules for the operation of the inducement principle

62. Bearing in mind these governing considerations of policy, with which the general tenor of our recommendations is in accord, we come back to examine the application of the inducement principle in present East African conditions. There are two general rules which we suggest should be made. The first is that the four East African territories and the High Commission should be regarded as a unit, and that there should be a mutual covenant between them not to offer inducement pay to each other's locally-born or domiciled people or to any officer who is already serving in another East African administration on basic salary terms. We have satisfied ourselves by enquiry that all administrations agree to this. The second general rule is that the external recruitment fields in which inducement pay should form part of an offer of employment should be scheduled by the Governor in Council

/with power

with power to make exception in special cases, and that these schedules should be drawn up and maintained on an East African basis by the administrations in consultation. In this connection we wish to record that we do not think it necessary to schedule India or Pakistan as recruitment fields in which inducement pay should be offered. Having regard to the basic salary scales recommended and the possible alternative of offering special contract terms in particular cases, we think that the administrations should have no difficulty in obtaining such recruits as they may need from these two countries without recourse to the inducement factor.

63. We understand that the creation of Public Service Commissions is under consideration in the three mainland territories, but that for obvious reasons Zanzibar is unlikely to find it necessary. These Commissions, when in operation, will assume the responsibility for recruiting for all ranks of the public services. It would be well to explain the application of the inducement principle, as we see it, in this part of the Commissions' work.

64. In all cases the Public Service Commission will invite applications for the vacancies to be filled, and will examine the credentials of the candidates who apply. In general, only when it has not proved possible to fill all vacancies with local candidates of the standard required will the Commission advise the Governor to ask for the recruitment machinery of the Secretary of State or Crown Agents to be brought into operation. A question would, however, arise what the position would be if a local candidate chose to present himself for selection by the Secretary of State's appointments board rather than to the Public Service Commission in his own country.

65. We have stressed earlier that appointment by the Secretary of State confers no superior status. It does, however, mean that the candidate submits himself to competition in a much wider field. Moreover he may, if chosen, express a preference for posting to any of the Colonial territories, and he undertakes a definite obligation to be transferred to any territory during the course of his service if the overall conditions of transfer are not unfavourable. Two other considerations must weigh with the Secretary of State's board: they must not only assure themselves of the candidate's academic performance and general background and suitability for the service in question, but have also to take into account that a Colonial Government is not in practice under an absolute obligation to accept a candidate selected from outside, and that while Colonies are generally ready to accept candidates from the United Kingdom or the Dominions, there have been not infrequent cases in which a Colonial territory has demurred to taking a candidate who belongs by birth to another Colony. It can be argued with reason that a man should not require inducement to serve in his own country. But in the peculiar and transient conditions with which we are dealing, we have decided to recommend that where a candidate of local origin obtains appointment by the Secretary of State to the administrative or professional services, he should receive the inducement addition to basic salary even if posted for service in his country of origin, for the reason that he will have fulfilled the conditions and accepted the obligations of such an appointment. For the purpose of our recommendations we define the administrative and professional services as those to which we have assigned Scale A salaries. As regards other services, we recommend that the same arrangement should apply in the Civil Aviation, Customs, Police, Postal and Prisons Services to appointments which are to the Colonial Services of those names.

/We do not think

We do not think it necessary that it should apply to any other posts to which we have assigned B or C Scales; appointments to these posts are to the specific post and not to a combined Colonies-wide service, and though such officers sometimes move from one Colony to another the move is in effect a new appointment and not a transfer to another post in the same service.

Recruitment to the B & C Grades

66. In the grades to which we have assigned the B or C Scales the position is complicated by their wide range. It seems likely that in these grades the locally-born element will become predominant more rapidly than in the administrative and professional grades because the qualifications and educational standards required can in many cases already be obtained within East Africa. There is even now a considerable recruitment locally to these grades, though not, as we have mentioned in paragraph 33 above, always of locally-born or domiciled candidates. In Kenya and the High Commission, and to a less extent in the other administrations, the practice has grown up of recruiting men and women in the local market who have had suitable previous experience in other walks of life than the public service. We see no reason why this source should not continue to be used in future if necessary; it is, in our view, essential to the proper balance of the public services that the sons of the farming and stockraising community in East Africa, for instance, should contribute their share to the "field" services of the Governments (e.g. Agriculture, Veterinary, Game Forests). But knowledge of the country and its languages, combined with practical experience in the kind of work concerned, has a market value which must be recognised as comparable with the possession of paper qualifications not yet backed by experience in the field. It is not for us to lay down the lines on which the Public Service Commissions will work, but we think it likely that they will have little difficulty in justifying recruitment, at an assigned market value in each case, of persons in the former category as well as those in the latter for an indefinite period to come, in order to keep establishments filled and ensure the right admixture of entrants into the services.

67. Nevertheless it is a condition essential to the building up of an indigenous public service that it shall offer a career to the entrant direct from school. In some fields previous experience can be valuable; but in others, particularly in the sphere of office work, its value may be diminished because the governmental organisation and accounting system differs from that of commerce and has to be learnt. It is true that various grades of "learner" exist here and there in the departmental services in East Africa, but only in a sporadic form, and we doubt whether the local boy on the eve of leaving school has at present a very full picture of the opportunities open to him in the public services. We recommend, therefore, that a Training Grade should be instituted by the administrations as an avenue of entry into selected classes of posts to which we have assigned the B and C Scales.

Creation of a Training Grade

68. We recommend that nominations to this Training Grade should be made on the advice of the Public Service Commission. The

numbers entering it from year to year would be regulated by Establishment branches according to the expectation of vacancies occurring in the posts for which it is designed to supply trained men and women. The channel of entry into the Training Grade should be a double one; candidates of outstanding promise already serving in the clerical and analogous grades may be selected for it, or entry may be direct.

69. We have given much thought to this problem of entry into the grade. It seems to us indisputable that there should be a way up from the lower ranks to positions of higher responsibility; apart from any other consideration it is in the interest of the administrations to get the utmost value out of those who have entered the public service. In regard to direct entry into the Training Grade, however, a problem arises over the qualifications required. There can be no doubt that, as the general level of education rises, the educational qualifications for entry into the various grades of Government service will be raised also. For instance, at present a School Certificate holder enters some way up the clerical structure, and we have had to follow this in our new scales. But the time will come in East Africa when a School Certificate will be the minimum qualification for the lowest established clerical appointment, and for grades superior to this level a higher educational qualification can then be demanded. But, for the present, to demand for the Training Grade a standard superior to a high grade School Certificate or its equivalent, plus a general record and quality of character of outstanding promise, would be to restrict the flow of entry to an uncertain trickle. We suggest, therefore, that those should be the prescribed qualifications at the outset, and that it should be left to the Public Service Commissions to see that a real distinction in quality is observed between those who are selected for direct entry into the Training Grade, and those who must find their way into lower grades through the normal School Certificate entry points. We need hardly add that direct entry to the Training Grade should be open to all without distinction of race.

70. We emphasise that we regard the institution of the Training Grade as an important item in our recommendations. If the financial and other attractions of the grade are properly attuned to prevailing conditions it should become an effective method of bringing to the public service candidates who, though not enjoying the advantages of a professional or graduate standard, will provide that trained and effective middle grade which is essential to any public service and serves also to free the professional grades from the distraction of a mass of detailed executive work. It will provide also an avenue for the man or woman serving in a clerical or analogous grade to be selected and trained for higher responsibility if real promise is shown. We should add in this connection that we should expect this latter type of candidate to come normally into the area of selection for the Training Grade after at least six years of service in the lower grade. But we suggest that an avenue of promotion into a Scale B or C post should be open to him throughout his service in the lower grade, and that such promotion should in exceptional cases be direct, by-passing the Training Grade. For instance, a clerk who has spent many years on book-keeping would not be in need of further training before promotion to a senior post of the same type, and could be promoted direct to it if eligible

/in all other respects.

in all other respects. The Training Grade is intended to be a means of picking and training candidates or serving members in their early years.

71. To sum up, therefore, our recommendation is that appointment to the grades in Scales B or C should be in one of four ways:-

- (1) from the Training Grade, which itself will have a double channel of entry, i.e. direct or by selection from the ranks below.
- (2) by recruitment locally of candidates who have already acquired by post-secondary education qualifications which fit them for the post, or of candidates with practical experience to whom an entry point on the basic scale will be assigned consonant with their local market value as assessed by the Public Service Commission.
- (3) where suitable, by direct promotion from a lower grade.
- (4) where the numbers or type required cannot be obtained from these three sources, by application to the Secretary of State or Crown Agents for the Colonies. Officers recruited through these channels will receive the inducement addition, if any, at the prevailing rate unless they are born or domiciled in East Africa.

72. We deal in Chapter XXI below with the action required for the organisation of the Training Grade, and the functions of the heads of departments, Establishment Divisions of the administrations and Public Service Commissions in this respect.

73. We recommend that the inducement addition to basic salary should be pensionable; the proportion of present salary scales which represents the inducement element is pensionable, and to take away pensionability would mean that inducement rates would have to be considerably increased in compensation for the loss. We do not think that this is desirable. 74. Finally we must add that we have assessed the inducement scales on the assumption that they will be regarded as part of the officer's salary for the purpose of reckoning any cost of living allowance which is payable in addition to salary, and will thus fluctuate in accordance with changes in the cost of living.

CHAPTER VIIOTHER STRUCTURAL PRINCIPLES OF THE NEW SCALES

75. In the preceding Chapters we have discussed the major questions of structure with which, though not included in our original terms of reference, we have been obliged to deal. It will be convenient to follow at this point with our views on certain other matters affecting the form of salary scales which come within the purview of any general revision of salaries.

The question of long versus broken scales

76. We define a "long scale" as one in which a public servant has the expectation of progressing uninterruptedly from bottom to top of a scale which may be as long as twenty years by regular increments of salary provided that the head of his department certifies annually to his efficiency and he passes such other "efficiency" or "promotion" bars as may be prescribed in the scale. In a "broken scale", however, there is a succession of segments each containing a defined number of posts; and while this system may work to the advantage of the public service in that an officer of exceptional ability may be selected for promotion to a vacancy in a higher grade from a point well down the grade below, it has the disadvantage that no officer can arise from a lower segment to a higher unless a vacancy exists in the latter, even though he may be certified as fully fit to do so.

77. The merits and demerits of either system in a public service are a frequent subject of discussion, and there is much to be said on either side. The 1947/48 Commission (see paragraphs 118 to 128 of their Report) favoured the long scale system with two modifications: that there should be a division of the long scale into two segments with a combined establishment, promotion to the upper segment being subject to the recommendation of a Promotions Board, and that there should be a means of accelerated promotion from one segment to the other for the officer of exceptional ability. For our part we feel that the broken scale system has two important points to its credit. It attaches to a post or grade a closer valuation of worth than can be given by a long scale which may extend to fifteen or twenty years, and it acts both as an incentive, by more frequent competition for promotion, and as a means of setting a stricter limit to the advancement of an officer of indifferent performance. On the other hand, experience has taught us not to underestimate the difficulties of operating the system in a public service. If stagnation occurring at the top of one segment is too freely resolved by the expedient of creating supernumerary posts in the next segment, the scale becomes in effect a long one and its advantages are lost; but if on the contrary the avenues of promotion are so constricted that general discontent prevails, the efficiency of the service is bound to suffer. In practice, where the broken scale system is in use, establishments in the successive grades are regulated by a compromise between "pay for the job" and the reasonable expectations of the individual in the service, and in a long-established and settled

/service

service it is not too difficult to maintain a structure which satisfies both demands.

78. But most of the East African services are neither long-established nor settled. Apart from the dislocation caused by world wars, developing Colonial territories are subject to uneven phases of expansion or contraction at various times and in various departments, and these are naturally reflected to some extent in rises or falls in the intake of recruits to the services. Such fluctuations aggravate the difficulties of working a broken scale system, and undoubtedly cause that system to be a deterrent to recruitment, since a candidate will obviously take a more favourable view of an appointment in which he can see his way along the full length of a long scale than one in which he may stagnate for indefinite periods for reasons which are beyond his calculation or control. Set against these considerations our review of conditions in the East African administrations has led us to conclude that the time has not yet come to advocate a general adoption of the broken scale system, but that we must recommend for each branch of the service the kind of salary structure best suited to it.

79. The result is that in our recommendations Scale A, for the administrative and professional services proper, is a long scale. Scales B and C are expressed each in five segments, but in many cases two or more of the segments are linked to form one grade, and to that extent become a long scale. (It may be assumed that in all such cases linked segments connote a combined establishment). In this way we have allotted to posts or grades the length of scale which seems to us to assign in present conditions a fair value, while at the same time offering reasonable prospects of career and advancement. In cases where we have employed the broken scale system more closely (i.e. by the allotment of one or at most two segments to a post) we have satisfied ourselves either that the value of the post must be limited in this way - which means that in practice it will generally be filled by promotion from below after some years of service - or that the administrations should have no great difficulty in building up a graded hierarchy in which stagnation of deserving officers should normally be avoided. We think that by the use of these methods the administrations will be left with the greatest degree of flexibility in the future regulation of salary scales to suit current conditions.

Incremental jumps in scales

80. In the present administrative and professional long scale which is common to all administrations, £550(743) - £1320(1670), a jump of two increments occurs from £760 to £830, i.e. after the seventh year. No similar jump is included in any other scale except those for gazetted Police and Prisons Officers.

81. We think that there is much to be said in favour of offering a sensible increase in salary at a relatively early stage in a public servant's career, provided that he satisfies an effective scrutiny of his performance up to that point. Not only does it provide a welcome break in

a plod up the scale which in East Africa is at present sometimes over-long and weary, but if properly placed it should come at a time when the value of acquired experience is becoming evident, and when on the domestic side he is likely to be undertaking family responsibilities. We have placed the point generally at the completion of five years' service after the normal age of entry; in the junior clerical and analogous grades it is placed in part after six years. In general also we have assessed the jump at three increments in all scales instead of the one which is normally given annually, but there are two exceptions. In our new Scale A for the administrative and professional services the jump is of two instead of three increments after the fifth year; but in compensation we have placed the starting point of the scale - £630(693) - an increment higher than we should otherwise have recommended. The reason for this is that owing to the length of time taken in reaching the qualifications demanded for appointment, to which is now added in most cases a period of National Service, many eligible candidates are already married, and it will be to the advantage of the administrations to offer them some of the benefit of the jump on account. The other exception is in the new E Scales for the clerical and analogous grades; here, owing to the differing entry points based on educational standards, it has been thought better to recommend a double jump at two different points rather than a triple jump at once. But these scales have been improved in other ways, and the entrant who enjoys only one of the jumps is not at a disadvantage with his colleagues on other scales.

82. The insertion of these jumps in the salary scales will, we hope, be accepted as advantageous to the public service as a whole apart from being welcome to its members. The alternative, which would be more costly and in our view not so suitable, would have been to recommend a general heightening of the starting points of the scales.

Standstill during probationary period

83. It is the practice in some, though not all, of the present East African scales to impose a standstill during a probationary period after entrance to a scale. For instance, in the present administrative and professional scale, which runs from £550 by increments of £35, an officer remains on £550 for two years and then rises to £620. We recommend that this practice, which is not followed in the Civil Service in the United Kingdom, should cease, and we have not included the standstill in our new scales.

Promotion and Efficiency Bars

84. When an officer is serving on a salary scale his fitness to receive an increment has to be certified on each occasion by the head of his department. Before he is promoted to a higher grade the promoting authority satisfies itself of his merit.

Where he is serving on a long scale with a common establishment of posts, a third form of check on his efficiency and conduct is commonly inserted in the scale. This is known at present as an "efficiency bar" or "promotion bar". The distinction between the two is not clear, but at this stage there should in theory be a more comprehensive review of him at a higher than departmental

level before he goes further up the scale.

85. There can be no doubt that without some effective check of this latter kind a long scale system is open to justifiable criticism. But the danger is that the more bars are set up, the more they tend to detract in practice from each other's value; the temptation exists to sign an increment certificate more readily because an efficiency bar lies a year or two ahead, while the efficiency bar may in turn be lowered because increment certificates have been granted uninterruptedly in the past, or perhaps because the stiffer hurdle of promotion by selection lies next beyond it. In recommending new salary scales in which both the long and broken scale systems are used, we think it relevant to explain the principles on which we suggest that periodical checks should be imposed.

86. Where a scale is broken, and movement to a higher segment is in fact promotion to a post of greater responsibility, we assume that the Public Service Commission will be called upon to advise; there may in some cases be candidates from outside the service as well as serving members whose claims must be considered. In long scales our advice is that the aim should be to use only one kind of periodical check in addition to the annual increment certificate; and that check should be a bar which necessitates an effective extra-departmental examination of the officer's performance. We do not think that this falls within the province of the Public Service Commission, as no promotion proper, in the sense of selection for or elevation to a new post, is involved; the recommendations should come ultimately from Service boards of adequate weight and impartiality. It is for the administration to decide in each case whether a central or alternatively a provincial or regional board should adjudicate, and in deciding this the main considerations are whether the service of the officer concerned is likely to be restricted or to range anywhere in a territory, and whether a uniform standard of judgment by regional boards can be ensured.

87. Where any of the boards is a central one we suggest that it should consist of the Chief Secretary or a representative (as long as he is responsible for the Civil Service as a whole), the Director of Establishments or a representative and such other member or members as the Chief Secretary may appoint. Where the officers under review are professional, the head of the department concerned or his representative should sit as a member of the board.

88. We recommend that this kind of check should operate in all cases immediately before the incremental jump recommended in paragraph 81 above, and thereafter at intervals of not less than five or more than nine years. We have placed the bars in long scales or combined segments accordingly. The result will be that in between bars of the kind proposed the responsibility will rest solely on the head of department who certifies the annual increment. We should make it clear that we do not regard these proposals as imposing on the latter any burden which he does not already recognise and discharge; but the removal of the present medley of efficiency

/and

and promotion bars should make conditions of service clearer to all concerned, and we think that the existence of these boards will come to be regarded by heads of departments as helpful to them in maintaining a proper level of efficiency in their departments.

89. The question remains of efficiency bars which at present mark the acquisition of some definite qualification, such as the passing of language examinations or a trade test. We think that the objective should be to synchronise these bars with the new bars proposed in the preceding paragraphs, and if the latter occur at intervals of five to nine years this should generally be feasible. But if an existing efficiency bar of this type has to be retained, at least the advantage will have been gained that the only efficiency bar remaining in the salary structure is one to which a set standard is attached.

Accelerated promotion within a long scale

90. We have referred in paragraph 77 above to the suggestion of the 1947-48 Commission that there should be a means of accelerated promotion of an officer of exceptional ability within a scale which, although divided into lower and upper segments, is in effect a long scale. We understand that this suggestion has proved in practice extremely difficult, if not impossible, to work, and we have therefore invited expressions of opinion on it during our tour of East Africa.

91. A distinction must be drawn between two separate kinds of accelerated promotion. Where the question at issue is a definite promotion to a higher grade the criteria are clear enough in theory, though perhaps not always easy to apply in practice; claims are to be considered "on the basis of official qualifications, experience and merit" (Colonial Regulation No. 32.). An officer who is outstanding in the field of selection may therefore be justly selected over the heads of his seniors in service. Moreover, although the standard for such promotion is assessed primarily by ability to perform the higher duties, it must ultimately be fixed at the time by the comparative numbers of vacancies and candidates; the keener the competition, the higher the standard is pushed. But where it is a question of jumping some officers over others in progression up a scale we find it impossible to see how any workable standard can be laid down by which to make the selection. Apart from the fact that vintage and non-vintage years occur in the intake of any large service, there are infinite gradations in ability and varieties of talent, and some officers show early promise which is not fulfilled while others are slower to reveal their full capacities. We can understand that an administration may well think twice before taking on itself the task of making an irrevocable choice in these shifting conditions, and we must record that we have found, particularly among senior administrative officers who can no longer have any personal interest in the question, a widespread distrust of accelerated promotion of this sort. It is not enough to attribute this solely to fear of favouritism. There is a genuine fear that the team spirit of the service might be seriously upset by a few promotions which were felt to be due more to the limelight having fallen on the officer than to markedly superior merit. It is necessary also to bear the interests of the taxpayer in mind. If by accelerated promotion any considerable number of junior officers pass over the heads of their less able but by no means inefficient colleagues, the cost of a service may grow by

effluxion of time to a figure which is much beyond what is justified by gradation of responsibility. The service may, in fact, come to resemble the Boat Race crew of whom a lady novelist is alleged to have said "All rowed fast, but none so fast as he".

92. The scales which we are recommending are in many cases rather shorter and steeper than those now in use. We have also, in our proposals for bars in paragraphs 84 to 89 above, endeavoured to provide for effective tests of ability at intervals within the scales. We are of opinion that it would be preferable not to attempt any further method of differentiating between the "fliers" and the "plodders" within the time scales, but that accelerated promotion should be left in the fields where it can operate under recognisable standards, i.e. in promotion to higher grades or superscale posts.

The pay of women

93. The principle generally followed in the East African services at present is that the pay of women is four-fifths of that of men in the same grade, though there are exceptions to the rule; for instance, women Medical Officers in Kenya are paid the same as men. Representations on this subject have been made to us by women officers and by Staff Associations, and comparisons have been drawn with the position in the United Kingdom Service, where Her Majesty's Government have accepted the principle of equal pay, though not at present able to implement it.

94. The present practice in other Colonial territories varies. In West Africa there is no differentiation; in other Colonies the four-fifths' principle is followed, though it has been tempered to a smaller fractional difference in some cases. It should be noted that present United Kingdom practice is less severe on women than that of East Africa. The differentiation may reach one-fifth, but it is subject to a maximum of £175 a year, and is tapered down to complete disappearance at Deputy Secretary level in the Home Service. Moreover, in recruitment grades which form the lowest tier of a class, the minimum for men and women is the same.

95. Partly because of this greater severity in East Africa, and partly because of one feature in the salary scales which we are recommending, we suggest that the East African administrations might take the initiative in altering their present practice rather than await further developments in the United Kingdom. The feature to which we refer is the incremental jump at the sixth year or thereabouts recommended in paragraph 81 above. To the extent that this jump is in recognition of increased domestic responsibilities a woman officer cannot be held to qualify for it. We think, therefore, that the benefit of this jump should be withheld from her; but at the same time we suggest that this differentiation is as much as need be made in view of present trends of thought. The effect, as we have implemented this suggestion in our proposed women's scales, is that the man and the woman enter a recruitment grade on level terms and receive equal salaries until the jump is reached. At that point the woman's scale drops behind, the increments which are jumped by the man being continued in her scale. This lag continues until it is

/caught

caught up again in the appropriate higher segment of the woman's scale. The woman thus reaches the same maximum as the man if she progresses far enough in the service, but takes a year or two longer. Superscale salaries should, we think, be the same for men or women.

96. We think that this is a more logical basis for women's scales than a fractional difference extending throughout their service. The four-fifths' practice rests on very debatable ground in some scales; it can hardly be contended, for instance, that a woman Medical Officer has less responsibility than her male colleague, or a woman Magistrate less jurisdiction. And if the argument is that a woman's work is subject to restrictions in East African conditions that do not apply to the man, such as on freedom of movement in rural areas, we suggest that this is better recognised by a clear-cut decision whether or not a woman can be employed in the grade concerned than by the deduction of a fraction of salary which is not imposed in that grade alone, but applies indiscriminately in all grades. There are grades in which it would be to the advantage of the public service that women should enter more freely than at present. This relative improvement in salary may act as an encouragement.

Application of the inducement principle to women's scales

97. The women's scales which we recommend on the principle explained above are set out in the appropriate parts of this report alongside those recommended for men, and are distinguished by the affix (W). We have considered to what extent these scales should carry the inducement addition in cases of recruitment from outside East Africa. In regard to the C (W) Scale our conclusion is that the inducement addition should not be attached to the salary as a matter of course where recruitment from an external source is found to be necessary. The criterion is whether the basic salary is in itself enough to attract the kind of candidate required. We doubt, for instance, whether it would be necessary to offer the inducement addition if a woman were recruited from overseas to one of the grades of Personal Secretary (see paragraph 200) for the reason that the basic salary of the grade may compare favourably with the salary which she can command in her own country. On the other hand it seems clear that Nursing Sisters must be offered inducement as long as recruitment continues to be from overseas, as East Africa would otherwise be unable to compete with other Colonial territories in this market. We suggest as a general rule that, with the exception of the Queen Elizabeth Colonial Nursing Service, and the analogous medical services, the inducement addition should not normally be offered in external recruitment on a C (W) Scale, and that other exception should be made only in a case where external recruitment is necessary and the basic salary is clearly not likely to attract candidates. We think, however, that considerations of market value will make it obligatory for the present to offer the inducement addition in cases of recruitment from external sources to the A (W) and B (W) Scales.

His Highness's Zanzibar Service

98. This Service, the foundation of which dates from 1947, was created by His Highness's Government in pursuance of the policy of fitting the subjects of His Highness the Sultan for posts of

/higher

higher responsibility and of employing them in increasing numbers in the higher ranks in substitution for imported officers. At the outset a single salary scale was attached to the Service; in 1950 this was divided into upper and lower scales, which were fixed at £400-1000 and £320-720 respectively. Scales which are roughly parallel, though not identical, operate concurrently for the salaries of officers who are not subjects of His Highness.

99. It will be seen that under this system the salary has come to be attached to the officer rather than the post. Now that the members of His Highness's Service have risen to twenty-four in number occupying a wide variety of posts, the difficulties of the arrangement are apparent. We understand that His Highness's Government would prefer that in future salary scales shall not be attached to the divisions of His Highness's Service, but that members should draw the salary of the grade or post in which they serve. We concur entirely in this view, and have not, therefore, proposed any new scale or scales for the Service. The effect will be that the salary of a post will be that of the grade which we have assigned to it irrespective of whether the holder is a member of His Highness's Service or not. We emphasise that this is not intended to derogate in any way from the prestige of the Service, or to affect either the interests of present members or the policy of His Highness's Government towards the Service in the future. The Service remains, as it is at present, a body membership of which requires certain prescribed qualifications. The only difference is that it will no longer be a salaried grade in the public service of the Protectorate.

CHAPTER VIIITHE COST OF LIVING FACTOR IN SALARIESRise in cost of living since the
Report of the 1947-48 Commission

100. In paragraph 155 of their Report the 1947-48 Commission pointed out that at the time of writing there were no indications of any trend towards a decrease in the cost of living, but that the cost of living in East Africa was continuing to rise. They went on to point out that the index figure for the purpose of calculating cost of living allowances had recently been increased to 65 in the case of Europeans and Asians and to 85 in the case of Africans. In view of this and other considerations, the 1947-48 Commission recommended that the then existing cost of living allowances and temporary bonuses should be completely consolidated in salary, and that no balance should be left as a temporary and variable cost of living allowance to enable emoluments of the civil service to be reduced in the event of an appreciable fall in the cost of living.

101. This recommendation of the 1947-48 Commission has been amply justified by events. The Nairobi cost of living index (excluding rent), as recalculated to exclude also all increase in duties on alcohol and tobacco since August, 1939, which in November, 1947, when the 1947-48 Commission left East Africa, stood at 165, stood at 237 at the end of December, 1953; while the Kenya retail price index of goods mainly consumed by Africans in urban areas, which is compiled from information collected in Mombasa, has risen from 198⁺ in December, 1947 to 324 at the end of 1953. All these figures rest on a base of 100 in August, 1939, and the percentages of increase in the case of the two indices since the end of 1947 are approximately 44 and 64 respectively. We are informed, however, that the latter index is by no means as accurate as the former, mainly owing to the difficulty of obtaining accurate prices per unit, and also the problem of comparable quality over periods of time.

+ The figure of 85 mentioned, as quoted above, by the 1947-48 Commission in paragraph 155 of their Report as being the index figure used at the time for the purpose of calculating cost of living allowances in the case of Africans was arrived at by an adjustment of this figure of 198. The application of a similar adjustment to the corresponding figure of 324 prevailing at the end of 1953 would make no substantial difference to the percentage of increase of 64 mentioned in the following sentence, and it is, therefore, not necessary for purposes of this Report to explain the method of adjustment.

Cost of living indices maintained for
High Commission territories

102. Three sets of indices are at present maintained by the East African Statistical Department in respect of the cost of living (excluding rent) for the non-African population in Nairobi, Dar es Salaam and Kampala. It should be noted that these three sets of indices are intended to compare living costs from time to time, and are not intended to measure cost of living in the three different places relatively to each other, although recent investigations have confirmed that there is considerable uniformity in the pattern of expenditure in the three towns; the Director of Statistics has informed us that, although there may be differences in detail, the relative changes in cost of living in the three capitals have remained roughly the same, and are likely to continue to do so unless artificially altered by the action of any individual Government. In order to remove the danger of attempting a comparison between the indices for the three towns, which may in a short period show differences for quite sound reasons, the East African Statistical Department has recently produced a single East African index of consumer goods compiled from prices ruling in each of the three. This new index does not vary significantly from the trends shown in any of the three main indices.

103. In addition, there are also maintained indices, for Mombasa and Dar es Salaam, of goods mainly consumed by Africans, the former of which is referred to in paragraph 101 above. These indices, it should be remembered, refer to persons on or about the minimum wage level; at this level of income a change in the price of, say, maize would have a much greater effect on the index than it would have in the case of persons on a higher salary level. Finally, the East African Statistical Department continues to maintain the other index referred to in paragraph 101 above, namely, the Nairobi index recalculated to exclude all increases in duties on alcohol and tobacco since August, 1939. This is commonly known as the Wage Adjustment Index, and is the index generally used as a basis for the consideration of awards of cost of living allowance.

104. Although rent is excluded from these indices owing to the difficulty in calculating an accurate index of rents, it should not be forgotten that where quarters are not provided either by Government as employer or in public housing estates, the rent of accommodation often constitutes a very large element in the cost of living in the case of the lowest income groups of public servants in large towns. We are, however, dealing with the question of the housing of public servants in Chapter XXIII.

Cost of living in the Zanzibar Protectorate

105. It should be noted that, as the Zanzibar Protectorate does not form part of the High Commission, none of the indices so far mentioned covers that territory. Nor are any figures available on which it might be possible to make an absolute comparison between the cost of living in the mainland territories and in the Zanzibar Protectorate. A retail price index prepared by the High Commission Statistical Department on the basis of prices collected by the Government of Zanzibar would seem to show that the percentage increase in prices since December, 1951 has been less than the corresponding increase on the mainland. On the other hand, the same index indicates that the percentage of increase in prices between 1948 and January, 1953 was 45. There is, in any event, a great problem in Zanzibar connected with the collection of prices before and after the arrival of supplies by sea. No figures are available to show how the cost of living in Zanzibar compared with that on the mainland at any time. A Cost of Living Allowance Committee appointed by the Zanzibar Government in February, 1951 considered that the cost of living was "certainly higher in Zanzibar than on the mainland owing to the fact that such a high proportion of the Protectorate's consumer goods was imported". In the absence of statistics we accept this view to the extent that the cost of living in the Zanzibar Protectorate is unlikely to be lower than on the mainland, and we, therefore, recommend the same general level of remuneration for adoption both on the mainland and in Zanzibar.

Special considerations relating to cost of living in Pemba Island, Zanzibar Protectorate

106. We should add at this point that we received a number of representations that a special allowance should be paid to Zanzibar Government employees posted for service on the Island of Pemba. Its remoteness and lack of amenities make it in any event an unpopular station, and the extra freight element and the fact that commerce is less well developed there than in Zanzibar undoubtedly combine to make the prices of consumer goods slightly higher than in Zanzibar. In addition, during the clove picking season there is an influx of clove pickers which, we have been told, may amount to 50% of the normal population of the Island in a bumper season, with resultant payments of wages in the Island which may exceed £2,000,000 in one season. The impact of an amount of money of this order on the economy of the Island naturally causes a surge in the cost of consumer goods.

107. We do not, however, consider that the remedy for this periodic but temporary dislocation of the economy of the Island lies in the payment of a Pemba allowance, which would probably only result in pushing prices still higher. The real remedy lies in ensuring that a sufficient supply of consumer goods is made available in the Island to absorb the temporary increase in purchasing power. If this is considered to be too vast an undertaking for present resources, the lot of public servants in Pemba might be ameliorated by the Government making arrangements to supply its servants there with the commoner consumer goods at

/reasonable

reasonable prices. This might be done either by the establishment of a Government retailing agency or by the formation of a consumer co-operative society assisted by a Government loan. Leaving aside the temporary surges in the cost of living in Pemba caused by the annual clove picking seasons, we were informed that the normal level of cost of consumer goods in Pemba is only slightly, say between 2% and 5%, higher than in Zanzibar. This, in our opinion, is insufficient to justify a special Pemba allowance. In nearly all territories there are stations where costs vary by this amount; to take account of such small differentiations in costs in the remuneration of public servants would, in our view, be impracticable. Periods of service in slightly more expensive stations which do not offer all the amenities available in other stations should be accepted as part of the normal lot of a public servant. We would, however, recommend that the Government should, as a matter of high priority, provide quarters for its employees posted to Pemba. Rents for private houses are very high there, and while we fully agree that the Governments should not accept any general liability for housing public servants, it seems reasonable that quarters should be provided in Pemba so long as it is necessary to post there for duty persons whose homes are in Zanzibar.

History of cost of living allowances +
paid by the East African territories
since the 1947-48 Commission

108. The following table sets out the cost of living allowances paid to public servants in the various territories of East Africa from time to time, together with the latest published figure at which the Wage Adjustment Index stood prior to each relevant date. The history of the cost of living allowances paid to the servants of the East African Posts and Telecommunications Administration and the East African Railways and Harbours Administration are set out in paragraphs and under the chapters dealing with these administrations. As has already been stated, the base of the Wage Adjustment Index is August, 1939 = 100, and at the time of the 1947-48 Commission's investigations it stood at 165.

-
- + In the case of some administrations in East Africa the existing allowances are referred to as temporary allowances and not as cost of living allowances. We have, however, throughout this Report referred to them under the generic title of cost of living allowances.

TABLE OF COST OF LIVING ALLOWANCES

<u>I-KENYA</u>	<u>RANGE OF SALARY</u>	<u>RATE</u>	<u>MAXIMUM</u>	<u>WITH EFFECT FROM</u>	<u>WAGE ADJUSTMENT INDEX</u>
(a)	(i) On first £300 p.a.	20%	£150 p.a.	1.1.51	194
	(ii) On next £350	10%			
	(iii) On remainder	5%			
(b)	(i) On first £100 p.a.	30%	£160 p.a.	1.7.51	204
	(ii) On next £200	20%			
	(iii) On next £350	10%			
	(iv) On remainder	5%			
(c)	(i) On first £70 p.a.	40%	£160 p.a.	1.12.51	209
	(ii) On next £30	30%			
	(iii) On next £200	20%			
	(iv) On next £350	10%			
	(v) On remainder	5%			
(d)	(i) Salary £210 p.a. and under on first £70 p.a. } on next £140 }	45% 15%	£250 p.a.	1.1.52	214
	(ii) Salary £210 p.a. and over	25%			
(e)	(i) Salary £210 p.a. and under on first £70 p.a. } on next £140 }	55% 17½%	£300 p.a.	1.8.52	224
	(ii) Salary £210 p.a. and over	30%			
(f)	(i) Salary £210 p.a. and under on first £70 p.a. } on next £140 p.a. }	60% 15%	£300 p.a.	1.5.53	233
	(ii) Salary £210 p.a. and over	30%			
(g)	(i) Salary £210 p.a. and under on first £70 p.a. } on next £140 p.a. }	60% 17½%	£350 p.a.	1.8.53	235
	(ii) Salary £210 p.a. and over	35%			

<u>II - TANGANYIKA</u>	<u>RANGE OF SALARY.</u>	<u>RATE</u>	<u>MAXIMUM</u>	<u>WITH EFFECT FROM</u>	<u>WAGE ADJUSTMENT INDEX</u>
(a)	on all salary	15%	£150 p.a.	1.1.51	194
(b)	" " "	20%	£200 p.a.	1.7.51	204
(c)	" " "	25%	£250 p.a.	1.1.52	214
(d)	" " "	30%	£300 p.a.	1.8.52	224
(e)	" " "	35%	£350 p.a.	1.8.53	235

III-UGANDA = as in Tanganyika.

IV-ZANZIBAR

(a)	(i)	On first £300 p.a.	20%	} £200 p.a.	1.1.51	194
	(ii)	On next £350 p.a.	15%			
	(iii)	On remainder	10%			
(b)	(i)	On first £300 p.a.	25%	} £250 p.a.	1.5.52	217
	(ii)	On next £350 p.a.	20%			
	(iii)	On remainder	15%			
(c)	(i)	On first £300 p.a.	30%	} £300 p.a.	1.1.53	229
	(ii)	On next £350 p.a.	25%			
	(iii)	On remainder	20%			
(d)	(i)	On first £300 p.a.	35%	} £350 p.a.	1.9.53	236
	(ii)	On next £350 p.a.	30%			
	(iii)	On remainder	25%			

V.HIGH COMMISSION

The High Commission, apart from the East African Posts and Telecommunications and East African Railways and Harbours Administrations paid allowances to those of their officers stationed in the three mainland territories of substantially the same amount as those paid by the local Governments to their own servants.

The cost of living allowances paid from time to time by the East African Posts and Telecommunications and East African Railways and Harbours Administrations are detailed in Chapters XXVI and XXVII.

109. It will be noted that, in the case of Kenya and the High Commission, and to a lesser extent in Zanzibar a higher rate of cost of living allowance has been paid in the case of the lowest income groups than in the case of others. Our salary proposals have, however, been designed to cover this, and this feature is not, therefore reproduced in our proposals for cost of living allowance. The figures of the Wage Adjustment Index prepared by the High Commission Statistical Department have been included in the case of changes in the Zanzibar cost of living allowance although, as previously explained, they are not strictly relevant. It will further be seen that the Zanzibar Government has, since the beginning of 1952, lagged behind the mainland Governments in the matter of cost of living allowance; but, as we have stated earlier, we accept the view that the cost of living is not likely to be less in Zanzibar than on the mainland.

110. We should add that we were consulted, while in East Africa, in regard to the raising of the cost of living allowance to 35% with a ceiling of £350 per annum and gave our full support to the increase.

General assumptions in the matter of level of emoluments

111. In arriving at the general level of remuneration which we recommend for the future we have had to take into account numerous factors, such as the emoluments offered by commercial firms in East Africa and, in the case of officers recruited from outside the East African territories, the emoluments offered by the Governments of other Colonial territories and the desirability of providing for non-racial scales of salaries. We have, however, acted on the general assumption that the overall level of emoluments recommended by the 1947-48 Commission, and accepted by the various Governments at the time, was then adequate; and, subject to the other considerations referred to, our recommendations are based on the rise in cost of living since the end of 1947. In other words, we have not attempted to go behind what was accepted as a result of the recommendations of the 1947-48 Commission.

112. We would also invite attention to the view expressed in paragraph 69 of the Report of the 1947-48 Commission, namely, that the two major wars of the present century have to be paid for, which is a further reason for not attempting to go back to the purchasing power of the salaries which obtained in 1939. We think, however, that it is only fair to the public services to add a note of warning that this consideration should not be pressed too far in fixing the general level of their remuneration. Otherwise the result can only be a discontented and, therefore, inefficient Government service.

/Question

Question of consolidation of existing
cost of living allowances

113. We refer separately where necessary to the impact of increased costs on individual classes of the public service e.g. the minimum emoluments necessary for the lowest grades of monthly-paid employees living under urbanised conditions. In this Chapter we are concerned with the general levels of remuneration of public servants, considered on the basis of our assumption that the general levels of remuneration recommended by the 1947-48 Commission were adequate at the time. This immediately raises the issue whether the whole of the cost of living allowances at present paid should be consolidated into salary, or alternatively, what proportion of those allowances should be so consolidated. Beyond repeating that a decision would present no difficulty if an accurate forecast of the future trend of prices over a period of years were possible, we do not propose to reiterate the arguments in favour of various possible courses which exercised the minds of the 1947-48 Commission and are set out in paragraphs 154-156 of their Report. In the case of recent Colonial salaries revisions, only in the case of Northern Rhodesia has a non-pensionable cost of living allowance been recommended in addition to salaries to provide for the possibility of a fall in the cost of living. Further, the Nairobi Wage Adjustment Index continues to rise, although there are signs of a flattening curve. Thus, while this index, which stood at 194 in December, 1950, had advanced by 35 points to 229 by December, 1952, it had only advanced to 237 by December, 1953. These factors would, however, seem to lead to the conclusion that the present cost of living allowance should be consolidated in full. On the other hand, it is undoubtedly true that the rising trend of the cost of living in East Africa has, in considerable measure been due to the increased cost of imports brought about by world conditions. Future developments in world conditions are impossible for us to forecast, but it does not seem to be beyond the bounds of reasonable possibility that, if the present state of international tension ceases and the energies at present devoted to armaments can be released for the production of consumer goods, world prices will fall. There is also the possibility of a general recession of trade which would have the same effect. With these possible developments in view, therefore, we have come to the conclusion that it would be unwise to recommend that the whole of the remuneration which we consider necessary for the public services in present circumstances should be made pensionable, and, therefore, almost impossible to reduce, but that 10% of that remuneration should be left floating as a non-pensionable cost of living allowance. Since this 10% is a percentage of the new total remuneration the effect of this, where the new total remuneration is exactly 135% of the previous pensionable salary, is that 22.7% of the former salary will have been consolidated and 12.3% left floating.

114. It is perhaps worth while emphasising here, at the risk of repetition, that this cost of living allowance which we recommend is merely a buffer against the possibility of a general fall in prices in the future. It is not intended as compensation for a rise in the cost of living since we formulated our recommendations for basic salaries; and, as we have already stated, in formulating these recommendations we have taken into account the fact that certain administrations have in the past paid higher rates of cost of living allowance to the lowest paid groups. While, therefore, the cost of living remains at its present level, there is no ground, in our opinion, for suggesting that a higher scale of cost of living allowance should be paid on the basic salaries that we recommend for the future to the lowest paid grades.

Ceiling on cost of living allowances

115. During the course of hearing evidence we received a great many representations to the effect that the operation of the maxima in the present system of cost of living allowances was unfair, and that the present percentages of salary paid as cost of living allowances should be applied to all salaries without limit. The effect of the present maxima in the mainland territories is that the cost of living allowance does not increase after an officer has reached a salary of £1,000 per annum. In Zanzibar the maximum is at present reached at £1,210 per annum. We agree that the effect of the maxima has been to reduce relatively the financial advantage of officers on the higher ranges of salary and thereby to detract from the reward for acceptance of promotion in the service and the undertaking of greater responsibility. We hold strongly the view that promotion and consequent acceptance of higher responsibility should be rewarded by a substantial increase in salary. On the other hand, the very nature of a cost of living allowance implies that it is intended to compensate for the increased cost of essentials for a normal and decent life, and it would be clearly impossible to hold, that in order to achieve this end in the face of rising prices, the same percentage of salary would be required for the highest paid as for the lowest paid officer. Further, in the United Kingdom, in accordance with normal practice in the British Civil Service, pay addition not only ceases to increase in proportion to increase of salary in the higher ranges but is actually extinguished at £2,100. We, therefore, accept the principle of a ceiling for cost of living allowance, but consider that the discontent which exists at the operation of the present ceiling arises from the fact that the proportion of cost of living allowance to pensionable salary has become very high. If, in future, it should in the event turn out that the rise of cost of living is such that (other than for a purely ephemeral reason) it is necessary to pay on the pensionable salaries which we now recommend a cost of living allowance which amounts to a very substantial proportion, say 25%, and there is no likelihood of a considerable fall taking place in the foreseeable future, consideration should be given

to an overall increase in pensionable salaries which would have the effect of reducing the percentage payable as a non-pensionable cost of living allowance.

We also see no reason to impose a maximum cost of living allowance which comes into operation at an arbitrary point on the senior officers' time scale. We, therefore, recommend a ceiling of £162 per annum on cost of living allowance, which means that it will come into operation at the top of our A, B and C Scales, account being taken of the inducement addition at that point. In determining our salary scales above this point, we haven't taken into account the fact that under our proposal the cost of living allowance at these levels will only be paid up to a maximum of £162 per annum although this does not mean that the whole of what would otherwise have been paid as cost of living allowance has been automatically consolidated into pensionable salary.

Method of providing for future
changes in the cost of living

116. In paragraph (vi) of our terms of reference we have been invited, in making our recommendations, to pay particular regard to a method for providing for further changes in the cost of living. In the course of receiving evidence it has been frequently suggested that cost of living allowance should be automatically linked to a cost of living index. We have no hesitation in rejecting this suggestion, particularly in developing territories, since development expenditure itself, both public and private, may, by increasing the monetary supply without a corresponding increase in the short run in production, cause price inflation. While, from the point of view of the public servant, a linkage between the cost of living index and a cost of living allowance might work reasonably well during a period of rising prices, it is difficult for a salaried employee to adjust his expenditure to a reduction in emoluments, and reasonable stability in his remuneration is clearly desirable. Further, the pattern of expenditure of a community is continually changing at the various income levels, and this is likely to be particularly marked during a period of violent alteration in prices. No cost of living index is, therefore, likely to remain for long a true criterion of what would be a fair level of emoluments for any particular grade of public servants. Again, this suggested system of automatically linking remuneration with a cost of living index has been tried in the United Kingdom, where the community is homogeneous, and was abandoned as unsatisfactory (a). It is even less likely to be satisfactory in a multi-racial community, where some price changes at any given period may affect one section of the public service more than others and may be more likely to be permanent than other price changes.

117. We can, therefore, do no more than suggest

/that

(a) Report of the Royal Commission on the Civil Service, 1929-31 (Cmd. 3909), paras 328-348.

that indices should be maintained for the higher and lower income groups by the High Commission Statistical Department on an East African basis, and on principles to be agreed upon by the administrations concerned, for the purpose of the consideration of cost of living allowances; and that, whenever a rise or fall of five points has occurred in one or other of these indices, a meeting of senior representatives of these administrations should be immediately convened by the Administrator of the High Commission to discuss and, if at all possible, to make an agreed recommendation to the Governments and to the High Commission on the action to be taken. For this purpose we suggest that the 1st January, 1954, be taken as the base date for the indices to be used for the consideration of any future variation in the cost of living allowance which we have recommended. We emphasise the necessity for speed in convening meetings to discuss the action to be taken after a substantial change in the cost of living has become evident; much of the prevailing discontent in the public service regarding the action taken by the Governments in the face of rises in the cost of living has resulted from the time lag that has sometimes occurred between these rises and the implementation of decisions to award increased cost of living allowances to meet them. We would also stress the need, whenever possible, for uniformity of action in the various territories in this respect. While we recognise and entirely accept the constitutional position that final decisions on the remuneration of the public service must rest with the Government and Legislature of each separate administration, we would urge with all the emphasis at our command that, unless there are very special and compelling reasons why the general level of remuneration should be different in one East African territory from that in the others, differences of opinion on this matter which are merely arguable should be abandoned in favour of the opinion of the majority. To do otherwise, on the mainland at least, puts the High Commission, which has establishments in all three territories, in an impossible position, and can in general only lead to discontent in the public service of the territory or territories where emoluments lag behind.

118. This recommendation cannot, as it stands, cover the case of the Zanzibar Protectorate where, as we have stated, no cost of living index is maintained. We consider that the Zanzibar Government should either agree to accept for this purpose the movements of the East African index or indices which we have suggested, and take part in the discussions as to the action to be taken, or should request that the High Commission Statistical Department be authorised to examine the position in Zanzibar statistically and, if necessary, prepare a separate index for that territory. While we appreciate that financial considerations must play an important part in determining the amount of cost of living allowance to be paid, the present position whereby, with no cost of living figures to support its decisions, the level of cost of living allowance in Zanzibar sometimes exceeds and sometimes falls below the level paid on the mainland, is not satisfactory from the point of view of the Zanzibar service.

119. It should be noted that we do not recommend that the cost of living allowance paid to public servants should vary in accordance with marital status and family commitments, although we have in paragraph touched upon the question of education allowances in the case of officers educating their children in the United Kingdom. We believe that the proper principle is that an officer should be paid for the work he does and not in relation to the size of his family. In formulating our scales of remuneration we have, however, taken into account the fact that most officers are married and have families, and we have made provision for the expenditure arising therefrom, apart from the special case of educational expenditure in the United Kingdom.

CHAPTER IXTHE SUBORDINATE SERVICESThe present position

120. The East African Administrations employ, spread over practically all their departments, a vast number of monthly-paid persons, e.g. office messengers, watchmen, boatmen, water guards, gardeners, hospital orderlies etc., whose posts are often not separately itemised in the Estimates of Expenditure but are provided under a block vote with some generic title such as 'Minor Employees'. These are all regular and permanent, though not pensionable employees of the administrations, as distinct from a further large number of temporary and daily-paid employees with whom we are not concerned as they fall outside our terms of reference.

121. The 1947-48 Commission did not deal in detail with the rates of remuneration to be attached to the former grades, but recommended that the Governments should examine them with a view to increases being given in line with those recommended for the more highly paid posts, and that these increases should be consolidated with the basic salaries then paid.

122. As is to be expected, conditions and modes of life vary so much within the East African territories as a whole, and within each territory except possibly Zanzibar, that there is no overall uniformity in remuneration for these classes of employees. Their scales of pay vary according to the type of work on which they are employed and the district in which they work, and the usual practice has been for the Governments to lay down patterns of remuneration and for the actual scales payable for any particular class of work to be settled locally within these patterns. A further point to be continually borne in mind is that, although all these types of employees are usually classified under a generic term such as minor employees and are paid on authorised salary ranges, they in fact represent widely differing fields of employment which have no connection with each other, and the conditions under which they work are quite incomparable. For example, while an office messenger in an urban area may work ordinary office hours, the gardener in an outstation works entirely different hours and a boatman different hours again. Many of them are probably not much, if any, more than half-time workers who have ample opportunity to cultivate their own holdings if they so desire. It is, therefore, quite inappropriate to consider either the present salary ranges or the proposed ranges which we recommend as the salary scale of a service, the members of which will progress from bottom to top by annual increments. They are not, in fact, intended to be more than a salary pattern into which a large number of posts of an almost inconceivably diverse nature will be fitted as may seem appropriate. We should also perhaps add, for the benefit of the reader who is unacquainted with African conditions, that, while salaries at the lower levels of the ranges may appear very small by comparison with European standards, they are in the outstations generally supplemented by what is grown by the employee or his family on the family holding, and the subordinate Government employee in such circumstances is generally substantially better off than his fellows who earn no cash wages at all. We received, therefore, no evidence that the services of minor employees were difficult to obtain at present wage levels.

123. In Kenya, Minor Employees are at present paid on an appropriate segment of a long scale running from Sh. 15 a month to Sh. 100 a month, divided as follows:-

/Segment V:

Segment V: Sh.15(24) x 1 - 24 x 2 - 38(61) a month

" IV: Sh.40(64) x 2 - 50(80) a month

" III: Sh.52(83) x 2 - 70(112) a month

" II: Sh.72(115) x 3 - 90(144) a month

" I: Sh.90(144) x 5 - 100(160) a month

A cost of living allowance of 60% is paid at present throughout the range of these segments, and the figures in brackets after the minimum and maximum of each segment represent the present total wage at those points. Segments are assigned to the various types of minor employees in each district by the District Commissioner after consulting the Wages Co-ordinating Committees where they exist, and the results are reported to the Secretariat for purposes of co-ordination. We understand that Segment V is only used in remote areas and that, therefore, the minimum generally employed is, inclusive of cost of living allowance, Sh.64.

124. In Tanganyika, the Subordinate Service scales run as follows:-

Group III: Sh.20(27) x 1.50 - 47 x 2 - 67(90) a month

" II(b): Sh.70(95) x 3 - 82(111) a month

" II(a): Sh.82(111) x 4 - 102(138) a month

" I: Sh.82.50(111) x 4 - 102.50(138) a month

A cost of living allowance of 35% is paid at present on all salaries of this level, and the figures in brackets after the minimum and maximum of each group represent the total wage. The entry points into Group III are fixed by the Provincial Subordinate Service Committees for different types of employees in the various areas.

125. In Uganda, the Employees Division consists of the following grades:-

Grade X: Sh.22(30) x 2 - 60 x 4 - 84(113) a month

" IX: Sh.24(30): 30: 36 x 2 - 60 x 4 - 80(108) a month

" VIII: Sh.44(59) x 2 - 52: 57 x 3 - 72 x 5 - 97:
102 x 6 - 120 x 7 - 148(200) a month

" VII: Class III: Sh.65(88) x 5 - 90(121) a month

Class II: Sh.96(130) x 6 - 120(162) a month

Class I: Sh.127(171) x 7 - 148(200) a month

" VI: Sh.44(59) x 2 - 60 x 4 - 80 x 4 - 96(130) a month

" V: Sh.65(88) x 5 - 90 x 6 - 120 x 7 - 148(200) a month

A cost of living allowance of 35% is paid at present on all

/salaries

salaries of this level, and the bracketed figures after the minimum and maximum of each grade represent the present total wage. Instructions regarding the grades (and also the maximum salaries within them) which apply to each category of posts are issued from the Secretariat. The points of entry are decided in each case by the Head of Department or the District Commissioner, and in the case of Grades IX and X are also governed by the Minimum Wage Ordinance where applicable, and by current market rates.

126. In Zanzibar there are six scales which are termed Range Scales, Range I rising to a maximum of £280(378) per annum. The first four are covered by our proposed E Scales and the following remain:-

Range VI: Sh.60(81) x 1.66 - 100(135) a month

" V: Sh.100(135) x 2.50 - 125 x 2.50 - 150(203) a month

A 35% cost of living allowance is also paid at this level in Zanzibar but there is no variation on account of local circumstances in the salaries paid.

General policy

127. As regards the general level of salaries of subordinate employees, we came across two schools of thought during our visit to East Africa, the first being that, owing to the relatively low output of employees at this level, the present salaries were as much as should be paid, and that increases in pay should await an increase in efficiency. The other school considered that an increase in efficiency could hardly be expected if wages remained at their present level, and that, if wages were increased, an increase in efficiency would follow, since employing officers would be more careful to terminate the services of those who were inefficient and to replace them by more efficient, and possibly fewer, employees. Although we hope that an increase in remuneration will not lead to a drastic reduction in employment and that, for their part, employees will respond to higher wages by increasing their efficiency, we are convinced that the remuneration of the lowest paid grades of Government employees should be increased.

Housing of subordinate employees

128. It is necessary at this stage to refer to the housing of minor employees. Only a minority of them are provided with Government quarters and, where they are so provided, no rent is charged. In Kenya, a rent allowance is paid to those who are not provided with quarters and who do not live in their own homes in a reserve adjacent to their place of work. In Uganda, a rent allowance is paid in urban areas to those minor employees not provided with quarters who work outside their own provinces. If they work within their own provinces no rent allowance is paid whether they pay rent for their quarters or not. In Tanganyika, Zanzibar and the rural areas of Uganda, quarters, if available, are provided free of rent, but, if no quarters are available, no rent allowance is paid.

129. We propose that, in future, there should be twin patterns of remuneration, one applicable to those provided with Government quarters and the other to those not so provided, the two patterns differing by an amount of Sh.9 a month (Sh.9.90 when cost of living allowance at the rate of 10% of salary is taken into account) at the

minima and maxima and each intervening point of the two patterns. We do not recommend that any differentiation should be made between persons who work in their own provinces and those who do not or, subject to our remarks below regarding particularly expensive areas where a rent allowance may still be necessary, between those who live in their own homes in an adjacent reserve and those who do not do so; in our opinion, the sole criterion for the use of the two patterns should be whether or not the employee is provided with Government quarters.

130. We should mention here, although it follows from what is stated in the preceding paragraph, that we do not recommend that, at this level of the public service, an attempt should be made, as we recommend in Chapter XXIII for the higher ranges, to fix the rental of the quarters provided in any particular case by reference to their size or amenities. We consider that a flat differential of Sh.9.90 a month does substantial justice, and that it is not worth the work and trouble involved in Establishment branches as well as in the Public Works Departments and in the departments of the subordinates concerned, to attempt to be more exact. As we have stated in Chapter XXIII, we do not think that an administration should assume any general liability to provide quarters solely for the use of its employees, although it may be necessary to do so in the case of certain institutions or certain remote places. Where they are so provided in future, the administrations will no doubt ensure that they are of an adequate standard.

The minimum salary of the Subordinate Service

131. This having been stated, however, conditions in East Africa vary so much that it is extremely difficult, if not impossible, to lay down what the minimum salary of a regularly employed monthly-paid public servant should be. Public servants should not become a privileged class, and regard must, therefore, be had to the wages paid for comparable employment outside Government service, though we think that at this level of employment Government should be in the lead. On the other hand, we are dealing with persons in regular monthly-paid employment and their remuneration should not, in our view, be based on a minimum wage formula. Again, conditions in large towns, where labour is gradually becoming urbanised, are vastly different from those in rural areas, where the cash wage is supplemented by food grown on land holdings. Finally, it has been the traditional custom in East Africa to look upon wages as what are necessary to meet the needs of the worker himself, since his family normally lives on the holding. While the habits of the country are, no doubt, changing in this respect, the change will first take effect in the large towns (to which we will revert later), and we do not think it necessary to make full allowance at present for this change in recommending a general level of minimum remuneration throughout the territories.

132. Having taken all these factors into consideration, we have come to the conclusion that Sh.60 a month is the right minimum for our proposed salary scale range for subordinate employees provided with Government quarters in the normal outstation. With our suggested cost of living allowance of 10%, this produces a total wage packet of Sh.66 a month. If quarters are not provided, these figures become, under our proposals Sh.69 and Sh.75.90 respectively. It is not possible to support them by a detailed cost of living analysis. On the basis of the cash purchase of all requirements, they are too low but, as we have already stated, wages in East Africa are normally supplemented by what is grown on the workers' holdings. On the other hand, the figures may be criticised as being too high, having regard to what are generally, in fact, the workers' cash needs, and the

general level of wages now being paid. We can only say that any figure that one might choose would be open to criticism from one angle or the other, and that the one that we have chosen provides what, in our view, is a proper mean.

The minimum in very remote areas

133. Even these figures, while generally suitable, in our opinion, for outstation circumstances, will probably be too high in some very remote areas if the public servant is not to become a privileged class; we should see no objection in such places to the minima being lowered at the discretion of the administrations concerned. But we would put in a plea that this power, while we agree that it is necessary in some areas, should be used only sparingly where it is clearly proper to do so, and that it should not be used to depress the minima of our subordinate employees' range generally. In any case, the same differentiation should, in our opinion, be maintained between the pattern for those provided with Government quarters and that for those not so provided.

The maximum salary for the Subordinate Service

134. Having dealt with the minima of our subordinate employees' ranges, it is necessary briefly to discuss the maxima. As will be seen from paragraphs 123 - 126, the maxima of the present ranges vary considerably among the different territories and, in Uganda and Zanzibar (Range V), rise to Sh.200 a month or more in total remuneration. We think, however, that, when it becomes necessary to pay a subordinate employee a basic salary of as much as Sh.200 a month, he has really ceased to belong to that category and should be absorbed into our E Scales with the opportunity of becoming pensionable; we, therefore, think that it will be sufficient if our subordinate employees' ranges rise to maxima of Sh.189 and Sh.198 a month for those provided with Government quarters and those not so provided respectively, giving, with the addition of cost of living allowance at 10%, total wage packets of Sh.207.90 and Sh.217.80 a month respectively.

Proposed basic salary ranges for the Subordinate Service

135. Based on these considerations, our suggested salary ranges for subordinate employees, except in Zanzibar, are as follows:-

Without quarters: Sh.69(75.90) x 3 - 93 x 4.50 - 120 x 6
- 144 x 9 - 198(217.80) a month

With " Sh.60(66) x 3 - 84 x 4.50 - 111 x 6
- 135 x 9 - 189(207.90) a month

Treatment of ranges for purposes of superannuation

136. We would add that, where an employee is on the lower "with quarters" range, he should, for purposes of superannuation benefits, be deemed to be on the corresponding point on the higher "without quarters" range, since, presumably, his eligibility for free quarters will not continue to exist after retirement. Further, any such employee who, at any time during his career ceases to enjoy the privilege of free quarters, should be

/automatically

automatically transferred to the corresponding point on the higher range and vice versa.

Treatment of ranges for purposes of rent
or housing allowance

137. It also follows from our general approach to this problem that, where an employee is in receipt of a rent allowance designed to cover the full rent of accommodation, this rent allowance should be added to a salary on the inferior range but that, in order to prevent his being worse off than his fellow employee with no quarters or rent allowance who is paid on the higher range, there must be a proviso that his total remuneration should not be less than it would have been if he had been paid on the higher range. The effect of this will be, if our recommendations are accepted, that no rent allowance will be payable unless it exceeds Sh.9.90 a month; but that, if such a rent allowance exceeding Sh.9.90 is paid, e.g. in Nairobi, it should be added to salary on the lower range but will not, of course, carry any cost of living allowance.

Segmenting of proposed ranges

138. It is perhaps as well, before leaving the question of the remuneration of subordinate employees in other than the more expensive (and generally urban) areas, to restate what we have already stated in paragraph 122 at the beginning of this Chapter, i.e. that our suggested ranges are not intended to be scales up which all employees would travel from the minimum to the maximum. They are intended only to be patterns into which the administrations will, at their discretion, fit the various grades of subordinate employee as regards both their minima and their maxima. We would, nevertheless, suggest for the consideration of the administrations that the segmenting of the ranges which will result from this process should be far simpler than the present structure, e.g. in Uganda; in our view, not more than four or possibly five segments should be required, the segments being linked together for various grades, where necessary, as we have done with our A, B, C and E Scales. Further, in order to secure uniformity between the territories, we would suggest that the segmenting of the ranges should be agreed between the Establishment Officers of the various territories in order that the same segments may exist in each. It would also be desirable, in our view, that the allocation of segments to, at least, the larger and more commonly used grades of subordinate employees should be agreed among the Establishment branches in order that a general level of uniformity may exist in the rates of remuneration paid in the various territories.

Treatment of urban and other special areas, if any

139. We now come to the areas in which the cost of living is especially high for this type of employee. Examples which we have particularly in mind are the urban areas of Nairobi, Mombasa, Dar es Salaam and Kampala; but the Governments may, if they adopt it, wish to extend the remedy, which we suggest and which we term a "local allowance", to other urban areas, and also to some non-urban areas if the circumstances warrant that course.

/140. Shortly after

140. Shortly after our arrival in East Africa we became impressed with the obvious fact that a fully urbanised minor employee at the lower levels, who has to purchase his food in an urban area, must find life for himself and his family far more difficult than his fellow in an outstation, most of whose food is grown either by himself or his family on his holding. We emphasise this because inability to supplement wages by the growing of a large proportion of the food required by the employee and his family has been throughout the basis of our thinking in evolving our proposals for a local allowance. These proposals, therefore, do not form any ground for claiming a specially increased cost of living allowance for Government employees generally who work in urban areas, nor do they affect any rent allowance which the Governments may think it equitable to pay to enable employees in certain areas to find accommodation for themselves.

141. While the problem is obvious, the remedy is not nearly so clear, since many, but by no means all, workers in urban areas at this level actually still live or keep their families in the rural areas and can, therefore, produce much of the food required. To attempt to secure precise justice, therefore, it would be necessary for the administrations to enquire into the domestic circumstances of all the subordinate employees working in the areas to which we have referred in order to discover whether they were, in the full sense, urbanised or not. We think that it will be agreed that this is impracticable, for, apart from the enormous labour involved and, no doubt, the reluctance of persons to have their domestic circumstances too closely enquired into, the circumstances of individuals are continually changing. The process of investigation would, therefore, be continuous and never-ending. In view of this, we see no solution except to make the allowance at the rates we recommend payable to all employees who fall within the salary levels concerned, and whose place of work is within any area in respect of which the Government may direct that the local allowance is payable, e.g. the city of Nairobi. This necessity has, however, forced us to compromise in regard to the amount of the allowance which we recommend, with the result that, while it will, we hope, meet the essential needs of the lower paid subordinate employees living in these areas, it is not so high as we should have recommended had we been dealing with a completely urbanised population.

The Carpenter Committee in Kenya

142. While we were in East Africa a Committee on African wages and conditions of employment was appointed in Kenya under the chairmanship of Mr. F.W. Carpenter, the Labour Commissioner. We have not, at the time of writing, seen the Report of the Committee, but have had the advantage of studying a summary of its proposals. The Committee dealt with statutory minimum wages in urban areas; and, as we have already stated, since we are dealing with regular and permanent employees of Government, we think that the lowest point of their salary range should be substantially above what may be calculated on a minimum wage formula. The Committee's conclusion was, however, that "the calculation of the minimum wage on the basis of our proposed formula, and using the prices ruling in Nairobi at December, 1953, gives a figure of Sh.69 per month, while a housing allowance based on the average economic rent of a bed-space in the Nairobi African locations would be of the order of Sh.12 per month". We are not, at the moment, concerned with the housing allowance; but as regards the minimum wage the Committee went on to recommend that their new minimum wage formula

/should be introduced

should be introduced with effect from 1st January, 1955, a flat increase of Sh.10 a month being meanwhile given on all existing minimum wage rates. We understand that these proposals have been approved by the Legislative Council of Kenya. We have, therefore, felt justified in taking a minimum wage of Sh.69 a month as the floor on which to construct our proposals for the payment of local allowance. Casual employees of the Government in Kenya are, at present, paid the minimum wage plus Sh.3 a month for the first three months of their employment, and, thereafter, are subject to a further increase of Sh.5 a month, bringing their wages to Sh.8 a month over the minimum wage. This addition would bring the total monthly wage of casual employees to Sh.77, but, in our view, the commencing salary for employees regularly and permanently employed in the urban areas should be somewhat more than this.

The minimum of the scale of proposed
local allowances

143. What the addition should be is, no doubt, a matter of opinion; but, at present, when the minimum wage is Sh.52.50 a month, the bottom of Segment IV, which is, in effect, the bottom segment of the Kenya Minor Employees' scale in use in urban areas, is, with cost of living allowance, Sh.64. If the same proportion is applied to the new minimum wage of Sh.69 the result is Sh.84.10. Under our proposals, cost of living allowance is also payable on the local allowance in order that, should there be any substantial rise or fall in price levels, the local allowance can be adjusted along with salary. We, therefore, propose a total of salary and local allowance of Sh.76 at the bottom of the subordinate employees' range. This, with cost of living allowance at 10%, will amount to Sh.83.60, which is as near as we can conveniently come to the figure of Sh.84.10 mentioned above.

144. Since this calculation has taken no account of house allowance, and since the lowest point of our subordinate employees' "with quarters" range is Sh.60 a month, we have recommended Sh.16 a month as the local allowance to be paid at this point. With the Sh.12 house allowance recommended by the Carpenter Committee, the total wage packet will be Sh.95.60 a month at the bottom of the range.

145. These arguments apply, of course, only to Kenya, but, from the enquiries that we have made, we doubt whether there is any substantial difference in the cost of living for Government employees at this level in the urban areas of the four territories which fall within our purview, and conversations with senior Government officers have confirmed that remuneration of this order for regular and permanent employees in urban areas is not unreasonable.

The maximum of the scale of proposed local allowance
and proposals for tapering etc.

146. So far as the maximum of the scale of local allowance is concerned, we consider that it should have ceased to be payable by the time that basic salary reaches Sh.150 a month, i.e. £90 per annum at the bottom of our E6 Scale. If, therefore, our assumption that it should amount to Sh.16 a month at the minimum of our subordinate services range is correct, the problem that remains is merely to taper it down as basic salary increases. We consider that it should fall by 50 cents for every Sh.3 increment in basic salary, by Sh.1 for every Sh.4.50 increment in basic salary and by Sh.1.50 for every Sh.6 increment in basic salary. It is clearly not necessary to provide for local

/allowance

allowance below the minimum salary of Sh.60 since, if our recommendations are accepted, salary will only be paid below that level in areas where the cost of living is too cheap to justify that salary.

Proposals for the remuneration of the
Subordinate Service in tabular form.

147. In tabulated form, therefore, our proposals for the ranges of remuneration of subordinate employees are as follows:-

<u>Basic without</u> <u>quarters</u> <u>Sh. Cts.</u> <u>per month</u>	<u>Basic with</u> <u>quarters</u> <u>Sh. Cts.</u> <u>per month</u>	<u>Local allowance</u> <u>Sh. Cts.</u> <u>per month</u>	<u>Total without</u> <u>quarters</u> <u>Sh. Cts.</u> <u>per month</u>	<u>Total with</u> <u>quarters</u> <u>Sh. Cts.</u> <u>per month</u>
69 (75.90)	60 (66)	16	85 (93.50)	76 (83.60)
72	63	15.50	87.50	78.50
75	66	15	90	81
78	69	14.50	92.50	83.50
81	72	14	95	86
84	75	13.50	97.50	88.50
87	78	13	100	91
90	81	12.50	102.50	93.50
93	84	12	105	96
97.50	88.50	11	108.50	99.50
102	93	10	112	103
106.50	97.50	9	115.50	106.50
111	102	8	119	110
115.50	106.50	7	122.50	113.50
120	111	6	126	117
126	117	4.50	130.50	121.50
132	123	3	135	126
138	129	1.50	139.50	130.50
144	135	-	144	135
153	144	-	153	144
162	153	-	162	153
171	162	-	171	162
180	171	-	180	171
189	180	-	189	180
198 (217.80)	189 (207.90)	-	198 (217.80)	189 (207.90)

148. We repeat that it is our intention that the local allowance should carry cost of living allowance at the same rate as salary, and that the same rate of local allowance should apply to the corresponding points on the "with quarters" salary range and the "without quarters" range.

149. As we have already stated, we recommend that local allowance should be paid to Subordinate employees whose place of work is in Nairobi, Mombasa, Dar es Salaam and Kampala. Our knowledge of the East African territories is insufficient to enable us to judge whether it should be applied in other areas and we must leave this question for the Governments to decide. It would be feasible, if it were so desired, to apply it at half-rates in towns where the problems of urbanisation are felt less acutely than in the towns which we have mentioned, but we must leave it to the administrations concerned to judge whether such fine distinctions are justifiable.

Application of proposals to the
Zanzibar Protectorate

150. Zanzibar represents a peculiar problem in that, while this allowance should, in our view, certainly be paid in respect of Zanzibar town by comparison with the mainland towns to which we have referred, the cost of living in Pemba is probably, if anything, slightly higher than in Zanzibar itself. We have, therefore, prepared twin salary ranges for subordinate employees in Zanzibar which represent our basic ranges and the local allowance added together, and we recommend that these ranges be employed over the whole of the Zanzibar Protectorate.

The Zanzibar ranges on this basis are as follows:-

(1) Without Quarters:

Sh.85(93.50) x 2.50 - 105 x 3.50 - 126 x 4.50 - 144 x 9
- 198(217.80) a month

(2) With free Quarters:

Sh.76(83.60) x 2.50 - 96 x 3.50 - 117 x 4.50 - 135 x 9
- 189(207.90) a month

Abolition of existing allowances at this level

151. If our proposals in this Chapter and elsewhere for increased remuneration are adopted, we recommend that all other special allowances to cover the cost of food, e.g. the Tanganyika maize allowance of Sh.5 a month paid to Government employees in Dar es Salaam drawing less than Sh.120 a month in basic salary, should be withdrawn from grades of employees covered by our proposals.

Local allowance not to apply to uniformed staff
of Police, Prisons and Customs

152. We also recommend that local allowance should not be paid to uniformed ranks of the Police, Prisons and Customs Departments. In any case, the minimum of the salary scales which we recommend for these grades are such that they hardly come within the scope of our table in paragraph 147.

Conversion of existing employees to proposed ranges

153. It is not possible to make detailed recommendations regarding the conversion of employees in the Government service to the new ranges since we do not know how our ranges, if adopted, will be segmented. But we recommend that the same basic principles for conversion as are outlined in Chapter XXVIII of this Report, and which we ourselves have adopted in preparing conversion tables for the higher grades of the service, should be applied. Conversion should first of all be made to our "with quarters" range and then, if neither quarters nor a rent allowance exceeding Sh.9.90 a month are provided for them, employees should be transferred to the corresponding point on our "without quarters" scale.

CHAPTER XTHE CLERICAL AND ANALOGOUS SERVICESThe present salary scales

154. The Services comprised in this Chapter are those classified under Division II in paragraph 25 in Chapter III. The present salary scales are as follows:-

KENYA

<u>Male</u>	-	<u>A</u>
Scale A Special	-	£740(999)x£20-£800(1080)
Scale A I	-	£580(783)x£20-£680(EB)x£20-£720(972)
Scale A II	-	£295(398)x£22.10s-£407.10s(EB)x£22.10s-£565(762)

<u>Female</u>	-	
Scale A Special	-	£560(756)x£15-£650(877)
Scale A I	-	£480(648)x£15-£540(729)
Scale A II	-	£295(398)x£15-£370(EB)x£15-£460(621)

<u>Learner</u>	-	£150(210): £175: £200(272)
----------------	---	----------------------------

<u>Male</u>	-	<u>B</u>
Scale B Special	-	£450(608)x£20-£550(743)
Scale B I	-	£390(527)x£15-£450(608)
Scale B II	-	£180(247)x£10-£240(EB)x£15-£315(EB) x£15-£375(506)

<u>Learner</u>	-	£100(149): £125: £150(210)
----------------	---	----------------------------

<u>Female</u>	-	Four-fifths of the above scales.
---------------	---	----------------------------------

<u>Male</u>	-	<u>C</u>
Scale C Special	-	£276(372)x£12-£348(470)
Scale C I	-	£154(215)x£6-£178x£9-£187(EB)x£9-£223 (EB)x£9-£268(362)+
Scale C II	-	£100(149)x£6-£136(EB)x£6-£172(237)
Scale C III	-	£72(115)x£3-£87(EB)x£3-£105(155)
Scale C IV	-	£48(77)x£3-£60(EB)x£3-£72(115)
		+ Maximum of certain posts is limited to £223(301)
<u>Female</u>	-	Four-fifths of the above scales.

HIGH COMMISSION

The scales follow the Kenya pattern in general.

Note. Both Kenya and the High Commission have a further scale £575(776)x25-700(945) which is ordinarily filled by promotion from the clerical ranks.

/Tanganyika

TANGANYIKAJunior Service Salary Scales

Superscale - £550(743)x20-630(851)

Executive Division

Special Grade - £450(608)x20-550(743)
 Grade A - £390(527)x15-450(608)(PB)
 Grade B - £255(344)x15-330(EB)x15-375(506)(PB)

General Division

Grade I - £180(243)x10-£240(PB)x10-270(365)
 Grade II - £100(135)x6-136(EB)x8-144x9-171-(231)(PB)
 Grade III - £60(81)x3-87(EB)x3-96(130)(PB)

UGANDALocal Civil ServiceSpecial Division:-

Special Grade - £740(999)x20-800(1080)
 Grade I - £580(783)x20-720(972)
 Grade II - £295(398)x22.10s-565(762)

Professional Division:-

Special Grade. - £420(567)x15-450(608)
 Grade I - £315(425)x15-405 546)(PB)
 Grade II - £190(257)x10-240(EB)x12-300(405)(PB)

General and Clerical Divisions:-

Superscale - £600(810)
 Special Class - £450(608)x20-550(743)
 Executive Class -
 Grade A - £390(527)x15-450(608)
 Grade B - £255(344)x15-330(EB)x15-375(506)(PB)
 General Class -
 Grade I - £180(243)x10-240(324)(PB)
 Grade II - £100(135)x6-136(EB)x8-144x9-171(231)(PB)
 Grade III - £60(81)x3-75(EB)x3-87(EB)x3-96(130)(PB)

ZANZIBAR

Senior Time Scale - £120(162)x10-190x12-238(EB)x12-334(449)(346:358:370(496))
 Junior Time Scale - £60(81)x3-96(EB): 106x6-160(216)
 Certain higher posts - £360(483)x15-405(EB)x15-450(600)

/Comments

Comments on the present Scales

155. In view of our recommendations later in this Chapter there are some comments to be made on the present scales:-

- (a) The differences as between administrations in the rates of cost of living allowance paid in some of these grades are explained in paragraphs 108 and 109 of Chapter VIII.
- (b) The division of the clerical scales in Kenya and the High Commission into A, B & C follows the pattern proposed in the recommendations of the 1947-48 Commission, and is, therefore, mainly racial. To give one illustration, the entry points for the possessor of a School Certificate are £295(398) in Scale A, £180(247) in Scale B and £100(149) in Scale C.
- (c) As already mentioned, these scales provide the salary basis not only of the clerical grades but also of the many non-clerical grades comprised in the term "analogous". The segmenting of the scales occasionally varies; for instance, Kenya has a scale £255-450 which is used for non-clerical posts in several departments. Uganda uses the distinctive titles "Clerical" and "General" for the one scale to mark the distinction, and also has a "Professional" Division which is applied to certain grades, all of which are non-clerical.
- (d) Establishments are regulated in the grades by varying methods. In Kenya there is a common establishment for the C IV and CIII clerical grades, progress from the former to the latter being permitted at any time on passing an examination; the numbers in C II in each department are limited to 25% of the total graded clerical establishment in the C division in each department; and C I contains a specified number of posts which is determined according to the needs of each department from time to time. The numbers in B I and A I are limited to 25% of the total graded clerical establishment in each of these divisions in the service as a whole, and the superior grades consist of a specified number of posts. In Tanganyika and Uganda movement from grade to grade in the clerical services is generally subject to the passing of promotional and grading examinations, and establishments, to some extent, are fluid being regulated by the examination system and the current needs of the service as a whole.
- (e) The superior grades in the scales, such as the £575(776)-700(945) grade in Kenya and the High Commission and the superscale posts in Tanganyika and Uganda, have mostly come into being as accretions to the main scales designed to

/offer

offer extra rewards to seniors of special merit, and, to that extent, were devised as a compromise between pay for the post and pay for the man rather than as a planned avenue of promotion for clerical officers into grades of higher salary and responsibility which already existed above the clerical structure.

Basis of the new scales

156. The problem with which we have been confronted is that of devising a new and uniform pattern of salary scales which is likely to meet the requirements of all administrations, while, at the same time, complying with the expressed desire of the Government of Kenya to remove the present racial differentiation from the clerical structure. With these requirements in view, and bearing in mind the general principles put forward in Chapter VII, we recommend that the following scales be adopted:-

E. SCALES

<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>
E6 £90(99)x6-120(132)	£90(99) x 6 - 120(132)
E5 £132(145)x6-156(172)	£126(139)x6-156(172)
E4 £162(178)x9-180x12- 228(251)	£162(178)x9-180x12- 228(251)
E3 £252(277)x12-300x18-318 (350)	£240(264)x12-300(330)
E2 £336(370)x18-390(429)	£318(350)x18-390(429)
E1 £408(449)x18-480(528)	£408(449)x18-480(528)

Explanatory notes on the new scales

Range covered by the new scales

157. It will be seen that in gross emoluments the new scales recommended above do not fully cover the existing grades set out in the opening paragraph of this Chapter. They are, in fact, intended to be in substitution for the present clerical and analogous ranges subject to the following lower and upper limits:-

<u>Lower</u>	<u>Upper</u>
Kenya C IV -£48(77)	£375(506) i.e. maximum of B.II
High Commission C4 - £48(77)	£375(506) i.e. maximum of B.3.
Tanganyika Grade III-£60(81)	£375(506) i.e. maximum of Executive Grade B.
Uganda Grade III-£60(81)	£375(506) i.e. maximum of Executive Grade B.
Zanzibar Junior Time Scale - £60(81)	£334(449) or extension to £370(496) i.e. maximum of Senior Time Scale.

/158. The

158. The reason for this upper limit of £480 is that, in our opinion, the salary range of the main body of the clerical service should not extend beyond that figure; and even in the two top segments of the E Scale there should be a definite swing over from the conception of employment in a grade to that of employment in specific posts. Our proposals for the posts at present included in the clerical range, to which we think a salary of more than £480 should be assigned, will be found in the next Chapter of this Report. They have been placed there because we hold that these posts fall properly into Division III rather than Division II of the classification of the service adopted in Chapter III. The dividing line is not an easy one to draw, and the next Chapter contains proposals for a good deal of examination and regrading of posts; it should not, therefore, be assumed at this point that every post now carrying a salary of £375 or less will find its ultimate place in the E Scales, or every post carrying a salary of more than £375 in a higher scale. Subject to that proviso, however, we are dealing in this Chapter with what we regard as the Clerical Service proper, i.e. a service the pay of which should range from £90(99) to £480(528).

Duties of the new grades

159. We have recommended in paragraph 48(ii) that "grading by race rather than by responsibility should disappear". Grading by responsibility of duties is particularly important where clerical duties are concerned. We were struck when in East Africa, and particularly in Kenya, by the number of senior clerks drawing relatively high salaries but performing minor duties. Such an arrangement is, of course, very costly in view of the fact that a high proportion of clerical work in Government services tends to be of a routine and minor character. Moreover, it is to the interest both of Government and of the officer himself that a senior officer should be employed on the higher duties proper to his experience and ability. It is also essential to an efficient service that officers whose ability does not enable them properly to discharge the higher duties should receive only the pay proper to the duties which they are able to perform. We therefore recommend:-

- (i) that the segment E6-5 be used for minor clerical work such as the simpler forms of registry work, checking or preparation of straightforward documents, simpler correspondence of the stock letter and printed form type under well-defined general instructions, simple arithmetical calculations with or without the use of adding machines and the operation of office machinery where appropriate. We anticipate that with experience many officers recruited into this segment will show themselves fit to perform the duties proper to the next higher grade and will be promoted accordingly, but we

/hold

hold strongly that it should be an essential condition of advancement beyond the segment E6-5 that the individual shall have shown himself fit for the duties in the higher grade.

(ii) For the grade E4-3 we recommend a salary adequate for the performance of more important clerical work, such as the collection of material on which judgments can be formed, the check and preparation of straightforward accounts, claims, returns and statistics in prescribed forms, the treatment of particular cases in accordance with well-defined regulations or instructions, and the supervision of the work of the grade E6-5.

(iii) It should be a condition of promotion into segments E2 or E2-1 that the individual has shown himself fit to perform the duties. In the case of Zanzibar, where the existing scale structure has been retained, we have placed the bar to ensure that this test can be applied. As already indicated in paragraph above, it is here that the conception of employment in a specific post as distinct from a grade comes into effect. We deal in the next Chapter in some detail with the duties of the E2-1 grade and the superior clerical grade above it.

Entry points according to educational standards

160. The range of the salary structure with which we are dealing here is a wide one, and entry points into the present scales are fixed by the standard of education reached at the time of first appointment. In the mainland territories the entry points are also influenced by schemes of departmental training, in which candidates may be trained for periods of up to three years before they are appointed to a grade. It is clear that this system must continue, and we have considered how it should apply to the new scales.

161. The cardinal point is the point of entry for the holder of a School Certificate. At present this varies from one administration to another. In Kenya and the High Commission, as already mentioned, the points are at £100(149) on CII, £150(247) on BII, and £295(398) on AII. In Tanganyika the point is at £136(184) and in Uganda at £100(135), but in the latter case there is a regrading examination after two years which brings the successful candidate up to £144(194) or possibly higher. In Zanzibar, a School Certificate holder would normally enter the Senior Time Scale at a salary of £140(189). After discussion with the administrations we recommend that a uniform entry point of £180(198) in the Scale E4 should be adopted, with the modification that in Uganda, the point should be £162 with retention of the present grading examination after two years; on passing this the successful candidate will rise to £204 and thus come to

/the

the same level as his colleagues in the other administrations.

162. The other entry points which we recommend on the E Scales are set out in the table in Appendix . It will be seen that, as a general rule, below Standard XII one standard of school education is valued at three increments; success in a departmental training scheme is valued at two increments for each year.

Regulation of establishments in the grades

163. We recommend that, in the Clerical Service, E6 and E5 should be a combined establishment, subject to the passing of a bar at £120, the top of E6. The way should also be open to progress from E5 to E4 provided that the bar at £156 is passed, and administrations should regulate their direct intake (of School Certificate holders) into E4 in such a way as to ensure that efficient clerks who have come up through E6 and E5 do not stagnate at the top of the latter grade. E4 and E3 should also be a combined establishment, subject to the passing of the bar at £226, the top of E4.

164. The establishments in grades E2 and E1 (or in the combined grade E2-1 where used) should be regulated primarily by the number of posts which it is necessary to have, but, at the same time, it must be ensured that stagnation of efficient clerks does not become a permanent occurrence at the top of E3, and the structure should be so arranged as to avoid this. We shall revert in the next Chapter to the particular functions which we envisage should be performed by members of the E2 and E1 grades.

Prospects in the new structure

165. The length of the scales from E6 to the top of E3 is twenty-five years, and the efficient clerk who joins the service with an educational standard below School Certificate should thus see a reasonable prospect of reaching £318(350) and possibly beyond. The School Certificate entrant at £180 should be able to hope to reach the top of E1 at £480(528) in twenty years, with the additional incentive of selection in relatively early years for the Training Grade, if of outstanding promise, or of selection for direct promotion later in his service to a post in the C Scales dealt with in the next Chapter. In both cases progress will be dependent on success in passing bars which should be of the effective type recommended by us in paragraph 86 of Chapter VII.

166. Comparisons with figures in the preceding paragraph may be given in respect of the existing scales. An entrant to the Kenya and High Commission CIV scale at £43(77) may take twenty years to reach the top of CIII at £105(155), and allowing for the overlap, another twelve years to reach the top of CII at £172(237). The School Certificate entrant on CII at £100(149) takes twenty-four years, allowing for the overlap, to reach the top of CI at £268(362). The entrant to Grade III in Tanganyika or Uganda at £60(81) may take twenty-four years to reach the top of Grade II at £171(231) and another seven years to reach the top

/of Grade I

Grade I at £240(324). The School Certificate entrant at £136(184) in Tanganyika takes twenty-one years to reach the top of Executive Division B at £375(506); in Uganda, assuming entry at £100 and a jump to £144 after the regrading examination, the period is twenty-two years.

167. It will be noted that the School Certificate entrant on the B Scale in Kenya and the High Commission at £180(247) at present reaches the top of BII at £375(506) in sixteen years, as compared with the period of twenty years for the future entrant to our new scales. This is due to our having had to strike a mean between the present B and C structure in Kenya which can, at the same time, be applied conveniently to the other territories. But, as we have already implied, what School Certificate entrants into the clerical and analogous grades really need is, in our opinion, not a marked increase in present pay for clerical work but a substantial opening of avenues to higher posts, and it is this which it has been our object to provide for those who have the ability to take advantage of these opportunities.

Application of the E Scales
to the analogous grades

168. We have been discussing hitherto the application of the new scales mainly to the clerical grades, though much of what we have said applies in general terms to the analogous grades as well. We have remarked earlier that the highest awards for the Clerical Services in the past have taken the form of superscale or "prize" additions to the top of the clerical structure rather than of avenues of promotion into the grades next above it, with the result that the Clerical Service remains a separate entity. Our recommendations are designed to substitute for this a number of avenues into the higher grades of the public service.

169. But it is very important not to upset the balance of attraction of the clerical as compared with the analogous services. We hold strongly that pay and prospects should be at least as good, if not better, in the latter; but if this is not ensured the tide of recruitment will set towards the clerical. For this reason alone the grading of the analogous services will require review against the new clerical structure, if adopted. There is another equally cogent reason for this review; in administrations where racial differentiation now exists in the salary structure it is as apparent in the analogous as in the clerical scales.

170. The analogous grades are very varied, and differ widely in comparative numbers as well as in the nature of their duties. It is, therefore, not possible to suggest one common method of treating them in order to forestall the contingencies pointed out in the preceding paragraph; but we can, at least, give some indication of alternative possibilities. In the first place, where the analogous grade is in the nature of a blind alley, or one in which

the member must normally expect to spend his whole career, it ought to offer prospects within itself which bear comparison with those of the Clerical Service if it is recruited from the same field. A notable instance is the grade of Medical Assistant, from which there is unlikely to be an outlet except by the acquisition of a professional or technical qualification.

171. In the case of other analogous grades, however, there are superior grades above them in the same service to which there can be an avenue of promotion, given the necessary ability backed by training; major examples are the grades of Forest Ranger, Agricultural Instructor and Veterinary Assistant. In such grades also the possibility should exist within the grade of a career comparable with that which the Clerical Services can offer, but, in addition, each grade should be examined with a view to instituting a Training Grade, or, alternatively, some less ambitious form of training scheme if it does not exist already.

172. We think that, in these ways, the administrations should find it practicable to ensure that the balance is fairly held between one analogous grade and another, with due regard to the value of the work done, and between the analogous grades as a whole and the clerical grades. We should make it clear that, in this as in other cases where we suggest a re-examination of grading, the new scales which we have assigned in the meantime to the present grades are a reflection of things as we find them, and not our opinion of things as they should be.

173. We are very conscious that the amount of examination and regrading in the clerical and analogous grades which we are recommending will constitute an involved and lengthy process. But it will be appreciated that the extent to which we, as a Commission, can lay down and recommend new grading is very limited; such a decision must emerge from a close evaluation of one branch of the service as compared with another, which requires both time and local knowledge. We do, however, advise that the regrading of the analogous services should follow the pattern of scales laid down for the clerical structure; that is to say, each analogous service should be graded into the appropriate segmenting of the E Scales, and where the value of the work done warrants it, the most senior posts in the service concerned should fall into the lowest segments of the C Scales in general accord with the process suggested in the following Chapter for the superior clerical posts. This does not, of course, imply that every analogous service must have some superior grades in the C Scale, or necessarily in the top segment of the E Scale; the regrading must be governed by the size and importance of the particular service, the value of the work done and, above all, by the paramount importance of ensuring that the attractions of the service enable it to hold its own in the common recruitment field with the clerical and other branches of the public service as a whole.

/174. In

174. In connection with the regrading of the analogous services, we invite particular attention to what is said in paragraph 195 of the next Chapter of this Report on the need for uniformity between administrations in regrading and in the titles of posts.

The use of examinations
at bars in the scales

175. It is the practice in some administrations to use a written examination as a means of testing eligibility to pass over a bar, particularly in the Clerical Service. We have received a number of representations on the nature of these examinations, the burden of them being that a man of some years' service should not be expected to "go back to school". We venture to suggest that these representations are not altogether without substance, in that some of the papers (e.g. on general knowledge) tend to take the form of an intellectual "quiz". The object of such a test, as we see it, is the practical one of making sure that the candidate has the knowledge and ability to undertake the greater responsibilities which would fall on him on promotion. Where this involves a test of fluency in written or verbal English, or ability in arithmetic, we suggest that this can be effected by a written test (together with an interview by a sympathetic board) which eschews the kind of questioning which may be in place on a school text-book or in a broadcast programme but is liable to be disconcerting to a candidate brought up in a different environment and often working in an acquired language. Without accepting the allegation of one head of department that an efficient clerk failed to obtain promotion because he happened to know nothing about "The Mill on the Floss", we suggest that where an examination is associated with the test at a bar, the practical object should be kept closely in view.

CHAPTER XI.THE EXECUTIVE AND TECHNICAL SERVICESComments on the present scales

176. The Services with which we deal in this Chapter are those comprised in Division III of the classification in Chapter III of this Report. In functions they cover a very diversified field in the public services; in numbers they exceed the administrative and professional grades. The comparative figures in each territory will be found in paragraph 36, we should explain that those figures include the superior posts in the clerical and analogous services which, in our opinion, belong also to this division and consideration of which has been carried forward to this Chapter (see paragraphs 158 and 173 of the preceding Chapter). We shall return to these posts later in the Chapter; in the meantime there are some general comments to be made on the present salary structure in this division.

177. While the present salary scales in this division of the public services vary considerably, it is true to say that they conform to a common pattern in that, although the starting and finishing points of the individual scales differ, the arrangement of the incremental rates is nearly always the same. All but a few of the scales are segments of the following pattern:-

£550(743) x 20 - 690 x 25 - 840 x 30 - 960 x 40 - 1000(1350)

178. It is important to note that, although this pattern is inferior to that of the administrative and professional services, the starting point of £550 (or the occasional variant £570) is, in the majority of cases, the same in both cases. Among the exceptions is a small group in Division III in which the entry points are £530, £510 or £490: there is also a group in which points between £630 and £690 are used, but in these grades some previous experience is generally a condition of appointment. The reason for this common use of a starting point of £550 or thereabouts for this division as well as the administrative and professional division above it is, presumably, that the 1947-48 Commission regarded the two divisions as being alike in one respect - at the time they reported, recruitment to both was largely from external sources. The difference in status between the two divisions was reflected partly in the incremental rates of the scales, and partly in different terminal points.

179. Of these terminal points in Division III there is a bewildering range. The shortest scale which we have found is £570-670. There are others running from £550 or £570 to £690, £715, £790, £840, £900 and £930. For Health Inspectors the scale runs from £570 to £1000. Assistant Superintendents and Superintendents of Prisons have a unique scale from £550 to £1025; and the scale of Senior Game Ranger, and of Superintendent of Agriculture or Principal Field Officer (which are grades superior to Game Ranger and Field Officer (Agriculture) respectively) extends to £1085 or £1140.

The New Pattern of C Scales

180. In devising a new pattern to fit this variety of requirements, together with those we have added, we have had to bear in mind that, while the development of secondary and technical education is opening these grades to all races, the need for recruitment from overseas still continues. It is at this point, therefore, that the inducement principle must appear in the revised salary structure. The

new pattern which we propose is:-

C 6	£498(548) x 18 - 516(568)
C 5	£540(594) x 24 - 636(700)
C 4	£714(785) x 30 - 804(884)
C 3	£834(917) x 30 - 924(1016)
C 2	£954(1049) x 30 - 984 x 36 - 1092(1201)
C 1	£1128(1241) x 48 - 1320(1432)

The inducement additions to these scales will be found in Appendix

Comments on the new pattern

181. There is a major difference in structure between the old and the new patterns. If, as we think, circumstances no longer require that the starting points of salary scales in this part of the service should be kept the same as those in the administrative and professional classes, there are good reasons why there should be a proper interval between them. Where entry into the service in either case follows closely on completion of education or acquisition of the qualifications required, the administrative or professional officer is likely to come in at a later age because his education or professional training takes longer to complete. Secondly, his qualifications command generally a higher market value. Thirdly, his status in the public service is higher, and this should be marked by a distinction in salary from the outset rather than by a quicker rise from the same starting level. It is for these reasons that we recommend that the C Scales should start in most cases from £540 as compared with £630 for the administrative and professional scale.

182. But we suggest that, at the same time, the position at the other end of the respective scales requires review. It is not equitable that the qualifications which have determined an officer's salary on first entry into the service should continue throughout his career to place limits on his progress without regard to subsequent factors, such as acquired experience and proved ability. The executive and technical grades work as part of a team with the administrative and professional grades. We believe that it would help to ensure harmony and mutual respect, as well as being a fair recognition of merit, if the former could see ahead of them, provided that they obtain promotion, rewards comparable to those reached by the latter at the top of their long scale. With this consideration in mind, the Scale C pattern recommended above is so designed that on reaching £1128, the initial point of C 1, it becomes identical with the administrative and professional Scale A and rises to the same maximum at £1320.

183. We must emphasise at this point that there is no suggestion that every person serving on a C Scale should reach £1320 maximum, provided that he passes the bars. The C Scale is a broken scale, and the top segment is only attached to a post where the post is considered to be worth that salary. Nor is it for us to suggest the creation of any defined number of posts in the top range of the C Scales, as we are not, by our terms of reference, a structure Commission. Our recommendation is that, if an administration is satisfied that such posts are required in any particular service, the salary attached to them should be identical with the final segment of the administrative and professional long scale.

184. There is one implication in this recommendation which may be of practical advantage. The question whether a man who does not possess the full professional qualification may be promoted from a

C type scale into the professional scale is often debated. In services where the qualification is prescribed by law or regulation (e.g. doctors, law officers or veterinary surgeons), the answer is clearly negative; but, in respect of services such as Agriculture and Forestry, opinions can and do differ. Our recommendation provides a way of evading this controversy. A Field Officer (Agriculture) or Forester of outstanding ability and experience can be promoted to a post in the top C Scale segment of his own grade, in which he will receive the same pay as his professional colleague and may, in fact, be doing very much the same work. The sanctity of the professional grade will thus be preserved, and, given the major solace of equal pay, he is not likely to be greatly troubled by the question of status. Even in services where the professional qualification is prescribed by law or regulation a top segment C scale post of a higher technical or executive type may exist alongside the professional grade without any violation of principle.

185. One further point has to be made in this context. As we have said, the officer serving in a C Scale can only hope to reach a post in the top segment, where it exists or is created, by way of promotion from grade to grade up the scale. He will also take longer, even given an uninterrupted run, to reach the starting pay of that post, i.e. £1128, than his professional colleague takes to reach the same point on the professional Scale A. The respective periods are nineteen years (from £540) and fourteen years. We think that this fairly reflects, in present conditions, the distinction which should be drawn between the two parts of the service.

Application of the new pattern

186. The details of the application of the new pattern to existing grades will be found in the relevant Appendices to this Report. We have worked on the general principles set out in paragraphs 76-79 above in the discussion of the merits of long and broken scales, and, in consequence, there is a wide variation in length of scales allotted and in linkage of segments. In a few cases (e.g. gazetted Prisons Officers, Health Inspectors, Pharmacists), the long scale C5-2 with bars is used; the use of three linked segments is fairly common. Where closer valuation is thought necessary, two segments, or even one, are employed; but, in these cases, we have satisfied ourselves that a chain of promotion from grade to grade exists or can be built up by the administrations to preserve the efficient officer from the frustrations of stagnation in a blind alley appointment after a few years.

187. We have also taken the opportunity to get rid of the small and irritating differences in starting and terminal points of scales which exist at present, both between one administration and another and between grades in the same administration. In our opinion, distinctions in grading such as £550 or £570 in starting points and £690 and £715 in terminal points are over-fine and out of place in the East African public services at this stage of development, and breed friction and a tendency on the part of the officer to be constantly looking round for other appointments with better prospects. We have also co-ordinated the scales of certain important grades common to several administrations (e.g. Field Officers (Agriculture), Foresters, Livestock Officers), which are, at present, out of alignment. This would, in any case, have been necessary under that part of our terms of reference which requires the removal of anomalies, but the administrations have strengthened our hand by their general request to us to propound a common pattern for such grades.

/The superior posts
188.

The superior posts in the present clerical structure

188. We must return, at this point, to those superior posts in the clerical structure consideration of which was deferred in paragraph of the preceding Chapter. It would be well, in the first place, to consider the present structure in this part of the United Kingdom Civil Service. An authoritative definition of the Executive Class in that service is given in the following quotation:-

"268. The structure of the class is difficult to summarise. The two top grades are almost exclusively employed on specialised work in accounts, supply contracts, finance and technical branches, though a small number of what are known as "executive assistant secretaries" (on the principal executive officer scale of £1600 - £2000) are found, particularly in regional organisations. These posts are thought suitable where there is insufficient policy content in the job to warrant administrative class grading. Chief executive officers and senior executive officers are used on a variety of duties. They may be found within the pyramid of an accounting or financial structure. Alternatively, they may be employed in administrative divisions working to assistant secretaries. It is not always possible to draw a clear-cut distinction between policy work and executive work, so that in many cases jobs are done by chief and senior executive officers which are of the same broad level of responsibility as that of principals. Chief executive officers and senior executive officers are also found in local or regional offices being used in a managerial capacity. Lastly, they are found giving assistance (say as office managers) to professionally qualified staff in specialised branches of the service. The higher executive officer is in the same way a general purpose agent, but in administrative divisions his task will be to give support to principals or chief executive officers - more rarely to senior executive officers. The executive officer is similarly employed at the base of the pyramid on all work indicated above and in addition on the supervision of clerical staff." (a)

This definition holds good only in respect of the period since 1947, when a reorganisation came into effect. The position before then was as follows:-

"275. At that time headquarter offices of Government Departments were not, for the most part, staffed on a uniform basis as at present with members of administrative, executive "

/and clerical

-
- (a) Royal Commission on the Civil Service, 1953 - Introductory Factual Memorandum on the Civil Service dated 15th December, 1953. Submitted by H.M. Treasury. (H.M.S.O., 1954)

"and clerical classes. Some Departments employed executive staff alone, others administrative and clerical and others again administrative, executive and clerical. The clerical structure above the clerical officer grade consisted at that time, not as at present merely of higher clerical officers (see Chapter 20), but of the following so-called super-clerical grades -

Higher clerical officer.
Staff officer.
Senior staff officer.
Principal or chief staff officer.

It was thought that this structure, parallel to that of the executive class, should not be perpetuated but that it should be merged with the upper executive pattern. At the same time the executive class was to be introduced on a far wider scale than pre-war and employed in Departments where it had not been used before and on work of a kind that would previously have been regarded as administrative or clerical. The features of the reorganisation were as follows:-

- (i) The higher clerical officer grade was reduced substantially in numbers and retained only for work of a purely supervisory type. The rest of the work assigned to higher clerical officers, including small and medium scale supervision combined with a measure of individual work, was allotted to executive officers.
- (ii) The higher executive officer and the staff officer grade were completely merged both in salary scale and duties, the title of the combined grade being higher executive officer.
- (iii) The senior staff officer grade was abolished, most of the posts being upgraded to senior executive officer and the rest translated to higher executive with an allowance.
- (iv) All higher posts in the old clerical hierarchy were merged with their nearest convenient executive analogue.
- (v) Certain administrative posts were regraded as senior executive officer or chief executive officer." (a)

189. We turn now to the present structure of the East African Administrations as we have found it. Generally speaking, there does not exist in East Africa the closely graded structure which, in the United Kingdom, fills the gap between the Clerical Service and the administrative or "policy" grades. The Clerical Services, as pointed out in paragraph , have spread upwards on no defined

pattern.

- (a) Royal Commission on the Civil Service, 1953 - Introductory Factual Memorandum on the Civil Service dated 15th December, 1953. Submitted by H.M. Treasury. (H.L.S.C., 1954.)

pattern, and there exists also a miscellany of posts of the Office Superintendent or departmental Accountant type on salary scales in the £550-900 range. That this is costly there is no doubt. Whether it makes for efficiency is another question. The obvious dangers are that these highly-paid clerical officers may remain, after promotion, on duties which are not really consonant with their salaries; and that the officers in the £550-900 range may, on the other hand, be doing work which could be done equally well and at less cost by men whose ability and training has brought them up from the lower clerical ranks. Above all is the need for a properly graded organisation, with assignment of responsibilities, which will remove from the busy and expensive professional and administrative officers the burden of detailed executive work which is their bane at present. We do not accept the inevitability of the existing state of affairs in present conditions. The time has come, in our opinion, to lay out the new framework and train the men for it.

190. It follows that, if this view is accepted, the mainland administrations will be obliged to undertake a detailed examination and regrading of a wide band of posts in this part of the service with the aim of devising a properly graded organisation. Such a regrading can only proceed if the definition of standards to which the grading terms should work is sufficiently clear. Our advice on this is that the grading should proceed on lines which will, in the long run, admit of flexibility of functions equal to that which has existed in the United Kingdom since the reorganisation of 1947. In the meantime, however, we think that the definitions should be even more flexible than that, as there is a limit to the amount of reorganisation that the East African services can digest at one time. The effect of this, as we see it, will be that the office grades to which the C Scale is attached will contain, not only the true executive posts, but also a certain number of superior clerical posts which, while they may contain some element of the individual work characteristic of the executive grade, are, to a major extent, clerical supervisory posts which are, at any rate for the present, too important to be graded in the top segments of the E Scale. We envisage that such posts would include those now known as Office Superintendent or Assistant Office Superintendent, Office Assistant, Registry Superintendent and the lesser financial posts such as Book-keeper, Cashier, Examiner of Accounts, or Revenue Officer. Where such posts represent the culmination of a clerical career the use of the segment C6-5 may be convenient. The posts should bear individual titles, and not merely the title of "clerk"; if a grade name is thought necessary the term "Staff Officer" can be used. We do not think that, in general, the United Kingdom nomenclature for the executive class should be introduced at this stage; to do so might be an obstacle to preserving the flexibility which should be the present objective.

191. We said in paragraph 158 of this Chapter that, even in the two top segments of the E Scale, there should be a definite swing over from the conception of employment in a grade to that of employment in specific posts. The same flexibility must apply here also. The work of posts in the segments E2 and E1 will, no doubt, be mainly of a superior clerical or supervisory nature, but may properly include also certain individual duties which verge on executive duties as defined above but are not sufficiently responsible to warrant the C Scale. In practice, it would be found that posts in the E1 grade might be occupied either by clerks

/promoted from

promoted from below or, from time to time, by men in the Training Grade (of which the salary scale is identical) who were doing the work as part of their practical training to qualify for appointment to Scales C or B.

192. The general result of the regrading, as we envisage it, would be that the larger the office the greater the number of C Scale posts of the kind discussed above. In a small district or departmental office, a chief clerk, in the upper part of the E Scale, may be the highest post that is necessary; in Secretariats or major departmental or provincial headquarters, there may be an Administrative Secretary or Assistant at the head with a number of subordinates on the C range charged with responsibility for defined blocks of work, such as establishments, finance and so on, together with an Office Superintendent in control of the clerical and subordinate personnel. This is, however, no more than a general picture; detailed recommendations on the organisation must be left to the grading team in each case. In the relevant Appendices to this Report, therefore, it will be seen that every such post on a present salary of more than £375 has been marked "Regrade" though, as already said, this does not imply that posts now on a salary below £375 will not come within the orbit of the regrading process.

193. Two questions arise from all this; what salary is to be assigned to present holders of the posts pending the completion of the regrading, and what happens in cases where the new grade assigned to a post carries a salary or prospects less than are enjoyed by the present holder. We deal with both questions in the subsequent Chapter on "Conversion Arrangements".

Superior posts in the present analogous structure

194. In the section of Chapter X contained in paragraphs 159 and 169 to 174, we have already anticipated, to some extent, the application of the general principles of regrading set out above to the structure of the analogous services. It is not necessary to repeat what has already been said there, except to emphasise once again our opinion that in regrading those parts of the analogous services concerned it is of primary importance to ensure that pay and prospects must be at least as good as those in the Clerical Services.

Uniformity in regrading and in titles of posts

195. There are two final points on which we wish to lay particular emphasis in regard to the examination and regrading of posts which we have recommended. These two points apply equally to the clerical and the analogous grades. They are:-

- (i) Even though each administration may be regrading in accordance with the uniform structure proposed by us, it is possible that, in the absence of consultation between administrations, the same kind of post might be assigned a markedly different valuation as between one administration and another. We have already remarked in paragraph 44 on the difficulties which result from this, especially to the High Commission,

/and on the expressed desire

and on the expressed desire of the mainland administrations for a general pattern of uniformity. We recommend, therefore, that the respective Establishment branches should keep in close consultation with each other while the regrading is in process in order to prevent any striking discrepancies of this kind from appearing in the final result.

- (ii) We advise that particular attention should be paid to a proper gradation of titles during the regrading. As is pointed out elsewhere in this Report, some titles (e.g. Draughtsman and Mechanic) are at present used without distinction in some places over a very wide range in the grade. In a properly constructed grade, differentiation in functions, and, therefore, in salary, should be paralleled by differentiation in the titles of the successive ranks, such as, for example, "Mechanical Supervisor" and "Mechanic", or "Mechanic Grade I" and "Mechanic Grade II". Here again we recommend that the Establishment branches should keep in close consultation, in order that the necessary changes in nomenclature may follow a generally uniform pattern. If this is not done, discrepancies may result which will, in future, become the basis of claims based on nomenclature which have no justification on the ground of comparative functions.

Stenographers and secretaries

196. The present grading of stenographers and secretaries varies between the administrations. In the lower ranges it is the practice, in some administrations, to pay an allowance in addition to grade salary to members of the Clerical Service who have acquired a prescribed qualification in shorthand and typing. Personal or confidential secretaries are, as a rule, paid in Kenya and the High Commission on the Clerical A Scales, though, in a few cases, a salary of four-fifths of £570-840 per annum is attached to a post of this type. In Tanganyika and Uganda there is a special stenographers' scale of £370(500) x 15 - 490: 510 x 15 - 540(729), extended in Tanganyika to £600(810).

197. The efficiency and proper staffing of this part of the service is essential to the speedy conduct of Government business, and we feel that there are good grounds for recommending that the administrations should adopt, as a pattern for the future, a graded structure which offers adequate pay and prospects to its members. Considerations of market value strongly influence the salary which will attract a stenographer, and it would clearly be useless for the public services to offer terms which are markedly inferior to those which commerce and industry are ready to offer. But, at the same time, if the public services adopt a structure in which competence and experience are rewarded by good prospects and pensionability, it should be possible to avoid having to offer unduly high pay at the outset; and this latter expedient can then be kept in reserve, and applied only to employees engaged on temporary terms, instead of being used as freely as it is at present in some cases.

198. In putting forward a suggested structure we have assumed that the grades will be staffed mainly by women, but we have included the male equivalents of the salary scales proposed. The foundation of the structure should, in our opinion, be a "pool" of stenographers distributed through the departments, and maintained at a level adequate for their general requirements. On the assumption that an entrant will be of educational standard not less than the School Certificate, we recommend that the entry point should be the starting pay of Scale E3, i.e. £240(264) for women or £252(277) for men, and that the scale should extend to the top of E2. Payment of this salary should be subject to two conditions: that the entrant holds a prescribed stenographer's qualification (on which we suggest that the administrations should jointly agree), and that he or she is appointed specifically to the pool. It does not seem necessary to pay this rate to any member of the Clerical Service who has or acquires the qualification; the deciding factor is whether or not he is required to join the establishment of the pool. Proficiency in typing alone is a different matter and may, where necessary, be laid down as a condition of passing a bar in the Clerical Service generally.

199. On appointment to the pool, stenographers should rank as members of the Clerical Service as long as they remain in the pool grade E3-2; to ensure flexible use of staff, it is necessary that their duties should not be regarded as confined to stenography alone. At the same time, there should be no question of entry into this grade becoming a means of obtaining a flying start in the Clerical Service proper by subsequent reversion to general clerical duties. Further, in view of the enhanced entry point on the clerical scales recommended for the pool stenographers, we see no need, after the pool has been established, for continuing any practice of paying shorthand allowances which may exist at present.

200. We suggest that above the pool there should be three grades distinct from the Clerical Service as follows:-

Women

Stenographer-Secretary	£408(449) x 18 - 516(568) (E1 & C(W)6)
Personal Secretary Grade II	£540(594) x 24 - 684 x 30 - 744(818) (C(W)5-4)
Personal Secretary Grade I	£660(726) x 24 - 684 x 30 - 864(950) (C(W)4-3).

Men

Stenographer-Secretary	£408(449) x 18 - 516(568) (E1 & C6).
Personal Secretary Grade II	£540(594) x 24 - 636: 714 x 30 - 804(884) (C5-4).
Personal Secretary Grade I	£714(785) x 30 - 924(1016) (C4-3)

201. There should be a recognised channel of promotion from the pool into these grades, and the administrations should also retain the right to make direct appointments to the higher grades where necessary. The distinction between the grades is that a stenographer-secretary may work to one or more departmental officers; a personal secretary would work only to one officer, generally of superscale rank. The grade of personal secretary requires something more than high proficiency in stenography; a good level of

/intelligence

intelligence and understanding of the department's activities is called for, and in many of the posts the element of security also enters. It is these requirements, and not consideration of race, which should determine placing and advancement in the grades.

202. We have suggested that the salary of the secretary-stenographer grade should be a combination of E1 and C6, partly for the reason that the five years of E1 may not be long enough to avoid stagnation in this grade.

203. Adoption of the salary scales which we have proposed above will involve the administrations in an examination of the present stenography posts, and their regrading into the appropriate grade of the new structure, by the same kind of process as we have already suggested for the super clerical posts

Salary scale of the Training Grade

204. The salary scale which we recommend for the Training Grade is the D Scale, £408(449) x 18 - 480(528), which is identical with the salary recommended for the grade E1. This seems to us the appropriate pay for a trainee who will be appointed, if successful, to a post in C or B Scales. It also has the practical advantage pointed out in paragraph 191 above, that a member of the grade may serve in a post to which the Scale E1 is assigned as part of his practical training. The reason for giving two different designations to one scale is that it may be convenient in the printed Estimates or Establishment Lists to see at a glance to which of the two grades the individual belongs.

The points of entry into C Scales

Use of the C6 segment

205. It will be seen that we have provided a short segment, £498 x 18 - 516, numbered C6. This provides a link with regular increments between the top of the E1 Scales at £480 and the starting point of C5 at £540, which is necessary in connection with several of our recommendations. In the present connection we suggest that, where a post which is mainly of a superior clerical machine is graded as C, the scale used should be a combination of C6 and C5, i.e. £498 - 636.

Entrants from the Training Grades

206. The reasons for recommending the creation of Training Grades have been given in Chapter VI, and further details of the proposal will be found in Chapter XXI - (Training). An officer passing successfully out of this Training Grade should be appointed on the starting salary of the grade to which he is posted.

Entrants from Makerere College

207. We are concerned here only with the "diploma" courses in agriculture (5 years) and veterinary science (6 years) at Makerere. The course in medicine and the teacher training course will be dealt with in the Chapters on Medical (Chapter XV) and Education (Chapter XIV) in their relationship to other grades in those departments.

208. Briefly, the course of events relating to entrants from Makerere appears to be as follows. With the development of these courses the administrations devised special scales to accommodate those who joined the Government service after qualifying. These scales were:-

Kenya.

Scale M Special	- £420(567) x 15 - 450(608)
Scale M I	- £315(425) x 15 - 405(546)
Scale M II	£190(259) x 10 - 240 (EB) x 12 - 300(405)

Uganda

Professional Division

Special Grade	- £420(561) x 15 - 450(608)
Grade I	- £315(425) x 15 - 405(546) (PB)
Grade II	- £190(257) x 10 - 240(EB) x 12 - 300(405)(PB)

Zanzibar

Scale 38	- £226(305) x 12 - 310(EB) x 12 - 370(PB): 430 x 20 - 550(730)
----------	---

Tanganyika used the grades of its General and Executive Division of the Junior Service equivalent to the Kenya and Uganda scales above.

209. Subsequently, in order to attract Makerere-qualified candidates into the service, enhanced entry points on these scales were fixed. At present the holder of an Agriculture Diploma enters as an Assistant Agricultural Officer or Assistant Soil Conservation Officer at £276(372) in Kenya and Uganda, and £285(385) in Tanganyika. The points for the holder of the Veterinary Diploma, who enters as an Assistant Veterinary Officer, are £288(389) for Kenya and Uganda and £285(385) for Tanganyika.

210. It is clear that these valuations of Makerere qualifications stand in need of further revision. Even granted that the first two years of the Agricultural and Veterinary courses are taken up by higher studies intended to improve the general level of education, the salary offered to Makerere entrants after qualification compares very unfavourably with that offered to Agricultural Field Officers or Veterinary Livestock Officers on first appointment (we refer to the £550 - 840 or £900 grades). We have, therefore, assigned C Scales to the grades of Assistant Agricultural Officer, Assistant Soil Conservation Officer and Assistant Veterinary Officer, and Makerere-qualified entrants will come in at the basic starting point, i.e. £540(594), in the former two grades, and one point higher, i.e. £564(620) in the latter grade in view of the extra length of the course. This represents a considerable increase over present grading, but we think that it is justified.

Entrants from other training institutions

211. The Public Works Department Engineering School in Uganda maintains a five year course for Africans who are subsequently eligible for appointment as Engineering Assistants (in Tanganyika, Technical Assistants). A five-year course is also given at the Survey Training School in Uganda. We understand that places are found in these courses for nominees of administrations other than Uganda. Courses of similar status in various subjects, i.e. based on previous secondary education up to School Certificate standard, exist or are in course of establishment in other territories.

212. The evaluation of candidates trained at Makerere and other institutions must, of course, be subject to periodical review as Makerere itself and these other institutions develop. In the light of conditions existing at the time of this Report, we think it would be right to assign to the Makerere qualifications discussed in the preceding paragraphs a slight superiority over others. We are, therefore, recommending that the starting point of Engineering Assistants and the parallel grade in the Survey Departments should, for the present, be at £498 in Scales C6, this scale being linked with C5 to form the bottom segment of the grade.

213. The Muljibhai Madhvani Commercial College in Uganda maintains a three-year course in accountancy and a two-year course in stenography or palantyping. We suggest that a candidate who has passed the accountancy course should be regarded as eligible for admission direct to the appropriate Training Grade, if vacancies exist, and that some allowance by way of enhanced entry point might be given in recognition of the time spent on the course. The evaluation of the stenography course depends on the standard of efficiency which the administrations lay down for general entry into the pool stenographers' grade (see paragraphs 198 and 199 above); if there is no significant difference between the two in the standard of proficiency, the successful candidate from the College would be offered the general entry point.

The Assistant District Officer class

214. There has come into existence in Kenya a grade of Assistant District Officer on the scale £190(259): 190 x 10 - 240 x 12 - 300 x 15 - 450(608). In Tanganyika there is a similar grade called Administrative Assistant, which is paid on the Executive Division, Junior Service scale. In the treatment of this grade, much depends on whether it is the intention of the Governments that an intermediate administrative grade of this sort should become a permanent feature of the Provincial Administration, as is the case in some other Colonial territories; and, if so, whether preference will be given to direct entrants of high educational and other qualifications or to experienced and able members of lower grades. We are informed that present members of the grade belong mostly to the latter category. Even so, the present salary is too low for officers who have administrative status, restricted though it may be. In present circumstances we recommend that entry to this class of post should be through the Training Grade, and that the salary scale of the post would be C5-4.

Entrants on salary fixed by market value.

215. We have given our views on this method of entry in paragraph of this Report. It may add further clarification if we draw attention also at this point to the opinion expressed in paragraph later in the Report that the conceptions of fixing salary by market value and of adding increments to the starting point of a scale for previous experience should be kept distinct. Recruitment at market value can only work satisfactorily if the Public Service Commission has full discretion to advise whether the salary to be offered bears a correct relation to the earning power of potential candidates in other employment at the time, after giving proper weight to pensionability, housing and other factors relating to employment in the public service.

General effect of recommendations in present structure

216. We pause at this point to summarise the general effect of the recommendations in this Chapter on the present structure of the public services in the various administrations.

217. In accordance with our terms of reference as subsequently enlarged by the policy decisions or announcements to which we have referred in Chapter II, it has been our aim to produce a non-racial structure extending from the E6 grade at £90(99), comprising the clerical and "office" executive classes, and extending through the C Scale into its highest segments. Parallel with this will be a similar structure for the present "analogous" grades and the higher technical and executive grades which lie above them. Throughout these two parallel structures, our endeavour has been to ensure that there are ladders of promotion which will enable a zealous and efficient public servant to climb as far as those qualities will take him from the point at which his initial qualifications brought him in.

218. If these recommendations are accepted, the effect in Kenya and the High Commission will be that the present A, Band C Divisions of the Clerical Service will disappear. In Tanganyika, the present overlap of the Junior Service and Senior Service Scales will be fused into one graded structure. The structure of the present Local Civil Service in Uganda will also be affected, the existence as separate entities of the Special and Professional Divisions being no longer necessary. In Zanzibar, the present multiplicity of scales will be greatly reduced, and His Highness's Zanzibar Service will no longer have salary scales attached to it.

219. We think it likely that the mainland administrations may wish to take the opportunity of deciding whether, concurrently with the adoption of these recommendations, they should not discard altogether this separation of their Services by nomenclature into divisions, and substitute for it one all-embracing name of Kenya Civil Service, High Commission Civil Service, Tanganyika Civil Service and Uganda Civil Service. The racial implications of the present Kenya and High Commission divisions need no emphasis. In Tanganyika also, the evidence which we received left a strong impression that the differentiation into Senior and Junior Service has come to be resented and to be in danger of having a racial basis imputed to it. Harmony within a public service owes much to the feeling of individuals that they are members of one united body. If this spirit is to be as strong in the humblest as in the most distinguished members, no good purpose can be served by retaining

/dividing lines

dividing lines which no longer have a meaning in the organisation.

220. Finally, we venture to offer one comment in regard to the present policy of the Government of Uganda (adopted in October, 1951), of debarring Asians from admission to permanent and pensionable status in the lower and middle grades of the public service. We are very glad to know that the Government is likely to reconsider this decision. To maintain the bar would seem to be out of harmony with the acceptance of a form of organisation which rests on the principle of equality of opportunity in due proportion for people of all races who are born or have made their permanent home in Uganda.

CHAPTER XIITHE ADMINISTRATIVE AND PROFESSIONAL SERVICESThe present scales

221. The services to which this Chapter refers are those for which the qualifications are laid down by the Secretary of State for the Colonial territories generally, and appointment to which rested until the 1st October, 1953 (see paragraph 61) solely in the Secretary of State's hands.

222. The present salary scales for these services follow a common pattern throughout East Africa:-

£550(743): 550: 620x35-760: 830x35-1005x45-1320(1670)

In the Medical Service alone this scale is further extended by increments of £45 to £1590(1940).

223. As a general rule this pattern is applied as a long scale with efficiency bars of the current type. There are, however, some services in which, although the professional salary pattern is applied, the scale is a broken one. It is with these services that we must deal first.

Services with broken scales

224. The principal services in this category are:-

Accountants (Treasury)

Accountants £550(743)-1050(1400)

Senior Accountants £1095(1435)-1230(1580)

Audit

Auditors & Assistant Auditors £550(743)-1050(1400)

Senior Auditors £1095(1435)-1230(1580)

East African Customs & Excise

Collectors £550(743)-1050(1400)

Senior Collectors £1095(1435)-1230(1580)

It should be noted in passing that there is a unique scale for gazetted Police Officers; though it has the same overall pattern of £550-£1320 the increments are inferior at some points, with the result that the length of the scale is twenty-two years as compared with twenty years in the general pattern.

225. It seems to us that the services listed above, including the Police, have been differentiated from the professional services for a twofold reason. The view may have been taken that the qualifications for entry are not quite of the same level or clear definition as those to whom the full scale is paid; it may also have been held that the officers

/in these

in these services are not, in fact, professional on appointment, but only reach a standard which may be regarded as professional by virtue of experience in the service.

226. If these premises are accepted-and we agree with them - we suggest that the gist of the argument in paragraph 181 above, in respect of the C Scale services, holds good here also. It seems to us wrong in principle that the services which we are now discussing should start level with the professional services proper and have the distinction between the one class and the other marked by a differentiation towards the top of the scale. The logical arrangement is that they should start lower, and be able to look forward to reaching the same level later on, when they have reached, by ability and experience, a status which most people would accept as professional. We have been led by these considerations to advocate that there should be an intermediate salary scale between the C pattern and the scale for the administrative and professional services proper.

The new B Scale

227. We recommend, therefore, that the following scale should be adopted:-

<u>MEN</u>	<u>WOMEN</u>
B5 £588(647)x24-684(752)	B5 £588(647)x24-684(752)
B4 £762(838)x30-852(937)	B4 £708(779)x24-732x30-792(871)
B3 £882(970)x30-912x36-984 (1082)	B3 £822(904)x30-912(1003).
B2 £1020(1122)x36-1128(1241)	B2 £948(1043)x36-1128(1241)
B1 £1176(1294)x48-1320(1452)	B1 £1176(1294)x48-1320(1452).

The inducement additions to these scales will be found in Appendix

Inclusion of other services in the B Scale

228. There are certain other services to which in some administrations the full professional scale is at present attached, which would, in our opinion, be placed more fittingly in the B Scale. The senior grades in Community Development or Social Development and Welfare Departments, and in Co-operative Departments, are staffed partly by officers of the Administrative Service and partly by direct recruitment. Where an officer of the Administrative Service is so employed (and we understand that the administrations would use them more freely for this purpose, as is the practice in other Colonies, if the staffing position in the Administrative Service permitted), he should draw the salary of his own service. But where direct recruitment is employed, we think that for these grades the B Scale is the appropriate one. In Labour Departments officers of the Administrative Service may also be employed, and the same rule should apply; but here also there may be direct recruitment to the grades, sometimes of candidates who have had previous
/experience

experience elsewhere in the field of trade union activities, and here again we recommend that the B Scale should apply. There are also some posts of Administrative Secretary in major departments, and of Assistant Secretaries or Establishment Officers in Secretariats, which should fall into the B Scale. We regard the work of these posts as being essentially in the superior executive category as defined in the United Kingdom (see paragraph 268). But in these higher ranges we think that their duties contain some of the "policy" element, and, therefore, approach near enough to the administrative grades to justify their being placed on the B Scale. The segmentation should be agreed between the administrations. These considerations do not, however, apply to the very small number of posts involved in Zanzibar, and we have assigned the C Scale to them.

229. The rule that an officer of the Administrative Service should continue to draw the salary of his own service even when serving in a B Scale post should hold good, even when the salary of the B grade happens to be higher than his own substantive salary. Only if he is permanently transferred to the B Scale grade and leaves the Administrative Service should he draw a B Scale salary.

Relative position of the Administrative Service

230. One criticism of these proposals may be anticipated at this point. It may be asked why the same arguments in favour of assigning the B Scale should not apply to the Administrative Service, whose members also come into the service without an absolute professional standard and learn their profession by experience. The answer is that the Administrative Service occupies a position and bears responsibility of its own. At no time have those responsibilities been heavier or more searching than at present. In the Provincial Administration, the Provincial or District Commissioner is the head of a team, and if the order and good government for which he is responsible breaks down, the activities of most departments other than the Police are likely to be interrupted. Moreover, both in the field and in the Secretariats and Members' offices, the role of the Administrative Officer is becoming more difficult in that advisory and guiding functions are replacing direct administration. It is disturbing to see that recruitment for the Administrative Service is at present more difficult than for almost any other service, whereas it should be in a position to attract the best of the material offering from the Universities. These present difficulties are not improved if the Administrative Service has to endure competition from other branches of the Service in the non-specialist market on level terms.

/ Application

Application of the B Scale

231. Although the B Scale is expressed in five segments, the object is not to impose a close segmenting throughout all the services concerned, but rather to retain the means of grading particular posts closely if it should at any time be thought desirable. We have borne in mind that many of the grades to which the scale is applied now enjoy the benefit of the greater part of a long scale, and should continue to do so. The grading which we have most commonly recommended is, therefore:-

Assistant Officer	-	B5
Officer	-	B4-2
Senior Officer	-	B1

We recommend that where this grading is employed the Assistant Officer and Officer grades should have a combined establishment, the former changing his title on successfully passing the bar at the end of the fifth year. The establishment in the B1 grade of this Scale should be a separate one, regulated according to the needs of the service and the reasonable expectations of officers in the grade. A full list of the B Scales recommended, with our suggestions for the placing of the bars, will be found in the Appendices.

232. It will be seen that, like the C Scale, the B Scale coincides with the proposed administrative and professional Scale A from the point £1128 to the maximum at £1320. This point is reached after seventeen years' service on the B Scale as compared with nineteen years on Scale C and fourteen years on Scale A.

Women Administrative Assistants

233. The salary attached to this grade at present is £550(743): 550: 600x30-780(1053) in Tanganyika and the High Commission. This type of appointment is still, to some extent, experimental, and is found only in these two administrations at present. We regard the grade as being of the same status as a departmental Administrative Secretary or a Secretariat Assistant Secretary or Establishment Officer, to both of whom the B grade has been assigned. We have, therefore, recommended that the posts should be graded in the appropriate segments of the Scale B(W) 5-2; B(W)1 does not seem to be required at present. We assume that this grading will only be applied to a post the duties of which warrant the appointment of a Woman Administrative Assistant as distinct from a Personal Secretary.

The present administrative and professional long scale

234. The length of the present scale from £550(743) to £1320(1670) is twenty years, with a jump of one increment at the eighth year from £760 to £830. As applied to the Administrative Service, however, the scale

is now two years shorter, for the reason that an additional jump of two increments from £900 to £1005 was introduced for this service alone in 1949, with retrospective effect. The length of the present scale is, therefore, eighteen years for the Administrative Service and twenty years for the professional services; on the other hand, entrants to many of the latter services come in at points higher than £550.

The proposed new Scale A

235. The new scale which we recommend is:-

A3 £630(693) x 30 - 750(825).
 A2 £810(891) x 36 - 918x42-1128(1241).
 A1 £1176(1294)x48-1320(1452).

The inducement additions to this scale are set out in Appendix . Though expressed in three segments, this is a long scale. We suggest that the bars should be placed at the top of A3 and A2. Discussion of the questions of entry points for various professions, and of the grant of incremental credits for experience before appointment, will be found in Chapter XX. The length of the proposed scale is eighteen years for the Administrative and Professional Services alike.

Abolition of the Administrative jump

236. The adoption of this scale in the manner proposed by us will involve the disappearance of the jump from £900 to £1005 at the tenth year in the scale for Administrative Officers. The reasons for inserting this jump appear to have been as follows:-

(a) the efficient Administrative Officer becomes, after about ten years' service, a highly qualified specialist, and would be accepted as a professional were there any recognised standard of qualification for professional status in this case;

(b) in many of the professional services entrants come in at an enhanced entry point because of the later age at which the qualification is obtained, and maintain this lead over the Administrative Officer throughout the timescale;

(c) in a district, this may result in the District Commissioner being on a lower salary than professional officers of the same length of service, which is incompatible with his position as leader of the district team.

237. There is no doubt that the application of this jump to the Administrative Service as a whole is resented by the professional services, and we received many

representations on the point. Leaving the special case of the District Commissioner out of consideration for the moment, we have some doubts about the present arrangement. If a professional officer comes in at a higher starting point on the scale because of his age at qualification, it can be argued that this is counterbalanced by the shorter pensionable career to which, in the normal course, he can look forward. Nor do all the professionals benefit by higher starting points; Assistant Conservators of Forests and Surveyors come in at the bottom of the scale with Administrative Officers, and Agricultural Officers only one increment up. It could be claimed that the years of experience will have made them fully professional also; but they do not share in the benefit of the jump. Perhaps the strongest criticism of the arrangement arises from its practical effect in the case of District Commissioners themselves. The jump occurs after the tenth year in the scale, but we have found not uncommonly that, owing to the lull in recruitment during the late war, there are officers serving as District Commissioners whose salary falls several years short of the £900 point. The responsibility and expense are already with them, but the relief designed for them lies in the future.

238. As already stated, we have some comments and suggestions to offer later in this Report on the subject of enhanced starting points. Subject to that, our investigations have led to the conclusion there should be an eighteen year scale common to the Administrative and Professional Services.

Position of the District Commissioner

239. Nevertheless, the removal of the Administrative jump from the new scale leaves the difficulty of the District Commissioner unresolved. In accordance with evolution in the theory of district and provincial administration, the District Commissioner has become the head of a team of professional and executive officers. In earlier days the activities of these officers were devoted almost entirely to direct administration; now they tend more and more to take the form of assistance and guidance to newly-formed local government bodies. In this work the District Commissioner is, and must be, the leader, because the mainspring of these developments is political. The burden of special responsibility which this places on him needs no argument. But there is another aspect of his position; the social burden can be very heavy. It is virtually impossible to draw a line between a District Commissioner's public and private life, or to separate the hospitality offered in his house or camp into private and official. If the district is to run smoothly, he must be ready to meet all people at all times, which involves, in effect, keeping open house. This obligation is particularly heavy in places where little in the way of amenities is available to the visitor from outside. More than one Administrative Officer has told us that while he welcomes the opportunities of appointment to a district, he dreads the effect on his pocket. We are

/satisfied

satisfied that this burden is a serious one, and presses hard on the officer, however modest his standard of living.

240. We are averse to the extension of the system of entertainment allowances for the reason explained in paragraph of this Report; moreover we should not regard that as the right form of relief to recommend here, as it touches only a part of the problem. We have considered the possibility of districts being graded according to the weight of responsibilities; but this would probably involve grading the service also, and we accept the opinion of most of the officers whom we consulted that this would run into too many practical difficulties in present conditions. We recommend, therefore, that a scale of duty allowances should be applied to posts of District Commissioner. We suggest that the scale should provide for three different rates of allowances, and should be applied to each district according to the weight of official and social responsibility. On the principle that an officer's capacity to carry official responsibility increases as he moves towards the top of the scale, whereas the social burden remains constant, we recommend that the amount of the allowance under each of the rates should decrease to a stated minimum at £1320, the top of the new Scale A. The recommended maxima and minima are:-

<u>A Districts</u>	£240 - 96
<u>B Districts</u>	£180 - 72
<u>C Districts</u>	£120 - 48

We suggest that the principle of a ceiling should operate to fix the rates of allowance payable between the maxima and minima suggested; the ceiling would be £1320 plus the minimum in each case, i.e. £1416, £1392 and £1368 respectively. The allowances would thus be:-

<u>Substantive Salary</u>	<u>Rate of Allowance</u>		
	<u>A Districts</u>	<u>B Districts</u>	<u>C Districts</u>
£1176 or less	£240	£180	£120
£1224	£192	£168	£120
£1272	£144	£120	£ 96
£1320	£ 96	£ 72	£ 48

We further recommend:-

(i) that these allowances should be non-pensionable, should be paid only while the officer is officiating in the post, and should not carry any cost of living allowance;

(ii) that they should not be paid to any officer in charge of a district whose salary is above the maximum of the new Scale A.

/(iii)

(iii) that they may be attached, where considered necessary, to a post of District Officer as well as District Commissioner, but not ordinarily to any post of second-in-command. The criterion should be whether the post is one of isolated responsibility.

241. If these recommendations are accepted, it would be for the Government to allocate the appropriate scale to each district and to alter the classification of a district where changes in conditions make it necessary to do so. We have considered whether the adoption of these allowances would tilt the balance unduly in favour of District Commissioners as compared with Administrative Officers serving in other branches. An officer on the timescale serving in the Secretariat or other headquarters office is not in the same position of isolated responsibility as a District Commissioner; moreover, there are advantages that may accrue from serving close to the fountainhead of authority, and the chances of acting for periods in the superscale posts. In view of these considerations, and of the fact that the duty allowance will be in part a reimbursement of expenditure incurred by a District Commissioner rather than an addition to his income, we do not think that he will be unduly favoured as compared with his colleagues in other branches of the Administrative Service. Moreover, if the principle is followed that the individual should, as far as is practicable, have the opportunity of serving for periods in both fields until his particular bent is revealed (and we think it greatly to the benefit of the service that this should be the practice), there is no need to examine meticulously where the balance of advantage to the officer lies at any one time.

Position of Provincial Heads of professional departments

242. The volume of work of a professional department, and, in consequence, the numbers of its staff, differ considerably from province to province, being governed by such factors as area, physical conditions, density of human or animal population and the way of life of the people. In some provinces, where the intensity of the department's work warrants it, the post of provincial head carries superscale rank; but, except in these cases, the provincial head who is an officer on the timescale, as he generally is, has drawn hitherto no more than his substantive salary, except in Uganda. In that territory a system was introduced in 1952 whereby certain provincial heads in the Agricultural, Education, Forest, Public Works and Veterinary Departments were enabled to draw charge allowances while officiating in the posts, on two conditions; that they had not yet passed the promotion bar at £1140 on the present scale, and that they had held the post for a period of one year. The allowance was to be the difference between the officer's substantive salary and £1185, the minimum of the top segment of the present long scale.

/243. We

243. We concur with the Government of Uganda in thinking that there is good reason to interpose another gradation between superscale rank and substantive timescale pay for this provincial responsibility. As has been seen, we fully recognise the argument that as an officer climbs the timescale, so his capacity to undertake responsibilities should be expected to increase; but the weight of district charges varies as much on the professional as on the administrative side, and the Director of the department disposes his men to meet these differing needs according to their experience. The charge of a province is different, in that the provincial head may have a very wide responsibility and quite a numerous staff of officers of his own class under him. To assign superscale rank to the post in all such cases may well be unnecessarily costly. The temptation to claim it will be lessened if an intermediate gradation is adopted.

244. A distinction must be drawn between the basis of an allowance for provincial heads and that for District Commissioners. The former has more social obligations of an official nature than fall upon the ordinary timescale officer of his department, but they are likely to be of a restricted nature, as the main burden at a provincial headquarters falls on the Provincial Commissioner. By far the major justification lies in the fact that he is on a higher plane of responsibility than his fellow timescale officers, though some of them may be his seniors in service. It is right that a provincial headship should not invariably be a perquisite of seniority; but the position of authority which it confers should be marked in some tangible way.

245. We think that only one rate of allowance is necessary in this case, and that the appropriate allowance to recommend is the equivalent of our proposal for a B Class District, i.e. a maximum of £180 decreasing to £72 at the top of the timescale by the same steps as are recommended for the District Commissioner's allowance. We recommend that this should be payable while the officer is officiating in the post, and should not be withheld pending completion of a year's service, as is the case in the Uganda system at present. The allowance should be non-pensionable, and should not carry any cost of living allowance.

246. It must be made clear that we are not proposing the attachment of this allowance to every post of provincial head which is not of superscale grading. There are provincial posts, where the number of departmental staff is relatively small and the activities limited, in which timescale pay is an adequate remuneration. We envisage that the Government will decide on the posts which, though not equal to superscale rating, nevertheless carry a responsibility which should fairly be recognised in the manner proposed.

/247. There

247. There is one contingency for which provision must be made. It may happen that the provincial head is in a service which carries the B Scale, and the post may already be graded in an upper segment of that scale, e.g. a Provincial Labour Officer's post might be graded as B1. Where an officer whose substantive salary is in a lower grade of the B Scale acts in the post, he should not draw both acting pay and the provincial allowance; but he should be entitled to draw whichever of the two is the higher. An officer whose substantive salary is already in the B1 segment would draw the prescribed rate of provincial allowance.

The extension of the Medical Scale

248. It has already been noted that the professional scale, as applied to Medical Officers, extends by another six increments beyond £1320(1670) to £1590(1940). The reason for this extension, which was granted in a number of Colonial territories in 1950, lay in the difficulties then being experienced in recruiting Medical Officers. As the evidence given to us has shown, it provides a constant target of criticism, or ground for claiming similar treatment, among the other professional grades.

249. We do not think the time opportune to recommend that the extension should be discontinued for future entrants. But it should be remembered that it was dictated by considerations of market value. Any betterment of conditions which results from a general revision of salaries should not, therefore, be held necessarily to apply to the extension automatically and in the same relativity as at present. Our recommendation is that, if the new Scale A is accepted for general application, the extension should take the form of three biennial increments of £54 extending from the top of the new Scale A at £1320(1452) to a terminal point of £1482(1630). In other words, the officer should serve for two years on the £1320 point and then proceed by increments every second year to £1374(1511), £1428(1571) and £1482(1630). Our enquiries have led us to think that an extension in this form will continue to meet present requirements in the recruitment market; we revert to this point in paragraph of Chapter XV on the Medical Departments.

Application of the extension to other posts

250. There are, in some of the professional departments, posts of a specialist scientific nature which are outside the run of the general professional grade. To quote examples, we refer to such posts as Entomologist, Botanist, Mycologist, Chemist and Veterinary Research Officer. When officers in these posts reach the top of the timescale they are at a disadvantage, in that, as a rule, the superscale posts in the department are of an administrative or directing nature for which they may have neither the inclination nor the experience.

/They

They may, therefore, prefer to retire on pension at the earliest possible date in the expectation of finding other employment without difficulty. That this is to the detriment of the public service has been recognised in some administrations by the creation of "senior" posts of this category with minor superscale salary.

251. Where the officer promoted to such a post does not exercise any superintendence over the work of others, but merely continues in his own line of research or investigation, the designation is a misnomer; and, moreover, only one or two of the officers in the service as a whole can reach the superscale grade in this way. We suggest that it would be more fitting, and a greater incentive to the officers to remain longer in the service, if the extension of the A Scale from £1320 to £1482 by biennial increments as recommended above for Medical Officers were applied to them personally. The effect would be that such an officer, after serving for two years on £1320 and being certified in the usual way as fit to go higher in the scale, would be able to proceed by further increments every two years to £1482. This prospect of increased salary, with benefit to pension prospects, would act, not only as an alternative to abandoning specialist for administrative work on promotion, but as an incentive to remain in the service for a few more valuable years of work, if such promotion were not open to him.

252. We assume that where "senior" posts as described above are already in existence, they would be continued during the tenure of the present holders, and then abolished.

Restricted use of the A Scale

253. We think it will be clear from what has already been said in this Chapter that we hold strongly to the view that the application of the A Scale should be restricted to the Administrative Service, and to those services, members of which hold an established and prescribed professional qualification at the time of recruitment. Reference to paragraphs , on the subject of professional entry points, will indicate the services which we regard as falling within this category. If this view is accepted by the East African Administrations, and our recommendation in favour of a B Scale is also adopted, we suggest that the administrations should be on their guard against assigning the A Scale at any future date to individual recruits or new posts unless the qualifications required clearly merit it. In times of difficult recruitment, or when it is desired to secure a particular candidate, the temptation exists to make a post more attractive by upgrading it. It seems to us that enough elasticity is already allowed within a scale by the arrangements for assigning higher starting points, or granting increments for previous experience, (see Chapter). There may also be the alternative possibility of offering a contract appointment on special terms. But if the post is elevated to a grading higher

/than

is warranted by the qualifications demanded, claims will inevitably be evoked from other grades for the same treatment. The same considerations apply to the distinction between the B and C grades.

254. We are not, of course, suggesting that our assignment of the various services to the A, B and C grades should be regarded as permanent or sacrosanct. It may well happen that, because of a heightening or lowering of the qualifications for some branch of the service, the administrations may decide to move it upwards or downwards in the hierarchy of the public service. Our advice is that, if and when this is done, it should be a considered act of policy, and not an expedient to which the administration has been obliged to resort because of pressure resulting from special measures applied to individual cases.

Posts in the Colonial Research Service

255. There are, in some of the professional departments in East Africa, a number of research posts to which the salaries and conditions of the Colonial Research Service are attached. As these salaries and conditions of service are regulated centrally by the Colonial Office, we regard this Service as being outside the scope of our terms of reference, and we have, therefore, made no recommendations in regard to the salaries of such posts. We think it relevant, however, to record that we received frequent representations from officers of this Service holding appointments in East Africa, and from officers to whom membership of the Service has been offered. The gist of these representations was that, taken as a whole, the terms of employment applicable to members of the Service were less favourable than those enjoyed by their colleagues in East Africa who hold scientific or research posts which are not, at present, in the cadre of the Colonial Research Service. We have not investigated this claim, as we understand that the Colonial Research Service is being re-examined by a Working Party in the Colonial Office. But it will, no doubt, be borne in mind by the authorities concerned that, if the recommendations contained in this Report are adopted by the East African Administrations, the general level of emoluments of scientific and research officers who are not members of the Colonial Research Service will be thereby improved, and comparisons based on present emoluments will no longer hold good.

CHAPTER XIIINOTES ON CLASSES COMMON TO SEVERAL DEPARTMENTSAccountants

256. We have found that more than one salary scale is attached in the mainland administrations to posts bearing the title of Accountant, and we must, therefore, explain the difference as we understand it and the way in which we have dealt with it.

257. Accountants serving in the Treasury or Accountant General's Department are, in nearly all cases, on a common scale throughout the mainland administrations. The scale is £550(743) - £1050(1400), with a senior grade on £1095(1445) - £1230(1580). We have recommended the allocation of the B Scale to this grade in paragraph 227 of Chapter XII, and suggest that the grading should be that proposed in paragraph 231 i.e.:-

Assistant Accountant	- B5
Accountant	- B4-2
Senior Accountant	- B1

258. In Tanganyika and Uganda, it is the practice to post Accountants of the grade referred to in the preceding paragraph to certain of the more important departments. They remain members of the Accountant General's Department, are responsible to him and represent, in effect, an outpost of the Treasury in the department. Such accountants should, of course, be graded in the B Scale. In Kenya and the High Commission, however, there is a grade also known as Accountant, members of which are departmental officers responsible to the head of the department and are, as a rule, on the scale £670(904) - £900(1215); there is also an Assistant Accountant grade on £670(904) - £790(1066). We have not assigned the B Scales to these grades, because we are not satisfied that in status and functions they are on the same level as the Treasury Accountants; they seem to us in most cases to carry out executive financial work within the department, but not to exercise Treasury control under the orders of the Accountant General. We recommend that each post in those grades should be examined; and if its functions are limited to the extent which we have suggested, we are of opinion that they should be graded in the appropriate segments of the C Scale. At the same time, the designation of the posts should be altered; the title "Accountant" should be reserved for posts which qualify for the B Scale or above.

259. The posts of Chief Accountant, Public Works Department, are at present graded as follows:-

Kenya	- £1140(1490) - 1320(1670)
Tanganyika	- £1185(1535) - 1320(1670)
Uganda	- £1300(1650)

We are of opinion that, as the top segment of the B Scale has been assigned to the grade of Senior Accountant, and as these posts are of particular importance and responsibility, it would be right to place them in the lowest superscale range, i.e. £1740(1902) - 1860(2022). This will also increase the promotion prospects of the Accountant grade, which are at present rather limited.

260. We have considered the question whether an Accountant holding a full professional qualification should be entitled to the A Scale. For this purpose we regard the full qualification as one which requires the serving of a period of articles. As a general rule, accountancy work in the East African public services does not call for this qualification, though there may be some exceptions to the rule, particularly in the self-contained services of the High Commission. We recommend that each administration should decide in what posts, if any, this qualification is required. If an Accountant who is professional in the sense of our definition is recruited for, or appointed to, such a post, he should be paid on the A Scale; but an Accountant should not qualify for the A Scale solely by reason of the fact that he is fully qualified. The deciding factor should be the duties performed and not the qualifications held.

Draughtsmen

261. The title of "Draughtsman" is distributed at present over a wide variety of grades; the lowest minimum we have found is £72 and the highest maximum £1080 (Chief Draughtsman). There is clearly a wide differentiation in the status of posts which carry the same name.

262. We recommend that for the grade of Draughtsman proper the grading should be:-

Draughtsman	- C6-4
Senior Draughtsman	- C4-3
Chief Draughtsman	- C2

The overlap between the bottom and middle grades, and the lengths of eleven and eight years respectively, are thought to be necessary because the grades are numerically small and promotion is slow.

263. In Kenya, there are posts of Draughtsman in several departments on the present Clerical and Analogous B and C Scales:- £255 - 450, £450 - 550, £154 - 223 and £72 - 105. In Tanganyika, the Junior Service Executive and General Divisions Scales are used, and, in Uganda, the local Civil Service Special Class (£450-550) and the General Division. We recommend that all these posts should be examined and regraded, in accordance with their status and responsibilities, into the C grading above or into the E Scales, with the proviso that the title "Draughtsman" should, in future, be restricted to posts on the C Scale. Posts which are regraded into the E Scales should be given a different title, e.g. Junior Draughtsman, Draughting Assistant or Tracer, as may be appropriate. Appointments of which the present Scales extend beyond £375 are marked "Regrade" in the Appendices to this Report, and interim conversion should be onto the appropriate shadow scale.

Laboratory Technicians or Technologists

264. This grade occurs in several of the professional departments; in the Agricultural Department in Kenya, the title of "Laboratory Assistant" is used for it. The salary scales vary; in Kenya and the High Commission, the usual scale is £550-840, Tanganyika uses £570-840 or £550-790, and Uganda has adopted since January, 1952, the scale £570-1000.

265. It is clear that the present salaries, except perhaps in Uganda, are inadequate to ensure satisfactory recruitment, and the administrations are agreed that they should be raised. We recommend, therefore, that the new grading should be:-

Laboratory Technologist	- C5-3
Senior Laboratory Technologist	- C2

There should be a common establishment, with a bar between the two grades. For future entrants we recommend that there should be a bar at the top of C5, progress beyond which should be dependent on holding the Associateship of the Institute of Medical Laboratory Technology, and promotion to the senior grade should require the Fellowship of the Institute. For serving officers the former requirement should be waived, but not the latter. We recommend that the title "Technologist" should be adopted by all administrations for the grades.

266. The grade of Laboratory Assistant, which is at present paid on a fairly wide range of the Clerical and Analogous scales, is one of those referred to in paragraph 169 of Chapter X which require examination by each administration in order to ensure that reasonable expectations of a career exist within the grade. In view of the qualifications to be laid down for Laboratory Technologist, there can be no advancement for a Laboratory Assistant into that grade beyond the top of C5, unless he has acquired the A.M.I.L.T. If the administrations find it desirable to create a grade of Chief Laboratory Assistant in order to provide an adequate hierarchy, we suggest that the grading C6-5 may be found convenient. Appointments, of which the present salary scale extends beyond £375, are marked "Regrade" in the Appendices to this Report, and interim conversion should be onto the appropriate shadow scale.

Librarians

267. The position over the employment of Librarians in the East African administrations is at present rather confused. In some professional departments, Librarians are employed, whose work is clearly specialist and whole-time, and may include the collation and translation of publications in a foreign language. In other departments, the work of Librarian is combined with other functions, e.g. Librarian-Secretary. But in both cases the title of "Librarian" may be used.

268. There are recognised Librarian's qualifications in the United Kingdom and elsewhere. Our recommendation is that, where the post of Librarian is a whole-time one requiring the possession of a recognised qualification, the B Scale should be assigned to it. It would probably be enough at present to attach the segments B5-3 or B(V)5-3 to these posts. We suggest that, for serving officers, the holding of a university degree should be regarded as an acceptable alternative to the Librarian's qualification.

269. We recommend that the title "Librarian" should be used for these B Scale posts only. Where the library is in charge of a person not holding a recognised qualification, he should be paid on the C Scale or a lower scale, as may be appropriate. We have accordingly marked all Librarian's posts "Regrade" in the Appendices to this Report.

Storekeepers

270. The nomenclature, grading and salaries of Storekeepers vary at present as between the administrations, and we have, therefore, endeavoured to devise a grading pattern which can be used by all administrations to fit their particular needs. The pattern which we suggest is:-

Chief Storekeeper	- C1
Deputy Chief Storekeeper	- C2
Asst. Chief Storekeeper	- C3-2 (required for Tanganyika only at present)
Senior Storekeeper	- C3
Storekeeper Grade I	- C4-3
Storekeeper Grade II	- C5-4
Asst. Storekeeper	- C6-5

It should not be implied from this pattern that a post now entitled "Chief Storekeeper" should automatically be placed in the C1 grade, or that an officer now designated as "Storekeeper" cannot be given a higher salary than that assigned to Grade I or II Storekeepers. Our intention is that grading in accordance with this pattern should be assigned, which is consonant with the responsibilities of each post. In the Appendices we have ourselves assigned a grading as far as possible; alternatively, the post is marked "Regrade".

271. Here again, we recommend that, in future, the title of "Storekeeper" should be reserved for posts which are on the new C Scale pattern. Any posts which are on scales inferior to C should have a different designation, such as is already in use in some administrations, e.g. Stores Clerk or Stores Assistant. There should be an avenue of promotion from these grades to that of Assistant Storekeeper or Storekeeper Grade II. The distinction between these two latter grades is that an Assistant Storekeeper would generally be working under a superior officer in the grade, whereas a Storekeeper Grade II might be in sole charge.

Surveyors

272. Standard qualifications are laid down for appointment without further training to the Colonial Survey Service. Officers who hold these qualifications are fully professional, and have been assigned Scale A.

273. Candidates are also accepted who have passed or gained exemption from the Intermediate Examination of the Royal Institution of Chartered Surveyors in Sub-Division V (Land Survey). These officers are recruited on the present professional scale, but cannot rise beyond £865(£1168) until they have obtained the full professional qualification. As this involves passing a further examination we think it right to regard them as not fully professional in the meantime, and we have assigned the Scale B5-4, i.e. a maximum of £1188, to the grade.

/On obtaining

On obtaining the full qualification they would be eligible for the A Scale.

274. There is a third category of Surveyor who is neither qualified nor semi-qualified in the way described in the preceding paragraphs. This comprises grades in some Survey Departments, including entrants trained at the Survey Training School in Uganda, and also grades in some other departments, e.g. Forests and Public Works. To such grades we have assigned the C Scale.

275. Some distinction in nomenclature of grades appears to be advisable. Administrations may find it convenient to adopt the Kenya designations of "Staff Surveyor" for the Scale A grade and "Assistant Surveyor" for the Scale B grade. The C Scale grades in the Survey Departments could then be called "Survey Assistants"; in other departments, they can retain their present designations of "Forest Surveyor", "Road Surveyor", and so on.

276. Below these levels there are various grades of staff. Some instances are:-

<u>Kenya</u>	Surveyors	Scales CI and CII.
<u>Tanganyika</u>	Survey Assistants	Junior Service General Division.
<u>Uganda</u>	Inspecting Surveyors	L.C.S. Special Division Grade II. L.C.S. Professional Division Grade I.
	Surveyors	L.C.S. Special Division Grade II L.C.S. Professional Division Grades I & II.

We leave to administrations the task of regrading these posts on the lines recommended in paragraph 169; but, here again, some distinction in nomenclature is clearly necessary in order to differentiate between them and the superior grades mentioned above.

Computers

277. These posts vary considerably in grading at present. We quote the following instances:-

Kenya Public Works Department

Computer	£450(608) x 20 - 550(743)	) Buildings Branch
Computer	£255(344) x 15 - 450(608)	
Computer	£610(824) x 20 - 690 x 25 - 790(1066)	) Hydrology Section.
Computer	£255(344) x 15 - 450(608)	

Survey Department

Assistant Computers	£450(608) x 20 - 650(877)	) Technical and Field Staff
Assistant Computers	£360(486) x 16 - 520(702)	

/Uganda

Uganda
Survey, Land & Mines Department

Computers £550(743):550: 620 x 35 - 725(EB)
 x 35 - 1005 x 45 - 1140(1490)

Computers L.C.S. Professional Division Grades I & II.

Assistant Computers L.C.S. General Division General Class.

Tanganyika
Lands & Surveys

Computers £550(743): 620 x 35 - 760: 830 x 35
 - 1005, x 45 - 1140(PB) x 45 -
 - 1320(1670)

Assistant Computers £340(459): 340: 365 x 25 - 690(PB)
 x 25 - 840(1134)

Where the qualifications required are those of the Staff Surveyor (see paragraph 274 above) the A Scale should be assigned to the post. Where this qualification is not stipulated but a degree in mathematics is required, we recommend the B Scale. Posts which do not require either of these qualifications should be regraded by the administrations on the appropriate segments of the C or E Scales. This is another case in which we recommend that the distinction in grading should be marked by a difference in nomenclature as well as salary; the title "Computer" should be reserved for posts in the A or B Scales.

CHAPTER XIVTHE EDUCATION DEPARTMENTS

Education Officers, and Teaching Staff (including Technical Instructors) with United Kingdom qualifications or the equivalent.

278. We have found in this field a greater lack of uniformity between the East African territories than in any other.

Kenya

279. Kenya, in fact, retains the broken scale system, reserving the top segment of the professional scale, £1185(1535) - 1320(1670), for Senior Education Officers with a sub-division of £1005(1355)-1230(1580) for Education Officers holding specially responsible posts. The normal scale for Education Officers is £550(743)-1140(1490). There are also two main lower scales for Headmasters and Assistant Masters, £815(1100) - 930(1256) for the former and £550(743)-815(1100) for the latter. As regards women educational staff in Kenya, the position is much the same. On the basis of the four-fifths differentiation in women's scales, the top segment posts in their case rise to £1056(1406) and £984(1328) respectively. The normal scale for the Education Officer is £496(670)-912(1231), that for Headmistresses £696(940)-744(1004), and for the Assistant Mistresses £490(662)-690(932).

Tanganyika and Uganda

280. In these territories members of the Colonial Education Service enjoy the long scale, the women's scale being four-fifths of that of the men. There are, however, certain modifications of the long scale system in these two territories, three posts in Tanganyika being placed on the top segment, £1185(1535)-1320(1670), and a number in Uganda on the scale £830(1121)-1320(1670). Uganda also has a system under which certain Masters and Mistresses receive less than the long scale, viz. £550(743)-1140(1490) for the men and £496(670)-912(1231) for the women.

Zanzibar

281. In Zanzibar, Education Officers are remunerated on the long scale subject to the four-fifths differentiation in respect of women. There is a parallel scale £400(535)-1000(1298), for officers who are on the Higher Scale of His Highness's Zanzibar Service. The Lower Scale of His Highness's Zanzibar Service, £320(431)-720(948), is also used.

The basis of uniformity

282. In view of this variation in present methods of remuneration in East Africa, and the desire of the administrations for a uniform pattern, we have come to the conclusion that a new method of approach is required. In this connection we have considered the views expressed by the 1947-48 Commission on the same problem. In paragraph 314 of their Report they wrote:-

/ "314. The term "education officer"

"314. The term "education officer" normally denotes a person engaged on educational administration, inspection or organisation. Were the use of the term so limited in East Africa we should have been disposed to recommend the fusion of the senior education officer and education officer grades into a single grade with a long scale salary, as we have done, for instance, in the case of senior agricultural officers and agricultural officers, and senior veterinary officers and veterinary officers. This course is, however, ruled out by reason of the fact that education officers are found not only as principals of educational institutions but also as assistant masters or mistresses. To accord the long scale to assistant masters and mistresses would result in their receiving salaries disproportionate to their duties and responsibilities and out of all proportion to those drawn by their counterparts in schools in the United Kingdom. A possible solution would lie in confining the long scale to education officers proper and to principals, retaining the broken scale system for other education officers. But we received weighty evidence against the adoption of this course on the ground that it would tend to discourage recruitment to the teaching staffs, and for this and other reasons we reject it."

283. We feel that there are good reasons for giving renewed consideration to the possible solution outlined at that time by the 1947-48 Commission. As far as recruitment from the United Kingdom is concerned, we have noted that the recent Burnham award fixes the maximum salary of graduate Assistant Teachers (including three increments in respect of a degree or diploma for teacher training) at about £870 per annum for men and £700 for women. Moreover, the possibilities of applying a broken scale in the teaching profession in East Africa have been rendered more favourable by our evolution of the B Scale which, though three years longer than the professional A Scale, proceeds to the same maximum and is identical in its last five years. We have, therefore, decided to recommend that the posts dealt with in this section of the present Chapter should be remunerated on the following principles:-

Education Officers

284. We recommend that the full professional scale (i.e. the A Scale) should be attached to these posts, as it is at present in all territories except Kenya. At the same time, we think that the cadre of posts remunerated on this scale should be regulated primarily by the requirements of administration, inspection and organisation as envisaged by the 1947-48 Commission. Some latitude will have to be allowed for the present; there may, for instance, be some teaching posts in which the qualifications laid down for Education Officers in the Colonial Education Service are necessary, and it may also be held that an Education Officer, whatever his previous experience elsewhere, needs to engage for a time in the practice of teaching in East Africa before he is fully equipped to undertake administrative, inspectorial or organisational duties.

/But, subject to

But, subject to these reservations, the number of posts on the A Scale, and the intake of recruits with the professional qualifications laid down for Education Officers, should be adjusted primarily to the requirements of the administrative, inspectoral and organisational sides of the departments in the territories. This should result in the number of posts on the A Scale being substantially reduced for the future. It follows from this that a candidate recruited in future on the A Scale should:-

- (i) have the full qualification required, i.e. a university degree, preferably with Honours, together with a Teacher's Diploma or equivalent qualification, and
- (ii) have been recruited to a vacancy in the cadre of Education Officers.

Teaching staff

285. We recommend that the salary to be attached to appointments for teaching duties should, in future, be the B Scale, the qualifications to be proscribed being in accordance with present practice. The pay and prospects on the teaching side should bear a reasonably close relationship to those of the Education Officer grade, and for that reason we think that the normal expectation of a Master or Mistress should be the scale B5-2 or the female equivalent. The segment B1 (which is equivalent to the top segment of the A Scale), should be allocated to posts of Headmaster of schools or Principal of educational institutions which, though important, do not warrant superscale grading; posts of the same kind which, though not important enough to qualify for B1, merit a closer evaluation than the timescale affords, can be given the segments B3-2 or B2. It would be possible for an officer on the B Scale to be employed on administrative, inspectoral or organisational duties if his bent clearly lay in that direction, and as the B and A Scales reach the same maximum, he would be eligible for consideration for superscale grades on that side of the department also.

286. We think that the organisation suggested above should provide equitably for the differentiation in functions of the grades, and ensure at the same time that the intake of recruits is regulated according to the respective requirements. It provides also a reasonable degree of elasticity in the employment of the two grades. We suggest that the grade names should be Education Officer for the A Scale, and Master or Mistress for the B Scale. Though we have been discussing the problem primarily in terms of overseas recruitment, it follows that a local officer, either present or future, who has the prescribed qualifications and is appointed to either grade, should be placed on the A or B Scale as may be appropriate.

Asian and African Education Officers

287. The following posts exist at present:-

KenyaAsian Education

Senior Education Officer	- £725(979)-800(1080)
Education Officer	- £560(756)-750(1013)
Education Officer (Female)	- £448(605)-600(810)

African Education

Education Officer	- £330(446)-684(923)
Assistant Education Officer	- £300(405)-600(810)

Tanganyika

Inspector of Indian Schools	- £460(621)-600(810)
-----------------------------	----------------------

Uganda

Indian Education Officer	- £725(979)-850(1148)
Assistant Indian Education Officer	- £540(729)-620(837)
Education Officer (African)	- £330(446)-792(1069)

Our recommendation regarding these posts is that if the holders perform the duties of an A Scale Education Officer as outlined above, and if they have the qualifications prescribed for that grade, the posts should be regraded on the A Scale; if not, they should be placed on the appropriate segments of the B Scale.

Technical teaching staff

288. Technical education is expanding rapidly in East Africa, and it is essential that teaching staff of adequate numbers and quality shall be recruited and retained in order that this important side of educational development may not be handicapped. We have, therefore, examined the present position in some detail in consultation with the educational authorities in East Africa.

289. Kenya at present pays the main body of its technical instructors on the scale £550(743)-815(1100) referred to in paragraph 279 above, though there are superior posts on broken segments of the professional scale. The scales in Tanganyika are £550(743)-840(1134) for technical instructors and £840(1134)-960(1296) for senior instructors. In Uganda the normal scales are £550(743)-1140(1490) for instructors and £830(1121)-1320(1670) for senior instructors.

/Zanzibar does not seem

Zanzibar does not seem to have any posts of this grade.

290. It appears to be generally agreed that present remuneration, except perhaps in Uganda, is not attractive enough in present conditions of recruitment. We recommend, therefore, that there should be a differentiation into two grades as follows:-

Technical Masters or Mistresses

291. The qualifications for this grade should be the Higher National Certificate of the United Kingdom or its equivalent. In parallel with the general grade of Master or Mistress recommended above, the salary scale of the grade should be B5-2 or the female equivalent. The segment B1 should be used for the major technical Hwadmasters', Principals' or organisational posts, the duties of which do not warrant superscale grading.

Technical Instructors

292. The qualification for this grade should be a technical or trade qualification lower than the Higher National Certificate. The grading which we suggest is:-

Technical Instructor	C5-3
Senior Technical Instructor	C2

Technical staff are employed in other departments besides the Education Department, e.g. Prisons. We recommend that the same pattern of qualifications and grading should apply to these posts also.

293. It is convenient to remark at this point on the existence of a number of posts entitled "Instructor" which are at present on the Clerical and Analogous C Scales in Kenya, the Executive and General Divisions of the Junior Service in Tanganyika, and the Executive and General Classes of the Local Civil Service in Uganda. We regard these posts as coming within the range of the analogous services with which we have dealt in Chapter X. The necessity for review and regrading therefore arises, in order both to ensure that a properly graded structure of remuneration by responsibility exists and also to remove any racial differentiation where it may be found. We draw attention at this point, accordingly, to the general principles governing this regrading process which we have advocated in paragraphs 168-173, and to our recommendations on uniformity of regrading and in titles of posts contained in paragraph 195.

Graduates of Indian or Pakistani Universities
and teachers with Makerere College qualifications

294. In our discussion of the Makerere diploma courses in paragraphs 207-210 of this Report, we reserved for consideration in the present Chapter the evaluation of the candidate with the Teaching Diploma. The course for this diploma is made up at present of two years of higher studies followed by two years of teacher training. It is clear, and is agreed by the educational authorities in East Africa, that this qualification ranks lower than those dealt with in the previous section of this Report, and what seems to us to be required is a lower grade of entry which will lead on, as experience is gained and ability proved, to the B Scale allocated for teaching staff.

/295. We have also to consider

295. We have also to consider the appropriate place in the teaching structure of graduates of Indian or Pakistani universities. Here again the advice given to us is that, normally, such qualifications cannot be regarded as equal to the United Kingdom qualifications to which the previous section of this Chapter applies. The requirement here also appears to be a lower grade of entry leading onto the B Scale in the same way as in the preceding paragraph.

296. We think that the requirement in both of the cases above can be met by the introduction of a T Scale as follows:

£462(508)-£516x24-£684(752).

It will be seen that the last five years of this scale, i.e. £588 to £684, correspond with segment B5 on the B Scale. A teacher who has reached this segment and is fit for further advancement can then be promoted onto the successive segments of the B Scale in accordance with the way in which the latter scale is broken by the administrations to provide for appropriate grades or posts. We suggest that the designation of Master or Mistress should be applied to officers on the T Scale.

297. As regards entry points, we understand that at present the entry points for holders of the Makerere Diploma are £264(357) in Kenya, £240(324) in Tanganyika, £252(340) in Uganda and £262(354) in Zanzibar; and that untrained graduates of Indian or Pakistani universities enter at £305(412) in Kenya, £300(405) in Tanganyika, £315(425) in Uganda and £320(431) in Zanzibar. We recommend that in future the entrant from Makerere with the Diploma (i.e. the four-year course), and the untrained Indian or Pakistani graduate should enter the T Scale at the starting point, i.e. £462(508). The trained Indian or Pakistani graduate should enter at £480(528). When they become available, graduates from Makerere College with a teacher training qualification should enter the B Scale at the starting point, i.e. £564(620).

298. We also recommend that holders of the Higher School Certificate who have qualified in the Nairobi two-year Teacher Training Course should enter the T Scale at £462(508).

Other teachers (African, Arab or Asian)

299. The present grading of teachers other than those with whom we have dealt in the two preceding sections of this Chapter is as follows:-

(a) Kenya

African Teachers (Male)

- | | | |
|--------|--|--------------------|
| K T 1. | (School Certificate plus 2 years' training) | £154(215)-223(301) |
| T 2. | (Standard X plus 2 years' training) | £100(149)-172(237) |
| T 3. | (Standard VIII plus 2 years' training) | £66(106)-105(155) |
| T 4. | (Standard VIII with a lower pass plus 2 years' training) | £51(82)-72(115) |

/Asian Teachers (Male)

Asian Teachers (Male)

Grade III	£305(412)-455(614)
Entry point for School Certificate plus two years Nairobi training	£305(412)
Grade IV	£180(247)-450(608)
Entry point for School Certificate	£180(247)
Grade V	
Unqualified teachers with a minimum of six years' education	£180(247)-315(425)

Note: The scales for women are four-fifths of those for men.

(b) TanganyikaAfrican teachers

Grade I	£100(135)-240(324)
<u>Main entry points</u>	
School Certificate plus two years' training	£171(231)
Standard XII - no School Certificate plus two years' training	£153(206)
Standard X plus two years' training	£136(184)
Grade II	£66(89)-171(231)
<u>Main entry point</u>	
Standard VIII plus certificate after two years' training	£66(89)
<u>Asian teachers (Primary)</u> -	£180(243)-400(540)
School Certificate entry point	£180(243)
and that for School Certificate plus two years' Nairobi training	£240(324)

Note: The scales for women are four-fifths of those for men.

/(c) Uganda

(c) UgandaAfrican teachers

Grade II	£130(176)-300(405)
----------	--------------------

School Certificate entry
point plus two years'
training

£144(194)

Grade I	£69(93)-171(231)
---------	------------------

Entry point - Standard VIII
plus two years' training

£69(93)

Asian teachers

Grade VI	£220(297)-400(540)
----------	--------------------

Grade V	£300(405)-450(608)
---------	--------------------

These grades are largely recruited
from India. Graduates enter at £315(425)
and matriculate at the minimum. The entry
point for School Certificate plus two years'
Nairobi training is £300(405).

Note: (i) The scales for women are four-fifths of
those for men.

(ii) There is a promotion grade open
to Grade II African teachers in
Uganda, viz. £190(257)-450(608).

(d) Zanzibar

<u>Primary teachers</u>	£120(162)-334(449)
-------------------------	--------------------

Entry point for School Certificate	£140(189)
------------------------------------	-----------

Entry point for School Certificate plus one years' training	£150(203)
--	-----------

<u>Assistant teachers (Primary)</u>	£90(122)-190(257)
-------------------------------------	-------------------

Entry point at the minimum for
Standard VIII plus two years'
training

Intermediate teachers

Intermediate degree plus two years' training - entry point £262(354)	}	(i) £226(305)-370(496)
<u>Nairobi trained teachers</u>		

School Certificate plus two years' training - entry point £238(321)	}	(ii) £430(574)-550(730)

Note: (i) Women's scales are roughly four-fifths those for men.

(ii) There is a promotion grade (Supervisory Teachers)
£360(483)-450(600) open to Primary teachers.

/300. It will be observed

300. It will be observed that, except in the case of Zanzibar, the existing pattern of scales in this field rests on a racial basis. The special entry point for holders of School Certificate plus two years' training varies between Africans and Asians in the three mainland territories as follows:-

	<u>African entry point</u>	<u>Asian entry point</u>
	School Certificate plus two years' training	School Certificate plus two years' Nairobi training
Kenya	£154(215)	£305(412)
Tanganyika	£171(231)	£240(324)
Uganda	£144(194)	£300(405)

In Zanzibar the entry point allowed to a holder of a School Certificate who is trained locally for one year is £150(203), while that conceded to Certificate holders trained at Nairobi for two years is £238(321).

Pattern of future organisation

301. In view of the variations, not only between races but between the various territorial scales, revealed in the tables of present gradings above, we recommend that the territories should adopt the following scale pattern in future in order to achieve uniformity:-

Grade I teachers	E2-1 or E(W)2-1	£336(370)-480(528). £318(350)-480(528).
Grade II teachers	E4-3 or E(W)4-3	£162(178)-300(330) £162(178)-312(343)
Assistant (or Vernacular) teachers Grade I (Promotion grade in Tanganyika, Uganda and Zanzibar only)	E4 or E(W)4	£162(178)-228(251)
Assistant (or Vernacular) teachers Grade II	E6-5 or E(W)6-5	£90(99)-156(172)

/302. The entry points

302. The entry points which we recommend in relation to these new scales are as follows:-

	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>Entry Point</u>
1.	Kenya African Preliminary Examination.	Standard VIII plus entry examination.	Junior Secondary III.	-	£90(99)
2.	As above plus two years' training.	As above plus two years' training.	As above plus two years' training.	Standard VIII plus two years' training.	£108(119)
3.	Kenya African Secondary School Examination.	Territorial X	-	-	£132(145)
4.	As above plus 2 years' training	As above plus two years' training.	School Certificate (untrained).	-	£162(178)
5.	School Certificate (untrained)	School Certificate (untrained)	-	School Certificate (untrained)	£180(198)
6.	Standard XII No School Certificate plus two years' training.	As Kenya	Secondary VI No School Certificate plus two years' training.	- (Kenya & Tanganyika) £204(224) (Uganda) £192(211)	
7.	School Certificate plus two years' training	School Certificate plus two years' training	School Certificate plus three years' training.	School Certificate plus two years' training.	£228(251)

+ Excludes Nairobi trained Asian teachers (see below)

The above are entry points for men; those for women should be at the corresponding points on the E(w) Scales.

/303. In the new T Scale

303. In the new T Scale recommended in paragraph 296 of this Chapter there is no racial differentiation, the entry points of Africans and Asians being fixed by valuation of their respective qualifications. In regard to the new E Scales for teachers recommended in paragraph 301, however, there are two obstacles to the complete removal at present of varying scales for the two races:-

- (a) the demand for Asians emerging from secondary school with the School Certificate is so keen in the employment market that in order to attract them into the educational field, and thereby to secure the continuance of Asian education, it is necessary to offer specially high rates. The Asian with two years of Nairobi teacher training is, we are informed, one of the most valuable elements in the teaching cadre of Asian schools, and it will be seen that in the three mainland territories the entry point at present offered to them is in the neighbourhood of £300(405).
- (b) because of the same keen competition, we are informed that in Kenya, in order to staff Asian schools, it has been necessary to offer £180(247), i.e. the present normal School Certificate entry point, to unqualified Asian teachers with a minimum of six years' education.

304. Although in both grades the result is that the Asian teacher receives a higher salary than the African of the same qualifications, we think it true to say that the accusation of racial differentiation loses much of its force in these cases because an Asian candidate for a teaching post in an Asian school is not competing with Africans; the post falls, in fact, into the mono-racial category to which we have alluded in paragraph 48 (ii) of this Report. It follows that, if current market conditions demand it, the payment of higher rates to those classes of Asian teacher can be continued for the present without a serious breach of the principles underlying this Report. We feel justified in recommending that in the case of (a) the entry point for the Asian Nairobi-trained teachers should be fixed at the bottom of E2, i.e. £336(370) on our new scales; but we suggest that this should come up for review in five years' time. We have in mind that as the general standard of education rises in East Africa, the entrant to the Nairobi Teacher Training centre will come to be the holder of a Higher School Certificate, and it will be noticed that in anticipation of this we have suggested an entry point for him of £462(508) on the T Scale, for which he will then be qualified. In the meantime the segment E2 will be, for this purpose alone, a direct entry segment; in all other respects it will be a promotion grade for teachers in the grades of the E Scale below it.

With regard to (b) we have had to bear in mind that the general entry point for School Certificate holders in the clerical and analogous grades has been fixed in our recommendations at £180(198). While prepared to continue in some degree the relative advantage which this category now enjoys, we feel that it would be inconsistent to recommend an entry point for the future higher than £162(178).

305. Subject to those two exceptions, the salary pattern which we recommend is uniform and non-racial, and is comparable as regards entry points and grading with that recommended for the clerical and analogous services.

306. In respect of the T Scale we have recommended that there should be an avenue of promotion to the appropriate segments of the B Scale. We are strongly of opinion that in the same way there should be an opportunity for teachers who have reached the top segments of the E Scale to pass onto the T Scale on promotion, if they have proved their fitness to undertake the higher duties.

307. In our discussions with the educational authorities the principle was advocated by them of a responsibility allowance for heads of Primary Schools, related to the size and importance of the school. As the pattern of salary which we have proposed is a broken scale pattern, we should prefer to recommend that the segment appropriate to responsibility should be attached to the headship of this type of school; but, in order to give flexibility and convenience of posting, the administrations may be prepared to agree that, so long as a vacancy in the approved cadre of the higher grade exists, a teacher posted to a headship may draw an allowance consisting of the difference between his substantive salary and the minimum pay of the post, in recognition of the responsibility which he is called upon to undertake.

CHAPTER XVTHE MEDICAL DEPARTMENTSApplication of the A Scale

328. At the present stage of development in East Africa recruitment to the professional grade of Medical Officer is almost entirely from external sources. The salaries of this grade were specially revised in 1959 in the light of salary expectations of doctors in the National Health Service in the United Kingdom, with the result that since that date the entry point for Medical Officers on the professional scale £550(743) - 1320(1670) has been £865(1168), and the scale has been extended by six increments of £45 a year for this grade to £1590(1940). The effect, therefore, is that Medical Officers enjoy a scale of eighteen years ranging from £865 to £1590.

309. As we have pointed out in paragraph 248 of this Report, this amendment of the professional scale in favour of Medical Officers was dictated by considerations of market value. To that extent it may be held to have been an anticipation of a general salaries revision; and our objective should be, therefore, not necessarily to preserve the lead which the Medical Officers have gained, but to ensure that the new rates applicable to that grade shall continue to have proper regard to the element of market value.

310. It will be seen from paragraph 249 of this Report that our proposal is that the present extension of six annual increments from £1320(1670) to £1590(1940) shall be replaced by an extension of three biennial increments of £54 from £1620(1782) to £1782(1944). + In addition, in paragraph later in this Report we recommend that the entry point for Medical Officers on the new A Scale shall be £1074(1181). + The effect of these recommendations is that the proposed new scale for Medical Officers will be of eighteen years' duration, as at present, and will run from £1074(1181) to £1782(1944). + We assume the continuance of the special incremental credits at present allowed for certain higher medical qualifications.

311. In consequence of the extension of the professional scale to £1590 for Medical Officers in 1950, the superscale grade of Senior Medical Officer was raised to £1650(2000). We anticipate our general recommendations on superscale salaries in Chapter XIX of this Report to remark that we recommend for the grade of Senior Medical Officer an incremental superscale salary of £1860(2022)x60-1980(2142).

/312.

+ These figures include the inducement addition.

312. We have formulated these recommendations after discussion with medical and other authorities in East Africa, consideration of current scales in other Colonial territories, hearing of representations made to us by individual Medical Officers, and study of the case made on behalf of the profession by the British Medical Association. The Association have drawn our attention to the effect of the Danckwerts Award of March, 1952 upon the calculations which formed the basis of the extension granted in 1950. They have also given us figures of the present-day average remuneration in the three main branches of the profession in the United Kingdom, with which the Colonial Medical Service must compete for recruits. They are:-

	<u>Aged 27</u>	<u>Aged 50-54</u>
General Practice	£1000	£2200
Hospital Service (Specialists and Consultants)	£670	£3275
Public Health Service	£950	£1700-2100

We have also ascertained that in the Army the total annual income, including allowances, of a married Lieutenant Colonel (Non-Specialist) of the R.A.M.C., who arrives at that rank "by selection at about his seventeenth year of service" is £1794.

313. We recognise that there can be no strict comparison between the Medical Officer in the Colonial Service and his confreres in the United Kingdom and in the Army. On the one hand, the latter are subject to United Kingdom Income Tax; in the case of the former, the disadvantages arising from the difficulty of educating children, separation from home and climatic conditions have to be balanced against higher retirement benefits, low rent levels and generous leave conditions.

314. Our conclusion is, however, that the revised salaries which we recommend, taken in consideration with our recommendations on the subject of reduced rent for quarters, should enable the East African Administrations to compete on favourable terms in the overseas markets.

/Private practice

Private practice

315. This question was regulated in 1950 when the new salaries were introduced and admission to the new scale was made contingent upon surrender of the rights of private practice, subject to the variation in Tanganyika that Medical Officers appointed prior to the 17th January, 1946 still retain those rights.

316. As this matter has been fully considered and settled by Governments, we are not prepared to reopen the issue. A claim has been put before us for compensation for the loss of the right to private practice; but as acceptance of the new salary scales in 1950 was expressly contingent upon surrender of those rights we are not prepared now to support the claim for compensation.

Non-European Medical Officers

A. Medical Officers with qualifications registrable in the United Kingdom

317. Asian and African Medical Officers with the above qualifications in Kenya and Uganda receive three-fifths of the Medical Officers' scale, in accordance with the recommendations of the 1947-48 Salaries Commission. In Tanganyika they are graded either as Senior Assistant Surgeons, £610(824)-690(932), or as Assistant Surgeons £445(601)-610(824). We recommend that, in future, all officers with medical qualifications registrable in the United Kingdom be placed on the A Scale.

318. We invite attention at this point to our recommendations on the subject of enhanced entry points contained in Chapter XX, and in particular to paragraph of that Chapter. As locally recruited officers are not involved in considerations of market value in the United Kingdom, our recommendation is that the Medical Officers referred to in this section should enter the A Scale at a point determined only by the length of time taken to reach the minimum standard for eligibility, i.e. two increments up the scale at £690(759) (see paragraph of Chapter XX). They would be subject to any bars occurring in the scale above that point of entry.

B. Medical Officers with qualifications registrable only in East Africa

319. The development of the Makerere Medical School has been examined by a Visitation Committee of the General Medical Council, which reported in February, 1952, that, although recognition by the Council could not be recommended at the present time, the standard of training had reached the level at which the Makerere Diploma should be recognised as a legal qualification for local registration by the territories concerned. Legal effect has now been given to this recommendation in all the four territories with which we are dealing.

320. In view of the favourable report made on the Makerere Medical School by the General Medical Council's Visitation Committee, and its conclusion that "inspection with a view to recognition of the Diploma by the General Medical Council would be appropriate in a few years' time", we consider that there is full justification for placing the Medical Officers who achieve East African registration on the B Scale. In this case we recommend the application of the full B Scale (i.e. B5-1 inclusive). This will, therefore, be a long scale but it will, of course, be subject to the operation of bars of the kind which we have recommended in paragraphs 84-89.

321. The legislation which gave effect to the recommendations of the Committee of the General Medical Council authorised registration in East Africa not only of licentiates of Medicine of Makerere College who have been qualified as such after 1st December, 1951, but also of other persons who fulfil certain prescribed conditions and satisfy the appropriate authority as to their fitness for registration. We understand that under this latter provision the following will be eligible for consideration:-

- (i) Licentiates of Medicine of Makerere College who qualified as such before 1st December, 1951, and
- (ii) Members of the grades of Senior Assistant Surgeon, Assistant Surgeon, Senior Sub-Assistant Surgeon and Sub-Assistant Surgeon, who have been licensed to practise medicine in East Africa in virtue of their diplomas from Indian or Pakistan Schools of Medicine.

If any Government Medical Officer of the categories indicated is so registered we recommend that he too should be placed on the B Scale, subject to the conditions set out earlier in this paragraph

C. Medical Officers licensed to practise in East Africa

322. As explained in the preceding section, provision has been made for the registration in East Africa of licentiates who are certified by the board of assessors as suitable to be registered. Provision must, however, be made for serving licentiates who do not achieve this registration. To these licentiates we allocate Scale C. The present scales of these grades and our proposed gradings are as follows:-

<u>Category</u>	<u>Present Scale</u>	<u>Proposed Grading</u>
Senior Assistant Surgeon (Kenya)	£530(716)-£610(824)	C3
Assistant Surgeon (Kenya)	£380(513)-530(716)	C5-4
Makerere Licentiate (Kenya)	£315(425)-450(608)	C5-3
Senior Sub-Assistant Surgeon(Tanganyika)	£530(716)-610(824)	C3
Sub-Assistant Surgeon (Tanganyika)	£380(513)-530(716)	C5-4
Makerere Licentiate (Tanganyika)	£315(425)-550(743)	C5-3
Senior Sub-Assistant Surgeon (Uganda)	£530(716)-610(824)	C3

/Sub-Assistant

<u>Category(contd.)</u>	<u>Present Scale(Contd.)</u>	<u>Proposed Grading</u> <u>(contd.)</u>
Sub-Assistant Surgeon(Uganda)	£380(513)-530(716)	C5-4
Makerere Licentiate (Uganda)	£315(425)-450(608)	C5-3
Senior Sub-Assistant Surgeon(Zanzibar)	£620(837)-720(948)	C3-2
Sub-Assistant Surgeon (Zanzibar)	£380(509)-550(730)	C5-4
Makerere Licentiate (Zanzibar)	£320(431)-720(948)	C5-3
Makerere Licentiate (Zanzibar)	£226(305)-550(730)	

Nursing and allied services
Nursing Sisters

323. Members of Queen Elizabeth's Colonial Nursing Service serving in the East African territories are at present on the salary scale £460(621)x20-600x25-700(945). In addition to salary they enjoy certain free perquisites and services relating to uniform, fuel, light, laundry and household equipment, the cash value of which is estimated at another £100-110 a year. This figure is not, however, reckoned as part of their pensionable emoluments, and the services are not, of course, enjoyed while on leave. There is general agreement among the medical authorities in East Africa, and in the nursing service also, that an increase to pensionable salary should be substituted for these services, and we understand that this is being done in other Colonial territories. We concur in this view, and have based our recommendation for a revised scale on the assumption that the cash value of the services should be incorporated in salary, the cost being met in future by the Nursing Sisters themselves. The scale which we recommend for Nursing Sisters is:-

£540(594)x24-684x30-804(884)

This is, in fact, segments C(W)5-4 of the C(W) scale; but as the superior posts of Matron above the scale are in effect superscale posts, the lag of two increments caused by the absence of the incremental jump in women's scales has been added to C(W)5-4 for the purpose of this scale. Partly for this reason, and partly because this scale must continue for the present to attract the inducement addition (see paragraph), we have distinguished it by the designation N, and the scale above appears in the Appendices as N5.

Mental Nurses

324. We recommend the adoption of the N5 Scale also for Mental Nurses (Female), subject to surrender of free services, as in the case of Nursing Sisters on the general side. Mental Nurses (Male) should be graded C5-4, the male equivalent of N.5.

/Sister

Sister Tutors and Health Visitors

325. These grades are at present paid on the Nursing Sisters' scale, and receive an additional pensionable allowance of £50 a year. We suggest that it would be preferable to incorporate this into salary, and propose for these grades the following scale, designated N4, which is superior by two increments to the N5 Scale:-

£508(647)x24-684x30-864(950)

Physiotherapists and Occupational Therapists

326. Having regard to the status of these posts in the United Kingdom, we recommend that they should be graded on the N4 Scale. Where the post is held by a man the grading should be C5-3, the male equivalent of N4.

Matrons

327. The present salaries of Matrons are:-

Matron Grade II	£730(986)
Matron Grade I	£780(1053)
Chief Matron	£850(1148)

Here again the value of the free services must be taken into account for incorporation into the new salaries. But apart from that we are of opinion that the burden of responsibility borne by Matrons must be marked by raising their salary levels higher above the top of the Nursing Sisters' Scale and by greater differentiation between grades. We, therefore, recommend the following revised salaries, which will carry the inducement addition where necessary:-

Matron Grade II	£864(950)	- N3
Matron Grade I	£954(1049)	- N2
Matron in Chief	£1128(1241)	- N1

Qualifications

328. The salaries proposed in this section are subject to the understanding that for future recruits the following qualifications are required:-

Nursing Sisters	}	S.R.N.
Male Nurses		
Mental Nurses		
(Male or Female)		R.M.N. or S.R.N.
Physiotherapists		M.C.S.P.
Occupational		
Therapists		M.Association of Occupational Therapists
		/Subordinate

Subordinate grades

329. There are various grades of Nurses in each territory, who are as a rule locally trained and whose qualifications are inferior to the S.R.N. There is also the numerically large grade of Medical Assistant, and a few Physiotherapists' Assistants and Orthopaedic Assistants. We regard these grades as falling within the range of the analogous services dealt with in Chapter X. The necessity for review and regrading therefore arises, both in order to ensure that a properly graded structure of remuneration by responsibility exists, and also in order to remove any racial differentiation in salaries where it may be found. We therefore draw attention again to the general principles governing this regrading process which we have advocated in paragraphs 168 - 173, and to our recommendations on uniformity in regrading and in titles of posts contained in paragraph 195.

Other Medical Staff Hospital Superintendents

330. The present grading in Kenya is £670(904)-840(1134) for Hospital Superintendents, and £530(716)-715(965) for Assistant Hospital Superintendents. In Uganda the respective scales are £765(1035)-1000(1350) and £530(716)-750(1013). The Tanganyika scale for Hospital Superintendents is £865(1168)-1140(1490).

331. The grading which we have assigned to Assistant Hospital Superintendents is C5-4. For Hospital Superintendents in Uganda and Tanganyika we have assigned the scale C3-2; but on the assumption that the lower scale for this grade in Kenya connotes a difference in status and responsibility we have assigned C4-3 to the grade in that territory.

Pharmacists

332. It is generally agreed that this is a grade to which recruitment is liable to be difficult owing to competition in the home market. We recommend, therefore, that the following uniform grading should be adopted:-

Chief Pharmacist	C1
Pharmacist	C5-2

We assume that the M.P.S. qualification will be required for admission to this grade.

Health Inspectors

333. Here also recruitment can be difficult at times, and we recommend the following grading:-

Chief Health Inspector	C1
Instructor in Hygiene	C2
Health Inspector	C5-2
(to include present grade of Senior Health Inspector)	

/The

The qualification required for the grade should be that of the Royal Sanitary Institute or of the Royal Sanitary Association of Scotland.

Radiographers and Orthopaedic Technicians

334. We recommend that the grading C5-3 should be adopted for these posts. We assume that for Radiographers the qualification of Member of the Society of Radiographers will be laid down in future.

Entomological Field Staff

The grades to which we refer are:-

<u>Kenya</u>	Senior Entomological Field Officers £715(965)-840(1134) Entomological Field Officers £550(743)-715(965)
<u>Tanganyika</u>	Malaria Field Officers £550(743)-840(1134)
<u>Uganda</u>	Malaria Field Officers £550(743)-960(1296)

The grading which we should normally assign to these posts is C5-3. We understand, however, that in addition to field duties some technical laboratory experience is required. If so, the Field Officer grade should be assigned C5-3 with a senior grade on C2; but the administrations may wish to make the possession of the A.I.M.L.T. or F.I.M.L.T. a condition of promotion as with Laboratory Technicians (see paragraph).

Subordinate staff

335. Below each of the grades dealt with in this section there are subordinate grades; e.g.:-

under Pharmacists	- Dispensers Compounders Pharmaceutical Assistants
under Health Inspectors	- Assistant Health Inspectors Sanitary Overseers Health Assistants
under Radiographers	- Assistant Radiographers X Ray Assistants

and so on. These are, again, in our view, analogous grades of the type referred to in Chapter X (paragraphs 168-173), and the necessity for review and regrading arises. The considerations to which we have drawn attention in paragraph 329 earlier in this Chapter apply equally in these cases.

336. We suggest for consideration that in regard to the grading of Assistant Health Inspector there should be a point beyond which promotion should be conditional on possession of the Certificate of the Royal Sanitary Institute (East African Examination Board).

CHAPTER XVI

POLICE, PRISONS AND CUSTOMS

337. In this Chapter we deal only with the salary scales of the uniformed grades of the Police Forces below the rank of Assistant Superintendent and corresponding uniformed grades in the Prisons Departments and the Customs and Excise Departments. Our recommendations for the salaries and salary scales of the gazetted ranks of the Police Forces and equivalent grades of the other Departments will be found in the Appendices to this Report.

Kenya Police Commission and Kenya Scales

338. In July, 1953, while we were making our enquiries in East Africa, the Kenya Government appointed a Commission to review the organisation, administration and expansion of the Kenya Police Force and to make recommendations inter alia in regard to its conditions of service. In respect of these it was required to have close regard to the investigations then being carried out by us.

339. In consequence, we had a number of meetings with the Members of this Commission, and are glad to say that we reached full agreement with them as to the interim scales of salary which they have recommended for the various ranks of the Kenya Police Force and which, we understand, have since been adopted by the Kenya Government.

340. The salary scales recommended by the Police Commission and by us are set out below, and in considering them it is necessary to bear in mind that the Police Commission scales are designed to carry cost of living allowance at present rates, while the scales which we recommend are designed to carry cost of living allowance at 10%. The bracketed figures at the beginning and end of each scale represent the total emoluments on these bases.

341. Kenya Police

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Police Commission Scales</u>	<u>Proposed Scales</u>	<u>Proposed Grading</u>
Constable	£48(77)x1/16s-66x1/10s (biennially)-72(115)	£72(79)x2/8s-96x3 (biennially)-108(119)	P14A
Corporal	£66(106)x3-84(129)	£96(106)x4/16s- 120(132)	P12A
Sergeant	£90(137)x6-126(180)	£132(145)x6-168(185)	P11A-10A
Assistant Inspector	£144(203)x8-192x9-210x 12-282x18-336(454)	£180(198)x12-228: 252x12 -336x18-480(528)	P7+5
Cadet Inspector	£330(446)x18-366(494)	£408(449)x18-480(528)	D
Inspector Grade II	£348(470)x18-456x24- 504(680)	£462(508)x18-516x24- 636(700)	P3
Inspector Grade I	£504(680)x18-540x24- 756x30-876(1182)	£498(548)x18-516x24- 636: 714x30-894(983) (a) £648(713)x24-672x30- 822: 912x36-1128(1241)	P2
Chief Inspector	£540(729)x24-756x30- 936(1264)	£540(594)x24-636: 714x30-954(1049) (a) £702(772)x30-822: 912x36-1200(1320)	P1

(a) Total of scale and inducement addition.

342. It will be observed that in general the salary scales recommended by us do little more than cover the interim scales of salary recommended by the Police Commission so far as total emoluments are concerned, although in certain cases we have recommended a substantial increase in order to give the Police Force the benefit of scales which we have recommended for comparable grades of the Government service. At the time of our discussions with the Police Commission our proposals for general salary levels had not been fully developed, and there is no reason why the Police Force should not benefit from the further consideration which we have since given to that problem, or why their salaries should be left behind those of other departments of Government. In comparing the interim salaries recommended by the Police Commission with those recommended by us it is necessary, in the case of the ranks of Inspector Grade I and Chief Inspector, to look at the total of salary and the inducement addition under our proposals, since these ranks are in the main filled by recruits from overseas.

343. We do not, however, agree with the Police Commission in paragraph 250 of their Report that there should be no bars in, at least, the longer scales proposed. It seems to us wrong in principle that an Assistant Inspector should rise from £180 to £480 or an Inspector Grade I from £648 to £1128 without some examination of his efficiency (apart from the annual increment certificate and language tests) by an impartial Police body of adequate weight and responsibility. We have not, however, ventured to indicate the position of the bars in our proposed scales; but we refer the Kenya Government to our discussion of this subject in paragraphs 84-89 of this Report, and recommend that bars should be inserted in our scales in the light of the principles therein recommended.

344. We have not generally considered the various allowances recommended for the Kenya Police by the Police Commission, but venture to doubt whether the allowance of 12 shillings a month recommended in paragraph 289 of their Report for the ranks of Sergeant and below serving in the urban areas of Nairobi and Mombasa is justified on grounds of cost of living, having regard to the fact that the local allowance for public servants generally recommended in paragraphs 139-152 of our Report ceases altogether at approximately the minimum of the scale now proposed for constables. The Police Commission, however, give other grounds for their recommendation besides that of cost of living, but we are not in a position to judge between the extra work involved in service in Mombasa and that involved in being stationed, for example, in Fort Hall and engaged in operations against the Mau Mau.

Application of Kenya Scales to Police Forces of other territories

345. We now turn to the Police Forces of territories within our ambit other than Kenya. We see no reason in principle why the salary scales which we have devised in consultation with the Kenya Police Commission should not apply to the Police Forces of the other East African territories and, in fact, it seems to us essential that they should do so.

/While, therefore,

While, therefore, we have attempted to apply the same salary scales to the other Police Forces in so far as corresponding ranks exist, the difficulty arises that in some major respects the rank structure is different. For example, there are no Inspectors recruited from overseas in Tanganyika but there are four grades of locally recruited Inspector, while in Uganda there are ranks of Head Constables and Head Constables-Major. As a Commission we are not generally concerned with structure, nor have we the technical knowledge required to give advice on police structure. We can, therefore, only advise that, in so far as the other territories decide to adopt the Kenya Police structure, they should follow the salary scales which we have recommended for Kenya. Meanwhile, we must deal with things as we find them, which we have done by adapting the Kenya scales to the best of our ability in order to provide equality of treatment. In comparing our proposals with the existing salary scales it must, however, be borne in mind that the Kenya Police Commission has greatly improved the previous Kenya level of Police salaries; for this reason to compare existing Police salaries in Tanganyika, Uganda and Zanzibar with the Police Commission salary scales in Kenya is not a fair comparison.

Proposals for Tanganyika Police Force

346. On this basis the existing and proposed Police salary scales for Tanganyika are as follows:-

Tanganyika Police

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing Salary Scale</u>	<u>Proposed Salary Scale</u>	<u>Proposed Grading</u>
Recruit	£40/16s(55): 42(57)	£72(79)x2/8s-96x3 (biennially)-108(119)	P14A
Constable	£43/4s(58)x1/4s-66(89)		
Corporal	£54(73)x1/16s-72(97)	£96(106)x4/16s-120(132)	P12A
Sergeant	£66(89)x3-90(122)	£132(145)x6-168(185)	P11A-10A
Sergeant-Major	£105(142)x3-120(162)	£174(191)x6-204(224)	P9A-8A
Cadet Inspector	£118(159)x6-154(208)	£180(198)x12-228: 252x12-276(304)	P7
Sub-Inspector	£180(243)x10-240x15-330(446)	£288(317)x12-336x18-480(528)	P5
Inspector	£330(446)x15-405(547)	£462(508)x18-516x24-564(620)	P4
Senior Inspector	£405(547)x15-465(628)	£540(594)x24-636(700)	C5
Chief Inspector	£470(635)x20-590(796)	£540(594)x24-636: 714x30-954(1049)	P1

/347. It will be seen

347. It will be seen that in Tanganyika we have nowhere provided the scale allotted in Kenya to Inspectors Grade I because, as we have stated above, there are no Inspectors in Tanganyika recruited from overseas who form the class from which this grade has been normally (though not entirely) filled in Kenya. If the Tanganyika Government at any time wish to adopt this scale, it can be taken from our Kenya proposals. It will also be seen that the proposed scale for Chief Inspector in Tanganyika, which is the same as that which we propose for Kenya, overlaps the whole of the scale for Senior Inspector. The scale for Chief Inspector in Kenya has been deliberately given a low starting point, in order that an Inspector promoted to the rank of Chief Inspector, and thereafter, after a short period of service in the latter rank, to the rank of Assistant Superintendent, should not gain a large advantage over the Inspector promoted direct to the grade of Assistant Superintendent without going through the rank of Chief Inspector. We think that the same advantage will hold good in Tanganyika.

Proposals for Uganda Police Force

348. In Uganda there is a grade of Inspectors recruited from overseas on a salary scale of £290(662)x20-690x25-715(965). With our agreement, an allowance is now paid to Inspectors of this grade drawing less than £550(743) sufficient to bring their total emoluments up to £550(743). We understand that no more recruitment from overseas to this grade is likely to take place, and we, therefore, recommend that for existing holders of these posts the scale which we have allotted to Inspectors Grade I in Kenya should be applied, viz. (inclusive of the inducement addition) £648(713)x24-672x30-822: 912x36-1128(1241), the allowance to bring the present basic salary up to £550 being continued, if necessary, on the basis of minimum total emoluments of £743.

349. There are also a number of locally domiciled Inspectors on a salary scale of three-fifths of this grade, viz. £294(397)x12-414x15-429(579). For these we propose the salary scale that we have assigned in Kenya to Inspector Grade II, viz: £462(508)x18-516x24-636(700). In view of the fact that the overseas Inspectorate is dying, we do not feel justified in introducing into Uganda the salary scale which we have assigned to Grade I Inspectors in Kenya as a permanent feature of the pay structure of the Uganda Police Force. If further promotion prospects for African Inspectors are desired it will probably be better to do this by introducing, after consultation with the other East African Administrations, the grade of Chief Inspector on the salary scale that we have assigned for this rank in Kenya.

/350. On this basis, therefore,

350. On this basis, therefore, the existing scales and our proposed scales and grading are as follows:-

Uganda Police

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing Salary Scales</u>	<u>Proposed Salary Scales</u>	<u>Grading</u>
Recruit	£40/16s(55): 42(57)	£72(79)x2/8s-96x3 (biennially)-108(119)	P14A
Constable	£43/4s(58)x1/4s.-66(89)		
Corporal	£54(73)x1/16s-72(97)	£96(106)x4/16s-120(132)	P12A
Sergeant	£66(89)x3-75(101)	£132(145)x6-144(158)	P11A
Station Sergeant	£81(109)x3-90(122)	£150(165)x6-168(186)	P10A
Head Constable	£105(142)x3-111(150)	£174(191)x6-186(205)	P9A
Head Constable-Major	£114(154)x3-120(162)	£192(211)x6-204(224)	P8A
Sub-Inspector	£112(151)x6-136x8-144x9 -180x10-240x15-330(446)	£180(198)x12-228: 252x12-336x18-480(528)	P7+5
Inspector	£294(396)x12-414x15- 429(579)	£462(508)x18-516x24- 636(700)	P3
Inspector	£490(662)x20-690x25- 715(965)	(a) £648(713)x24-672x30-822: 912x36-1128(1241)	P2
Inspector (Technical)	£490(662)x20-690x25- 840(1134)	(a) £648(713)x24-672x30-822: 912x36-1128(1241)	P2

(a) Total of scale and inducement addition.

/Zanzibar Police

351. Zanzibar Police

In Zanzibar the existing Police salary scales and our proposed scales are as follows:-

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing Salary Scale</u>	<u>Proposed Salary Scale</u>	<u>Grading</u>
Recruit	£40/16s(55): 42(57)	£72(79)x2/8s-96x3 (biennially)x108(119)	P14A
Constable	£43/4s(58)x1/4s-66(89)		
Corporal	£54(73)x1/16s-72(97)	£96(106)x4/16s-120(132)	P12A
Sergeant	£66(89)x3-75(101)	£132(145)x6-144(158)	P11A
Station Sergeant	£78(105)x3-84(113)	£150(165)x6-162(178)	P10B
Sergeant- Major	£87(117)x3-90(122)	£168(185)	
Sergeant Mechanic			
Regimental Sergeant- Major	£105(142)x3-120(162)	£174(191)x6-204(224)	P9A-8A
Assistant Inspector	£120(162)x12-170x12- 254x12-360(483)	£180(198)x12-228: 252x12- 336x18-480(528)	P7+5
Inspector of Police	£360(483)x15-375x15- 420(561)	£462(508)x18-516x24- 636(700)	P3
Chief Inspector	£430(574)x20-550(743)	£498(548)x18-516x24-636: 714x30-894(983)	P2

352. We have already stated that we have not generally considered the various allowances recommended for the Kenya Police Force by the Police Commission. Nor have we found it possible to study the allowances at present paid by the East African Administrations to their Police Forces. In view, however, of the fact that we have devised our proposed salary scales for the other Police Forces on the basis of those recommended in consultation with us by the Police Commission for the Kenya Police, it would be in accordance with our views if the allowances paid to the Police were also revised to conform to the Kenya pattern, regard being taken, of course, to variations in circumstances and in rank structure. This can only be achieved by interterritorial consultation and, if our recommendations regarding the new Police salary scales are accepted, we strongly recommend that these should be taken in hand.

/353. Notes regarding Police
gazetted ranks

Notes regarding Police gazetted ranks

353. Although we are not dealing generally in this Chapter with the gazetted ranks of the Police, it may be convenient at this point to add that under our proposals officers below the rank of Assistant Commissioner who are in charge of Provinces will, as in the case of other Provincial Heads of departments, be eligible for the provincial allowance under the conditions recommended in paragraph 244 of this Report.

354. It will also be observed from the relevant Appendix to this Report that we have provided in all territories broken scales for the ranks of Assistant Superintendent and Superintendent. We support the Kenya Police Commission in this proposal.

Application of Police salaries and conditions of Service to Prisons and Customs Departments

355. While the Police Commission have recommended that Police conditions, including pay, allowances and other emoluments, should be fixed independently of those of the Civil Service and prescribed by regulations under the Police Ordinance, they have qualified this by stating that this does not mean that the actual terms of service which are decided upon should bear no relation to those given to men recruited from the same sources and employed in comparable work elsewhere in Government service. We agree with this qualification and have, therefore, in so far as the grades with which we are dealing in this Chapter are concerned, recommended similar salaries for the uniformed staff of the Prisons and Customs and Excise Departments. We have, however, as we have stated above, not studied either the various allowances recommended by the Police Commission for the Kenya Police or the allowances at present in issue in the Prisons and Customs and Excise Departments in East Africa. We recommend that this question of allowances in these Departments should receive the attention of the Governments concerned, and that such allowances as may be agreed upon for the Police Forces should be applied, where appropriate, to them. We would, however, once again put in a plea for uniformity in this matter, to be obtained by interterritorial agreement.

356. So far as salary scales themselves are concerned, we are once again confronted with the difficulty that the organisation of the departments with which we are now dealing differs from that of Police Forces, and also that the rank structures of similar departments in the various territories differ between themselves. Our proposed salary scales in these departments are necessarily based on things as we find them, and we have devised these scales by adapting to the best of our ability the scales proposed for the Police Forces to suit the existing rank structure in each case. We venture to suggest, however, although this is not strictly our concern, that this is not a satisfactory long-term solution of the problem, particularly in the case of the Prisons Departments. What is required is a reorganisation of the Prisons Departments on some more or less uniform model within East Africa. For example, in Kenya there is, apart from one post of Assistant, a notable gap between the grade of Chief Warder Grade I, at present on a salary rising from £117(170) to £153(214), and that of Assistant Superintendent of Prisons with a scale starting on a salary of £550(743). In Tanganyika this gap is filled by three grades of

/Chief Warder

Chief Warder under the titles of Special grade, Grade I and Grade II. In Uganda the Chief Warder grades are of a lower salary status and the gap is filled by a grade of Jailers on a long scale starting from £100(135) and rising to £330(446). Looking at the problem purely from a structural point of view, we would suggest that the titles of Warder and Chief Warder should be confined to grades rising, under our proposals, to a salary of £270(297). Parallel to this, however, there should be grades of Assistant Prisons Officer on a scale of £162(178) rising to £228(251) with an entry point at £180 for a candidate with a School Certificate qualification, a grade of Prisons Officer rising from £252(277) to £480(528) and on top of this a grade of Chief Prisons Officer on a salary scale of £498(548) rising to £636(700). This would allow of four promotion ladders, viz. from Warder to Chief Warder, from Warder, Chief Warder or Assistant Prisons Officer to the grade of Prisons Officer, from Assistant Prisons Officer or Prisons Officer to Chief Prisons Officer, and from any of the lower ranks to the grade of Assistant Superintendent of Prisons via, if necessary, a Training Grade.

357. Whether such a reorganisation would suit the requirements of the Prisons Departments is a matter which can only be decided in the light of technical knowledge, but if our general recommendation that ladders of promotion should be provided whereby junior officers are given opportunities of promotion, as far as their ability and devotion to duty will take them, is to be implemented, it is clear that some considerable reorganisation on those general lines is necessary.

Proposals for Kenya Prisons Department
under present structure

358. To return to things as we find them, the existing grades in Kenya with their present salary scales and our proposed scales and grading are as follows:-

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing Scales</u>	<u>Proposed Scales</u>	<u>Grading</u>
Recruit	£37/16s(60)	£72(79)x2/8s-84x3 (biennially)-96(106)	P16A
Warder	£40/4s(64)x1/4s- 53/8s(86)		
Lance Corporal Warder	£54(86)x1/16s-61/4s(98)	£84(92)x2/8s-96x3 (biennially)-108(119)	P15A
Corporal Warder	£63(101)x1/16s-70/4s(112)	£96(106)x4/16s-120(132)	P12A
Sergeant Warder	£78(122)x3-93(140)	£132(145)x6-168(185)	P11A-10A
Warder Artisan	£54(86)x3-93(140)	£84(92)x2/8s-96x4/16s-120: 132x6-168(185)	P13A
Warder Clerk	£57(91)x3-96(130)		
Chief Warder	£96(144)x3-114(166)	£174(191)x6-204(224)	P9A-8A
Grade II Chief	£99(148)x3-117(170)		
Warder Clerk Grade II			
Chief Warder Grade I	£117(170)x6-153(214)	£210(231)x12-270(297)	P6A
Chief Warder Clerk Grade I	£120(174)x6-156(217)		
Assistant	£162(225)x9-270(365)	£288(317)x12-336x18- 480(528)	P5

Proposals for Tanganyika Prisons Department
under present structure

359. In Tanganyika the existing scales and our proposed scales and grading are as follows:-

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing Scales</u>	<u>Proposed Scales</u>	<u>Grading</u>
Recruit Warder	£40/16s(55)	£72(79)x2/8s-96x3 (biennially)-108(119)	P14A
Warder Grade III	£43/4s(58)x1/4s-52/16s x1/16s-60(81)		
Wardee Grade II	£61/16s(83)x1/16s-69(93)	£96(106)x4/16s- 120(132)	P12A
Warder Grade I	£70/16s(95)x1/16s-78(105)	£132(145)x6-168(185)	P10A
Chief Warder Grade IV	£84(113)x7/4s-120x9- 183(247)	£174(191)x6-210x12- 270(297)	P9A+8A +6A
Chief Warder Grade III			
Chief Warder Grade II			
Chief Warder Grade II	£190(257)x10-240x12- 300(405)	£288(317)x12-336x18- 480(528)	P5
Chief Warder Grade I	£300(405)x12-360x15- 465(628)	£498(548)x18-516x24- 636(700)	C6-5
Chief Warder Special Grade	£470(635)x20-550(743)	£540(594)x24-636: 714x30-954(1049)	P1

/360. Proposals for Uganda Prisons
Dept. etc

Proposals for Uganda Prisons Department
under present structure

360. In Uganda the existing scales and our proposed scales and grading are as follows:-

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing Scales</u>	<u>Proposed Scales</u>	<u>Grading</u>
Recruit	£40/16s(55)	} £72(79)x2/8s-84x3 (biennially)-96(106)	P16A
Warder	£43/4s(58)x1/4s-56/8s(76)		
Lance Corporal Warder	£51/12s(70)x1/16s-58/16s (79)	£84(92)x2/8s-96x3 (biennially)-108(119)	P15A
Corporal Warder	£55/4s(75)x1/16s-66(89)	£96(106)x4/16s-120(132)	P12A
Sergeant Warder	£62/8s(84)x1/16s -69(93)	£132(145)x6-144(158)	P11A
Chief Warder Class III	£72(97)x2/8s-90(122)	£150(168)x6-168(185)	P10A
Chief Warder Class II	£93(125)x3-111(150)	£174(191)x6-186(205)	P9A
Chief Warder Class I	£114(154)x3-120(162)	£192(211)x6-204(224)	P8A
Chief Warder Luzira Prison	£132(178)x3-150(203)	£210(231)x12-270(297)	P6A
Jailers	£100(135)x6-136x8 -144x9 -180x10-240x15-330(446)	£180(198)x12-228: 252x12 P7-5 -336x18-480(528)	

Proposals for Zanzibar Prisons Department

361. In Zanzibar the existing salary scales, our proposed salary scales and gradings are as follows:-

<u>Rank</u>			
Warder	£40/16s(55): 43/4sx12 -56/8s(76)	} £72(79)x2/8s-84x3 (biennially)-96(106)	P16A
Wardress	£43/4s(58)x1/4s-56/8s(76)		
Corporal	£55/4s(75)x1/16s-66(89)	£96(106)x4/16s-120(132)	P12A
Sergeant	£62/8s(84)x1/16s-69(93)	£132(145)x6-144(158)	P11A
Chief Warder	£114(154)x4/10s-132(178)	£192(211)x6-204(224)	P8A

/362. Rent of Quarters in Police and
Prisons Departments

Rent on Quarters in Police and Prisons Departments

362. The Kenya Police Commission have recommended that Police ranks below that of Assistant Inspector in the Kenya Police Force should be eligible for free quarters, and that in the case of Assistant Inspectors and above rent should be paid. In devising our scales for Police and Prisons we have attempted to follow this principle, and the P Scales lettered A or B in the relevant Appendices are intended to carry with them the privilege of free quarters. It will be seen that in the case of Police Forces other than that of Kenya, we have assumed that Sergeants-Major in the case of Tanganyika, Head Constables and Head Constables-Major in the case of Uganda and the Regimental Sergeant-Major in Zanzibar will be eligible for free quarters. In the case of the Prisons Departments the problem is more difficult, owing to the multiplicity and variety of roughly corresponding ranks in the various territories, but under our proposals all ranks up to and including Chief Warder Grade I in Kenya, Chief Warder Grade III in Tanganyika, Chief Warder Luzira Prison in Uganda and Chief Warder in Zanzibar should receive free quarters.

Treatment of Recruits in Police and Prisons Departments

363. It will be observed that throughout the Police and Prisons Departments we have followed the Kenya Police Commission in assigning no separate salary for Recruits, it being considered that they will be enlisted on the minimum salary for a Constable or Warder as the case may be.

Application of Police salaries and conditions of service to Customs Departments

364. We now turn to the Customs and Excise Departments, which present less difficulty, since the collection of customs and excise revenue on the mainland is centralised in the Customs and Excise Department of the High Commission and we have, therefore, only to deal with the uniformed staff of that department and the Customs Department of Zanzibar.

365. We have assumed throughout that this staff will not be eligible for free quarters and have, therefore, not employed the lettered P Scales. If any employees are eligible for free quarters they should, under our proposals, be placed on the corresponding P Scales lettered A.

366. Although the mainland department is centralised under the High Commission the salary scales paid to the uniformed staff vary at present between the three territories, and we have shown these variations in the table below. It seems, however, clearly desirable that there should be common scales of remuneration,

/wherever the staff is employed

wherever the staff is employed, and we therefore propose single scales.

East African Customs and Excise Department

367.

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing Salary Scales</u>	<u>Proposed Salary Scales</u>	<u>Grading</u>
	Kenya £40/4s(64)x1/4s) -52/4s(84) }		
Preventive men	Tanganyika £40/16s(55)x1/4s) -66(89) }	£78(86)x2/8s-102x3 (biennially)-114(125)	P14
	Uganda £40/4s(64)x1/4s) -52/4s(70) }		
	Kenya £54(86)x1/16s-) 70/4s(113) }		
Corporal	Tanganyika £54(73)x1/16s-) 72(97) }	£102(112)x4/16s- 126(139)	P12
	Uganda £54(73)x1/16s-) 70/4s(95) }		
	Kenya £78(122)x3-) 93(140) }		
Sergeant	Tanganyika £66(89)x3-) 96(130) }	£138(152)x6- 174(191)	P11-10
	Uganda £78(105)x3-) 90(122) }		
	Kenya £96(144)x3-) 114(166) }		
Sergeant-Major	Tanganyika £105(142)x3-) 120(162) }	£180(198)x6- 210(231)	P9-8
	Uganda £96(130)x3-) 114(154) }		
Assistant Inspector	£255(344)x15- 375(506)	£180(198)x12-228: 252x12-336x18- 480(528)	P7+5
Inspector	£405(546)x15- 465(628)	£462(598)x18- 516x24-636(790)	C5

/368. Zanzibar Customs Department

Zanzibar Customs Department

368. The corresponding table in Zanzibar is as follows:-

<u>Rank</u>	<u>Existing Salary Scales</u>	<u>Proposed Salary Scales</u>	<u>Grading</u>
Watchman	£40/16s(55): 42: 43/4s x1/4s-66(89)	£78(86)x2/8s-102x3 (biennially)-114(125)	P14
Corporal	£54(73)x1/16s-72(97)	£102(112)x4/16s- 126(139)	P12
Sergeant	£66(89)x3-75(101)	£138(152)x6-150(165)	P11
Assistant Inspector, Preventive Force	£120(162)x12-360(483)	£180(198)x12-228: 252x12-336x18- 480(528)	P7+5
Inspector, Preventive Force	£430(574)x30-550(730)	£498(548)x18-516x24- 636: 714x30-894(983)	P2

CHAPTER XVIITHE PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENTSThe Professional Grades

369. Engineers, Architects and Quantity Surveyors possessing the prescribed qualifications of their professions are at present on the professional scale £550(743)-1320(1870), and have been assigned the new Scale A by us. We deal in Chapter XX of this Report with the question of entry points for the professions generally, and reference is also made in that Chapter to the position of Pupil Engineers.

The Technical Grades

370 The technical grades of the Departments present a complex problem. The number of grades employed in the three mainland territories is large and varied, and the difficulty of forming a composite picture is aggravated by variations in initial and terminal points of scales in different administrations, the presence of racial differentiations in some of the scales, differences in designations of grades and the application in some grades of the same title over a very wide salary range. The title of Mechanic, for instance, is applied indiscriminately at present (in the Public Works and other departments alike) to posts the salaries of which range from £100 to £840 per annum. The titles of Foreman and Artisan similarly cover a wide variety of grades. In Kenya and Uganda an Engineering Assistant is a product of the P.W.D. Engineering School in Uganda entering the service at £276 or thereabouts; in Tanganyika this grade is known as Technical Assistant, and the title of Engineering Assistant is applied to a grade on a scale of £840-1080.

371. If a general uniformity of pattern is to be the aim, and racial differentiation is to be removed (and we understand that this is desired in the Public Works Departments as much as in any others), there are certain principles by which we think that we must be guided:-

- (i) the present minor differences in starting and terminal points of scales must be abolished where, broadly speaking, the same level of responsibility exists;
- (ii) if there is to be close grading, as there is at present and as we agree there should be in this type of post, there must be a structure which offers reasonable avenues of progression to the officer who is ready to fit himself for advancement by good work in the field or by qualifying himself in his trade;
- (iii) differing degrees of responsibility should be marked by differences in titles of posts, and those titles should follow a broadly uniform pattern throughout the administrations.

/In these

372. In these circumstances, we think it best to illustrate our recommendations by means of two tables. Table A below shows a representative section of the present gradings of technical staff in the mainland territories. The table is not intended to be comprehensive, but we think that there should be little difficulty in determining the appropriate placement of any existing post which does not appear in it. Table B shows the grading which we recommend should be assigned to each group of Table A, together with our suggestions for a uniform pattern of nomenclature for the respective grades. We should explain at this point that we have not included Zanzibar in these tables because the Department is relatively a small one. In the relevant Appendices we have assigned to present Zanzibar posts the grading that seems to be appropriate on this general pattern, and leave it to the Zanzibar Government to make any change in grading or nomenclature which may seem desirable in the application of our recommendations to local conditions:-

TABLE A PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENTS PRESENT MAIN GRADINGS OF TECHNICAL STAFF

Group	KENYA	£	£	Group	TANGANYIKA	£	£	Group	UGANDA	£	£
1.	Senior Road Surveyor	935(1262)	-1005(1355)	1.	Engineering Assistant	840(1134)	-1080(1430)	1.	Superintendent of Works	920(1242)	-1000(1350)
	Road Superintendent	865(1168)	-1005(1355)								
	Senior Inspector of Works	865(1168)	-1005(1355)								
	Water Superintendent	865(1168)	-1005(1355)								
	Electrical Supervisor	740(999)	-1080(1430)								
2.	Senior Inspector of Works	740(999)	- 840(1134)	2.	Works Superintendent			2.	Senior Supervisor	550(743)	-890(1202)
	Road Superintendent	740(999)	- 840(1134)		Mechanical Superintendent	630(851)	-				
	Mechanical Plant Inspector	740(999)	- 840(1134)		Waterworks Superintendent	880(1188)					
	Inspector of Works (Bridges)				Electrical Superintendent						
	Assistant Road Superintendent	650(877)	- 790(1066)								
	Senior Foreman Electrician	790(1066)	-900(1215)								
	Senior Inspector (Water)	670(904)	-840(1134)								
	Inspector of Works (Water)	550(743)	-790(1066)								
3.	Joinery Shop Foreman	550(743)	-715(965)	3.	Foreman Operator			3.	Senior Sub-Overseer		
	Workshops Foreman	550(743)	-715(965)		Road Foreman	550(743)	-630(851)		(Special Class)	450(608)	-550(743)
	Senior Foreman (Asian)	450(608)	-550(743)		Airport Foreman						
	Engineering Assistant (Asian)	450(608)	-550(743)								
	Foreman Electrician	550(743)	-715(965)								
	Foreman (Buildings & Roads)	550(743)	-650(877)								

TABLE A (Contd) PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENTS

PRESENT MAIN GRADINGS OF TECHNICAL STAFF

Group.	KENYA	£	Group.	TANGANYIKA	£	Group.	UGANDA	£
4.	Engineering Assistant	276(372)-450(608)	4.	Technical Assistant	285(383)-550(743)	4.	Senior Engineering Assistant L.C.S.Special Division	295(398)-565(762)
							Engineering Assistant L.C.S.Professional Division	190(256)-405(546)
5.	Foreman Grade I (Asian)	375(506)-450(608)	5.	Junior Road Foreman (Executive Division) Works Overseer (Executive Division) Artisan (" ") Assistant Elec.Inspector (Executive Division)	255(344)- 550(743)	5.	Sub-Overseer (Executive Class) Artisan (Executive Class) Building Inspector (Executive Class) Water Inspector (Executive Class)	255(344)-450(608)
6.	Mistri Foreman Grade II(Asian) Artisan Supervisor	255(344)-360(486) 255(344)-360(486) 220(297)-315(425)	6.			6.		
7.	Artisan Grade I	220(297)-255(344)	7-9	Road Overseer (General Division) Works Overseer (General Division) Artisan (General Division)	60(81)-240(324)	7-9	Sub-Overseer (General Class) Artisan (General Class) Road Inspector. (General Class)	100(135)-240(324)
8.	Artisan Grade II	100(149)-172(237)						
9.	Artisan Grade III	72(116)-105(155)						

PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENTSTABLE B. PROPOSED GRADING OF STAFF BELOW PROFESSIONAL LEVEL

<u>Group No.</u> <u>(Table A)</u>	<u>Proposed future</u> <u>Grading</u>	<u>Suggested uniform nomenclature</u> <u>for main grades</u>
1.	C2	Superintendent or Chief Inspector
2.	C4-3	Assistant Superintendent or Inspector
3.	C5-4	Assistant Inspector or Senior Foreman
4.	C6-4 (with C3 as promotion post)	C3 Senior Engineering Assistant C6-4 Engineering Assistant
5.	Regrade in approximate segments of C or E Scales (see paras 168-173 & 195)	Foreman Grade I
6.		Foreman Grade II
7.		Artisan or Headman Grade I
8.		Artisan or Headman Grade II
9.		Artisan or Headman Grade III

The Grade of Senior Supervisor, Uganda.

373. This grade now has a scale £550(743) - 890(1202). In order to conform to the principle of close grading which has been adopted we suggest that it be divided into two grades and redesignated as follows:-

Inspector	-	C4-3
Assistant Inspector	-	C5-4

Engineering Assistant (Kenya and Uganda) and Technical Assistant (Tanganyika)

374. We have dealt with the entry point of this grade in paragraph 212 of Chapter XI. Our recommendation is that the salary scale should be C6-4, with one or more promotion grades to be added on the higher C segments as they become necessary.

Regrading of Groups 5-9

375. We have not proposed any detailed pattern of grading for these groups because we regard them as falling within the range of analogous services on which we have commented in paragraphs 168 to 173 of Chapter X. For the reason given in paragraph 173, we do not feel competent to attempt a detailed regrading; in a department of such technical diversity, the task is essentially for those who possess both the professional and the local knowledge. But we emphasise once again the double objective of such a regrading - to ensure a properly graded structure of remuneration by responsibility, and to remove racial differentiation where it may be found. It is essential also in this case that the apprenticeship and trade testing system, on which East Africa has made a good beginning, should be so developed that a rising standard of qualification may be laid down for each step in the ladder of progression. Subject to these comments, we must leave the administrations to entrust the task to those who have the knowledge to undertake it, calling attention once more to the principles of regrading which we have advocated in paragraphs 159, 169-174 and 194, and to our recommendation on uniformity in regrading and in nomenclature contained in paragraph 195.

Works Staff in Tanganyika

376. We must add a note before leaving Groups 5-9, that Tanganyika stands in a special position in regard to some of the grades involved. The Tanganyika Government has adopted, after careful and lengthy consideration, a system under which the bulk of its artisan grades are, we understand, classified as Works Staff, only a small number being carried on the regular establishment. Works Staff are remunerated at appropriate market rates; and are eligible for a bonus on leaving Government employment after a minimum period of five years' continuous service. As this decision has been reached and implemented so recently and after so much deliberation, we do not suggest that the Tanganyika Government should reverse it, and to that extent our recommendations should be held not to apply to the Tanganyika Service.

/Mechanics

Mechanics

377. We have already remarked above on the possibilities of confusion existing in this grade at present because of the absence of distinction in nomenclature. We suggest as a pattern the following grading and titles:-

Superintendent or Chief Inspector (Mechanical)	C2
(where required)	
Inspector (Mechanical)	C4-3
Foreman Mechanic	C5-4
Mechanics Grade I	} to be regraded as in paragraphs 168-173
Grade II	
Grade III	
Mechanical Assistant	Subordinate service

Electrical Branch

378. We suggest the following pattern of grades and titles:-

Superintendent (Electrical)	C2
Inspector (Electrical)	C4-3
Foreman (Electrical)	C5-4
Electricians Grade I	} to be regraded as in paragraphs 168-173
Grade II	
Wiremen Grade I	
Grade II	

CHAPTER XVIIICOMMENTS ON OTHER DEPARTMENTSDepartments common to several administrations369. Accountant GeneralKenya - Accounts Division, Treasury.

Stores Verifiers: We have assigned the B Scale to these posts on the assumption that they are of the same status as Treasury Accountants.

Tanganyika Stock Verifier: We have assigned the B Scale for the same reason as for Stores Verifiers, Kenya.

Hollerith Operator: We have marked this post "Regrade" to enable the Tanganyika Government to decide whether it should be properly graded as C5 or on the top segments of the E Scale.

Hollerith Supervisor: We have assigned C4-3 to this post on the assumption that previous experience is required.

370. Administrator General and Registrar General

Kenya Trust Officer:)
Assistant Registrar of Trade Unions:) On the information given to us regarding the duties of these officers we consider that the B Scale should be assigned to them.

Uganda Examiner of Accounts: It seems to us that this post should also fall properly into the B Scale and we have provisionally graded it accordingly, subject to consideration by the Uganda Government.

Zanzibar Administrator General's Agents: These posts also appear to us to fall into the B Scale.

371. AgricultureKenya - Board of Agriculture.

Secretary:)
Secretary, Water Resources Authority:) We have marked these posts "Regrade" to enable the Kenya Government to determine whether the duties require a B or alternatively a C grading

/Agricultural Department -
Plant Breeding Services, etc.

Agricultural Department -

Plant Breeding Services - Assistant Plant Breeder: (£300-550))
Sugar Services - Assistant Agricultural Officer: (£300-550))
Field Services - Assistant Agricultural Officer: (£300-550))

We have assigned C5-3 to these posts on the assumption that the present salary contains racial differentiation.

Soil Conservation Headquarters - Assistant Surveyors:

We have marked these appointments "Regrade" and the appropriate grading should be assigned to them under our recommendations in paragraph

Tanganyika Secretary: We have marked this point "Regrado" on the assumption that the Tanganyika Government will wish to place it in the appropriate segment of the B Scale.

Uganda - Administrative Division - Administrative Assistant:

We have marked this post "Regrado" on the assumption that the Uganda Government will assign the appropriate segment of the B Scale to this class of appointment.

372. Co-operative Development

Uganda - Assistant Co-operative Officers: These appointments have been marked "Regrado". The appropriate grading for posts filled by candidates from Makerere is C5-3 or C6-4, according to length of course. For the posts which are now in the Professional Division Grade II we suggest that the appropriate segments of the E Scale should be given.

373. Forests

Kenya - Administrative and General - Learner: (£150-200): We are unable to assign any grading to this scale.

Senior Assistant Foresters:)
Assistant Foresters:)

We have marked these posts "Regrado" on the assumption that they will be placed in the appropriate segments of C or E Scales.

Forest Guards: We have marked the three grades of Forest Guard "Regrado". In Tanganyika, Forest Guards are graded in the Subordinate Service and the Kenya Government will wish to consider the application to them of our proposed new Subordinate Service range. We invite attention also to the new rates recommended for the lowest uniformed ranks in the Police, Prisons and Customs services.

374. Geological Survey

Tanganyika Associate Chemists:) We understand that the former
Assistant Chemists:) grade hold a South African
 qualification whereas the latter were recruited
 from Makerere and that the former hold the higher
 qualification. On this assumption we have
 assigned the grading C5-3 and C6-4 respectively.

Uganda Field Officers: We have assigned the A Scale
 on the assumption that these are fully qualified
 professional officers.

Records Officer (Woman): We have marked this post
 "Regrade". If this officer holds the full
 professional qualification she should be assigned
 the A(W) Scale; if not, the grading should be
 B(W)5-2.

Assistant Chemists: We have assigned the grading
 C6-4 to these posts on the assumption that they
 are equivalent in qualification to the lesser of
 the Tanganyika posts (see comment on Tanganyika
 above).

375. Government Chemist

Tanganyika Associate Chemists:)
Assistant Chemists:) See comment under Geological
 Survey above.

376. Immigration

Immigration Officers: We have assigned the B Scale
 to this grade, and suggest that the following pattern
 and nomenclature should be adopted by all
 administrations:-

Immigration Officer: B5-2

Senior or Deputy Principal Immigration Officer: BI

Kenya Immigration Officer (£180-465): We have marked
 this post to be regraded and leave it to the Kenya
 Government to allot the appropriate grading in the
 light of our recommendation for the Immigration
 Officer grade above.

Tanganyika Passport Officer (Female) (£550-780): We have marked
 this post "Regrade". If this officer is an Immigration
 Officer the scale to be assigned should be B(W)5-2;
 if the post is in the grade of Woman Administrative
 Assistant, as the existing salary implies, the grading
 should be B(W)5-3.

/Judicial

Resident Magistrates

377. Judicial

Resident Magistrates: We have been impressed by representations made to us by the Chief Justices and by the Resident Magistrates themselves on the restricted promotion prospects enjoyed by Resident Magistrates. Their normal expectations are of promotion to the post of Puisne Judge, and in practice promotion has proved to be very slow as compared with the number of Magistrates serving on the timescale. We think that there is a case for the creation of a few posts of Senior Magistrate in order to give this grade a reasonable expectation of promotion, and if this suggestion is favoured by the administrations we recommend that the grade of Senior Resident Magistrate should be placed on the first super-scale in our recommendations in Chapter XIX i.e. £1740(1902)-1860(2022).

Interpreters: Interpreters are, as a rule, at present paid in all administrations on the clerical scales, though Zanzibar has two posts of Head Interpreter which are on superior scales. We have marked the higher grade of Interpreters, i.e. those whose salary scales extend at present beyond £375, for regrading. We suggest that in the course of this regrading, however, administrations may wish to adopt the Zanzibar system and grade such posts as Chief or Senior Interpreter as may be appropriate. If this is done, we suggest that the salary scale of such posts should be C5, but that Interpreters promoted or placed in this grade should cease to draw any of the language allowances which are at present paid to Interpreters on the clerical scales. These allowances would, however, be continued for Interpreters placed on the new E Scales where they are at present paid.

Kenya Probation Officers: We have assigned the B Scale to this grade.

Uganda Librarian-Secretary: We have assumed that a qualified Librarian is not required for this post and have, therefore, assigned to it the grading appropriate to its present salary.

378. Labour

Chief Inspectors of Factories:)

Inspectors of Factories:) We suggest that these titles should be reserved for posts in which a professional engineering qualification is required; the A Scale will then be assigned to such posts. Where the professional engineering qualification is not required these titles should not be used for the posts and they should fall into the category in the note immediately following.

/Engineer Surveyors:
etc.

Engineer Surveyors:)
Trade Testing Inspectors:)
Boiler Inspectors:)
and similar grades.) As we understand the position, engineering qualifications are not required for these posts, but some form of technical qualification is stipulated. The posts should, therefore, properly be graded in either the B or the C Scales according to the value of the qualification required, which, we suggest, should be settled by comparison with the qualifications demanded for technical masters and technical instructors respectively (see paragraphs 291-292). We have accordingly marked all such posts "Regrade" except those which are clearly professional.

Labour Officers: We have assigned the B Scale to this grade (see Chapter XII) and suggest that the normal pattern of grading should be:-

Assistant Labour Officers:	B5
Labour Officers:	B4-2
Senior Labour Officers:	B1

Kenya Assistant Industrial Relations Officers: We understand that these officers are not of Makerere or the equivalent level and have, therefore, assigned the E Scale to the posts.

Registration of Persons - Fingerprint Clerks: We are informed that these clerks are engaged on specialised work and are, therefore, unlikely to be transferred, but that they are treated as part of the general cadre of the clerical service for purposes of promotion. It may be thought equitable to arrange a structure of posts inside the department which will provide a suitable internal promotion system for this particular class.

Uganda Assistant Labour Officers: We assume that, if the present designation of these posts is retained, they should go on to the B Scale in segment B5 in accordance with the pattern for Labour Officers recommended above; if, however, the duties are not of this status, the posts should be graded in the E Scale.

379. Lands and Surveys

Kenya Lands Department - Land Officers:)
Principal Registrar of Titles:)
Registrars of Titles:)
 These posts should be graded on the A Scale if legal qualifications are required; if not, they should be graded on the B Scale.

Tanganyika Survey Division - Computers: If a professional surveyor's or other qualification is required for these posts the grading should be A; if not, they should be on the B Scale.

Air Survey Division For grading Pilots see under Civil Aviation (High Commission) below.

/Uganda Senior Land and Mines Secretary:
Land and Mines Secretary:

UgandaSenior Land and Mines Secretary:)Land and Mines Secretary:)

We have assigned Scale B to these posts but suggest that, as the present salaries are identical, they should form one grade.

Computers: See note under Tanganyika above.

Draughtsman: We suggest that the present grade on the salary scale £550-840 should be separated into two grades in accordance with the structure recommended in paragraph 262.

380. Legal Crown Counsel: The same considerations apply as are pointed out in paragraph 377 above in regard to Resident Magistrates. We suggest that the administrations should consider the creation of a few posts of Senior Crown Counsel (where they do not exist already) on the superscale £1740(1902)-1860(2022).

Tanganyika Legal Assistant: We assign the B Scale to this grade.

UgandaCrown Prosecutor:)Law Clerk:)

We understand that, as full professional qualifications are not at present required, these two posts also should appropriately be placed on the B Scale. The post of Court Prosecutor in the Department of Commerce falls into the same category.

Zanzibar

Legal Assistant: We have graded this post in the B Scale also.

381. Legislative Council

Kenya

Clerk to Legislative Council: If professional qualifications are required for the post, the grading should be A; otherwise the post should be on the B Scale.

382. Printing and Stationery:

We regard the senior timescale posts in the three mainland departments as being somewhat under-graded at present in view of the volume of work and responsibility attached to them, and we have, therefore, recommended the following revised gradings:-

Assistant Government Printer:	C1
Press Superintendent or	
Letterpress Superintendent:	C2
Press Engineer:	C3-2

This involves a substantial up-grading of Press Engineer in Tanganyika, and we have assigned the scale C3-2 to this post on the assumption that the status of the post is the same as that of the similar posts in the other two territories.

/Linotype Operators:
etc.

Linotype Operators:)

Monotype Operators:)

Foremen, etc.:)

We have found it very difficult to suggest suitable revised salary scales for these grades, which carry the same titles in the mainland administrations, because of the wide variations in present grading, and in the status and salary of posts the duties of which appear to be the same. In Kenya there appears to be employment of Europeans on operative work to a far greater extent than is found necessary in the other territories. We have, therefore, had no alternative but to mark a good many of these posts "Regrade", and we would further suggest to the Kenya Government that the regrading process in the Kenya department should be accompanied by an examination by an impartial grading team of the nature of employment given to the various races and the remuneration paid for it.

383.

Prisons

We have allotted the scale C5-2 to the present grade of Assistant Superintendent and Superintendent of Prisons, and we suggest the grading should be:-

Assistant Superintendent:	C5
Superintendent:	C4-2

There is some variation in the grading of the senior posts in the departments below the Commissioner. Our recommendations for these posts are as follows:-

- (i) The Deputy Commissioner of Prisons, Kenya should be raised to the first superscale grade £1740(1902)-1860(2022).
- (ii) The Assistant Commissioner (Approved School), Kenya, the Assistant Commissioner, Tanganyika and the Assistant Commissioner, Uganda should be graded C1, and
- (iii) the Superintendent of Prisons, Zanzibar should be graded C2-1.

Kenya

Assistant Storekeeper: If the holder of this post is in sole charge of the store, the grading should be C5-4; if he works to another officer who is in charge of stores, the grading should be C5 - (see paragraph 270).

Tanganyika

Assistant Veterinary Officer: We have assumed from the present salary that this post is not held by a Makerere-qualified officer. We have, therefore, assigned the E Scale to it, and suggest redesignation.

384. Provincial Administration

Liwalis:)
Mudirs:)
Kathis:)
Chiefs:)
Akidas:) Except in the case of Mudirial
 officers in Zanzibar we have decided that it
 would be preferable not to attempt ourselves
 to apply the new salary scale structure to
 these posts. We think that it would be
 advisable to leave the detailed application
 of the new scales to the Governments who may,
 in their turn, take their Provincial Commissioners
 into consultation before coming to a final decision.
 We have, therefore, marked all these posts "Regrade".
 For Zanzibar, our recommendation is that there should
 be two grades of Mudirial officers, the higher grade
 on C6-5 and the lower on E4-1.

Tanganyika Development of Sukumaland - Assistant Livestock
Officer:

This post is at
 present on the professional scale, £550-1320.
 If the holder is required to have the professional
 veterinary qualification the title should be
 altered.

385. Public Relations and Information

Kenya Provincial Information Organisation - Assistant
Provincial Information Officers (Scales MI and MII):
 We have assigned the E Scale to those posts on the
 assumption that the holders are not required to be
 Makerere-qualified officers.

Uganda Assistant Information Officer: We have assigned
 the E Scale to this post on the assumption that the
 holder is not required to be a Makerere-qualified
 officer.

Engineering Assistants: The scale C6-4 has been
 assigned to these posts on the assumption that the
 holders are products of the Engineering School in
 the same way as holders of similarly-named posts
 in the Public Works Department.

386. Public Works Department

Kenya - Administrative and General

Establishment Officer: We have marked this post
 "Regrade", as we must leave it to the Kenya
 Government to decide whether the duties of this post
 warrant the assignment of the B Scale or whether it
 should be more properly graded in the C Scale.

Pupil Engineers: (£285: 330: 375:) We have marked
 those posts "Regrade" as it is not clear whether they
 are for the type of Pupil Engineer for whom we have
 recommended the A Scale in paragraph

Medical Dressers: Care should be taken in applying
 the E Scale to those posts that they are related to
 the corresponding grades in the Medical Department.

Water Law Section

Registrar of Water Rights:)
 Assistant Registrar of Water Rights:) We have marked
 these posts "Regrade" and leave it to the Kenya
 Government to decide whether they should fall into
 the B or the C Scale.

Maintenance of Aerodromes etc.

Medical Orderlies: See comment on Medical Dressers
 above in this section.

Training Schemes

Apprentices: We must leave it to the Kenya Government
 to allocate appropriate salary scales to the grades of
 Professional and Non-Professional Apprentices in
 accordance with the principles recommended in this
 Report.

TanganyikaDepartmental

Secretary: We have marked this appointment "Regrade"
 and leave it to the Tanganyika Government to decide
 whether B or C is the appropriate grading for this
 post.

Aerodromes

For proposed grading of Airport Manager see under
 Civil Aviation (High Commission) below.

Uganda

Superintendent, Engineering School: If this post is
 held by a qualified professional officer the scale
 should be A; alternatively we have suggested the
 grading B3-1.

Bursar and Physical Training Officer: We have assigned
 the grading B5-2 in accordance with the principles
 advocated in Chapter XIV.

Airport Manager:)
 Assistant Airport Manager:) For the grading of
 these posts see under Civil Aviation (High Commission)
 below.

387. Secretariat

Secretaries:)
 Assistant Secretaries:)
 Establishment Officers:) We invite attention to the
 recommendation made in regard to these grades in
 paragraph 228 of the Report. This recommendation
 applies equally to these grades in the Secretariat and
 in the departments.

/Kenya Confidential Secretary to the Chief Secretary:

Kenya Confidential Secretary to the Chief Secretary: We have marked this post "Regrado" and it should be placed in the appropriate grade of Personal Secretary (see paragraphs 200-201).

Establishment Officers: (2600-800) We suggest that, in regrading these posts, the personal and pensionable allowance now paid should be absorbed into pensionable salary.

Tanganyika Establishment Assistant We have marked these posts "Regrado"; it will be for the Tanganyika Government to decide whether they should be properly graded in the B Scale as junior Establishment Officers or, alternatively, in the C Scale.

Uganda Establishment Assistant: See note on the same post in Tanganyika above.

388. Community or Social Development

Probation Officers: This service appears under the Judicial Department in Kenya, under Social Development in Tanganyika and under Community Development in Uganda. We have throughout assigned the B Scale to the Probation Officer grade.

Kenya Jeanos School - Assistant Commissioner: In view of the present salary scale we have assigned segments B3-1 to this post. This is subject to confirmation by the Kenya Government that this correctly represents the level of responsibility involved.

Tanganyika Broadcasting - Radio Engineers: The grading which we have suggested for these posts is C4-3, which will involve a shadow extension for the present holders. The Tanganyika Government may wish to consider whether one post on the scale C2 should be provided.

Uganda Assistant Community Development Officers: We have marked these posts "Regrado". Where they are filled by Makerere-qualified officers the appropriate C grading should be allotted, but the Uganda Government may wish also to have a grade on the top segment of E to provide promotion posts from the grades below.

389. Town Planning

Kenya Planning Research Assistant:)
Town Planning Assistant:) We have assigned to these two posts, which are held by women officers, the grading C(W)4-3. These are posts in respect of which the Kenya Government may have in future to make an exception to the general rule that the inducement addition should not attach to posts on the C(W) Scale.

/390. Township Authorities

390. Township Authorities

Executive Officers:)
Assistant Town Clerks:) The grade of "Executive Officer" in Tanganyika is at present paid on the scale £840-960. There are also appointments of Building Inspector and Township Foreman on lower scales. In Uganda the grade of Assistant Town Clerk is used in addition to that of Executive Officer, but the salary scale, £690-960, seems to be attached to both grades. We have marked all these posts "Regrade" and suggest that the administrations concerned should examine the grading in order to see whether any differentiation is required to accord with the relative responsibilities of the posts. We suggest also that they should examine whether it is possible in the course of this regrading to arrange an avenue of promotion to the lower grade of Executive Officer from the grade of Township Foreman, and also of District Assistant or District Foreman where it exists. We have, in the meantime, assigned a grading on the C Scale to these latter posts which seems to be in accordance with their present salaries and responsibilities.

Tanganyika Tanga - Works Superintendent: We suggest that this post should be re-designated in accordance with our recommendation in paragraph 371 dealing with the corresponding Public Works Departments grade.

391. Local Government Department

Local Government Inspectors:)
Local Government Officers:) It will be seen that we have assigned the B Scale to the former grade and the C Scale to the latter grade.

392. Veterinary Services

Livestock Officers: In Kenya and Uganda this title is applied to grades paid on the scales £550-900 and £550-960 respectively. In Tanganyika, however, the title of "Livestock Officer" is given to a grade paid on the scale £550-1320 whereas the grade paid on the scale £550-840 is known as "Assistant Livestock Officer". We have assigned the scale C5-3 to the grades whose present scales terminate at £840, £900 or £960 but we think there should be uniformity in nomenclature also and suggest that Tanganyika should fall into line with the other territories and cease to use the term "Livestock Officer" for a professional grade.

Kenya Senior Assistant Veterinary Officer: (£530-610))
Assistant Veterinary Officer: (£380-530)

We have marked these posts "Regrade". They are, we understand, posts held by Asians and the correct grading should presumably be C5-3 in parallel with the Assistant Veterinary Officer grade filled by Makerere-qualified officers. It is for the Kenya Government to decide whether the higher grading C2 is required at present for the post of Senior Assistant Veterinary Officer.

393. Weights and Measures

We note that Uganda has a common scale £570-1000 for the posts of Chief Inspector and Inspectors of Weights and Measures. In Kenya the latter grade is on this scale whereas the Superintendent, Weights and Measures is paid on the scale £970-1140. We have assigned the scale C2-1 to the Superintendent in Kenya and suggest that Uganda may wish to create a separate post on this same grading for its Chief Inspector.

In Tanganyika, Inspectors of Weights and Measures are on the same scale, £570-1000, and the Estimates show one Chief Inspector and two Inspectors. The Tanganyika Government may wish to consider differentiating the post of Chief Inspector by assigning the scale C2-1 in the same way.

We should add that in Tanganyika and Uganda the Weights and Measures services form a part of the Police Department and the Department of Commerce respectively, and only in Kenya is the Department of Weights and Measures a separate entity. It is for the Kenya Government to decide whether this difference should be maintained, but we record that we do not find in it any justification for assigning a superscale salary to the Superintendent.

Kenya Departments394. European Settlement Organisation (Appendix E to Estimates)

Estate Agent: (£550-900))
 Assistant Estate Agent: (£550-790)) The reason
 for two separate scales is not apparent and we have
 assigned the scale C5-3 to both grades.

395. Inland Revenue

With the exception of the post of Principal Revenue Officer and the junior clerical posts we have marked all posts in this department "Regrade". We do not think it would be appropriate to assign new scales to the present grades in this department until they have been fully examined by a grading team to ensure that relative responsibilities have been correctly assessed and the grading of posts arranged accordingly. Without wishing to pre-judge the work of the grading team, we must add that we formed the impression that this department is over-weighted in the salary scales of its staff.

396. Member for Agriculture - Board of Agriculture - Secretary:)
Water Resources Authority - Secretary:)

We have marked these two posts "Regrade" in order that the Kenya Government may determine whether they should properly fall into the B or C Scale.

High Commission Departments/397. Desert Locust Survey

High Commission Departments397. Desert Locust Survey

Executive Officer: We have marked this post "Regrade" in order that the High Commission may decide whether the appropriate grading is B or C.

398. East African Meteorological Department

Meteorological Assistants: We invite particular attention to the fact that this title covers a number of grades ranging from a minimum of £48 per annum to a maximum of £900 per annum. Some of this wide range may be caused by racial differentiation in salary scales, and the structure should be reviewed in order to remove it.

399. East African Office in London

As these are presumably salary rates based on United Kingdom conditions we have no recommendations to make.

400. East African Statistical Department

Hollerith Machine Operators: These appear to be racial scales and should be reviewed accordingly.

401. East African Directorate of Civil Aviation

We have considered the posts in this Department concurrently with those of Airport Managers in Tanganyika and Uganda and Pilots in the Lands and Surveys Department in Tanganyika. The gradings which we have adopted are:-

Operations Officers:	}	B Scale
Pilots:		
Airport Managers:		
Telecommunications Officers:		
Air Traffic Control Officers:	}	C Scale
Aviation Assistant:		
Radio Superintendents:		
Radio Officers:		

We have assigned the grading C1 to the post of Chief Air Traffic Control Officer and leave it to the High Commission to allocate the appropriate segments of the C Scale to the various existing grades of Air Traffic Control Officer.

/402. East African Customs & Excise Departments.

402. East African Customs & Excise Department

In accordance with our general recommendations in paragraphs 224 and 231 of Chapter XII the grading to be assigned to Collectors should be:-

Assistant Collectors	B5
Collectors	B4-2
Senior Collectors	B1

403. East African Income Tax Department

Tax Officers: We have assigned the C Scale to this grade and suggest that it should be segmented as follows:-

Junior Tax Officer	C5
Tax Officer:	C4-3
Senior Tax Officer	C2

CHAPTER XIXSUPERSCALE SALARIESThe Existing Position

414. The present position regarding superscale salaries in the four East African territories and the High Commission is set out in the following table, which lists the post under the various administrations against each level of salary. Superscale salaries in the self-contained services of the High Commission are dealt with in Chapters XXVI and XXVII respectively:-

TABLE OF PRESENT SALARIES OF SUPERSCALE POSTS

158.

Present Salary	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission</u> (<u>Non-self-contained</u> <u>services</u>)
£3150(3500)					Administrator
£2700(3050)	Chief Justice				
£2600(2950)	Chief Secretary				
£2550(2900)		Chief Justice			
£2500(2850)			Chief Justice		
£2400(2750)		Chief Secretary	Chief Secretary		
£2200(2550)	Commissioner of Police				
£2150(2500)	Financial Secretary Member for Finance & Development Attorney General and Member for Legal Affairs Deputy Chief Secretary, Member for Education and Labour Member for Agriculture, Animal Husbandry, and Natural Resources Member for Health, Lands and Local Government Chief Native Commissioner and Member for African Affairs Member for Commerce and Industry				Finance Member

<u>Present Salary</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission (Non-self-contained Services)</u>
£2100(2450)		Financial Secretary and Member for Finance & Economics Attorney General and Member for Legal Affairs	Financial Secretary Attorney General		
£2050(2400)	Director of Medical Services				
£2000(2350)		Member for Social Services Member for Local Government Member for Lands and Mines Member for Agriculture and Natural Resources Member for Communications, Works and Development Planning Director of Medical Services	Secretary for African Affairs Secretary for Social Services, and Local Government Secretary for Agriculture and Natural Resources Director of Medical Services		

160.

<u>Present Salary</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission (Non-self contained Services)</u>
£1950(2300)	Director of Audit				Commissioner of Customs Legal Secretary Commissioner of Income Tax
£1900(2250)				Chief Justice	
£1850(2200)	Puisne Judge Director of Establish- ments Secretary to the Treasury Director of Agriculture Director of Education Director of Public Works Director of Veterinary Services Deputy Commissioner of Police	Senior Provincial Commissioner Director of Lands and Surveys Director of Agriculture Director of Education Director of Public Works Director of Veterinary Services Commissioner for Development	Senior Provincial Commissioner Director of Agriculture Director of Education Director of Public Works	Chief Secretary	Director, East African Meteorological Department
£1800(2150)	Deputy Director of Medical Services Senior Specialist	Deputy Director of Medical Services Senior Specialist Puisne Judge			Economic Secretary Assistant Chief Secretary

Present
salaryKenyaTanganyikaUgandaZanzibarHigh Commission
(~~Non-self contained~~
Services)

£1775(2125)	Provincial Commissioner Labour Commissioner Administrative Secretary	Provincial Commissioner Labour Commissioner Commissioner of Police	Provincial Commissioner Labour Commissioner Administrative Secretary Puisne Judge Deputy Director of Medical Services Resident, Buganda Commissioner for Local Government		
£1750(2100)	Senior Assistant Commissioner of Police	Director of Establishments Chief Conservator of Forests	Director of Veterinary Services, and Animal Husbandry Director of Surveys, Land Officer and Commis- sioner of Mines Commissioner of Police		Deputy Director, East African Agriculture & Forestry Research Org. Director, East African Bureau of Research in Medicine & Hygiene. Director, East African Directorate of Civil Aviation Deputy Commissioner of Income Tax
£1725(2075)			Medical Superintendent, Mulago		

162.

<u>Present Salary</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission (Non-Self-Contained Services)</u>
£1700(2050)	Assistant Director of Medical Services Assistant Director (Laboratory Services)	Assistant Director of Medical Services	Assistant Director of Medical Services Establishment Secretary Director of Geological Survey		
£1685(2035)		Director of Water Development		Director of Medical Services Attorney General	Director, East African Statistical Department
£1650(2000)	Senior Medical Officer Tuberculosis Officer Accountant General	Senior Medical Officer Accountant General Commissioner for Social Development Commissioner for Mines Commissioner for Co- operative Development Secretary for Trade and Economics Director of Geological Survey Director of Audit Secretary for Finance	Senior Medical Officer		

<u>Present Salary</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission (Non-Self-contained Services)</u>
£1635(1985)	Chief Conservator of Forests Commissioner (Mines and Geology) Solicitor General Director of Surveys Commissioner of Lands Assistant Chief Secretary Secretary for Commerce and Industry Secretary for Health, Lands and Local Government Secretary for Legal Affairs Secretary for Agriculture, Animal Husbandry and Natural Resources Secretary for African Affairs Secretary for Education and Labour Chief Veterinary Research Officer		Commissioner for Co- operative Development Chief Conservator of Forests Commissioner for Community Development		Assistant Deputy Commissioner of Income Tax

Present
Salary

Kenya

Tanganyika

164.

Uganda

Zanzibar

High Commission
(Non-self-contained
Services)

£1600(1950)x50 -1700(2050)	Specialist	Specialist Senior Dental Surgeon Malariologist Senior Pathologist Radiologist	Specialist Senior Pathologist	Specialist Officer Medical Department	
£1600(1950)		Solicitor General	Accountant General Director of Audit		
£1585(1935)		Director of Town Planning		Senior Commissioner Financial Secretary	Regional Commissioner of Income Tax

Present
Salary

Kenya

Tanganyika

Uganda

Zanzibar

High Commission
Non-self-contained
Service)

£1535(1885)	Deputy Director of Agriculture	Deputy Director of Agriculture	Deputy Director of Agriculture	Director of Agriculture	Deputy Commissioner of Customs
	Deputy Director of Education	Deputy Director of Education	Deputy Director of Education	Director of Education	Director, East African Industrial Research Board
	Deputy Director of Public Works	Deputy Director of Public Works	Deputy Director of Public Works		
	Deputy Director of Veterinary Services	Deputy Director of Veterinary Services	Director of Tsetse Control		
	Deputy Director of Audit	Deputy Chief Conserv- ator of Forests	Solicitor General		
	Commissioner of Prisons	Chief Surveyor	Deputy Financial Secretary		
	Commissioner for Community Development	Land Officer			
	Road Engineer				
	Superintending Engineer (Buildings)				
	Hydraulic Engineer				
	Chief Research Officer, Department of Agriculture				

166.

(9)

Present
SalaryKenyaTanganyikaUgandaZanzibarHigh Commission
(Non-self-contained
Service)

£1580(1880) x50-£1680(2000)	Assistant Commissioner of Police				
£1500(1850)	Government Printer		Judicial Adviser		
£1485(1835)	Town Planning Adviser Assistant Commissioner of Lands	Commissioner of Prisons Deputy Commissioner of Police	Deputy Commissioner of Police Deputy Director of Geological Survey Director of Information Deputy Director of Surveys, Deputy Land Officer and Deputy Commissioner of Mines	Director of Public Works, Electricity and Land Survey	
£1450(1800)	Registrar General	Registrar General			
£1435(1785) x50-1525 (1885)	Deputy Road Engineer				

Present
SalaryKenyaTanganyikaUgandaZanzibarHigh Commission
(Non-self-contained
Services)

£1435 (1785)	Deputy Labour Commissioner	Deputy Labour Commissioner	Deputy Labour Commissioner	Comptroller of Customs	Regional Commissioner of Customs
	Chief Field Zoologist	Chief Veterinary Research Officer	Deputy Director of Veterinary Services		
	Assistant Director of Veterinary Services	Regional Assistant Director of Veterinary Services	Commissioner of Prisons	Commissioner of Police	
	Assistant Director (Veterinary Research)	Assistant Commissioner for Mines	Assistant Director of Geological Survey		
	Chief Geologist		Deputy Commissioner for Co-operative Development		
	Director Department of Trade and Supplies				
	Assistant Director of Education	Assistant Director of Education	Assistant Director of Education		Assistant Commissioner of Income Tax
	Chief Inspector of Schools	Director, Tsetse Survey and Reclamation			
	Deputy Commissioner for Local Government	Chief Soil Conservation Officer	Senior Research Officer, Department of Agriculture		Ceramic Specialist, East African Industrial Research Board
	Conservator of Forests	Conservator of Forests	Deputy Chief Conservator of Forests		
	Principal Immigration Officer	Government Chemist			
	Senior Establishment Officer	Assistant Chief Secretary, Principal Asst. Secretary	Assistant Chief Secretary		Establishment Officer

<u>Present Salary (Contd)</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	163, <u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	(11) <u>High Commission</u> <u>(Non-self-contained</u> <u>Services)</u>
£1435 (1785)	Assistant Financial Secretary	Senior District Officer	Assistant Financial Secretary Administrative Officer (Staff Grade)	Secretary Office of Finance Member	Assistant Secretary I
	Senior District Commissioner	Local Courts Adviser			
	African Courts Officer	Regional Assistant Director of Agriculture	Assistant Director of Agriculture		
	Assistant Director of Agriculture	Chief Livestock Officer	Assistant Director of Surveys and Assistant Land Officer		
	Assistant Director of Surveys	Legal Draftsman	Senior Crown Counsel		Senior Assistant Legal Secretary
	Legal Draftsman	Assistant Director of Water Development	Administrator General		
	Deputy Public Prosecutor	Irrigation Engineer, Water Development Department	Rural Water Engineer, Geological Survey		Assistant Director East African Meteorological Dept.
		Assistant Director of Public Works	Assistant Director of Public Works		
			Assistant Commissioner of Police		
			Assistant Commissioner of Mines		Director of Produce Disposal
			Town Planner		

Present
SalaryKenyaTanganyikaUgandaZanzibarHigh Commission
(Non-self-contained
Services)

£1400(1750)		Administrator General			
£1385(1735)	Government Chemist Chief Materials Engineer Chief Electrical Engineer Senior Soil Conservation Engineer Mechanical Engineer Structural Engineer Government Architect Planning Engineer Game Warden Registrar of Co-operative Societies Principal, Prince of Wales School Principal, Duke of York School	Superintendent of Agricultural Education Superintendent of Technical Education Assistant Director of Geological Survey Assistant Labour Commissioner Chief Architect Game Warden Assistant Commissioner of Police	Government Printer Chief Water and Drainage Engineer Chief Architect Game Warden Registrar of Titles and Conveyancer		Accountant General Chief Fisheries Officer, Lake Victoria Fisheries Service.
£1360(1710)			Director of Hydrological Survey.		

170

Present
SalaryKenyaTanganyikaUgandaZanzibarHigh Commission
(Non-self-contained
Services)

£1350(1700)		Government Printer			
£1335(1685)x50 -1335(1885)	Senior Research Officer Department of Agriculture	Senior Research Officer Department of Agriculture			
£1355(1705)				Administrative Secretary	-
£1335(1685)	Assistant Accountant General Assistant Director of Audit Superintendent of Surveys Executive Officer, African Information Services	Deputy Accountant General Deputy Director of Audit Principal Immigration Officer Public Relations Officer	Assistant Accountant General Principal Auditor Chief Veterinary Research Officer	Accountant General Principal Auditor Senior District Commissioner Administrator General	Assistant Director, East African Statistical Department Regional Commissioner of Customs
£1148(1498)	Assistant Director of Education	Assistant Director of Education	Assistant Director of Education		
£1108(1458)	Principal, Kenya High School for Girls				

Broad-banding

415. Anyone who examines this table will at once be struck by the extraordinary multiplicity of salary levels that has grown up over the years and yet covers only a relatively small range of salary. For instance, between the top of the present long timescale, which is £1320, and the salary level of £1775 there are no fewer than nineteen different levels of fixed salaries or salary scales. In this connection we would invite reference to paragraphs 44 and 187 of this Report, in which we have discussed the same feature which occurs lower down in the existing salary structure. We doubt whether it is possible to make, with certainty, the present meticulous distinctions in the value of posts even within the structure of a single large department. When this process is applied to many different departments with completely disconnected functions under a single administration, it becomes even more difficult, and when it is applied to all departments under five separate administrations it is, in our view, completely unpractical. To attempt such fine estimation can only, in our view, lead to petty jealousies and bickerings about the value of posts and to a tendency for experienced civil servants to leave the service of one administration for similar employment under another in order to gain a very minor advantage in salary and prospective pension. These results cannot be in the interests of the service as a whole, and we believe that the only principle to adopt is that where different posts are roughly on the same level of skill and responsibility they should carry the same rate of salary, no attempt being made to mark minor differences in the responsibilities of the posts by minor differences in their salary levels.

416. We also hold the view, which accords entirely with the principle which we have enunciated in the preceding paragraph, that when an officer receives promotion at these levels it should be accompanied by a substantial increase in salary and not by a mere £50 or £100 per annum. If these two principles are accepted, it follows that departments should be broadly grouped in relation to their size and importance; and that when departments are for this purpose grouped together, the salaries at the various levels of the pyramid should, as far as circumstances permit, be the same. On the other hand, when they are not so grouped, the differences in salary at the respective levels of the pyramids should be substantial. For our purposes we have adopted differentials of £200 per annum or a figure approaching that amount. It also follows that, within a single department, a promotion should carry with it a very definite and marked increase in responsibility and should, at the same time, be rewarded by such increase in salary as will make the shouldering of that responsibility worth while. This is particularly the case at the level

/of Head

of Head of Department and Deputy Head of Department, for it is clear that the responsibility of a Head of Department must greatly outweigh that of his Deputy. We have, therefore, tried where possible to mark the increased responsibility at this level by a difference of £400 per annum in salary (in some cases, where there is no Deputy but more than one Assistant directly responsible to the Head of Department, it may be more). Immediately below this level we have differentiated between various promotion grades by increases of £200 per annum in salary, decreasing to £120 between the minimum of the superscale ladder and the maximum of the long time scale (inclusive of the inducement addition). Although we had already taken these decisions before seeing the Treasury evidence before the Royal Commission on the Civil Service at present sitting in the United Kingdom, our conviction that these principles are correct is strengthened by the statement of the Rt. Hon. Sir Edward Bridges, G.C.B., G.C.V.O., M.C. Permanent Secretary to the Treasury, before that Commission, that at this level no differentiation less than £250 or £300 or something of that kind is wanted.*

Incremental superscales versus fixed salaries

417. We have carefully considered the question whether we should generally recommend short three-step incremental salary scales for superscale posts, instead of fixed salaries as exist at present in East Africa. There would appear to be advantages in such a system, particularly where the numbers of levels of superscale salary are greatly reduced, since annual increments would tend to induce officers to remain in service for a reasonable period after promotion and not to take advantage of opportunities for optional retirement. Further an officer's value in a post normally increases with his experience in it. On the other hand an officer would presumably not be selected for promotion to the higher levels unless it was certain that his intention was to remain in the service for a reasonable period and unless he was already very experienced. Partly for these reasons, and partly because to have recommended incremental scales for all promotion posts up to Head of Department level would have been a complete break with East African tradition, we have confined the principle of incremental superscales to the lowest level of superscale.

The Inducement principle in the superscale range

418. We have set out the considerations on which our recommendations for inducement pay are based in Chapter V of this Report. We feel, however, that when the stage is reached of selecting the most suitable officer in any grade for promotion to a superscale post, those considerations are no longer operative. We have stated in paragraph 54 of this Report that some of the

/ data

* Minutes of Evidence taken before the Royal Commission on the Civil Service (H.M.S.O. 1954)

data necessary for a close evaluation of market values on which we could base our timescales for local recruits has not yet emerged, and that our estimate of these scales must be considered to that extent empirical. This is the case to a much greater extent when superscales are in issue; no evidence is available on which we could base a salary for, for example, a locally recruited Head of Department. We can, therefore, only recommend that, for the present at any rate, the principle of inducement pay should no longer operate in connection with superscale posts, and that as superscale levels of salary must clearly be fixed above the total of the maximum of the timescale and inducement pay at that level (i.e. £1620 per annum) in order that overseas officers may be attracted to them, locally recruited officers should also, if selected for these posts, be appointed on these salaries. We have recommended that the timescales suggested by us for locally recruited officers should be kept under review by the administrations to ensure that a suitable relation with local market values is maintained and we consider that the same course should be followed in regard to our superscale proposals. If, at some future date, when a substantial number of locally recruited officers is available for selection to superscale rank, it is found that the superscale salaries which we recommend are widely out of line with levels of remuneration in other spheres of employment in East Africa, the question whether the inducement principle should be applied in the superscale range also can be considered in the light of circumstances prevailing at the time.

Superscale salaries for women officers

419. It follows from our proposals in paragraph 95 of this Report that there should be no differentiation between the salaries paid to men and to women in the superscale ranges. Women will have attained equality with men in the matter of salary by the time they reach the salary of £1320 at the maximum of their long timescale.

Grading of posts by responsibility

420. We have in all our proposals accepted the view that subject to local variations in each territory the general level of cost of living in Kenya, Tanganyika and Uganda is substantially the same, and that the cost of living in Zanzibar is not likely to be less than that on the mainland. We have, therefore, proposed the same salary scales for posts of comparable duties and responsibilities below superscale level in all four territories, and follow the same principle in the superscale range. In other words, in assigning levels of salary to the superscale posts in the four territories we have had regard only to the responsibilities

/of the

of the posts, and have made no differentiation on the ground of cost of living.

421. In grading posts within the superscale framework which we have devised in accordance with the principles already mentioned, we have carefully studied the advice given to us by the Governments of the territories concerned on the relative importance of each department vis-a-vis other posts in the same territory and comparable posts in other territories. Owing to the severe reduction in the number of superscale grades it has not been possible to reproduce in our pattern the finer differentiations which were recommended to us, but we have only departed from the general pattern of relativities where, in our opinion, there have been very good reasons for doing so. We have also had recourse to the mass of evidence which we heard on the subject of superscale relativities in East Africa, and have drawn on the experience from the United Kingdom and other Colonial territories available within the Commission itself. Most of the alterations in relativities have resulted from the compression into four grades of the existing levels of salary of heads of department and below. Others have resulted from the view which we take that the special responsibilities pertaining to the headship of a department require in equity special recognition in salary. Yet others have been necessary to produce what, in our opinion, is a proper promotion ladder within departments, while others are due to a desire to produce, as far as possible, uniformity (having regard to the relative importance of the same departments in the various administrations) between the various territories. We append notes in paragraph 423 on some of the more important alterations in grading which we have proposed.

General level of superscale salaries

422. Having thus dealt with certain principles affecting our superscale proposals, it remains to discuss the general level of salaries in the superscale range. The lowest grade of superscale presents no difficulty. With the total of salary and the inducement addition amounting to £1620 at the maximum of the long scale, the desirability of giving a substantial increase in salary on first promotion to superscale and our preference for a three-step incremental scale at this level, the first superscale naturally falls to be £1740(1902)x60-1860(2022). An officer on £1320, the maximum of the present timescale, draws in total emoluments (including cost of living allowance) £1670, and under our proposals will draw in total emoluments £1782. Under our superscale proposals, the majority of officers at present on salaries of £1435(1785), £1385(1735) and £1335(1625)

/vi.11

will be placed on a salary scale rising to £1860(2022) and we think that this increase in salary is generally adequate at this level.

423. As regards the higher posts in the range, however, the problem is not nearly so easy, as there is no firm foundation on which to build. Opinions will no doubt vary as to the proper level of salary which should be paid, and no exactitude is possible. We have made careful comparisons with other Colonial territories at the levels of head of major departments, and have come to the conclusion, in the light of these comparisons and all other circumstances within our knowledge, that we should recommend a salary of £2600(2762) for the heads of the major departments in all three mainland territories. The present salaries of heads of major departments are normally £1850(2200), so that the increase in total remuneration which we propose for them is over £550 per annum. We think that this increase is justified, and if our figure of £2600 is accepted for the heads of the most important departments, it follows from the earlier argument that the levels of superscale salaries below this should be £2400(2562), £2200(2362), £2000(2162) £1860(2022)x60-1980(2142) and £1740(1902)x60-1860(2022).

424. At a still higher level we have made comparisons of the salaries of Chief Secretaries in other Colonial territories with those obtaining in East Africa, and have come to the conclusion that we should recommend a salary of £3200(3362) for the Chief Secretary, Kenya, against a present salary of £2600(2950), and salaries of £3100(3262) for the Chief Secretaries, Tanganyika and Uganda against their present salaries of £2400(2750).

Detailed proposals for the salaries
of superscale posts

425. Having thus fixed the levels of salary which we recommend for various points in the superscale structure, it only remains for us to set out the grading which we recommend for each individual post within the general framework. This we do in the following table:-

TABLE OF PROPOSED SALARIES OF SUPERSCALE POSTS

(the figures in brackets after the posts refer to the notes in paragraph 426 below)

<u>Proposed Salary</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission (Non-self-contained Services) Administrator</u>
£3800(5962)					
£3300(3462)	Chief Justice				
£3200(3362)	Chief Secretary	Chief Justice	Chief Justice		
£3100(3262)		Chief Secretary	Chief Secretary		
£2900(2062)	Financial Secretary, Member for Finance and Development (1)	Financial Secretary and Member for Finance and Economics	Financial Secretary		Finance Member(2)
	Attorney General and Member for Legal Affairs				
	Deputy Chief Secretary, Member for Education and Labour	Attorney General and Member for Legal Affairs (1)	Attorney General		Legal Secretary(2)
	Member for Agriculture, Animal Husbandry and Natural Resources				
	Member for Health, Lands and Local Government				
	Chief Native Commissioner and Member for African Affairs				
	Member for Commerce and Industry				

Proposed
Salary

Kenya

Tanganyika

Uganda

Zanzibar

High Commission
(Non-self-contained
Services)

£2800(2962)

Member for Social
Services

Secretary for
African Affairs

Member for Local
Government

Secretary for
Social Services
and Local
Government

Member for Lands and
Mines

Member for Agriculture
and Natural Resources

Secretary for
Agriculture and
Natural
Resources

Member for Communications,
Works and Development
Planning

£2700(2862)

Chief Justice

Proposed
SalaryKenyaTanganyikaUgandaZanzibarHigh Commission
(Non-self-contained-
Services)

£2600(2762)

Director of Medical Services(3)	Director of Medical Services(3)	Director of Medical Services(3)	Chief Secretary	
Director of Education	Director of Education	Director of Education		Economic Secretary
Director of Agriculture	Director of Agriculture	Director of Agriculture		
Director of Public Works	Director of Public Works	Director of Public Works		Assistant Chief Secretary
Puisne Judge	Puisne Judge	Puisne Judge		
Provincial Commissioner	Senior Provincial Commissioner Provincial Commissioner (4)	Senior Provincial Commissioner Provincial Commissioner (4)		
Commissioner of Police	Commissioner of Police	Resident, Buganda Commissioner of Police		Commissioner of Customs
Labour Commissioner	Labour Commissioner	Labour Commissioner		
Director of Establishments	Director of Establishments			
Director of Veterinary Services	Director of Veterinary Services	Director of Veterinary Services and Animal Husbandry		Commissioner of Income Tax
	Director of Lands & Surveys	Director of Surveys, Land Officer and Commissioner of Mines		
Solicitor General (5)				
Secretary to the Treasury				
Director of Audit (6)	Commissioner for Development			

<u>Proposed Salary</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission</u> (<u>Non-self-contained</u> <u>Services</u>)
£2400(2562)	Administrative Secretary		Administrative Secretary	Financial Secretary	Deputy Director
		Solicitor General	Solicitor General	Attorney General	East African Agriculture & Forestry Research Organisation.
		Secretary for Finance	Establishment Secretary		Director, East African Meterological Department
	Chief Conservator of Forests	Chief Conservator of Forests	Chief Conservator of Forests		Director, East African Statistical Department
			Commissioner for Community Development		
			Commissioner for Co-operative Development		
	Commissioner of Mines & Geology	Commissioner for Mines			Director, East African Directorate of Civil Aviation
	Director of Surveys	Director of Geological Survey	Director of Geological Survey		
	Commissioner of Lands				
	Commissioner of Prisons (8)	Secretary for Trade & Economics			
		Director of Water Development			

180.

<u>Proposed Salary</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission (Non-self-contained Services)</u>
£2200(2362)	Registrar General(9)	Administrator General (9)	Administrator General (9)		Director, East African Industrial Research Board
		Director, Tsetse Survey & Reclamation (16)	Director of Tsetse Control		
			Deputy Financial Secretary (10)		
	Deputy Director of Medical Services (11)	Deputy Director of Medical Services (11)	Deputy Director of Medical Services(11)	Director of Medical Services (11)	
	Deputy Director of Agriculture	Deputy Director of Agriculture	Deputy Director of Agriculture	Director of Agriculture	Deputy Commissioner of Customs
	Deputy Director of Education	Deputy Director of Education	Deputy Director of Education	Director of Education	
	Deputy Director of Public Works	Deputy Director of Public Works	Deputy Director of Public Works	Director of Public Works Electricity and Land Survey	Director of Produce Disposal (16)
	Accountant General	Accountant General	Accountant General		Deputy Commissioner of Income Tax (12)
	Deputy Commissioner of Police (13)	Deputy Commissioner of Police	Deputy Commissioner of Police	Commissioner of Police	
	Deputy Labour Commissioner (15)	Deputy Labour Commissioner (15)	Deputy Labour Commissioner (15)		
	Commissioner for Community Development	Director of Town Planning		Senior Commissioner (14)	
	Director of Trade and Supplies (16)	Commissioner for Social Development			

Proposed
SalaryKenyaTanganyikaUgandaZanzibarHigh Commission
(Non self-contained
Services)

£2200(2362)

Deputy Director of Audit
(17)
Assistant Chief Secretary
Secretary for Legal Affairs
Secretary for Education &
Labour
Secretary for Agriculture,
Animal Husbandry & Natural
Resources
Secretary for Health, Lands
& Local Government
Secretary for African Affairs
Secretary for Commerce and
Industry
Deputy Director of
Veterinary Services
Registrar of Co-operative
Societies (18)
Chief Veterinary
Research Officer (21)
Road Engineer (20)
Senior Specialist
Medical Department
(22)

Director of Audit
Deputy Director of
Veterinary Services
Commissioner of
Prisons
Commissioner for
Co-operative
Development (18)
Public Relations
Officer (19)
Land Officer
Chief Surveyor
Senior Specialist (22)
Registrar General (23)

Director of Audit
Deputy Director of
Veterinary Services
Commissioner of
Prisons
Deputy Director of Surveys
Deputy Land Officer and
Deputy Commissioner of Mines
Director of Information (19)

E

<u>Proposed Salary</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission (Non- self-contained Services)</u>
£2000(2162)	Game Warden	Game Warden	Game Warden		
	Assistant Director of Medical Services(25)	Assistant Director of Medical Services (25)	Assistant Director of Medical Services (25)		
	Assistant Director (Laboratory Services)			Administrative Secretary	Establishment Officer
	Principal Immigration Officer	Principal Immigration Officer	Medical Superintendent Mulago (30)		
	Government Printer	Government Printer	Government Printer		
			Deputy Director of Geological Survey		
	Conservator of Forests	Deputy Chief Conservator of Forests	Deputy Chief Conservator of Forests		
			Director of Hydrological Survey		
		Assistant Director of Public Works	Assistant Director of Public Works		
	Superintending Engineer (Buildings) (26)				
	Deputy Road Engineer(26)				
	Hydraulic Engineer				
	Assistant Director of Agriculture	Regional Assistant Director of Agriculture	Assistant Director of Agriculture		Director, East African Bureau of Research in Medicine & Hygiene(27)
	Assistant Director of Education	Assistant Director of Education	Assistant Director of Education		

<u>Proposed Salary</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission (Non-self-contained Services)</u>
£2000(2162)	Assistant Director of Veterinary Services	Assistant Director of Veterinary Services			Chief Fisheries Officer Lake Victoria Fisheries Service
	Assistant Director (Veterinary Research)		Deputy Commissioner for Co-operative Development		Assistant Director East African Meteorolog- ical Department
	Town Planning Adviser		Town Planner		Assistant Director, East African Statistical Department
	Government Chemist	Government Chemist			
	Chief Geologist	Assistant Director of Geological Survey		Comptroller of Customs	
		Assistant Director of Water Development			
	Deputy Public Prosecutor				Senior Assistant Legal Secretary
	Legal Draftsman	Legal Draftsman		Administrator General (31)	
	Senior Assistant Commissioner of Police (28)	Assistant Commissioner for Mines			
	Chief Research Officer Department of Agriculture		Assistant Commissioner of Mines		Assistant Deputy Commissioner of Income Tax (29)
			Judicial Adviser (32)		Regional Commissioner of Income Tax (29)
	Assistant Commissioner of Lands	Assistant Labour Commissioner	Land Tenure Officer (32)		Secretary Office of Finance Member
	Assistant Director of Surveys		Assistant Director of Surveys and Assistant Land Officer		

<u>Proposed</u> <u>Salary Scale</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission</u> (Non-self-contained Services)
£1860(2022)x60 -1980(2142)	Specialist.Medical Department Senior Medical Officer (36) Tuberculosis Officer	Specialist,Medical Department Senior Dental Surgeon Malarialogist Radiologist Senior Pathologist Senior Medical Officer (36)	Specialist,Medical Department Senior Medical Officer (36) Senior Pathologist	Specialist Officer Medical Department	

<u>Proposed Salary Scale</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	
£1740(1902)x60-1 1860(2022)	Senior Crown Counsel (33)	Senior Crown Counsel (33)	Senior Crown Counsel (33)		
	Senior Magistrate(33)	Senior Magistrate (33)	Senior Magistrate (33)		
	Senior Research Officer, Department of Agriculture	Chief Soil Conservation Officer	Senior Research Officer, Department of Agriculture		
		Senior Research Officer, Department of Agriculture			
	Government Architect	Chief Architect.	Chief Architect		
	Structural Engineer		Public Works Department		
	Chief Accountant Public Works Department(34)	Chief Accountant Public Works Department(34)	Chief Accountant Public Works Department(34)		
	Planning Engineer				
	Chief Materials Engineer				
	Mechanical Engineer				
	Chief Electrical Engineer				
	Assistant Commissioner of Police (35)	Assistant Commissioner of Police	Assistant Commissioner of Police		
	Senior District Commissioner	Senior District Officer	Administrative Officer (Staff Grade)	Senior District Commissioner	
					Ceramic Specialist East African Industrial Research Board
					Regional Commissioner of Customs
					Assistant Commissioner of Income Tax

<u>Proposed</u> <u>Salary Scale</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	
£1740(1902)x60- 1860(2022)	Deputy Commissioner for Local Government				
	Chief Field Zoologist	Chief Veterinary Research Officer	Chief Veterinary Research Officer		
	Assistant Accountant General	Chief Livestock Officer			
	Assistant Director of Audit	Deputy Accountant General	Assistant Accountant General	Accountant General	Accountant General
	Chief Inspector of Schools	Deputy Director of Audit	Principal Auditor	Principal Auditor	
	Principal, Prince of Wales School	Superintendent of Technical Education			
	Principal, Duke of York School	Superintendent of Agricultural Education	Registrar of Titles and Conveyancer, Public Works Department		
	Principal, Kenya High School for Girls				
	Senior Soil Conservation Engineer, Department of Agriculture	Irrigation Engineer, Water Development Department	Chief Water and Drainage Engineer, Public Works Department		
			Rural Water Engineer, Geological Survey		
			Assistant Director of Information		
	Assistant Financial Secretary		Assistant Financial Secretary		

<u>Proposed Salary Scale</u>	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>	<u>High Commission</u> <u>(Non-self-contained Services)</u>
£1740(1902)x60 (1860(2022))	Senior Establishment Officer	Assistant Chief Secretary Principal Assistant Secretary Conservator of Forests	Assistant Chief Secretary Assistant Director of Geological Survey		Assistant Secretary I
	African Courts Officer	Local Courts Adviser			
	Superintendent of Surveys				
	Deputy Commissioner of Prisons (37)				
	Executive Officer African Information Services				

Notes on individual superscale grading

426. We append the following notes setting out reasons for certain individual gradings:-

- (1) Attorney General and Member for Legal Affairs,
Kenya
Financial Secretary, Member for Finance and
Development, Kenya

It would have been in accordance with our own views to have recommended a salary of £3000(3162) per annum for these two posts, as it appears to us that the responsibility of these two Members must exceed those of other Members. We understand, however, that it is in accordance with the policy of the Kenya Government that apart from the Chief Secretary all Members should be on an equal salary level, and we have bowed to this view.

- (2) Finance Member, East Africa High Commission
Legal Secretary, East Africa High Commission

In the light of the responsibilities of these posts, we consider that they should properly be graded with the Attorneys General and Financial Secretaries of Tanganyika and Uganda.

- (3) Directors of Medical Services, Kenya, Tanganyika
and Uganda

We have stated in paragraph 309 of this Report that the recent revision of Medical Officers' salaries which resulted in the salaries of the heads of these departments being brought out of line with those of heads of other major departments, may be held to have been in anticipation of a general salaries revision. The present gross emoluments of these officers, including cost of living allowance, are £2400 in Kenya and £2350 in Tanganyika and Uganda and under our proposals will be £2762. Since the recent salaries revision in this Department was dictated by considerations of market value, we see no reason to perpetuate the anomaly whereby the heads of these departments receive greater emoluments than those of other comparable departments.

- (4) Provincial Commissioners, Tanganyika and Uganda

At present there are two grades of Provincial Commissioners in Tanganyika and Uganda, one on £1850(2200) and the other on £1775(2125). Under our proposals this distinction will disappear.

- (5) Solicitor General, Kenya

We consider that in view of political conditions

/in Kenya,

in Kenya, this post has been seriously undergraded in the past and that, in the light of its responsibilities, we are justified in equating it with that of a head of a major department. It also follows from our view that the salary of the Attorney General should be £3000 per annum, that in accordance with our principles the salary of his Deputy should be £2600(2762) per annum.

(6) Director of Audit, Kenya

The high salary grading which exists at present for this post arises from the fact that the audit of the High Commission accounts is also undertaken by the Director of Audit, Kenya.

(7) Director, East African Meteorological Department

We consider that the salary status of this post should be equated with that of the Director, East African Directorate of Civil Aviation.

(8) Commissioner of Prisons, Kenya.

We consider that in view of the present conditions in Kenya the salary of this post should be relatively upgraded.

(9) Registrar General, Kenya
Administrator General, Tanganyika
Administrator General, Uganda

We have deliberately suggested the upgrading of these posts both in view of their heavy and multifarious responsibilities and in order to provide promotion posts for solicitors in the Legal Service. At present avenues of promotion in the main are confined to barristers, and it is undesirable that for this reason all solicitors should be tempted to qualify for the Bar.

(10) Deputy Financial Secretary, Uganda.

There are two posts of Deputy Financial Secretary in Uganda, which in our view justifies a grading lower than that of Secretary for Finance in Tanganyika.

(11) Deputy Directors of Medical Services, Kenya,
Tanganyika and Uganda
Director of Medical Services, Zanzibar

The considerations which we have mentioned in (3) above in respect of the posts of Directors of Medical Services, Kenya, Tanganyika and Uganda apply also to these posts.

(12) Deputy Commissioner of Income Tax,
East Africa High Commission

The salary of this post has recently been revised in order to attract officers from the Board of Inland Revenue in the United Kingdom. The considerations which apply to the posts in the Medical Department apply therefore also to these posts. The gross emoluments of the post are at present £2100 per annum. Under our proposals they will be £2362 per annum.

(13) Deputy Commissioner of Police, Kenya

The salary quoted against the post in the table in paragraph 404 is the salary recently recommended by the Kenya Police Commission. The same considerations therefore also apply.

(14) Senior Commissioner, Zanzibar

This post is at present graded for purposes of salary with that of the Financial Secretary. We consider that it should more properly be aligned with that of the heads of major departments in Zanzibar.

(15) Deputy Commissioners of Labour, Kenya,
Tanganyika and Uganda

In view of the growing importance of industrial relations everywhere we have graded the Labour Departments with other major departments and the relative upgrading of these posts follows from that.

(16) Director, Tsetse Survey and Reclamation,
Tanganyika.
Director of Trade and Supplies, Kenya.
Director of Produce Disposal, East Africa
High Commission.

We consider that the responsibilities attached to the management of these Departments justify the relative upgrading of the salaries of these posts. In the case of the first named, we see no reason why the salary of the post should be less than that attached to the corresponding post in Uganda.

(17) Deputy Director of Audit, Kenya.

Our remarks above regarding the grading of the post of Director of Audit, Kenya, apply also to this post.

(18) Registrar of Co-operative Societies, Kenya
Commissioner for Co-operative Development,
Tanganyika

Co-operation is not so far advanced in Kenya

/ and

and Tanganyika as it is in Uganda, and we consider that the Head of the Co-operative Development in Uganda should receive a higher grading on that account. We consider, however, that the post of Registrar of Co-operative Societies in Kenya has been seriously undergraded in the past and have, therefore, regraded the two posts now under discussion on a basis of equality.

(19) Public Relations Officer, Tanganyika
Director of Information, Uganda

In view of the growing importance of Public Relations we consider that these posts should be relatively upgraded. The post in Tanganyika has, in our opinion, been conspicuously undergraded in the past.

(20) Road Engineer, Kenya

The post is at present held on a personal basis on a pensionable salary of £2150 per annum, which is considerably higher than that of the Director of Public Works. This clearly cannot be perpetuated in a salaries structure, and we consider that in principle the salary of the post should be less than that of the Deputy Director. We may not, however, be aware of the full circumstances and have, therefore, equated the two posts for purposes of salary grading. A personal salary scale will be necessary for the existing holder as at present.

(21) Chief Veterinary Research Officer, Kenya

This post at present carries a salary higher than that of the Deputy Director of Veterinary Services, though we consider that the Deputy Director should in principle be on a higher salary. In the light of the present situation we have, however, equated the two posts. A personal salary will not be necessary for the present holder.

(22) Senior Specialist, Medical Departments
Kenya and Tanganyika

Our remarks above regarding the posts of Director and Deputy Director of Medical Services in the mainland territories apply also to these posts.

(23) Registrar General, Tanganyika

Our remarks under (9) above regarding the desirability of opening up avenues of promotion for solicitors apply also to this post and we have, therefore, upgraded it.

- (24) Heads of Departments which we have
graded at the £2000(2162) level.

It will be observed that in a considerable number of cases we have upgraded the salaries attached to posts of heads of minor departments as compared with the grading that we have assigned to offices of Deputy and Assistant in larger departments which at present carry the same salaries. This is due to the special responsibilities which, in our opinion, attach to the posts of head of department as such, and in the cases in which we have recommended a salary of £2000(2162) we consider that the importance of the department in question justifies this grading.

- (25) Assistant Directors of Medical Services,
Kenya, Tanganyika and Uganda

The remarks which we have already made in (3) and (11) above regarding the salaries which we have assigned to the posts of Director and Deputy Director of Medical Services apply to these posts also. It may be objected to our present grading that the salary of £2000(2162) is only £20 above the maximum of the scale of £1860(2022)x60-1980(2142), which we have recommended in paragraph 311 of this Report for Senior Medical Officers, and it is certainly contrary to the principles of our thinking that promotion should be rewarded by so small an increase in salary. We therefore gave very careful consideration to an alternative proposal that while the salary of the Directors of Medical Services should remain at £2600 in line with that of other heads of major departments, the Deputy Directors should be placed on £2400 and the Assistant Directors on £2200. This proposal seems, however, to do more damage to the logic of our superscales salary structure than the pattern which we recommend. The difficulty is, of course, caused by the high maximum of the special timescale for Medical Officers, and we see no reason in equity why this advantage should be carried on into the higher superscales.

- (26) Superintending Engineer (Buildings), Kenya
Deputy Road Engineer, Kenya

There is no post of Assistant Director of Public Works in Kenya and these posts are at present on a higher salary level than the posts of Assistant Director in Tanganyika and Uganda. We do not think that they should be so graded and have, therefore, equated them with the general level of Assistant Directors in major departments.

- (27) Director, East African Bureau of Research
in Medicine and Hygiene, East Africa High
Commission

This post is at present on £1750(2100) per annum, but we consider that it should be equated with that of an Assistant Director of Medical Services and have graded it accordingly.

- (28) Senior Assistant Commissioner of Police,
Kenya

The salary of this post mentioned in the table in paragraph 404 of this Report is that recommended by the Kenya Police Commission and it may be considered that in this salary the benefit of a general salaries revision has been anticipated.

- (29) Assistant Deputy Commissioner of Income Tax,
East Africa High Commission
Regional Commissioner of Income Tax

Our remarks in (12) above relating to the post of Deputy Commissioner of Income Tax apply to these posts also. In the recent revision a salary of £1635(1985) per annum was assigned to the post of Assistant Deputy Commissioner and a salary of £1585(1935) to posts of Regional Commissioner. As we have stated earlier, we are not in favour of these minute differentiations and we have assigned the same salary to both grades.

- (30) Medical Superintendent, Mulago, Uganda

For the same reason we have assigned to this post the same grading as that of Assistant Director of Medical Services, although the present salary is £25 per annum in excess of the salary of the post of Assistant Director.

- (31) Administrator General, Zanzibar

We have upgraded this post relatively to other posts in Zanzibar on the same salary level at present for the reasons stated under (9) above.

- (32) Judicial Adviser, Uganda
Land Tenure Officer, Uganda

We do not think that a higher grading than that which we propose can be justified for these posts.

- (33) Senior Crown Counsel, Kenya, Tanganyika
and Uganda
Senior Magistrate, Kenya, Tanganyika and Uganda

- (34) Chief Accountant, Public Works Department,
Kenya, Tanganyika and Uganda

See paragraph 259.

- (35) Assistant Commissioner of Police, Kenya

Our remarks under (28) above regarding the post of Senior Assistant Commissioner of Police, Kenya, apply also in this case.

- (36) Senior Medical Officer, Kenya, Tanganyika
and Uganda

See paragraph 311.

- (37) Deputy Commissioner of Prisons, Kenya

See paragraph 393.

CHAPTER XXCOMMENTS ON SOME GENERAL POINTS AFFECTING SALARIESIncremental credit for War Service or Military Service

427. Under rules common to the Colonial Service as a whole, incremental credits have been given on appointment to officers who by reason of service in the late war have entered the Colonial Service at a higher age than the normal. The general plan adopted was that war service after the average pre-war age of entry was counted in full towards increments in a salary scale, and war service before that age counted only in part according to a prescribed scale. The object of these concessions was, of course, to bring the salary-earning level, reckoned by age of an entrant with war service, up to that of the normal entrant, and to that extent to improve his pension prospects as well.

428. It is clear that in the end these concessions would lapse by passage of time, as the point must be reached at which no entrant can any longer claim that the beginning of his career has been set back by service in the war of 1939-45. But our discussions in East Africa have led us to recommend that, as close on nine years will have elapsed from the cessation of hostilities in that war by the time this Report is implemented, the administrations should abolish the concessions in respect of entrants to the East African public services after that date. They have served the purpose for which they were instituted, and their continued application is increasingly difficult to justify, is already causing embarrassment and is more likely in future to create anomalies than to remedy any substantial injustice.

429. Post-war compulsory military service stands on a different footing. Here also there are rules applicable to the Colonial Service as a whole. Periods of military service of this kind count towards increments in the salary scale in the following manner:-

Two years of service or more	-	2 years
Twenty-one months up to two years	-	21 months
Eighteen months or more, but less than 21 months	-	18 months
Fifteen months or more, but less than 21 months	-	15 months
One year or more, but less than 15 months	-	1 year
Less than one year	-	Nil

We are of opinion that these concessions should continue unchanged as long as the period of compulsory service remains at two years in the United Kingdom. An entrant to the service may, for legitimate reason, not have had to discharge this liability, but it is not equitable that he should thereby gain a permanent advantage over his colleagues. The concessions should, of course, apply also to compulsory service under Kenya legislation in accordance with the same formula.

/Initial entry points in the Professional Scale

Initial entry points in the Professional Scale

430. It is the custom at present to give enhanced entry points on the professional scale £550-1320 to candidates appointed to certain of the professional services. The entitlement to an enhanced entry point lies - or, it would be more correct to say, lay in its original conception - in the comparative time taken to reach the standard laid down by the Secretary of State as the minimum required of a candidate. This time may be made up entirely of the years of study required to obtain the professional qualification; in some professions, however, it includes a certain minimum of practical experience after qualifying. Candidates for the legal service, for instance, are required to have three years' professional experience either as a barrister since call or as a solicitor since admission. A careful distinction must be drawn between this practical experience which is an essential part of the minimum standard for appointment, and further experience which goes beyond that minimum. We deal with the latter kind of experience in the later section of this Chapter devoted to incremental credit for experience.

431. The enhanced entry points which operate in the present professional scale are as follows:-

	<u>Initial salary</u>	<u>No. of Increments</u>
Agricultural Officers (including Agricultural Chemists, Entomologists, etc.)	£585	1
Architects	£655	3
Engineers		
Quantity Surveyors		
Town Planners		
Geologists	£690	4
Legal Officers: Barristers	£865	8
Solicitors	£760	6
Medical and Dental Officers	£865	8
Mines Officers	£655	3
Veterinary Officers	£865	8

432. We have examined these entry points in consultation with the Colonial Office, and are grateful to the officers of that Division for the help and factual information which they have so readily given us. From this examination it is clear that in the fixing of these entry points some element has entered other than that required to constitute the minimum qualification of a candidate. The

/The true figures

197.

The true figures, based solely on this latter element and taking as zero the Administrative Service, with three years for a degree and a fourth year spent on the First "Devonshire" Course, are:-

	<u>No. of increments</u>
Agricultural Officers (including Agricultural Chemists, Entomologists, etc.)	1
Architects)	
Engineers)	1
Quantity Surveyors)	
Town Planners	2
Geologists	1
Legal Officers: Barristers	3
Solicitors	3
Medical Officers	2
Dental Officers	1
Veterinary Officers	1

(For Mines Officers the entry point appears to be fixed by post-qualification experience; the "true" figure is zero).

433. In so far as the incremental credit at present granted exceeds that tabulated in the preceding paragraph, entry points have moved upwards because of considerations of market value, i.e. the difficulty of recruiting at the true figure. We have, therefore, had to consider how far it is necessary to take account of this consideration in suggesting the entry points on our new Scale A. Our recommendations are as follows:-

	<u>Present</u>	<u>Proposed</u>	<u>No. of increments on Scale A</u>
Agricultural Officers	£585(790)	£852(937)	1
Architects)			
Engineers)	£655(884)	£852(937)	1
Quantity Surveyors)			
Town Planners	£655(884)	£888(977)	2
Geologists	£690(932)	£852(937)	1
Legal Officers: Barristers	£865(1168)	£1074(1181)	6
Solicitors	£760(1026)	£1074(1181)	6
Medical Officers	£865(1168)	£1074(1181)	6
Dental Officers	£865(1168)	£852(937)	1
Veterinary Officers	£865(1168)	£1032(1135)	5

/We add

We add the following explanatory notes:-

- (i) in the case of Medical and Veterinary Officers the entry points recommended by us are four increments above the "true" figure in paragraph above, and in the case of Legal Officers three increments above. We have felt obliged to recommend these enhanced points because we are satisfied that current conditions in regard to recruitment from external sources demand that they shall be retained for the present. It must be emphasised that these are "market value" additions to salary and should, therefore, be subject to periodical review in the light of recruitment conditions. Alternatively, if at some future date the administrations, in pursuance of the suggestion made in paragraph 58 of this Report, should vary the rate of inducement addition to salary for particular classes of the service, these "market value" enhancements of entry point would disappear in that process.
- (ii) These "market value" enhancements of entry points apply only to recruitment from external sources. As far as we are aware, there is no reason to apply them to local recruitment. A Legal, Medical or Veterinary Officer recruited on the basic salary should be given the "true" entry point of his profession, but not the extra three or four increments respectively.
- (iii) According to our information, current recruitment conditions do not demand that any "market value" enhancement should be offered to Geologists or Dental Officers. We have, therefore, recommended the adoption of the true figure in these two cases. We are of opinion, however, that the reasons which have led us to recommend the application to Scientific Officers of the extension of the A Scale (see paragraphs 250 and 251) apply equally to these two classes of officer, and we recommend that they should be able to proceed to the extended maximum of £1482 on the same conditions.
- (iv) Current conditions require that the "market value" enhancement for Veterinary Officers should be four increments; but the "true" point has been adjusted to its correct figure. Discussions with veterinary authorities both in this country and in East Africa suggest that the comparative smallness of superscale appointments in this service may be a deterrent to recruitment. In Kenya, for instance, excluding the Research side of the department, there are only three superscale posts to twenty-nine timescale posts; in Uganda the figures are two and seventeen respectively. We record this in passing because of its possible relevance to recruitment, though we understand that the administrations concerned already have it under consideration.

434. In the Administrative Service, and in the professions other than those listed above, the entry point as fixed in relation to minimum qualifications should be at the bottom of the A Scale. The professions to which this applies are:-

Chemists (if not holding the qualification of any other profession)

Education Officers

Fisheries Officers

Assistant Conservators of Forests

Meteorologists

Surveyors

Statisticians

Valuers

Two particular cases require special comment:-

(i) Assistant Conservators of Forests

There are two types of recruit; first, those who take a degree followed by a year's Forestry Course at Oxford; and second, those with a degree in forestry who are appointed without further training. The "true" figure for the latter class, on the basis of calculation used by us, is strictly minus one. We recommend, however, that this class should enter Scale A at the minimum, but serve two years before receiving the first increment.

(ii) Pupil Engineers

The qualifying period of candidates for this grade is two years less than that of the professional engineer, as they are not required to have two years' practical experience. Here again the "true" figure should, therefore, be minus one, but in this case also we recommend entry at the minimum of Scale A with service for two years before receiving the first increment.

It will be remarked that in paragraph 83 of this Report we have recommended the general abolition of the standstill in salary while on probation. This does not apply to the two special cases in (i) and (ii) above, in which the standstill will operate for different reasons.

/Increments

Increments for experience beyond the minimum standard

435. We turn now to the second reason for granting incremental credit referred to in paragraph 430 above, i.e. that the candidate has experience which goes beyond the minimum required to make him eligible for the appointment concerned. The present practice in East Africa is to allow increments up to a total of four for "approved" experience; in recruitment for the educational appointments, increments for approved teaching experience are allowed at the rate of one increment for one and a half year's experience up to a maximum of twelve increments.

436. The satisfactory working of these arrangements depends on two conditions. In the first place there must be some clearly recognisable point of departure for calculation of the increments, or in other words some clear-cut minimum standard for appointment to the service concerned which entitles the candidate to enter either at the minimum salary of the scale or at some prescribed point above it. Secondly, given this firm base there must also be a clear understanding of what constitutes "approved experience" in any particular case. Both of these conditions can generally be met in most of the professions; for doctors, lawyers, engineers and so on the minimum qualification is a prescribed one, and experience beyond that minimum is in practice of the profession. The same is true in some of the technical grades such as pharmacist, laboratory technologist or health inspector. But in other of the many grades to which the B or C Scales are applied the position is different; the standard for entry may not be expressed in terms of some recognisable qualification such as a diploma or membership of an institute, and experience may not be of a kind that can be valued in terms of incremental credit. This is particularly the case in the "field" grades in the Agricultural, Forestry, Game and Veterinary Departments, and in some of the foreman and supervisor grades in the Public Works Department.

437. We suggest, therefore, that the system of increments for experience should only be applied where the definitions of initial qualification and subsequent experience are clear. It should not be applied where neither point is capable of clear definition as a means of justifying the appointment of a candidate with some previous experience at a point some way up the scale; this forced application of the principle can only lead in practice to anomalies and confusion. There is an alternative criterion at hand - that of market value, by which we mean the salary and conditions of service which will make the appointment as attractive to the candidate as employment outside the public service. We do not suggest that it is always easy to assess market value. But the assessment will be made by an impartial Public Service Commission; and to the extent that the B or C Scale applicable to the grade concerned is broken, the bottom points of the successive segments will provide possible alternative entry points.

438. Our view is, in short, that there is an essential difference between recruitment on the principle of increments for experience and recruitment on market value, in that the former is based on an ascertainable formula and the latter is adjusted to current market conditions. As long as the two methods of recruitment exist side by side we suggest that the difference should be observed. We suggest as general working

rules:-

- (i) Increments for experience should as a rule only be granted where recruitment is to the lowest grade of a service; where there is direct appointment to a higher grade, the assumption is that experience has already been taken into account.
- (ii) The present limitation of increments for experience to four can remain, but should not be a rigid rule. Its general justification presumably is that it does not pay a Colonial territory to recruit at too late an age, as the time for settling down and acquiring local experience may be too short, as may also be the pensionable career offered. Further, the interposition at high points in the scale of newcomers whose experience has been gained elsewhere may be upsetting to officers who have practised their calling wholly in East Africa; at best a period of adjustment to local conditions may be necessary before the newcomer pulls his full weight. But there may be exceptions to this, and it seems unnecessary for the administrations to tie their own hands too tightly. Increments for teaching experience, at the present rate of one increment for $1\frac{1}{2}$ years' experience, might be reduced to a working maximum of eight increments.
- (iii) Recruitment at market value should not be applicable to recruitment to a grade on the A Scale, except on contract. For posts on the B and C Scales it should apply where the alternative of increments for experience is impracticable because of the absence of clear definitions.
- (iv) Recruitment at market value should apply equally to recruitment from external sources as to recruitment locally. We suggest that the Establishment branches of the administrations should take their Public Service Commissions into consultation when considering the salaries which an external recruitment agency recommends should be offered to obtain candidates. There should also be continuous inter-territorial consultation and agreement on the general level of rates to be offered whether locally or externally.

The cost of education of children outside
East Africa

439. We received during the course of hearing evidence in East Africa ample evidence that one of the greatest financial difficulties, if not the greatest difficulty, encountered by the overseas officer lies in the matter of the education of his children in his home country, especially the United Kingdom. The position does not arise so acutely in Uganda or Zanzibar where, in consideration of a tax payable by all Europeans, whether civil servants or not, grants are made of varying amounts for the education of European children. In Uganda this is only the case, as far as primary education is concerned, when parents are stationed where no primary school exists. At present

/also in Tanganyika

also in Tanganyika, pending the provision of adequate education facilities for the full secondary education of European children, educational grants in consideration of a European education tax are made for this secondary education. The amounts of the grants paid at present are, in summary form, as follows:-

<u>Territory</u>	<u>Grant per child towards primary education outside East Africa</u>	<u>Grant per child towards secondary education outside East Africa</u>
Tanganyika	-	£100 per annum
Uganda	£90 per annum for the first child, £99 for the second, and £108 for any subsequent children or half the school fees whichever is the less	£140 for the first child, £149 for the second and £158 for any subsequent children or three-fifths of the school fees whichever is the less.
Zanzibar	A maximum of £75 per annum for the first child and £85 for subsequent children subject to parents paying the first £105 for the first child and £95 for subsequent children.	A maximum of £132 per annum for the first child and £142 for subsequent children subject to parents paying the first £123 for the first child and £113 for subsequent children.

Since these grants are paid in respect of all European children, whether those of public servants or not, they do not form conditions of Government service and are, therefore, outside our terms of reference. They serve, however, to ease this problem for public servants in these territories. In Kenya, however, the position is different. Here there is no education tax, but educational facilities are available for European children in Kenya at the cost of a very considerable subsidy from the public revenue. No doubt, therefore, it can be argued that the overseas officer should take advantage of these facilities, and that no additional charge on the revenue on account of the parent who does not wish to do so can be justified. We venture, however, to suggest that the offer of these facilities does not in all cases meet the requirements of overseas officers. We are in no position to compare the standard of the educational facilities offered in Kenya for European children with those available in the United Kingdom, although we heard considerable evidence on this aspect of the question; but there is a very natural desire on the part of parents to give their children the same educational advantages as those that they themselves enjoyed, and if possible to send them to the same school as themselves or at least schools of equivalent standing. The main point, however, so far as officers recruited from overseas are concerned, is that they are in most cases members of a transferable service; and to put their children to school in Kenya involves the risk of their being themselves transferred to other territories during the period of their education, with the consequent necessity to transfer their children to schools in the United Kingdom or elsewhere at possibly the most important stage of their educational career. There is also the case of officers transferred to the Kenya service when their children are already at school in the United Kingdom. To have to change schools in the middle of their children's secondary education is a risk which few parents will willingly undertake.

440. It is this question of transferability which, in our opinion, differentiates the case of the overseas public servant from that of the European settler in Kenya in this matter. Since to suggest that the Kenya Government should adopt some such form of European educational tax system as is in operation in the other East African territories falls entirely outside our terms of reference, we can only leave this subject by strongly recommending that the Kenya Government should introduce some system of placing its overseas public servants in the same position in this respect as their brother officers in, say, Tanganyika. We might add that it is possible that such a system might result in a saving of expenditure on European education in Kenya. The same considerations will apply to Tanganyika itself if and when the present educational grants are withdrawn as at present proposed on the introduction of secondary educational facilities for European children. We have said in paragraph 119 that, in formulating our proposed salary scales, we have taken into account that most officers are married and have families, but have not made provision for the education of children in the United Kingdom.

CHAPTER XXITRAINING

441. As has been remarked earlier in this Report, it is the ultimate objective of the East African Governments to staff their public services as far as possible from their own resources; and in Chapter III we have tried, by analysing the services in divisions and giving figures of present educational output, to show how far the Governments have still to go in order to fulfil this ambition. Further, where the enlarged interpretation of our terms of reference has obliged us to recommend structural changes, we have worked on the assumption that we are providing for services ultimately to be recruited wholly within East Africa. In these services it is the desire of the Governments that there shall be equality of opportunity for all races; to this we have tried to add a system of ladders of promotion from grade to grade which will be open to all who have the zeal and ambition to use them. But to set up the ladders is only half the task. The means must also be provided whereby, by training and study, the aspirants can be fitted to climb them.

The present position

442. We undertook earlier in the Report to explain more fully our proposal for a Training Grade for the Executive and technical divisions of the service. It would not be easy to deal with this proposal in isolation, or enough merely to define its boundaries; a recommendation of this importance, though relating directly to one part of the service, must affect the structure as a whole. For that reason alone we think that we shall not be regarded as straying beyond our field if we offer some comment on training for the public services as a whole.

443. Let it be said at the outset that we are far from claiming to bring any new gospel to East Africa. We have drawn wherever necessary in this Report on the evidence given to us of what is being done by administrations at present to fit candidates for the public services or to train them after they have entered. If we do not detail in full the training institutions or courses that exist, our apology in regard to those not mentioned must be that this subject is subsidiary to the main purpose of the Report. But we would like to record the convincing impression which we received of the awareness among members of the Legislatures and senior officers of the administrations of the importance of training, and of the thought which many heads of departments and professional officers are giving to its development. Few criticisms can be justly made on the grounds either of present achievements or of good intentions. The suggestion which we wish to make is that now, when the foundations of an indigenous public service are being laid, is the time to focus all this activity and thought into co-ordinated planning. We must, however, preface this suggestion with a brief and very general survey of the present state of affairs.

/444. The Administrative and Professional
Divisions

The Administrative and Professional Divisions

444. Paragraphs 39-41 of this Report will serve to indicate the present position in regard to training for these services, together with the further information in paragraphs 319-320 on training for the medical profession. We should add that, according to information given to us, the Royal Technical College at Nairobi is likely in time to provide education up to graduate level in science. There is little more for us to say, for the reason that the development of higher education is a matter of major policy which is not in our province. A University or a higher Technical College has wider functions to perform than to provide staff for the public services alone, though the Governments will no doubt see that due weight is given to that requirement in their plans for development, and that their services can compete on fair terms for the products of these institutions. In the meantime, until centres of higher education are so developed that their output is adequate in numbers and quality to meet the demands that will exist throughout the East African field of employment, the position will remain that local aspirants for the administrative and many of the professional services can only reach the prescribed standards by seeking higher education outside East Africa, either by their own resources or with the aid of scholarships or other financial assistance. The alternative of lowering the standards should not, in our opinion, be contemplated even as a temporary measure.

The Executive and Technical Divisions

445. We have illustrated in Chapter XI the part played at present by the University College of Makerere, in its diploma courses, and by other training institutions in supplying candidates for some services in these divisions. Valuable though these contributions are, it must be remembered that only a minority of the numerous services are catered for in this way, and that the output is still relatively small from some sources. Moreover, Makerere and the Engineering and Survey Schools in Uganda are at present open only to Africans, and other centres are similarly restricted; the Egerton School of Agriculture in Kenya, for instance, is restricted to Europeans. It would not be unfair to say that the present picture of training facilities for these divisions is a patchwork one; some services are provided for on a racial basis, and others are not provided for at all. The result is that the administrations have to recruit very largely in the open market in order to keep their establishments filled, and this in many cases obliges them to go outside East Africa.

446. It is against this background that we set our proposal for a Training Grade in these divisions of the Service. The primary and outstanding need is to build up in this way the class of officer who will carry out in Government offices and establishments the work of the executive class as we have defined it on the United Kingdom analogy in Chapter XI - the accounting, establishment, and other day-to-day work which falls below the "policy" level. But we must make it clear that the proposal is by no means confined to this sphere alone. There are, in our opinion, many technical and field grades in the professional departments into which, by means of a Training Grade, the locally-born candidate can be introduced either direct from school or from the ranks below.

/447. The Clerical and analogous divisions

The Clerical and analogous divisions

447. We did not find any evidence of organised schemes of clerical training, though it was interesting to note that Uganda has created a post of Supervisor of Clerical Training. We shall return to this point later. In regard to the analogous services we have remarked in paragraph 160 on the existing schemes of departmental training under which candidates are trained after leaving school for several years before being appointed to a grade. There is also a variety of training arrangements for serving members; to cite two instances, the Medical Departments train their Medical Assistants and lower nursing grades, and the new Natural Resources School at Tengeru in Tanganyika offers training for the lower grades of several of the field services under the same roof. The training system for the analogous grades is not a complete one, but it has clearly received a lot of attention.

The operation of the Training Grade

448. A Training Grade should be able to fulfil several needs which are not covered at present. By its non-racial nature it should offer opportunities alternative and equivalent to those which at present have a racial restriction in them. It should open a way to candidates who, though promising in performance at their secondary schools, have not the resources to go on to post-secondary education. And above all it should provide for the middle grades of the public services men and women trained from the outset in the ways of Government service and in the duties which they will take up.

449. If the proposal finds favour for those reasons, we suggest that it should be implemented in the following way:-

- (i) Creation of Grades. The Training Grade for the executive side, as we have defined it, should be under central control. The Establishment branches would regulate the size of the yearly intake into the grade according to the expectation of vacancies, assisted by the advice of the Chief Accounting Officer of the administration in respect of accounting posts. As regards the technical or sub-professional grades in the departments, the initiative in proposing the setting-up of a Training Grade should lie with the head of department concerned in each case.
- (ii) Selection of Candidates. It would be for the Public Service Commission to examine the field of candidates and advise on selection. Candidates already serving in lower grades would be nominated by heads of departments, and the Commission would consider their claims concurrently with those of applicants for direct entry to the Training Grade.
- (iii) Arrangement and duration of Courses. We have suggested a five-year scale for the Training Grade. Within this period we think that there should normally be time for training combined with testing of the candidate's ability in practical application of what he is being taught. (As we have remarked earlier, it would be possible to employ a trainee in a post in the E1 grade during part of his training, as the scale of that grade and the Training Grade is the same). It may not be necessary in some cases

/that a trainee should spend

that a trainee should spend the full five years in the grade, as this will depend both on the length of the actual course and practical work and the results achieved by him. Executive training should in all cases include a course in organisation and method (see paragraph below). The curriculum of training would be drawn up with the advice of the professional heads of departments concerned, who would act in consultation where a Training Grade might serve several departments, e.g. a grade for training draughtsmen. The curriculum might include a period of overseas training where the facilities in East Africa are at present inadequate.

- (iv) Failure to qualify in a Training grade. Apart from culpable failure, which would be dealt with by the normal disciplinary methods, it may happen that a member of the grade fails to realise expectations and cannot be recommended for appointment to the grade for which he has been trained. The way in which he would be treated would, we suggest, depend on the nature of the reports on him. If he had already been in the Service on selection, he could at worst return to the grade from which he came, without loss of seniority. Alternatively he could be posted to any other grade in his service up to the E1 segment, and would retain the chance of achieving his original aim by direct promotion throughout his subsequent service if he subsequently proved fit for it. A direct entrant to the Training Grade who failed to qualify could be given the alternative of leaving the Service or of being posted to another branch, in a grade at best not higher than the Training Grade. We recommend that a direct entrant to the Grade should not have pensionable status until he has qualified and been posted, but that his service in the Grade should then be regarded as part of his pensionable service under the ordinary pensions rules.

Planning of training for the future

450. We hope that enough has been said above to give a broad picture of the general position at present, and to indicate how the proposal for a Training Grade may be expected to fill what seems to us to be an obvious gap. It may be useful to try to survey the future in the same broad perspective. The analysis in Chapter III led us to the inference that in present circumstances the East African Administrations must make the best use of the recruits whom they now obtain within their own territories. It is no doubt true that in the long run the tide of educational development will bring in an adequate flow of local candidates even up to the highest grades. The evidence given to us indicates that the administrations are not content merely to wait for that tide to rise. If that is so, there are cogent reasons for co-ordinating their efforts and resources in the field of training. In any large service there are men whose natural abilities will take them high above the level at which their educational attainment brought them in provided that those abilities are trained and tempered for higher responsibility. The service in which such incentives are freely offered is

/likely to be far more efficient

likely to be far more efficient at all levels than one which is confined within rigidly drawn compartments. We do not accept as an argument of any force against the free provision of such incentives that the results may for a time be uneven or disappointing; the gain in morale of the service which should result from this evidence of the intention to do away with arbitrary barriers should be a more than adequate compensation. Further, there is the aspect of cost to be considered. No part of the public services should be, in the words of the 1947-48 Commission, "a Mandarin caste, divorced in income and interests from their fellows". The services must be able to compete on fair terms for the best of the material available, but not to monopolise it. We have tried to fix our salary levels by that standard. But even if the levels are right, the service is not getting full value for money, and the taxpayer's interest is not fully preserved, unless every post is weighted with a responsibility equivalent to the salary, and every holder is being used to the limit of his ability. Political considerations apart, we believe that it will pay handsome dividends if the administrations have a comprehensive system whereby public servants of talent and industry can be recognised and picked out of every grade for training and advancement to the limit of their bent. It seems to us that only in this way can the administrations begin to move away from the expensive, and to some extent haphazard, expedient of recruitment in the open market until such time as the educational system within East Africa is ready to take the full strain of demand.

A Standing Committee on Training

451. We suggest, therefore, that a Standing Committee on Training should be set up forthwith, at any rate in each of the four territorial administrations. It has been suggested that this work should be done by Public Service Commissions when they come into operation. We agree that the Commissions have an interest in the matter; but their concern with a candidate normally extends only up to the time when he is appointed to the service, and a considerable part of the training is given after that stage. We suggest that the permanent core of the Committee should consist of the head of the Establishment Branch of the administration (representing both the Establishment and the Treasury interest), the Director of Education and a representative of the Public Service Commission. The heads of the professional departments concerned should be co-opted as and when required. The functions of the Committee should, we suggest, be:-

- (i) To set up the executive Training Grade.
- (ii) To devise a system of clerical training.
- (iii) In consultation with the co-opted heads of departments, to examine the present systems of technical training in all grades, to decide to what extent the creation of Training Grades for technical services is desirable and to organise the system of training in the analogous grades so that it may be fully comprehensive.
- (iv) To receive reports on trainees in the Training Grades from time to time and to advise the Government on questions of posting on promotion from the Grades or of reversion.

452. The participation of the High Commission in these arrangements will require special consideration. It is likely that, except perhaps for executive and clerical training, the Self-Contained Services (i.e. the Railways and Harbours and the Posts and Telecommunications) may find it preferable to operate their own arrangements, as they do at present, because of the specialised nature of the technical training required. As regards the other services of the High Commission, the alternatives are to participate in the territorial arrangements or to create a Standing Committee for the High Commission also. The decision whether to adopt one or other of these alternatives, or a combination of them, can only be made after consideration of the actual requirements, and we suggest that the Administrator should initiate a survey of these requirements at once.

453. The arrangements in Zanzibar, in so far as that Government decides to adopt our suggestions, will be more simple, as no Public Service Commission is likely to be created in that territory. But we trust that Zanzibar will encounter no difficulty in making use of training services on the mainland to the extent that may be found helpful to its services.

454. This leads on to the question of inter-territorial co-operation in training. There is no doubt that in some cases the combined resources of the administrations may provide better and more economical training services than can be given by separate institutions, but on the other hand there may be geographical, ethnical and other reasons which make it best for each administration to follow its own path. We can do no more than to emphasise the desirability of inter-territorial liaison at all times in the matter, and of occasional meetings of representatives of the respective Committees to discuss matters of common interest. In this way the administrations will be furnished with comprehensive and expert advice on which to base the decision whether to pool their resources in any particular project or to act on their own.

The needs of the Local Government Services

455. Organs of local Government are now being created throughout East Africa, and as they become established some of the functions now carried out by the Central Governments will be increasingly devolved onto them. It is not easy for local government authorities, whose resources are often limited, to keep their salary patterns in relation with those of the central Government services, and fear has been expressed that our recommendations may aggravate this difficulty. We suggest that by allowing officers of the local government bodies to use the training facilities the territorial Governments will go some way to offering relief, in that the standard of efficiency of the local government services should be noticeably raised in time by this means. From all points of view this kind of assistance is likely to be of great benefit to the development of local government.

Organisation and Method

456. We have been asked at various times whether we can advise what action should be taken to obtain for the public services in East Africa the benefits of modern developments in organisation and method. This branch of the Treasury in the United Kingdom receives frequent requests from Colonial territories for assistance, and it is unlikely that it could spare an officer for secondment to East Africa. We suggest, however, that the administrations might jointly ask for the visit of a Treasury Organisation and Methods officer, the object being that he should meet representatives of each administration in conference for a common discussion of their problems, to be accompanied by such inspection on the ground as time permits. It seems likely that the larger administrations may then find it of benefit to arrange for selected officers to attend a course of training in the United Kingdom and then to set up Organisation and Methods branches under their charge. If this is done, it may be found convenient also to entrust this branch with two functions in addition to that of advising on and supervising the introduction of modern methods throughout the Service; it should be responsible for teaching organisation and method to the executive Training Grade and to periodical courses of other serving officers, and the head of the branch might also be charged with the direction of clerical training.

The future of Establishment Branches

457. It is relevant, in conclusion, to comment briefly on the functions of the Establishment Branches. The suggestions which we have made in this Chapter will clearly throw an extra burden on them. If our suggestions are accepted and implemented, it would be advisable for administrations to review the status and staffing of these branches. We think that it will be found to be the most convenient form of organisation that the head of the branch should be responsible to the Member for Finance or the Financial Secretary, though as regards the disposition of Government staff generally he will have responsibility towards the Chief Secretary also as long as the latter retains general charge of the Civil Service. The regulation of establishments and rates of remuneration are essentially Treasury functions, and we think so long as the Establishment Branch remains outside the Treasury, friction is almost inevitable owing to divergency of outlook. If this arrangement is adopted, the Chief Establishment Officer could then exercise executive control, under the Member for Finance, of the Organisation and Methods Branch. In view of the importance of all this work in its relation to the efficient working of the Government machine, the administrations will no doubt ensure that the Establishment Branch is organised and staffed to carry out all parts of its responsibilities. By way of illustration, we suggest that a post of fairly high level will be required to perform the executive work of the Standing Committee on Training both preparatory to and resulting from its deliberations. Lastly, we cannot emphasise too strongly the necessity for close liaison, by personal contacts as well as by correspondence, between the Establishment Branches throughout East Africa; it is by this constant co-operation more than by any other means that a common standard of economical administration can be preserved. It should be the unvarying practice of Heads of Establishment Branches to cultivate these close relations, and of the administrations to encourage them.

458. It will not be out of place to end this Chapter with a quotation which shows how much importance is attached to this question of training even in a service as highly developed as the United Kingdom Civil Service:-

- + "While our scheme is experimental in the sense of being the first attempt to devise a system of training for all civil servants, aiming both to increase the competence of the individual and to give the whole profession a higher conception of the contribution it can make to the welfare happiness and good government of the community, some of its features are already in successful operation in the Service or elsewhere, and we do not doubt that the rest will also be productive of good and early results. But alone they will not suffice to attain our objective of a Civil Service keyed up to meet the demands of its generation not only successfully but acceptably to the community. For this the Service must be pervaded with a sense of its obligations to the citizen as well as to the Crown. The faults we have recited earlier can be pointed out and to some extent prevented in the lecture-room, but if there is to be an ever-present consciousness of the importance of clarity of thought, directness of action, simplicity of expression, speed, initiative, considerateness and the other virtues in which civil servants are said to be deficient, these must be the key-notes of daily practice in all ranks from the highest downwards. It is our hope that if training - the idea that, besides being told what their jobs are, people need to be guided into the right way to do them - is given due prominence as a cardinal feature of good staff management, and if our scheme is worked with enthusiasm and vision, the whole Service will in due course be brought to an appreciation of the higher standards attainable and will be inspired by the force of example to attain them."

- + Paragraph 119, Report of the Committee on the Training of Civil Servants, May, 1944; (published by H.M. Stationery Office (Cmd. 6525))

CHAPTER XXIISUPERANNUATION ARRANGEMENTS

459. The history of retiring benefits in the East African territories up to 1947 is contained in paragraphs 191 to 221 of the Report of the 1947-48 Commission; from the historical angle, therefore, it is only necessary to set out in this Report the action which was taken by the Governments on the recommendation of that Commission.

Pensions

460. The 1947-48 Commission recommended that the contributory pension schemes which it found in existence and in prospect in Kenya and Tanganyika should be replaced by free pension schemes, the level of salaries being adjusted in the light of this. The Government of Kenya has adopted this and now, with the exception of a very small number of officers whose posts have not been declared pensionable, all European and Asian officers, as well as African officers serving in posts on salary scales with maxima of over £72 per annum, have been accorded free pensionable status on the basis of a pension constant of 1/600th for each completed month of service. A number of European officers, however, both in Kenya and elsewhere, whose terms of service prior to the 1st January, 1946, included free pensionable status on a constant of 1/480th for each completed month of pensionable service, retain that constant in respect of their service prior to that date. Similarly, the Government of Tanganyika dropped its proposals for a contributory pension scheme, and all pensionable officers now come under free pension schemes on the basis of the same constant. In Uganda and Zanzibar, similar pension schemes cover pensionable officers of all races, and there are now no contributory pension schemes, apart from that of the Railways and Harbours Administration, under the East African Governments.

461. We have been asked, in the course of hearing evidence, to recommend various alterations in the general pensions structure of the East African territories, such as an increase in the pensions constant to offset the increase in the cost of living and an increase either in the maximum commutable portion of a pension, which is at present one-fourth, or in the number of years' purchase allowed for commutation, which is at present ten. Subject, however, to the relatively minor amendment suggested below regarding the minimum age for pensionable service, we do not recommend any change in the present pensions structure, which is already in conformity with the general Colonial pattern; and, having regard to present conditions in East Africa, we think that the present pensions constant of 1/600th is sufficiently generous. Our view is that a pension should be a reward for a lifetime's service, and a substantial increase of the pension constant would inevitably lead,

/in the

in the case of many officers, to their attaining their maximum pension fraction of two-thirds of salary well before what we consider to be a proper age for retirement. The increase in the cost of living will be taken care of by the increased salaries on which pensions will be calculated.

462. We do, however, recommend an alteration in the age limit below which service under Government cannot at present count for pension, which is now 20 in East Africa. We have tried to trace the origin of this restriction, which is of very long standing, but without success. In present conditions in East Africa we recommend that the age qualification for pensionable service be lowered to 18, which is approximately the age at which a locally domiciled person will have completed his educational career up to School Certificate standard.

Computation of Pensions in respect of
service on present salaries

463. We have been approached on a number of occasions with a view to our making recommendations on the subject of permanent increases to pensions already in issue, but, in our view, the case of officers who have already retired does not come within our terms of reference. It is, however, a general provision of pensions legislation that, in cases where an officer has not held a post or been in a grade for three years at the date of retirement, his pension falls to be calculated on the average of the salaries drawn by him during the last three years of his service. Because of this provision, the pensions of some officers in the East African services on the date when the salaries resulting from our recommendations come into force will, in part, be calculated on salaries in force before that date. In such cases we recommend that for purposes of pension computation these 'pre-revision salaries' shall be taken to have been the total of salary plus cost of living allowance drawn at the relevant period minus 10% of this total, and that legislative provision should be made accordingly.

Death Gratuities in respect of
Pensionable Officers

464. The present position regarding death gratuities is that, when a pensionable officer dies in service for any reason, a year's pensionable emoluments become payable to his legal personal representative. We have been asked by a number of staff associations to recommend that, in such circumstances, there should be payable instead the amount which would have been paid if the officer concerned had retired on the date of death and commuted his pension, if such a sum should be in excess of one year's pensionable emoluments. We feel unable to accede to this request, since in fairness to

/the general

the general taxpayer it seems to us that the amount payable to the estate of a deceased public servant should be determined by one method in all cases, and that the public service cannot expect to 'have the best of both worlds'. As in the majority of cases a year's pensionable emoluments will exceed any amount which might be due by way of commutation of pension, it would not be in the general interest of the public service to substitute the latter method of calculation for the former, and we do not, therefore, recommend any change in the present method of computation of the amount due. We think, however, that some improvement might result from making provision that the amount due should be payable to the dependants of the deceased officer, the discretion as to whom it should be paid or among whom it should be shared being exercised by the Chief Establishment Officers, who would, no doubt, soon build up a body of precedents to guide them in cases of difficulty. In the last resort, the money could always be paid to the legal personal representative as is the case now. This would avoid the gratuity attracting estate duty and should, in many cases, result in its being received earlier by the widow and family of the deceased officer, when they are most in need of it, than if it passes through the hands of the legal personal representative.

Mixed service pensions

465. We have been asked for our recommendation on the case of officers with pensionable service in the United Kingdom or other non-Colonial territories who are transferred to pensionable offices in the East African territories, and who, by reason of the working of the various pensions provisions in the territories in which they commenced their service and in East Africa, do not receive the amount of pension on retirement that they would have received if the whole period of their service had been in East Africa, or, for that matter, partly in East Africa and partly in other Colonial territories.

466. In brief, the provisions relating to transferred pensionable officers in Colonial territories are that their pensions are calculated on the basis of the length of their Colonial service as a whole and of their salary on retirement, and the various territories in which they have served apportion this aggregate pension among themselves in proportion to the total amount of salary drawn by the individuals concerned from each. In other words, an officer with mixed Colonial service is in the same position, so far as his total pension is concerned, as an officer who has served throughout in one Colonial territory. The Government of the United Kingdom and other non-Colonial Governments do not, however, adhere to these arrangements, and, in the case of an officer transferred to Colonial territories, calculate the pension payable by them on retirement on the basis of the salary drawn by the officer

/at the

at the time of his transfer, which is, of course, in practically every such case a great deal less than his Colonial salary. While, therefore, the Colonial Governments treat such an officer transferred from United Kingdom or other non-Colonial service in the same way as an officer transferred from other Colonial Service, the aggregate of his Colonial and non-Colonial pensions is generally considerably less than the aggregate pension of an officer with a similar amount of purely Colonial Service.

467. We are not concerned with pensions legislation and practice in the United Kingdom and non-Colonial territories, and clearly the only way in which the East African Governments could remedy this inequality is by paying the difference, and the argument submitted to us for doing so is that the East African Governments have received an officer already trained at the time of his transfer.

468. We do not appreciate the validity of this argument from the point of view of the East African tax-payer. The fact that the officer is already trained is presumably reflected in his salary on arrival in East Africa, and we see no reason why the tax-payer should, in addition, carry an extraordinary pension burden on that account. Owing to the fact that salaries in the United Kingdom and non-Colonial territories are usually lower than corresponding Colonial salaries for overseas recruits, the East African share of the pension of such an officer is nearly always higher under the working of the ordinary rule than it would be in the case of an officer with similar service transferred from another Colonial territory. Nor, from the point of view of the officer himself, do we think that there is a strong case in equity for increasing his pension to the amount which he would have earned had his whole career been in the Colonial Service. Generalisations do not perhaps cover every case, but an officer, whose service has taken the form that we are considering and who originally elected to join the Home service and not the Colonial Service, has not been subject to the risks of a tropical climate for so long as his Colonial Service confreres with equivalent service. Moreover, he must clearly have considered that a transfer to the Colonial Service at a later stage in his career was, having regard to all the conditions including those relating to pension, in his interest; and, finally, he will in nearly all cases gain a much higher pension at the Colonial retiring age than he would if he had remained in his Home service. For a person with mixed Home and Colonial service we see nothing inappropriate in his being granted separate pensions for his Home and for his Colonial service.

469. A suggestion has also been made that relief might be granted to officers in the category which we are discussing by ignoring in their cases the normal rule that the hypothetical total pension on which the East African proportionate actual pension is calculated

/should

should not exceed two-thirds of their retiring salary. This, however, is merely another method of paying these officers an amount of pension greater than that for which they would be eligible under the general practice for pensions of transferred officers; and since this rule is, as far as we are aware, of general application throughout all Colonial territories, we do not recommend for the reasons already stated, that it should be interfered with.

Inclusion of war service and periods of courses
of training in computation of pension

470. It is perhaps appropriate at this point to note that we have been requested to consider the question of counting part, if not all, of war service prior to appointment as service for purposes of pension computation. It has been the practice since the war to give incremental credit for such service in deciding on the starting salary of new recruits (though we recommend in paragraph 428 that this practice should now cease), and it is argued that the grounds which, in the post-war recruitment period, justified this concession would also justify the counting of such service for pensions purpose. We also understand that value is given to war service for pensions purposes in the United Kingdom.

471. We consider, however, that the extension of the concession to Colonial territories would give rise to great practical difficulties. It would be necessary to make distinctions between different types of war service and this would inevitably give rise to jealousies. It is also, in our opinion, too late now, nearly ten years after the end of the second World War, to take up this question, which might more properly have been a subject for the consideration of the 1947-48 Commission. We do not recommend, therefore, that war service prior to appointment to Government service should have any pension value.

472. We have also been asked to recommend that the period of pre-appointment courses should count as service for computation of pension, but, here again, we feel unable to add our support to the request. Although it may, in some cases, produce situations which appear to be anomalous, and the dividing line may sometimes be difficult to draw, we consider that the only safe principle which is at once generally fair to the officer and the taxpayer is that pre-appointment courses of training during which the candidate, while being trained, is doing a substantial amount of effective work for the Government should have pension value, while pre-appointment courses of training, for example at a University, should not do so. On the basis of this principle what are normally known as pre-appointment courses of training, e.g. the first Devonshire Course, should not count for pension.

/Provident

Provident Funds

473. In Kenya the 1947-48 Commission found three provident funds in existence - the Kenya European Civil Service Provident Fund, the Asian Civil Service Provident Fund, and a Government Staff Provident Fund which catered for the needs of Africans. In accordance with the Commission's recommendations that posts, the occupants of which normally remain in service until retiring age, should be accorded free pensionable status, and that, on transfer from provident fund to pensionable status, the officer concerned should surrender to Government his entire interest in the provident fund, including his own contributions, and his whole service should then count for pension, the first two funds were closed for all officers who were participating in them prior to the 1st January, 1946, and elected for the revised terms of service, and for all new entrants into the Service on or after that date. The Government Staff Provident Fund was absorbed into a new Provident Fund scheme which became operative on the 1st April, 1951, and which is designed mainly for the benefit of African officers serving in posts on salary scales with maxima not exceeding £72, which have been accorded provident fund status. In addition, a small number of African subordinate officers of the Police and Prisons Services, whose posts have been accorded free pensionable status but who have elected for provident fund benefits in preference to free pension benefits, as well as a few minor employees who were depositors in the former Government Staff Provident Fund, have been allowed to participate in the new fund. The terms of this scheme are that the member contributes $7\frac{1}{2}\%$ of his salary, Government contributing a like amount for the first ten years of his service, $11\frac{1}{4}\%$ for the next ten years, and 15% for the remainder of his service.

474. In Tanganyika non-pensionable officers of both the senior and junior service are normally required to contribute to the Government Employees' Provident Fund unless employed on contract-gratuity terms, which are usually applied to short-term engagements of two tours or less. Subordinate employees in receipt of salaries of not less than Shs.70/- per month are also permitted to contribute, but are not required to do so. The terms of this fund are that both the employee and the Government contribute $8\frac{1}{2}\%$ of the employee's salary but, unlike the case of Kenya, the employee can withdraw the total amount to his credit in the fund at any time on leaving the service other than by dismissal; and if he is subsequently appointed to a pensionable post the whole of his provident fund service is allowed to count for pension, while his own deposits in the fund are returned to him.

475. In Uganda, at the time of the 1947-48 Commission, the current regulations contained no provision for pensionable status for Asians and Africans, although a number retained such status which they had attained under

/previous

previous regulations. Instead, they were admitted, with the exception of Members of the Employees' Division, to the Government Employees' Provident Fund. Since that date, in accordance with the recommendations of the 1947-48 Commission, all grades in the Local Civil Service with the exception of the Employees' Division have been accorded free pensionable status, with the result that the scope of the Government Employees' Provident Fund is now confined to Non-Commissioned Ranks of the Police Force and Prisons Department (except Police Constables and Prison Warders) and to officers serving in established posts on agreement for a period of years. The terms of the fund are that both the Government and the employee contribute 7% of the officer's salary for the first 15 years; thereafter, the employee contributes 5% and the Government 9%. Compound interest is paid on both contributions at a rate which may be varied by the Governor-in-Council but has so far been fixed at 2½%, and in the event of transfer to pensionable service the employee receives a refund of his own contributions and interest, while the whole of his provident fund service counts for pension.

476. In Zanzibar no provident funds of general application exist.

477. The High Commission has a provident fund on the Kenya model intended, in the main, for African employees drawing less than £72 per annum, but a few exceptions have been made and other non-pensionable employees admitted as contributors.

In paragraphs 240 to 243 of their Report, the 1947-48 Commission discussed at some length the question of the treatment to be accorded to provident fund service for pensions purposes when immediately followed by service entitling the officer to free pension, and recorded their preference for the system whereby an officer should, at the time of his transfer to pensionable service, surrender to the Government his interest in the provident fund of which he is a member and at the same time have the whole of his provident fund service counted for pension. This seems to us to be logical in principle, as the Government should not pay superannuation benefits twice in respect of any period of service. Consequently, if an officer is to retain a right to the Government contributions to a provident fund and interest thereon in respect of any period of provident fund service, that service should have no value, apart from qualifying value, for pensions purposes. If, however, he retains the right to his own contributions and interest thereon, the Government contributions and interest thereon being refunded to the Government, the service in question could quite logically be treated in the same way as non-pensionable service is normally treated for pensions purposes where followed by pensionable services, i.e. at half value. Finally, as recommended by the 1947-48 Commission, it would seem equitable that if the contributor surrenders his whole interest in the provident fund (i.e. his own as well

as the Government contributions and interest thereon) to the Government, the service in question should count in full for pension, the contributors' contributions being accepted by the Government as payment of a pension contribution. Subject to the retention of any existing rights of individuals, we recommend that in the case of future transfers of provident fund contributors to the pensionable establishment, the individual be treated at his option in any one of these three ways. This option would not, of course, affect any other election which he might be entitled to make to continue his service entirely on a provident fund basis rather than to receive a free pension at all.

479. In the course of our evidence we have been asked to recommend that the gratuity system, which we deal with in paragraph 481-486 below, be replaced generally by a provident fund system for employees not on the pensionable establishment. This would appear in principle to have advantages from the point of view of Government finance, since the liability in respect of the superannuation of non-pensionable employees would be met as it was incurred, although this could equally well be done by the creation of a reserve fund for the gratuities. On the other hand, the creation of a vast number of very small accounts for individual minor employees under a provident fund may cause expenditure on clerical and accounting work out of proportion to the value of the accounts. Whether this change would be to the advantage of the employee is also open to doubt, as, apart from the fact that this issue clearly depends on the terms of the provident fund in question, provident fund benefits are based on current salaries throughout a person's career, whereas gratuity benefits are normally based on salary at time of retirement. While, therefore, we leave this suggestion which has been made to us for the consideration of the Governments, we make no recommendation on it, and in constructing our salary ranges for the subordinate service we have assumed that no change will be made in the method of providing superannuation benefits for this grade of employee.

480. It will be observed from paragraphs 473 to 475 above that there is a wide discrepancy between the rates of Government contribution to the provident funds and also important differences between the conditions under which provident fund benefits may be withdrawn in the various mainland territories. Although, if our proposals in the matter of extending the range of pensionable offices are adopted, the scope of the various funds will be much reduced, we recommend that the provisions of the Tanganyika and Uganda funds should be brought into line with the Kenya model, subject to consideration of our suggestion at the end of paragraph 488 that provident fund benefits should only be withdrawable when the contributor is no longer able to work or dies. It seems very desirable that there should be uniformity in this matter between the East African territories, and the

Kenya rates of contribution are, in our view, more equitable than those operating in the other territories. Once again, it will be necessary to safeguard existing rights.

Gratuities

481. Gratuities are, in general, of two classes; namely, those paid under the terms of their contracts or letters of appointment to officers engaged for relatively short periods, and those paid to minor employees who may serve for the whole of their working lives but are not, by reason of their low salary, admitted to pensionable status.

482. As regards the former, we have no comment to make in the matter of the rate of gratuity except that, where the sum payable is expressed as a sum of money and not in terms of monthly salary, it would seem equitable that, in cases where the officer's salary is raised as a result of our recommendations (see paragraph), the sum payable as gratuity on satisfactory termination of his employment should be raised in approximately the same proportion. We suggest that the precise amount of the increase should be discussed among the Chief Establishment Officers of the various territories in order to secure uniformity, particularly in respect of future recruitment. Where the gratuity is expressed in terms of monthly salary, the raising of the salary will automatically adjust the amount.

483. As regards minor employees, the present position is that, in Kenya and Uganda, minor employees who are not eligible for any pension or provident fund benefit and retire on grounds of ill health or age after fifteen years service (or in the case of abolition of office or reorganisation, after seven years) are eligible for a gratuity of half a month's pay as at the date of their retirement for each year of service. In addition, if they have over thirty years service and their salary does not exceed £10 per mensem, they receive an annual allowance of £12 which is increased to £15 if their service amounts to thirty-five years and £18 if their service amounts to forty years or more. In Kenya, this arrangement also applies to a few minor employees who have been permitted to participate in the provident fund.

484. In Tanganyika a similar provision exists as regards gratuities but no annual allowance is granted in addition to the gratuity. In respect of service during which a minor employee elects to contribute to the Government Employees Provident Fund no gratuity is payable, but such service is counted towards the qualifying period of fifteen years.

/In Zanzibar

485. In Zanzibar a gratuity is granted based on one month's salary for each year of service up to twelve years and half a month's salary in respect of each year of service over twelve. In lieu of this gratuity, at the employee's option, there may be granted an annuity equal to one half the pension that would have been grantable if the post in which the employee served were pensionable.

486. We consider that the terms under which gratuities are calculated for minor employees should be improved, and that in future they should be paid at the rate of one-twelfth of one month's salary as at the date of retirement for each completed month of service without limit to the amount which can be earned on this basis. If this recommendation is accepted, the annual allowances paid in addition to gratuity in Kenya and Uganda might be abolished; minor employees at present in service in those territories being given the option on retirement of either receiving an enhanced gratuity at the rate which we recommend or a gratuity at the present rate of half a month's pay for each year of service plus the annual allowance at present rates. We do not, however, recommend any relaxation of the present conditions under which a minor employee becomes eligible for a gratuity on retirement, although the Zanzibar Government, which prescribes 50 as the qualifying age for retirement on account of age, might well fall into line with the mainland practice in this respect.

487. Emplacement on the pensionable establishment

We recommend that, on the basis of the salary scales which we propose, posts the minimum salary of which is not less than £90 per annum (i.e. - the bottom of our E6 scale), should be eligible to be declared pensionable. By saying this, we do not, however, mean to say that every post carrying a salary above that figure should necessarily be made pensionable. Every Government must, in view of the constantly expanding and contracting activities of its various departments, carry on its pay roll a considerable number of temporary officers whose services can be dispensed with in case of need without a superannuation commitment. But, subject to the exception in the next paragraph we consider that in all grades of the public service those posts above the £90 minimum level which can safely be regarded as part of the permanent establishment should be made pensionable. This does not appear to be the case in East Africa at the moment; in the course of our investigations we came across numerous cases of public servants who had been employed continuously for many years but had still not been placed on the pensionable establishment. We recommend that instructions should be given by the Governments that the cadres of all departments should be now reviewed, and subsequently reviewed at regular intervals, to ensure that this principle is followed, and that individuals who have already been employed over a number of years and whose services, if satisfactory, will clearly continue to be required, are not condemned to an indefinite future of

/non-pensionable

non-pensionable employment.

488. The exception which we desire to make rests on the fact that we agree with the view expressed in paragraph 225 of the Report of the 1947-48 Commission that pensionable status is not really suitable for those posts in the public service which, though permanently required, are not necessarily filled by persons who intend to spend their whole working lives in the Government Service, e.g. artisans, who may transfer from public service to private employment and vice versa. In the case of these grades a provident fund forms the best form of benefit, although, if provision is made in the provident fund scheme that the benefits can be withdrawn at any time on leaving the Government service, this may lead to persons resigning at any time for the sole purpose of drawing their provident fund benefit. With such a provision a provident fund may cease to provide a superannuation benefit altogether. This can, and in our opinion should, be overcome by providing that provident fund credits can only be withdrawn at a certain age, or when a man is certified as being no longer able to work, or on death or on retirement from East Africa. If such a system were adopted the employee would at any time on due notice be at liberty to leave the Government service to better his prospects outside, but his provident fund credit would remain earning interest in the fund until he finally ceased to be able to work and would then fulfil the real purpose of a superannuation benefit. It would, however, be necessary to safeguard existing rights.

Retiring benefits for Police, Prisons and Customs

489. In Kenya all uniformed ranks of the Police Force are pensionable except African constables, who contribute to the Government Provident Fund, and a small number above that rank who have elected to do so in preference to free pensionable status.

490. In Tanganyika pensionable status only extends down to the rank of Sergeant-Major. Below that rank, members of the Force are eligible only for a gratuity after twelve years' service of two-thirds of a month's salary for each year of service.

491. In Uganda commissioned officers and the European and Asian Inspectorate only are pensionable. The African Inspectorate contribute to the Government Provident Fund, while the African rank and file receive gratuities on the same basis as in Tanganyika.

492. In Zanzibar pensionable status extends down to the rank of Assistant Inspectors; below that rank gratuities are awarded on the same basis as in Tanganyika and Uganda.

493. The position is generally the same in regard to the staff of the Prisons Department in so far as there

/are

are corresponding ranks, while in the Customs Department the preventive staff down to and including the rank of Corporal are pensionable, and Preventive Men contribute to the High Commission Provident Fund.

494. Before the arrival of the Police Commission in Kenya in August, 1953, we were ourselves coming round to the view that African constables in the Kenya Police Force should be given free pensionable status, and we are glad to see that in paragraphs 295-297 of their Report the Commission have recommended that African constables should in future be placed in the same position as their colleagues in the higher ranks, i.e. that existing members of the Force should be given the option either to retain their provident fund status, or to receive a pension on their total pensionable service based on the same principles as those applying to the rest of the Force, but that future entrants should be given normal pensionable status. For the reasons mentioned by the Police Commission we doubt whether this change will be popular with some of the men themselves, but we regard it as in their interests that it should be made.

495. In paragraphs 300 and 301 of their Report the Police Commission have gone on to recommend that, in view of the special consideration that the Police Force needs an establishment with a reasonably low average age, a member of the Force in the rank of Constable, Corporal or Sergeant should be given the right voluntarily to retire after twelve, sixteen or twenty years' service, and, if he does so retire, to receive either a gratuity at the rate of one-tenth of his annual pay for each completed year of service, or his accrued provident fund benefits in the case of persons who elect to retain their provident fund status.

496. We support these recommendations, except that we think that the more normal rate of one month's pay for each year of service should replace the rate of one-tenth of the annual pay for each year of service recommended by the Police Commission. We also think that, if a member of the Force is to have the right to retire after any of these periods, the Government should have the complementary right to retire him after the same period without reason assigned, in which case he should be eligible, at his option, either for a gratuity calculated as above or for a proportionate pension.

497. We do not, however, agree, with what we understand to be the recommendation of the Police Commission in paragraph 298 of their Report; namely, that existing contributors to the provident fund who elect for pensionable status in the future, should receive a refund of their deposits in the provident fund on retirement and also have the benefit of counting their back service for pensions purpose in full. We recommend that they /should

should be treated in accordance with the principles that we have suggested earlier in paragraph 478, i.e. that if they are to retain their interest in their own contributions to the Provident Fund, their back service should only have half value for computation of pension.

498. Since the same considerations as apply to the Kenya Police Force must apply to the Police Forces of Tanganyika, Uganda and Zanzibar, we recommend that the same policy should be adopted in those territories; and since they affect equally the corresponding ranks of the uniformed staff of the Prisons Departments in the East African territories and the uniformed preventive staff in the Customs Departments of the High Commission and Zanzibar, the same policy should also apply to them. We have already recommended similar salaries for the lower uniformed ranks of these Departments, having regard to their different circumstances in the matter of the provision of free quarters.

Widows' and Orphans' pensions

499. The position in respect of Widows' and Orphans' pensions has not changed since the Report of the 1947-48 Commission was written. While schemes exist for the dependants of European officers in all the East African territories, there is no provision for the dependants of Asian officers in Tanganyika, while the Uganda scheme for the dependants of Asians provides for a fixed pension of £50 per annum. This latter scheme is unsatisfactory both for the Government, since it is actuarially unsound, and also for the more highly paid Asian officers.

500. We have been pressed by numerous associations of African public servants to recommend the institution of Widows' and Orphans' pensions schemes for African officers. To do so would be a further step towards equating the conditions of service of all established public servants, regardless of their race, and we attach the greatest importance to this principle. On the other hand, since all Colonial Widows' and Orphans' pensions schemes of which we are aware contain an element of subsidy by Government, it can well be argued that there is no reason why the widows and orphans of that section of the indigenous population which comprises the public service should be subsidised at the expense of the whole tax-paying community. In other words, while, so long as it is necessary to recruit public officers from overseas, it may be necessary to continue to make special provision for their dependants in the case of their death, if for no other reason than the necessity for providing conditions of service as beneficial as those offered in other Colonial territories recruiting in the same field, there is no reason why the scheme should be extended now, when locally born officers are beginning to replace officers recruited from overseas, to cover the indigenous section of the service. There is certainly no necessity in principle to treat the widows and orphans of public servants as a privileged class in this respect,

/and no

and no doubt many such widows and orphans will be cared for under traditional custom in East Africa. But traditional customs are breaking down and a class of African society growing up divorced from its tribal environment. Further, there is no developed social security system in the East African territories such as exists, for instance, in the United Kingdom. Moreover, in a number of Colonial territories single Widows' and Orphans' pensions schemes exist which cover all pensionable public servants, regardless of rank or race. On balance, since we are recommending identical basic salaries for all public servants regardless of race, we consider in principle that the same policy should for the present be adopted in regard to widows and orphans in East Africa. When social services are more fully developed the question can, subject to the preservation of accrued rights of existing contributors, be reconsidered.

501. But even if the principle of Widows' and Orphans' pensions schemes for Africans is accepted by the East African Governments, this does not settle the matter, as there are practical difficulties. The system of registration of births, marriages and deaths is, to say the least, very incomplete in East Africa and polygamy is undoubtedly practised, though we met in the course of our evidence varying opinions as to its extent. We do not recommend that Widows' and Orphans' pensions schemes should be established in East Africa other than on an actuarial basis, and these factors will presumably cause considerable difficulty in working out actuarially sound schemes, though the latter difficulty might, at any rate in part, be surmounted by means of provisions on the lines of the Asiatic Widows' and Orphans' Pensions Decree of Zanzibar. Having recommended that the principle of actuarial schemes for pensions for the widows and orphans of African public servants in the East African territories be accepted in principle, we can only recommend that actuarial advice be obtained on its practical application.

502. It follows from these arguments that we also recommend the establishment of an actuarial Widows and Orphans' pensions scheme for dependants of Asians in Tanganyika and that the Uganda scheme for dependants of Asians should be revised to conform to actuarial principles, due regard being had, of course, to existing rights. It would be in accordance with our views, subject to the considerations mentioned above regarding the desirability of having Widows' and Orphans' pensions schemes at all for the indigenous population, if, so far as is practicable, the present racial Widows' and Orphans' pensions legislation in East Africa gave place to non-racial schemes; but actuarial advice may be against this. There are also practical difficulties, e.g. the present European Widows' and Orphans' pensions schemes in the various territories are conducted on a pan-East African basis, and the Kenya Asian Officers' Family Pension Fund is already funded. We suggest, however, that the aim of non-racial schemes be kept in view.

/We

503. We have also in the course of our evidence received a number of complaints regarding the inadequacy of the pensions payable under the existing schemes and also various suggestions for amendment of the schemes, e.g. the admission for benefits of widows married after the retirement of the contributors, and of adopted children. In particular, we have received several representations to the effect that contributions to the existing schemes should be funded and not paid into revenue as at present.

504. So far as adequacy of pensions and the suggested amendments to the schemes are concerned, we do not consider that we are in a position to make recommendations, since these are clearly matters for actuarial advice. We understand, however, that a review of the schemes has been under consideration for a long period, and with a view to expediting action on them we would suggest that an officer of the United Kingdom Government Actuary's Department, after sufficient study of the problems at issue, be asked to visit East Africa and discuss the action to be taken at a conference with the Financial Secretaries. Widows' and Orphans' pensions questions are always difficult and somewhat tedious, and their difficulty in East Africa is enhanced by the desirability of common action between the various territories. These circumstances combined with pressure of work on already busy officers make the problem almost insoluble by correspondence, and we therefore suggest that the visit of an actuary, who could then himself become acquainted with the problems on the spot and give his views on policy, would be the best means of ensuring that common action, which could be decided upon round a table, would be taken.

505. As regards funding, the advocates of this proposal usually proceed on the assumption that if the present scheme had been funded, larger benefits would have been payable than are now paid. We are in no position to express an opinion on this point, but it is clear that since no separate accounts are kept, it is almost impossible to convince contributors to the present schemes that larger pensions would not have been payable if contributions had been separately invested. On balance, we consider funding to be the better course, though there are obvious difficulties which will require the very serious consideration of the Governments before acceptance of this recommendation e.g. the determination of the hypothetical balances of the fund and the finding of the money. Suggestions regarding the solution of these difficulties are made in the Report of the Committee on Pensions to Widows and Orphans of Officers in the Colonial Service and on Colonial Provident Funds (1936)⁺ and there is no need for us to repeat them.

/Age of

Age of retirement

506. The 1947-48 Commission recommended in paragraph 260 of their Report that any officer, whether European, Asian or African, should be permitted to retire at any time after attaining the age of 45 with, in the case of a pensionable officer, proportionate pension, and that the Governments should be empowered to require officers to retire under the same conditions without assigning cause. They safeguarded this recommendation by a proviso that the arrangement should, in the first instance, apply for an experimental period of three years.

507. This recommendation was brought into force in the East African territories for a period of three years from the 1st January, 1949, and was renewed for a further period from the 1st January, 1952. At present the arrangement ceases to have effect at the end of 1954 in the mainland territories, and the end of 1955 in Zanzibar. It is generally referred to as the '45 years rule'.

508. The object of the recommendation was to enable officers whose keenness had lost its edge, and who were staying on in the service because they could not afford to lose their prospective pension, to retire; and also to enable Governments to dispense with the services of officers of mediocre capacity without resorting to procedure designed to apply only to cases of proved incompetence. The 1947-48 Commission pointed out that if the experiment had the effect of purging the service of disgruntled or mediocre officers, it would be all to the good, whereas if it resulted in the premature retirement of officers of good quality it would be detrimental to the service. They hoped that experience of its working gained during the experimental period would enable the Governments to form an opinion whether it should be made permanent.

509. It has obviously been impossible for us to assess the result of the working of the experiment from this angle, as we are unacquainted with the merits of the officers who have retired under the scheme and the circumstances in which they retired. We have canvassed the opinions of senior officers of the various Governments on this issue and we find that they are divided, some considering that the scheme has been beneficial to their Government, others holding the contrary view. We must, therefore, leave it to the Governments themselves to judge the working of the scheme from this aspect.

510. We should, however, wish to make some general observations in this connection. First of all, we think that a pension should be the reward for a life's service under a Government and not merely a form of assistance which will enable an officer at a comparatively

/early

early age to embark on a new career. We are therefore, in principle, opposed to a system which permits of optional retirement at the early age of 45, although we would see no objection to the present system if the age of 50 were substituted for that of 45. On the other hand, since optional retirement is allowed at the age of 45 in the case of certain West African territories, recruitment from overseas will undoubtedly be adversely affected to some extent if the experimental rule is not made permanent. To form a precise estimate of the extent to which it would be affected is a matter of difficulty, since East Africa has advantages, e.g. better climatic conditions, to offer, which will at least in part offset such a disadvantage. But it would appear that within East Africa itself there should be uniformity, if possible, in this matter, since if salaries and other conditions of service are to be equal as between the territories, as we hope they will be, recruits will naturally be attracted towards the territory or territories which offer them the earliest retiring age on pension. This is evinced by the universal popularity of the rule among the Staff Associations. A third point that was mentioned to us is that, when it is announced that the experimental concession is to be abolished, there may well be something of a landslide among officers over 45 years of age, who may be prepared to stay on in service while the door remains open for them to retire at any time, but who are not prepared to bind themselves to continue in service until they reach the age of 55. Fourthly, we consider that public servants are entitled to adequate notice of the abolition or amendment of the present rule. Admittedly, it may be argued that since the present temporary concession is due to expire at the end of 1954 (or in the case of Zanzibar at the end of 1955), public servants have no right to anticipate a decision that it will be extended. But everyone must plan his future, and since the experimental period has already been once extended, it seems to us that, in the absence of any announcement by the Governments of their future intentions in this matter, Government officers had a reasonable right to assume that the concession would not be cut off at short notice, and to plan accordingly.

511. Subject, therefore, to any agreed view which the Governments may come to in the light of their assessment of the effect of the working of the rule on the efficiency of their services we recommend:-

- (i) that the operation of the rule should be continued to a date not less than twelve months after the date of the announcement by the Governments of their intentions in this matter;

/(ii)

- (ii) that officers who had attained the age of 45 years by the date of cessation of operation of the rule should have the option of retaining their rights (and their liabilities) under it until they leave the service of the Colony in question; and
- (iii) that the rule should be made permanent with the substitution of 50 years of age for 45 years of age.

512. It follows from our remarks on the '45 years rule' that subject to what we have said in paragraph regarding the uniformed staff of the Police, Prisons and Customs Departments, we should not recommend any extension of it to permit of officers retiring with superannuation benefits after twenty years or other period of service regardless of age, as has been suggested to us in various forms during the course of hearing our evidence, nor would our general principles permit us to recommend varying retiring ages according to race. We consider that, with the usual exception in favour of High Court Judges, retirement should, in general, be compulsory at the age of 55, unless in the case of any individual the Administration concerned considers that it is in the public interest that the officer should remain in service, and recommends that this should be incorporated in the pensions legislation, where this has not already been done.

CHAPTER XXIIIHOUSING

513. We should state at the outset of this Chapter that we are unable to subscribe to the view expressed in paragraph 161 of the Report of the 1947-48 Commission that the Governments should relieve their officers of the anxiety of finding accommodation, and should themselves provide quarters for them; or of Government quarters are not available, should accept responsibility for renting privately owned houses and let them to officers against payment of rent. So long as officers have to be recruited from overseas, it will be necessary for the administrations to accept responsibility for their housing, as such officers cannot be expected to build or acquire houses of their own. There will also be a number of remote stations where privately owned accommodation of a suitable nature will not be available for locally domiciled officers who may be transferred to such stations, and also a number of Government institutions where it will be in the interests of the administration concerned that its employees should live on the job, e.g. hospitals, post offices, agricultural stations, etc. In such cases administrations must build quarters for their staffs. But it would, in our opinion, be entirely unjustifiable for the administrations to accept an unlimited liability to build quarters for all their staffs, both on account of the enormous capital expenditure involved to the taxpayer and also because it would make the public service a privileged class in this respect. The building capacity of the territories available for the construction of houses must be shared between Government employees and the general public.

514. This is not to state that the Commission are opposed to the building of houses. Indeed, the housing shortage in some parts of the East African territories is acute, and, in consequence, the rents charged by private landlords are extremely high and out of relation to the general level of salaries; and this results, in respect of public servants, in very high expenditure on rent allowances. But with the exception of the cases mentioned in the preceding paragraph, we consider that the efforts of the administrations in the matter of housing should be directed towards the provision of houses for the population in general and not for public servants as such, through the agency, possibly, of local authorities or a separately constituted Housing Authority.

Rent of Government quarters

515. At present, in accordance with the recommendations of the 1947-48 Commission, the general practice of the East African Governments is to charge 10% of salary as rent for Government quarters, where available, in the case of European officers subject to a maximum of £150 per annum, and 7½% in the case of other officers, subject to a maximum of £50 per annum. The additional 2½% charged in the case of Europeans is justified on the ground that European quarters are partially furnished, while non-European quarters are not. We are dealing with the question of furniture for Government quarters and the charge to be made for it separately, so that for the present purposes it may be assumed that the rental charged at present for Government quarters in the East African territories is 7½% of salary.

/516. In paragraphs 161 and 162

516. In paragraphs 161 and 162 of their Report, the 1947-48 Commission stated that the salary scales proposed by them took account of this recommendation and had been framed on the basis that these arrangements would apply to all officers. It may be assumed, therefore, that an alternative open to that Commission would have been to reduce all salaries by 7% and to recommend the privilege of free quarters for Government officers. This would clearly not have been in the interests of the officers concerned, both as regards pension and salary while on leave and also because cost of living allowance has, in recent years, been calculated on the basis of total pensionable salary. This, however, is now forgotten by the public service, and we have received in the course of our tours a number of complaints that, in certain cases, the rent charged on the basis of a percentage of salary is greater than the rent properly assessable; and in certain circumstances the Governments have admitted the principle of this contention by granting rent reductions. In any case, looked at in isolation and without regard to the origin of the concession, the principle of basing rent on a percentage of salary must result in illogicalities, as the rent payable on any given house will, under such a system, vary from time to time in accordance with the salary of the officer occupying it. Further, an officer on a high salary but with no family may be willing to have a small house but could object to paying a high rent for it, while a junior officer with a large family gets a large house for a small rent. While we do not, in view of the origin of the practice, admit the validity of these complaints, the origin has now become so obscured that we consider that the best course would be to abandon the principle of basing rent on salaries and to base them on the houses. It should, of course, be made clear that, whatever basis for rent of quarters is adopted, it is necessary to adjust the level of remuneration of public servants in relation to it. Our concern is with the net remuneration of a public servant after taking into account the order of the rental which he is likely to have to pay for his quarters.

517. It was urged by certain unofficials who were kind enough to give evidence that rent should be charged to public servants for their quarters on an economic basis. We appreciate the reason for this view - namely, that it is desirable to know the full cost of employing a civil servant; but, in our opinion, a strictly economic rent system (in the sense of market value) is impracticable in a public service. There must be a number of Government quarters that have hardly any economic value, e.g. quarters in a prison compound or leprosy settlement or in a remote station. In other cases the quarters can only be occupied by the officer for whom they are provided, e.g. quarters that form part of an institutional building, such as a post office or police station. Again, a public servant can be posted anywhere, and it is not desirable that his net remuneration should fluctuate violently according to the relative value of property in his particular station. It would, of course, be possible to arrive at a system of rentals based roughly on the average cost of construction and maintenance of the various types of quarters at post-war prices, their situation and the value of the land being ignored for this purpose; but, in the majority of cases at least, such calculations would lead to rentals considerably in excess of the rent that is at present paid, and it would be necessary to increase the salaries of public servants to enable them

/to pay them

to pay them. We see no point in increasing the pension bills of the administrations merely for this purpose.

518. After taking into consideration all the relevant factors that have been brought to our notice we have adopted a middle course, and recommend that the rents to be charged to public servants should be related to the size and amenities of the quarters concerned, but should not be tied to their values. We therefore suggest that all Government quarters be roughly classified into seven grades according to their type and accommodation, the criterion of which might be the number of their bedrooms, and that annual rentals should be charged according to the following table. We can, in this Report, do no more than describe the types of quarters to which we refer and which came to our notice during our tours in East Africa. This rough description will, however, clearly not be sufficiently precise for the working of the system, and if our proposals are accepted, we suggest that an inter-territorial conference of senior Public Works Department officers should be convened to define the various grades of quarters more precisely, possibly by reference to their floor area, type of construction or replacement cost.

	per annum
Grade A. Quarters of the type at present generally allotted to European officers and containing more than three bedrooms.	£78
Grade B. Quarters at present generally allotted to European officers and containing three bedrooms	£60
Grade C. Quarters at present generally allotted to European officers and containing two bedrooms.	£42
Grade D. (Quarters at present generally allotted to European officers and containing only one bedroom. (Quarters at present generally allotted to Asians and containing more than two bedrooms.	£30
Grade E. (Quarters at present generally allotted to Asians and containing two bedrooms. (Quarters at present generally allotted to Africans and containing more than two bedrooms.	£21
Grade F (Quarters at present generally allotted to Asians and containing only one bedroom. (Quarters at present generally allotted to Africans and containing two bedrooms.	£12
Grade G. Quarters generally allotted to Africans and containing one bedroom.	£6

For purposes of classification, living rooms that can be used as occasional bedrooms should not be classified as bedrooms; and quarters that the Public Works Department consider to be sub-standard, either in construction (regard being paid to the comfort of living in them and not the life of the quarters) or in the amenities normally appropriate to the class of quarters concerned, should be reduced by one grade below the grade that would otherwise be justified. No rent should be charged in cases where an officer has no private room of his own, e.g. in barrack accommodation.

/519. We should add that,

519. We should add that, by describing the grades of quarters in the manner that we have adopted, we do not intend that there should, in future, be any racial discrimination in their allotment. Subject to availability, they should be generally allotted according to the seniority of grading of the officers concerned, although no doubt where possible the allotting authority will take into account personal circumstances. We should also make it clear that the suggested rental system if adopted should not, in our opinion, involve any alteration in the present system of compulsory allocation of quarters, where necessary. The rent charged on our platform system will not generally exceed what is already charged on the basis of a percentage of salary, and, in the majority of cases, will be less. The Governments clearly cannot afford to allow their houses to remain unoccupied, and senior officers must, where necessary, be prepared to occupy and to pay rent for the larger houses.

520. Classification of quarters in this manner must necessarily be arbitrary; but we have deliberately constructed our rent table so that the difference between each grade of quarters in the matter of the rent payable is very small, and this should prevent any real hardship arising on this account. We recommend, therefore, that the Establishment Officers should not allow themselves to be involved in correspondence on account of applications for reductions of rent, either on the ground of minor differences in the amenities of various quarters in the same grade or because the rent payable under the table above on any particular quarters is higher than the economical rent according to local assessment.

Rent allowance for officers occupying private quarters

521. At present, in cases where no Government quarters are available for a Government officer, and he has, therefore, to rent a privately owned house at a charge which exceeds the rent deduction which would be made if he occupied Government quarters, certain of the East African

Administrations pay him a non-pensionable rent allowance of the difference between the rent which he actually pays (subject to certain maxima and to his satisfying the administration concerned that the house is not out of proportion to his status) and the appropriate rent deduction on the basis of his salary. If our recommendation regarding the rent to be paid for Government quarters is adopted it will be necessary, in calculating the rent allowance in such cases, to deduct from the rent actually paid to the private landlord the rent payable in respect of a similar Government quarters, regard still being had, of course, to the officer's status. We should add that, in principle, we are not in favour of this system whereby the administration pays, by way of rent allowance, the difference between the rent actually paid for a private house and the rent which would be payable to the administration, if a Government quarters were available. It throws a very large amount of work on Establishment Officers and is clearly open to considerable abuse. We, therefore, spent a considerable time trying to evolve a system whereby there should be paid to officers not provided with Government quarters rent allowances of fixed amounts prescribed according to salary levels. The shortage of houses, both Government and privately owned, is, however, at present so acute, and the rentals charged by private landlords so high in certain parts of East Africa, that we have had with reluctance to abandon this proposal as impracticable in present circumstances; it is not desirable to crystallise rent allowances in such cases at their present levels, but at the same time a severe reduction in the amounts paid at present would cause hardship. The

/differential between the amounts

differential between the amounts that it would now be necessary to pay as rent allowance in different parts of the territories is also too great to permit of the formulation of such an arrangement without an elaborate grading system from one town to another. We recommend, however, that the Governments should bear this suggestion in mind and as soon as housing conditions permit should re-examine the problem with a view to the introduction of this system in so far as a rent allowance system is necessary. It would save a lot of unprofitable work in Establishment Offices, and also enable the administrations to make a reliable estimate of their current liabilities in respect of the housing of their servants, which is not always possible at present.

522. To avoid misunderstanding, we should perhaps add at this point that we have dealt separately with the question of provision of quarters and payment of rent allowances in the case of the lower uniformed ranks of the Police, Prisons and Customs services and the subordinate services generally in Chapters XVI and IX respectively of this Report.

Rent of furniture

523. At present in the East African territories European quarters are partially furnished, and, in consequence, a rent of 10% of salary is charged for such quarters as against 7½% in the case of unfurnished quarters. For the reasons stated above we do not agree with this method of assessing the charge for furniture on the basis of a percentage of salary. The furniture rental should, in our opinion, be assessed on the value of the furniture supplied, and not on the salary of the officer occupying any particular quarters.

524. We are informed that the approximate cost, as at the 1st July, 1953, of the furniture supplied to European quarters in Kenya is as follows:-

Quarters with one bedroom	£150
Quarters with two bedrooms	£200
Quarters with three bedrooms	£250
Quarters with four bedrooms	£350

Quarters with four bedrooms have a higher scale of furniture generally in addition to the furniture for the extra bedroom.

525. We were also informed that the average life of furniture in a Government quarter is approximately ten years, though this does not, of course, mean that all articles of furniture necessarily have only a life of ten years and need to be replaced after this period; some articles of furniture have a longer life than others. But we have been informed that the cost of replacements and repairs to a complete set of furniture approximately equals its original value over that period.

/526. On this basis

526. On this basis, if overhead charges and interest on the capital cost are taken into account, a commercial charge for the furniture supplied, on a no-profit basis, would be of the following order:-

Quarters with one bedroom	£18 per annum
Quarters with two bedrooms	£24 per annum
Quarters with three bedrooms	£30 per annum
Quarters with four bedrooms	£42 per annum

527. We strongly recommend that the rent charged for furniture should be related to the cost of the furniture supplied and approximate to a commercial return; but in case our information regarding the average life of the furniture represents too low an estimate, and in order to provide for differences either in quality or in quantity of the furniture actually supplied in particular cases, we are prepared to modify the figures set out above to the extent of recommending that the following scale of charges should be made:-

For quarters normally allotted to a European officer and containing one bedroom	£15 per annum
For quarters normally allotted to a European officer and containing two bedrooms	£18 per annum
For quarters normally allotted to a European officer and containing three bedrooms	£24 per annum
For quarters normally allotted to a European officer and containing more than three bedrooms	£36 per annum

528. Objection may be taken to our proposals on the ground that the rent that we suggest for furniture is nearly as high as the rent that we have recommended for the quarters themselves. This, of course, is due to the fact that the rents that we have suggested for quarters are, for reasons that we have explained, heavily subsidized, whereas the rent that we recommend for furniture is related to a commercial rent. Officers of those classes for whom we have recommended that Government should undertake a housing liability could not be expected to provide their own houses but could, if they do not wish to pay furniture rent at the rates we recommend, be expected to buy their own furniture.

529. It will be observed that we have so far dealt only with the position in Kenya, which we have shown by way of example. The scales of furniture provided for quarters and their cost vary in the different East African territories, and if we had maintained a strict relation between the value of the furniture supplied and the rent to be charged, it would have been necessary to calculate the scale of rents to be charged separately for each territory. As we have said, however, in paragraph 527, we have in our recommendation modified the figures based on a strict calculation, and it is in any case one of our principles that over-refinement of calculation in matters connected with the remuneration of the public service is to be avoided. We trust, therefore, that the other territories will feel able to accept the scale of furniture rent which we suggest for the various

classes of quarters for Kenya in the interests of uniformity between the various territories. If the discrepancy between the value of the furniture at present supplied and our suggested rentals is in any case too wide for this to be acceptable, adjustment might be made in the scales of furniture. If, however, this course also is unacceptable and any territory feels it to be necessary to evolve new furniture rent platforms of its own, we would again put in a plea that the calculation should not be over-nice. One of the objects of our modification of the calculated rentals in favour of round and reduced figures is to prevent Establishment Officers from becoming involved in correspondence on applications for reduction of furniture rent on the ground of minor defects or deficiencies in the furniture supplied to particular officers. If, therefore, new platforms are unavoidable, we recommend that, while the rents charged should be related to the value of the furniture supplied and the cost of its maintenance, they should be substantially rounded downwards in order that Establishment Officers may be able to decline to enter into such correspondence, which must cost in the time of all the officers concerned more than any resulting adjustment, at the levels of furniture rent which we recommend, is likely to be worth.

530. We have so far dealt only with European-type quarters. This is because, apart from Asian quarters in Uganda, these are the only quarters for which furniture is supplied. But we would recommend that, subject to the availability of furniture, furniture should be supplied on appropriate scales to officers of any race who apply for it, provided that the rental charged for the furniture is related in the manner we describe to the cost of it and the cost of its maintenance. This would not, of course, extend to the acceptance of applications for odd articles of furniture, and quarters should either be furnished according to the appropriate scale or not at all. While the issue of furniture to Asian quarters in Uganda remains on its present scale, we recommend a flat rental of £6 per annum.

531. We trust that these recommendations regarding the rent to be charged for furniture in Government quarters will dispel the discontent which emerged on a number of occasions during our hearing of evidence in East Africa, and which arises from the present position whereby some officers are eligible to enjoy the use of furniture at a rental of $2\frac{1}{2}\%$ of their salary and others are not so eligible. Officers who made this complaint are normally of the lower paid categories, and tend to forget that, while considerable furniture can economically be supplied at $2\frac{1}{2}\%$ of a large salary, practically no furniture can be economically supplied at a rental of $2\frac{1}{2}\%$ of a small one. But so long as the rental is expressed in terms of a percentage of salary, we feel that this grievance will inevitably persist, and that it can only be dispelled by making the furniture available to all who ask for it, regardless of race, on the clear understanding that a charge related to the economic rent is paid.

CHAPTER XXIVLEAVE AND PASSAGESLeave

532. The decision that racial differentiations, where they exist, shall be removed from the salary structure of the East African Administrations has obliged us to examine the present regulations on leave, in order to see how far they, in their turn, have been conditioned hitherto by a racial structure. We have also had to consider to what extent the recommendations which we may make on the subject of leave must be governed by the assumption that the service for which we are providing is one which will ultimately be recruited from within East Africa.

533. In a homogenous service the determining factors in regard to leave are status and seniority in the service. But where the service is, and is likely to be for some time to come, recruited from external as well as indigenous sources, the domicile or place of birth of the officer has to be taken into consideration in determining the kind of leave to be granted. If this results in different arrangements being applicable to an officer recruited from outside the country, there is no reason why preferential treatment based on race should be imputed, always provided that the general conditions are not more favourable than are justified by considerations of status. The difference is dictated not by race, but by geography.

534. We have, therefore, reviewed the present leave system in terms of devising arrangements which will be suitable for an indigenous service on the principle of graduating leave by seniority and status, while, at the same time, having due regard to the requirements of that part of the service which is recruited from overseas. In the following paragraphs the present regulations for the various parts of the services are summarised in brief, and our recommendations follow. These summaries have been compressed in the interest of brevity, and minor differences in practice and nomenclature have been ignored, but they give a substantially correct picture of the present position.

Present leave regulations for locally-born or domiciled staff.

Africans

535. The existing practice in the various administrations in regard to African staff is set out in the following table:-

/Table

<u>Administration</u>	<u>Category</u>	<u>Length of Tour</u>	<u>Vacation leave earning rate</u>	<u>Maximum that can be accumu- lated.</u>	<u>Local leave earning rate</u>	<u>Maximum that can be accumulated</u>
Kenya	(a) Grades other than (b)	Period necessary to accumulate 60 days	20 days per annum	80 days	10 days	Nil
	(b) Minor employees	Period necessary to accumulate 42 days	14 days per annum	56 days	8 days	Nil
Tanganyika	(a) Grades other than subordinate staff	36 to 48 months	24 days per annum	96 days	14 days	28 days
	(b) Subordinate staff	36 to 48 months	15 days per annum	60 days	Nil	Nil
Uganda	All grades	36 months	24 days per annum		14 days	28 days
Zanzibar	(a) Officers drawing Shs. 396/67 and over a month		30 days per annum	120 days	14 days	28 days
	(b) Officers drawing over Shs. 150 a month		24 days per annum	120 days	14 days	28 days
	(c) Officers drawing less than Shs. 150 a month		15 days per annum	60 days	8 days	Nil
High Commission	All grades	Period necessary to accumulate 72 days	18 days		14 days +	22 days

+ 6 days may be carried forward as vacation leave

/Local leave is not

Local leave is not, with the exception asterisked, allowed to be taken in conjunction with vacation leave.

536. It will be noted that in all grades, with the exception of subordinate staff in Tanganyika, leave is divided into two distinct categories - vacation leave, which can be accumulated in most cases for four years, and local leave which may or may not be accumulative also, but may not be taken in conjunction with vacation leave. The practice of having these two kinds of leave may be a reflection of the treatment given to the higher ranks, or may have had its origin in long distances to be travelled and slow communications. Whatever may be the reason, it seems to us that the practice has lost any virtue which it possessed and is out of place in an indigenous service, and we suggest that the opportunity should now be taken to discontinue it. Our recommendation is that for locally-born or domiciled staff leave-earning should be expressed in future in a single category of days per year according to status in the service. We think, however, that to ease the transition, and because local circumstances may still require it, some accumulation of leave should still be permitted.

Asians

537. There are separate regulations for Asian staff at present, though in their case also leave is divided into the two distinct categories of vacation and local leave. The latter varies between 14 and 18 days. The 1947-48 Commission recommended in paragraph 186 of their Report that all Asian officers of the permanent staff should be granted vacation leave for the purpose of proceeding overseas as follows:-

	Tours	Rate of leave (inclusive of voyage)
Officers with up to 15 years service	60 - 72 months	2½ days a month
Officers with over 15 years service	48 - 60 months	3 days a month

The Government of Kenya has followed this recommendation, but for officers serving in the Northern Province has added one day per month to the leave-earning rate of each class officer with a consequent reduction in the length of tour.

538. The Government of Tanganyika has discarded the differential treatment of officers with less than 15 years' service and, apart from Asian officers who were pensionable under Ordinance 21 of 1932, has adopted a flat leave earning rate of 3 days per month and a tour of 48 months for officers recruited from overseas. In the case of Asian officers who were on local Civil Service terms on the 30th July, 1948 and such officers who have been subsequently appointed locally the leave-earning rate is reduced to 2 days per month and the tour increased to 60 months. Voyage leave up to a maximum of 14 days in each direction is also granted.

539. The Government of Uganda also grants vacation leave at a flat rate of 3 days per month irrespective of length of service with the addition of voyage leave after a tour of between 48 and 60 months..

540. The Government of Zanzibar grants vacation leave at a flat rate of 3 days per month with the addition of voyage leave not exceeding 12 days in each direction to non-European officers

/of other than East African domicile

of other than East African domicile after a tour of between 40 and 50 months.

541. The High Commission has adopted an inclusive rate of vacation leave with no addition in respect of the voyages and grants leave at the Kenya rates in respect of service in Kenya, at the rate of 3 days per month for officers with 15 years' service or more and $2\frac{1}{2}$ days per month for officers with less than 15 years' service in respect of service in Tanganyika, and at the rate of 3 days per month for all officers in respect of service in Uganda.

542. The tours with the exception of officers serving in the Northern Province of Kenya represent the time taken to accumulate 180 days of leave except that officers serving in Tanganyika with less than 15 years' service may go on leave after accumulating 150 days' leave.

543. It should be noted that the arrangements summarised above apply to all Asians without distinction of place of birth or domicile. In consequence, an Asian officer born or domiciled in East Africa is granted leave to the Asian continent, together with free passages, in exactly the same way as an officer born or domiciled in that continent. There is, of course, no reason why an Asian should not spend leave in his country of racial origin, but if he is an East African by birth or domicile it is difficult to see why he should receive assistance from public funds to do so, and the practice is out of harmony with the principles of an indigenous service. Nor do we regard it as justified for climatic reasons in the case of Asians. We recommend, therefore, that it should be discontinued in the case of future entrants, though we think that existing rights of serving members should be preserved unless surrendered by mutual consent. This change should not apply to future recruits who are Asian-born; in their case the terms of engagement in respect of passages to and from their country of birth are a matter for arrangement at the time of recruitment.

Future leave regulations for locally-born
or domiciled staff

544. We recommend that, in future, one kind of leave only should be granted to locally-born or domiciled staff of all administrations, and that it should be earned and granted on the basis of the following table:-

<u>Grades by salary</u>	<u>Annual entitlement</u>
Subordinate Service up to Shs.150/- a month inclusive	18 days
£90 per annum up to £228 per annum inclusive (including Subordinate Service over Shs.150/- a month)	24 days
£252 per annum up to £318 per annum inclusive	30 days
£336 per annum up to £480 per annum inclusive	36 days
£498 per annum but less than £810 per annum	42 days
£810 per annum and over	60 days

/We further recommend:-

We further recommend:-

- (i) that this new scale of leave shall come into force at a future date to be agreed by all administrations;
- (ii) that in respect of leave taken within East Africa, Sundays and public holidays should be excluded from the calculation of leave under this table, but in respect of leave taken outside East Africa Sundays and public holidays should count as part of the leave.
- (iii) that accumulated leave standing to an officer's credit at the date of change-over may be carried forward under the terms of the existing regulations;
- (iv) that leave under the new regulations may be accumulated in any two consecutive years, e.g. an officer earning 24 days a year who takes only 6 days in the current year may carry forward 18 days and take a maximum of 42 days in the second year, but may not carry on the 18 days into the third year;
- (v) that these regulations, when brought into force, shall apply to locally-born or domiciled officers of all races, subject to the special provisions referred to in paragraph 543 affecting serving local officers who at present enjoy overseas passage privileges.

Sabbatical leave for local officers

545. It will be seen that our proposed regulations rest on the basis that an East African officer's leave is spent in East Africa, or that if he chooses to travel outside it he should not expect assistance from public funds towards the cost of travel. We are strongly of opinion, however, that it will be to the benefit of the public service if an officer, when he has reached a position of responsibility after an adequate period of service, is given facilities periodically to spend his leave elsewhere in the Commonwealth in order to broaden his experience. We therefore recommend:-

- (i) that when a local officer has reached a salary of £810 per annum or over (i.e. when he has served for five years on the A Scale, seven years on the B Scale or nine years (from £540 per annum) on the C Scale), he should be allowed to spend a period of leave overseas once in every five years, and should be granted for this purpose the same passage privileges as are granted to officers recruited from the scheduled territories (see paragraph 567 below);
- (ii) that, in order to take this leave, the officer should be allowed to accumulate a maximum period of 150 days within the five-year cycle, the balance remaining available to him for leave taken within East Africa. Further, he should be allowed to accumulate leave for this purpose in the five years preceding the year in which his salary reaches or passes £810, so that he may be in a position to apply for overseas leave at any time after

/his salary has reached that figure.

his salary has reached that figure. We suggest that the administrations should lay down a minimum accumulation of 90 days, as well as a maximum of 150 days as, as qualifying for overseas leave. For instance, five years' leave at 42 days a year accumulates to 210 days. Of this the officer should be allowed to reserve not less than 90 or more than 150 days for overseas leave; the balance of 60 to 120 days may be used during the five-year period for leave within East Africa subject to a maximum in any year of 42 working days' leave of this kind. If, however, an officer declares his intention not to accumulate for overseas leave, he may accumulate for leave in East Africa under the rule proposed in paragraph (iv) above.

- (iii) Overseas leave may be taken in the United Kingdom or elsewhere in the Commonwealth, but not outside the Commonwealth except with special permission.
- (iv) It should be open to the administrations to require the officer to take short courses of study or pay visits to institutions in the United Kingdom or elsewhere during his leave; but this should not be a condition invariably attached to the leave, nor should these regulations operate in any way to prevent an administration from sending an officer whose salary has not yet reached £810 outside East Africa for the specific purpose of a course of study.
- (v) On reaching superscale rank a local officer shall enjoy the same leave and passage privileges as apply to officers from the scheduled territories of the same rank.

Retention of existing privileges

546. We have said in paragraph 543 above that we think that the existing rights of Asian officers to overseas leave and passages should be preserved unless surrendered by mutual consent. It will have been noticed that the present regulations in this respect are not uniform as between administrations. As the exercise of present entitlements will expire by lapse of time if discontinued for new entrants, it would be open to administrations to leave them unchanged; but for the sake of uniformity they may perhaps wish to adopt a standard rate of leave inclusive of voyage (as will be seen later, we are recommending an inclusive rate for officers from scheduled territories). If so, our suggestion is that the leave-earning rate adopted should be three days a month inclusive of voyage throughout the officer's service. If this is adopted, we recommend that the officers earning leave at this rate should

/be entitled also

be entitled also to casual leave within East Africa at the rate of 12 working days a year as recommended in paragraph 555 below for officers from the scheduled territories. Passage privileges would remain as at present.

547. The question may, however, arise whether a serving Asian officer may prefer to surrender his present entitlements in regard to leave and passages in exchange for the new arrangements, including sabbatical leave, which we recommend above. We suggest that serving Asian officers, at the time when they are appointed or promoted to a post carrying a salary of more than £480 per annum, should be required to opt whether to accept the new regulations or to remain on their existing regulations as amended above. Such option, when exercised, should be irrevocable; in other words, the officer who elects to retain his present privileges must remain on them for the rest of his service.

548. We recommend that locally-born or domiciled serving European officers who are at present in enjoyment of overseas leave and passage privileges should have their existing entitlements preserved, subject to the proviso that from the date of adoption of the new regulations their leave-earning rate should be in accordance with the new table in paragraph 544 above.

Present leave regulations for European officers

549. In paragraph 172 of their Report the 1947-48 Commission recommended substantially uniform conditions of service in respect of rates at which vacation leave might be earned and the length of tours of service after which it might be taken throughout the four East African territories. These recommendations were broadly adopted by the Government of Kenya but not by the other Governments and the present position is summarised in the table below. This table takes no account of further variations in the leave-earning rate which have resulted from the increasing availability of air travel for purposes of taking leave since the 1947-48 Commission made its recommendations.

/Table

<u>Adminis- tration</u>	<u>Class of Officer</u>	<u>Vacation leave earning rate</u>	<u>Length of tour</u>
Kenya	(i) Officers while below the age of 40 serving in healthy stations.	4½ days for each completed month of service (inclusive of voyage periods)	36 to 48 months.
	(ii) Officers of the age of 40 and over serving in healthy stations and all officers serving in unhealthy stations (except the Northern Province)	5½ days for each completed month of service (inclusive of voyage periods)	30 to 40 months.
	(iii) Officers serving in the Northern Province	6½ days for each completed month of service (inclusive of voyage periods)	The period over which a minimum of 165 and a maximum of 220 days leave has been accumulated.
Tanganyika	All officers	5 days for each month (exclusive of voyage periods) or 6 days (inclusive of voyage periods)	24 to 36 months.
Uganda	All officers	5 days for each month (exclusive of voyage periods)	30 to 36 months.
Zanzibar	All officers	5 days for each month (exclusive of voyage periods)	24 to 36 months
High Commission	Officers stationed in Kenya	As for officers of the Government of Kenya	The period over which a minimum of 165 and a maximum of 220 days leave has been accumulated.
	Officers stationed in Tanganyika	7 days for each month (inclusive of voyage periods)	
	Officers stationed in Uganda	6½ days for each month (inclusive of voyage periods)	

550. In the case of officers of the Tanganyika and Zanzibar Governments, the normal period of additional leave allowed in respect of the voyage is 32 days in each direction or the period of the voyages, whichever is less, while in the case of Uganda the upper limit is 28 days, Mombasa being considered the point of departure on and return from leave.

551. We have already stated our recommendations in regard to European officers of local birth or domicile, and also in respect of Asians, whether local or Asian birth or domicile, who at present enjoy overseas leave and passage privileges. It remains now to consider the leave arrangements of other officers recruited from overseas; or, to express it in terms of the future, of officers recruited from the scheduled territories (see paragraph 62.)

Proposed leave regulations for officers from
scheduled territories

552. In view of the expressed desire for uniformity (and it is particularly desirable in regard to the leave conditions of officers recruited from overseas) the first point for consideration is whether the leave-earning rate should be inclusive or exclusive of voyage time. It will be seen from the table above that present practice varies in this respect. The practice of granting voyage leave seems to have originated from the recommendations of the Plymouth Committee of 1934 (Cmd. 4730). The aim at that time was uniformity of leave conditions among overseas officers in Colonial territories as a whole. If the rate were inclusive, an officer going to the United Kingdom on leave from, say, Fiji would obviously consume far more of his leave in travel than an officer going from East Africa, and it was for the purpose of adjusting this difference that voyage leave was introduced as a supplement to earned leave. At that time, however, surface travel was the normal way of making the journey. Now that air travel has become highly developed, the difference in comparative times of journeys from the various territories has shrunk to a matter of days, and this reason for perpetuating voyage leave has become correspondingly weaker. Some officers prefer to travel by sea, and may regard a sea voyage as part of the recuperative process for which leave is intended; others prefer to spend the longest possible time in their home country. As far as the requirements of the service permit, freedom of choice is all to the good; but we feel that conditions no longer justify permitting the officer who elects for sea travel to be absent from duty for an additional period of 28 to 32 days, during which he is on full pay and his accommodation and board are provided. We have decided to recommend, therefore, that all administrations should adopt an inclusive leave-earning rate irrespective of the method of travel which is used.

553. We recommend that, in future, the following should be the standard leave-earning rates through the East African administrations, and that the rates should be inclusive of travel time:-

/Table

<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Days a month of duty</u>
1. Officers while below the age of 40 serving in healthy stations	4
2. Officers of the age of 40 or over serving in healthy stations, and all officers serving in unhealthy stations (except the Northern Province).	5
3. Officers serving in the Northern Province.	6
<u>Tanganyika</u>)	
<u>Uganda</u>)	5
<u>Zanzibar</u>)	

We further recommend:-

- (i) that these rates should come into force from a future date to be appointed by agreement between the administrations;
- (ii) that an officer should be entitled to carry on any leave earned up to the appointed date under the present regulations;
- (iii) that under the new regulations an officer should be regarded as qualified to go on leave, subject to the exigencies of the service, when he has earned 180 days' leave during his first ten years of service, and 150 days' leave thereafter, except in the Northern Province of Kenya, where the respective periods should be 144 days and 108 days;
- (iv) that no officer should be allowed to take more than eight months' leave at any one time, including leave prior to retirement.

Local or casual leave

554. It will be seen that, as regards local officers, we have recommended that local, as distinct from vacation, leave should cease to exist, being absorbed into the single category of leave which we advocate. The question arises what should be recommended in regard to local leave for officers from the scheduled territories. At present the practice varies, local leave being granted up to 14 days a year in some administrations and 18 days in others, and the rules for accumulation also differ.

555. Some senior officers have advocated that separate local leave for officers from the scheduled territories should be discontinued, and that an officer wishing to take periods of casual leave in East Africa should draw on his earning of overseas leave for this purpose. We doubt the advisability of this. The earning of home leave will be reduced in most

/cases by our proposals,

cases by our proposals, and an officer's natural tendency to conserve his leave in order to spend it in his own country is likely to be increased for that reason. It is not to the benefit of the service that an officer should spend prolonged periods in a station with no change in environment or relief from responsibility, and we think that facilities should exist to enable him to get away periodically. We recommend, therefore, that officers from the scheduled territories should be allowed, in addition to vacation leave as recommended above, casual leave up to 12 working days (i.e. excluding Sundays and public holidays) in a year, and that this should be accumulable in respect of any two consecutive years not broken by a period of overseas leave.

556. We recommend also that Asian officers who are on, or elect to remain on, the existing leave regulations which allow them overseas leave and passages, should be entitled in addition, to casual leave at the same rate of 12 working days a year, and subject to the same conditions. As stated in paragraph 546 above, this recommendation is contingent on the administrations adopting a leave-earning rate of three days a month inclusive of voyage for this class of officer.

557. We suggest that, to avoid any ambiguity, the term "casual leave" be adopted in future for leave of the category dealt with in this section.

Short tours

558. In consequence of greater availability of air travel, the East African Administrations are in some cases tending to introduce a practice of short tours for overseas officers, under which the officer goes on leave after a tour of 15-24 months, or possibly less, and takes a correspondingly shorter leave. We have been specifically requested to give our views on this practice.

559. The question of short tours must be viewed from two angles - that of the administration and that of the officer. On the part of the administration it has been argued that short tours should be a great help towards continuity of tenure in a post, though not all administrations entirely subscribe to this view. Clearly this argument can only hold good if the duties of the absent officer are covered by those remaining on the spot without a series of transfers and short-term acting appointments; if not, the element of disturbance caused by leave merely becomes aggravated. We feel that normally it should be possible to "cover up" in this way during an absence of the officer concerned for a period of two to three months; subject to that, our opinion is that short tours should be an aid to continuity. They should also help to avoid the staleness that inevitably affects an officer towards the end of a long tour in tropical conditions. The question of cost must also affect the administration's attitude. If the added cost of more frequent passages could be offset by a substantial rebate on account of the number of passages taken, or by a noticeable reduction in the leave relief carried on the establishments, it would be easier to envisage a general adoption of the short tour system; but it remains to be seen whether substantial economies are feasible in these ways.

/560. Opinion among officers themselves

560. Opinion among officers themselves on the pros and cons of short tours seems to be fairly equally balanced. There are inevitably elements of disturbance, and consequently expenditure, associated with going on leave which an officer has to meet from his own pocket; the more frequently leave comes round, the heavier the drain on his resources. On the other hand, if this obstacle is not too great, an officer whose children are being educated in his home country will welcome the opportunity of seeing them more often. If they are being educated in East Africa, opposing considerations may apply; he may be willing to leave them at school and take a short leave home during the school term, or alternatively may wish for family or other reasons to take them home with him, in which case a break in their education can only be avoided if he can obtain leave during the holiday period. It is not surprising in these circumstances that opinions on the short tour system vary considerably in the service.

561. We feel, therefore, that there can be no question of our making a definite recommendation either for or against the adoption of a short tour system for officers from the scheduled territories as a whole. It seems to us that the administrations would be best advised to proceed as they are doing at the moment; that is, to introduce the system by degrees as financial and other circumstances permit. It will probably be easier, and a way of applying the remedy where it is most needed, to introduce it from the top of the service downwards; but it may also be decided to be of benefit to apply it to some selected classes of the service, (e.g. the Administrative Service) as a whole, and some administrations are, in fact, working on these lines at present. In the later section of this Chapter dealing with passages we make recommendations on the subject of the passage entitlement of officers taking leave on short tours which are designed to ease the increased incidence of cost on them.

562. We do not recommend that any serving officer or class of officer should be called upon to accept an obligation to serve short tours as a condition of being placed on the new salary scales or other terms of service proposed by us. As we have indicated above, there are two sides to this question, and we suggest that a change-over to the short tour system, as far as it may be found desirable and feasible, can best be effected by degrees and by enlisting the good-will of the present service. It is, however, very necessary that leave arrangements should be flexible, and for this purpose we suggest that each administration should insert an explicit provision in its code of regulations whereby the administration would have the right in the public interest to call upon an officer to take his leave before the completion of a normal tour of duty, provided that no expense by way of passages is thereby imposed on him which he would not have had to meet if the normal tour had been completed. We see no reason why this should not apply to serving members as well as future entrants.

Passages

The present regulations

563. Reasonable uniformity exists among the various East African Administrations in the matter of sea passages for which officers are eligible for themselves and their families in respect of each tour of service, as all have followed the recommendations of the 1947-48 Commission that free return passages should be granted once in each tour for officers and their wives and, in the case of married officers with families, the equivalent of a further return adult passage for the children.

/Provision also exists.

Provision also exists in all territories whereby, in cases where this passage assistance is insufficient to meet the full cost of the transport of the officer and his family, the officer concerned may use towards this cost any savings which he may be able to effect by travelling in a grade of accommodation lower than that for which he is eligible under the passage regulations.

564. Since the 1947-48 Commission reported, however, the increased availability of air travel facilities has given rise to considerable alterations in the structure of the passage regulations of the various territories, and these have resulted in discrepancies. In Tanganyika, officers appointed after the 1st February, 1951, and certain classes of officer appointed before that date, are regarded as subject to compulsory air travel conditions when proceeding on or returning from vacation leave in the United Kingdom, and are granted free air passages for their dependent children without limit as to their number provided that they travel with one of their parents. On the other hand, an officer not subject to compulsory air travel conditions who is directed to travel by air when proceeding on or returning from vacation leave in the United Kingdom is subject to normal limitations in respect of any excess cost that he would have had to pay if he had travelled by sea on a grade of accommodation lower than that for which he is eligible. In Uganda, an officer appointed to the service after the 15th March, 1952 is normally required to travel by air at the direction of Government, but receives no additional concessions in respect of passages for his family as a result unless he is required to proceed on leave after a tour shorter than a normal one; Kenya has recently introduced on an optional basis a short tour system of leave in respect of the holders of certain specified posts in the Administration, and while travel by air or sea is allowed subject to the return of the officer to the Colony within the short period of leave granted, officers who opt for the short tour system become eligible for passage assistance for their whole family without limitation.

565. In view of the revised arrangements for leave which we have advocated earlier in this Chapter, we have now to deal with two contingencies, i.e.:-

- (a) sea or air travel after a normal tour;
- (b) sea or air travel after a short tour.

566. If the administrations accept our recommendation that the leave-earning rate for officers from the scheduled territories should be an inclusive one, we suggest that unless the public interest requires otherwise, the officer should be at liberty to travel either by sea or by air as he prefers. If, however, he is subject to compulsory air travel at the direction of the Government and the Government wished to enforce that obligation at any particular time, the option would not apply. We suggest also that this general rule should apply equally after a short tour as after a normal one; if the officer prefers to

/spend a large part of a short
leave

spend a large part of a short leave on the sea, there seems to be no reason why he should not do so provided that he returns at the due time.

567. In respect of leave after a long tour we think that the administrations would be justified in keeping their expenditure on passages at its present limit of three adult passages provided that they accept and implement the new salary scales and other conditions of service recommended by us. This limit would apply equally to air or sea travel, and would operate also in the case of local officers taking sabbatical leave or Asians exercising their passage privileges under the existing regulations. We suggest, however, that the present arrangement should be continued whereby an officer may travel on a lower grade of accommodation in order to use the savings to cover additional members of his family not provided for by three adult passages. It should be a condition of this concession that the full sum granted is expended on passages.

568. In regard to leave after a short tour, however, there are further points to consider. As we have said already, an officer on short tours is subject to more frequent disturbance for which he is not reimbursed; moreover, he may have to meet extra passage costs twice as often if his family is not covered by three adult passages. For these reasons we recommend that, where an officer is required by his administration to serve short tours, he should be granted passage assistance for his family without limitation. In addition, where an officer serving long tours is called on by his administration to go on leave so long before the expiration of his normal tour that, in effect, he will have served only a short tour, he should be granted passage assistance without limitation in the same way. Where he does not qualify for this, he should, as we have said in paragraph 562 above, receive the assistance which he would ordinarily have received on completion of his normal tour.

569. In regard to the passage eligibility of an officer who is granted leave before expiration of his minimum tour for private reasons, we recommend no change in the present practice.

570. We have endeavoured in these recommendations both to co-ordinate and to simplify present practice in East Africa. It seems to us in this way much time may be saved in headquarters offices and Establishment Branches which is liable to be spent on the application of complex regulations and in the consideration of hard cases arising or alleged to arise from them.

Other assistance towards travel on leave

571. Various concessions are granted by the administrations in the way of free railway travel within the territories or within East Africa in connection with leave taken within the territories. In the interests of brevity we will not detail these concessions. We are in favour of their continuance, and the only question is whether anything should be said about their co-ordination. Complete uniformity is, of course, neither possible nor necessary, as there are geographical and climatic differences. We suggest that, when more urgent matters have been disposed of, the respective

/Establishment Officers

Establishment Officers might compare notes of the present rules in their administration in order to see whether any alignment of practice is desirable.

572. In regard to officers who take leave overseas we have been asked to consider the question whether the cost of travel from their port of disembarkation to their home should be defrayed from public funds. We should make it clear that we have assumed that the administration will pay the cost of travel of an officer and his family and their baggage to the port or airport of departure from East Africa on leave and on return, and that leave will begin on the day of departure from the port. On the question of travel from the place of disembarkation our considered view is that the administrations should regard themselves as having discharged their liability when the officer and his family disembark in their own country. There is a limit to the extent to which fortuitous inequalities can be levelled out. We feel that the work involved in checking and accounting for expenditure under this head would not be justified, and that the better way is to strike a general level in salaries which will provide for contingencies of this kind. We record for the information of the administrations and of the officers concerned that we have taken this particular contingency into account in revising the salary scales of the grades concerned.

573. If our recommendation is adopted, there is no need for absolute rigidity in its application. We do not imply that justice is done to the officer whose home is in Vancouver by leaving him to reach it at his own expense from Montreal. If he travelled by air he would presumably be given a passage to the trans-continental airport nearest to his home, and it is equitable that he should be given an equivalent measure of assistance if he chooses surface travel. But relief can be given in such cases without an administration involving itself in a multiplicity of petty claims.

CHAPTER XXV

ALLOWANCES AND OTHER CONDITIONS OF SERVICE

574. For purposes of this Chapter we divide allowances into two classes - those which are reimbursements of expenditure incurred in the course of duty, and those which are an addition to salary.

Reimbursements

Entertainment allowance

575. The Commission have received a number of representations on this subject tending to suggest that entertainment allowances should be attached to a wider range of posts than at present; but we have decided to recommend that there should be no tampering with the principle on which such allowances are attached to posts at present. This is, as the Commission understand it, that allowances expressed in fixed sums a month are given only to holders of posts on whom there falls, by virtue of their status as representatives of the Government in the territory, a continuous burden of entertainment. It is because the liability is perennial, and because the entertainment is extended to a wide range of the community as a whole, that payment of a regular allowance is justifiable. We are unable to recommend it in any case where these criteria do not apply. It will have been seen that we have taken account of the entertainment aspect of the District Commissioner's and Provincial Officer's responsibilities in our recommendations in paragraphs 239.- 247.

576. We are reinforced in this view by the fact that it is the practice in some administrations to reimburse the cost of occasional entertainment given in the course of their duties by officers who are not in receipt of entertainment allowances. These payments are of two kinds:-

- (a) an officer who entertains a visitor in the course of duty to a meal or for the night may recover the cost from his administration according to a prescribed scale;
- (b) an officer who is called upon to offer hospitality to a visiting body of importance, such as a mission of the Trusteeship Council or one of the Specialised Agencies of the United Nations Organisation, or from the United Kingdom or other territory or group of territories, may recover the cost of the appropriate entertainment from a central vote, subject to previous sanction having been obtained.

/We

We encountered at times some criticism of this former arrangement on the ground that it is troublesome and embarrassing to the officer to make the claim. He is, of course, not under any compulsion to do so; but we think this attitude a mistaken one, and our view is not only that both kinds of payment are justified in present East African conditions, but also that they should be adopted by all administrations. We would, however, suggest that there should be the greatest amount of decentralisation in operating the former arrangement (if the rates are prescribed centrally, the actual payment can be widely devolved); and that in regard to the latter, the aim should also be to decentralise as far as possible, in order to avoid the delay and trouble of channelling all applications through one central authority.

Expenses on transfer

577. Here again we refrain in the interests of brevity from setting out in detail the present regulations in the administrations, in which there are various discrepancies. Our recommendation is that, as soon as is convenient, representatives of the Establishment branches of each administration should confer, in order to work out a uniform pattern of reimbursement of these expenses which can be recommended to their respective administrations for adoption. We think that a broadly uniform pattern is of importance because this is a matter on which public servants are quick to draw comparisons and to found grievances on them. We recommend that in devising a uniform pattern the following principles should be observed:-

- (i) a public servant transferred by order of the administration should be entitled to recover the full cost of transporting himself, his family and his household effects by the authorised means of travel from the old station to the new. The cost of transporting servants and their effects should also be recoverable on an authorised scale.
- (ii) He should be entitled to recover also the cost of hotel or other lodging expenses necessarily incurred for himself and his family and servants for a reasonable period before leaving his old station, while on the journey and after arriving at the new station. Normally payment should not be made for a period exceeding seven days in all, but this should be extended in special circumstances. Alternatively, instead of actual expenses, the officer should be entitled to claim subsistence allowance

/at the

at the prescribed rate for the same period. In either case payment should cover only the nights in which he is not in occupation of quarters or in receipt of a rent allowance.

- (iii) In order to cover all expenditure other than that under (i) and (ii) arising from a transfer, an officer should be paid a disturbance allowance in respect of the transfer which we suggest should amount to one-sixtieth of his annual basic salary, exclusive of cost of living allowance or inducement addition. An officer is always liable to find himself out of pocket on a transfer because of various expenses which are not easy to assess or cover by regulation, and we think it equitable that these should be provided for by a small lumpsum payment
- (iv) Disturbance allowance should not be payable when an officer goes on leave, but should be paid if he is posted to a different station on return from leave.

578. In general, the principle by which regulations relating to expenses on transfer should be governed is, in our opinion, that an officer should be able to recover all reasonable expenses in connection with the transfer that are in excess of his normal daily living expenses. It is impossible to provide for every contingency by regulation, and check by financial and audit officers will occasionally bring to notice points on which an ad hoc decision will be necessary; but if this general principle is kept in mind no officer should have substantial cause for complaint.

Travelling and subsistence allowances

579. We have received various representations on the subject of these allowances. We do not propose ourselves to suggest any revised scales of allowances of either kind, for we cannot pretend to have acquired the extensive local knowledge which is required for this, and which is already possessed by the authorities on the spot. Our comments and suggestions can only be of a general nature.

580. With regard to travelling allowances, i.e. the cost of running a privately-owned vehicle on Government duty, it seems desirable that the three mainland territories and the High Commission should have the same system of assessment. There cannot be a rigid uniformity in rates; the cost of petrol, lubricants and spare varies considerably in the territories according to distances from supply centres, and road conditions

/are

are another factor to which weight may have to be given. But if the rates of allowance paid by the territorial Governments are zoned according to local considerations, the rates paid to High Commission officers can then equitably be fixed on the territorial scales according to where they are stationed.

581. As subsistence allowances are related to the salary and status of the officer under the present system, we assume that the present rates will be revised as and when our recommendations for revised salaries are adopted. We should record that it was suggested in evidence received by us in various places and from various grades of the service that the current rates are inadequate in comparison with present costs of living on tour. We suggest that the revision of rates should be undertaken on an inter-administration basis, in order to ensure that a common system of assessment is used. Subsistence allowance is not easy to assess with accuracy; but it should be designed to keep the officer's living expenditure on an even keel, so that he is neither discouraged from travelling on duty because he is out of pocket, nor inspired to do so by the hope of adding substantially to his income.

Allowances in addition to salary

Acting allowance

582. The present method of calculating acting pay when an officer is appointed to act in an office higher than his own remains the same throughout the East African territories as when the 1947-48 Commission reported, i.e.:-

- (a) When acting in a non-incremental post, the officer is eligible to receive as acting pay half the difference between his salary and that of the post in which he is acting.
- (b) When acting in an incremental post, the officer is eligible to receive as acting pay the whole difference between his salary and the minimum of the scale attached to the post in which he is acting.

There are some minor differences in practice within these limits in the various administrations - in qualifying periods of service in an acting capacity, in posts to which the arrangements apply and in the reasons for absence of the substantive holder on which eligibility for acting pay is based.

583. We have been unable to discover any convincing reason for the marked difference in the rates of allowance payable under (a) and (b) above. One suggestion which we have seen on record is that a junior officer cannot be expected to assume the same responsibilities as a senior and more experienced officer. But if the difference between substantive and acting emoluments is small, it follows that the officer must be within the orbit of promotion; if he cannot carry the higher responsibility to the full he would not be promoted, and if so it would be better that he should not even act in the appointment. On the other hand, if the difference is considerable and the officer therefore relatively junior, it is difficult to conceive how in practice an administration can assess this alleviation of responsibility; either an officer is in charge or he is not.

584. It seems to us that the basis on which any system of acting pay should rest is not whether the officer is capable of carrying the higher responsibility in whole or part - which should be the predetermining factor of his selection - but whether the burden which he is called on to carry is essentially the same as that of a substantive holder of the post. The latter is an ascertainable fact. It cannot seriously be contended that, except in circumstances of emergency, a deputy who takes over the work of his senior during the latter's temporary absence moves into the position of isolated and unaided responsibility which would be his lot if his senior were removed permanently from the scene; to carry this contention to its logical conclusion would mean that every fortuitous absence of his senior through leave or sickness would involve payment of an acting allowance. But this brings in another consideration - the length of time during which the responsibility is carried. The burden of office is liable to be cumulative.

585. In pursuance of these lines of thought, we have endeavoured to determine the circumstances in which an acting allowance should or should not be payable. Our recommendations are as follows:-

- (1) (i) Where the substantive holder of a post has ceased to perform the duties of his office because of:-

- (a) leave prior to retirement,
- (b) permanent transfer or promotion to another post,
- (c) removal from office,
- (d) death,

the officer appointed to act in the post shall be granted an allowance equal to the difference between his

/own

own substantive salary and the fixed salary of the post or the minimum of the salary scale of the post.

- (ii) The officer shall be required to act for one month before this allowance is paid; but if the acting period exceeds one month it shall be paid from the date on which he began to act. If he reverts to his substantive duties before one month has elapsed no payment shall be due to him.

- (2) Where the substantive holder is absent from duty because of:-

- (a) leave for any period,
- (b) sickness,
- (c) special duty of a temporary nature,

and an officer is appointed to act in the post, the acting officer shall draw no allowance until three months have elapsed. For any period in excess of three months an acting allowance shall be drawn of the same amount as under (i), but there shall be no retrospective payment.

586. It will be seen from these recommendations that, in our opinion, no differentiation should be made in the way of calculating an acting allowance according to whether the superior post is on a fixed or an incremental salary. Further, when the substantive holder's absence is of a temporary nature, we think that it should be expected of the service that his duties shall be covered for three months without resort to acting appointments to which acting pay is attached. As we have indicated in paragraph 539 in discussing the question of short tours, the aim should be to avoid the disturbance and loss of continuity caused by reshuffling of appointments for relatively short periods.

587. There is a further reason in support of our recommendation that when an acting allowance is paid, it should amount to the full difference between substantive salary and the fixed or initial salary of the superior post. It sometimes happens that an administration wishes to test an officer in an acting capacity in a vacancy before deciding on his fitness for promotion. Though service opinion frowns on such periods being unduly prolonged, it is hardly practicable to fix a set limit. If, however, the officer is drawing the full difference between

/the respective

the respective salaries, the objection to a long period of test is less strong than if only half the difference were paid.

588. We are aware of the practice that exists in some Colonies of paying an acting allowance equivalent to 95% of the difference between the respective salaries. We do not favour the practice; such a fine assessment of relative capacity can serve little purpose beyond being an irritant.

589. There is one implication of our recommendations to which we should draw attention. It is sometimes necessary, for reasons of law or regulation, to make and publish the appointment of an officer in an acting capacity in order that he may be duly authorised to perform the functions of the office. If our proposals are adopted, it should not follow that an officer gazetted to act in an appointment should thereby become entitled to an acting allowance of any kind, or that an officer not so gazetted should be held to be ineligible for it. Whatever may be the future practice in regard to publishing acting appointments in the Gazette, it should be clear that the statutory aspect is divorced from the financial implications.

590. We recommend that acting allowance, under the system advocated by us, should be payable in respect of any post of which the minimum salary exceeds £480 per annum. This recommendation should not, however, be taken to preclude the payment of extra remuneration to holders of posts on salaries of £480 or less in exceptional circumstances where the burden of work undertaken justifies it.

Medical benefits

591. The 1947-48 Commission made no comment on the subject of medical benefits; but as we have received various representations on the subject the administrations may wish to have some indication of the general views which we have formed.

592. In the first place it would be a useless exercise to try to reduce to a common pattern the systems of medical benefits for public servants now existing in East Africa. Not only do medical and dental facilities and geographical circumstances vary from one territory to another, but in Kenya there is special legislation applicable to Europeans (the Hospital Treatment Relief (Europeans) Ordinance, 1951), whereby a compulsory contribution to the European Hospital Treatment Relief Fund, based on gross income, is levied on all Europeans. This applies not only to European public servants in the Kenya Service, but also to High Commission officers stationed in Kenya. It is from this Fund, augmented by a Government grant,

/that the

that the European Hospitals in Kenya are mainly financed, and European officials pay a charge for hospital treatment of themselves and their families. All races in the Kenya public service are eligible for free medical treatment for themselves and families, and Asians and Africans are eligible in addition for free hospital treatment in general wards in the Government hospitals.

593. Generally speaking, free medical treatment is the rule throughout the East African services; there is a disparity, however, in regard to dental treatment. The High Commission has no regulations of its own on the subject, but its officers generally follow the practice of the territories in which they are stationed.

594. In origin, the medical benefits enjoyed by the public services were not provided solely as a perquisite or form of hidden emolument; the facilities, and the means of getting to them from isolated stations, were introduced in order to maintain the fitness, and thereby the efficiency, of the services. That consideration still holds good, and will no doubt govern the attitude of the administrations in any changes in existing benefits which they may make from time to time. The only comment we have to make relates to the long-term objective of an indigenous public service. The position ought ultimately to be reached where, provided that medical facilities are adequate, public servants should be on the same footing as anyone else in their use of them, and the administration should employ its funds on medical services for the community as a whole. In contemplation of that prospect, distant though it may be in some parts of East Africa, we do not think it advisable to recommend any extension of medical or dental benefits. It may be that there are disparities which could be justifiably levelled out at the present, but that we prefer to leave to the administrations to decide in the light of comparative conditions. The long-term trend should, we think, be in the direction of bringing the public service and the general public onto the same plane rather than of maintaining for one class facilities which will have become privileges rather than requirements of efficient administration.

CHAPTER XXVIPOSTS & TELECOMMUNICATIONS ADMINISTRATIONSuperscale Posts

595. Since January, 1949 this Administration has been a self-contained and self-financing organisation within the East Africa High Commission. This was not the case when the Report of the 1947-48 Commission was issued. Further, the scope and responsibilities of the Administration have considerably increased in the interval, with a consequential increase in the number of higher posts, especially the superscale posts, which were placed at seven by the 1947-48 Commission and now stand at twenty. The growth of work and increase in responsibilities have led to at least two interim revisions of salaries, the last as from 1st January, 1952, when the following increases in salary took effect:-

Postmaster General: from £2150 to £2650

Assistant Postmasters
General:-

Traffic	}	from £1685 to £1850
Engineering		
Finance		

Regional Directors from £1435 to £1600

At the same time, eleven posts, which were put within the timescale by the 1947-48 Commission but had advanced in the interval to £1335, were further increased to £1435, while two other such posts on the engineering side were raised in salary from £1435 to £1600. Although we formed the impression that the work of the Posts and Telecommunications Administration is still growing, we do not recommend any further upgrading to superscale at the present time. Our recommendations as regards the existing superscale salaries are as follows:-

Statement A.SUPERSCALES

<u>Post</u>	<u>Present Salary</u>	<u>Proposed Salary</u>
Postmaster General	£2,650(3,000)	£3,200(3,352)
Assistant Postmasters General	£1,850(2,200)	£2,400(2,562)
Regional Directors Assistant Engineers-in-Chief }	£1,600(1,950)	£2,000(2,162)
Personnel Manager Deputy Regional Directors Controllers of Traffic Staff Engineers Finance Officer Accounts Officer }	£1,435(1,785)	£1,740(1,902)- 1,860(2,022)

/Present salary position below the
Superscale level

Present salary position below the superscale level

596. These salary scales, which follow the recommendations of the 1947-48 Commission, are at present on the same racial basis as those obtaining in the Kenya administration, and apply to the Uganda and Tanganyika branches of the Service as well as to the Kenya section.

The structure of the Service conforms broadly to the pattern, set out by us in paragraph 25, as that of the public services throughout the East African Administrations.

Sources of recruitment

597. The sources of recruitment are at present broadly as follows:-

(1) Europeans:

European men have been recruited locally in relatively small numbers as learners on both the operational and engineering sides and women have been recruited locally as telephone operators and in some cases as stenographers. The great majority, however, of the European staff have been experienced staff recruited from Great Britain, generally on secondment in the first instance from the British Post Office. European staff are subject to service anywhere in East Africa.

(2) Asians:

Asian staff (almost entirely male) has been recruited locally into the basic Grade II scale for employment on clerical, engineering and operational work. This staff is subject to service anywhere in East Africa. During recent years Asian girls have been recruited as telephone operators mainly in the larger towns. Most Asian recruits have been secondary school candidates, having spent about two years in secondary schools.

(3) Africans:

Recruitment to the graded staff on the engineering and operational sides have been centralised for some years, recruitment being controlled by the Principal of the Central Training School. Recruits, in the main, have been from primary schools and possess the preliminary school certificate. This staff is liable to transfer anywhere in East Africa although, generally speaking, there has not been a great deal of movement as yet.

/Cost of Living allowance

Cost of Living allowances

598. As foreshadowed in paragraph 108, it is necessary to give some account of the history of the cost of living allowances paid by the East African Posts and Telecommunications Administration to their staff from time to time. As this staff serve in all three mainland territories in East Africa, the Administration evolved a compromise which was fairly uniform throughout their service and, at the same time, stood in reasonable relation to the rates paid by the Government of each territory. As regards the higher ranks of the graded staff, the rates since 1952 have been uniform throughout the service and in conformity with the rate of cost of living allowances granted by territorial administrations, viz:-

	<u>Rate of allowance</u>	<u>Maximum allowance</u>
As from 1st January, 1952	25%	£250
As from 1st August, 1952	30%	£300
As from 1st September, 1953	35%	£350

The Posts and Telecommunications Administration has, however, since 1952 adopted broadly the principle followed by Kenya of paying a higher cost of living allowance in the case of the lower income groups than in the case of others. This has been effected by the use of the device of a minimum allowance in the case of its lower paid graded staff, viz:-

As from 1st January, 1952	Minimum rate of allowance	£27
As from 1st August, 1952	Minimum rate of allowance	£35
As from 1st September, 1953	Minimum rate of allowance	£36

Before 1st January, 1952, there was some variation between the rates granted to territorial sections of the service in that, whereas 15% on all salaries with a maximum of £150 was granted to the Tanganyika and Uganda sections as from 1st January, 1951, and 20% with a maximum of £200 as from 1st July, 1951, in the Kenya section the allowance given at 1st January, 1951 was graded as follows:-

(1) On first £300	- Rate 20%	} Maximum £150
(2) On next £350	- Rate 10%	
(3) On remainder	- Rate 5%	

The allowance in the Kenya section granted at 1st July, 1952 was the same as that given in the Tanganyika and Uganda sections, viz. 20%, but it was accompanied by a small lump sum payment (maximum Sh.100/-) to officers on salaries of £300 or less, who did not benefit under the new flat rate system.

/The history of the cost of living allowances

599. The history of the cost of living allowances granted to permanent minor employees has been much the same as that of the graded staff, as will be seen from the accompanying Statement B. The main difference lies in the fact that minor employees have been granted a rather high rate of cost of living allowance (5% at the present time) and that there has been some upgrading of the wages of minor employees in Kenya, so as to keep in line with the overall rates paid to its minor employees by the Kenya Administration.

600. If comparison is made with the table of cost of living rates at paragraph 108, it will be seen that there is a broad equivalence between the cost of living rates granted to its staff by the Posts and Telecommunications Administration and those given to its staff by the Kenya Government. As stated in paragraph 109, our salary proposals are designed to cover the higher rate of cost of living allowance paid to its lowest income groups by the Kenya Government. They should also be adequate for the Posts and Telecommunications staff.

Table of cost of living allowances

Statement B.

I. Kenya

	<u>Range of Wages</u>	<u>Rate</u>	<u>With effect from</u>
(a)	On all wages	20%	1.1.51
(b)	On all wages ϕ	20%	1.7.51
	ϕ With one lump sum varying from Sh.24/- to Sh.60/- to permanent minor employees on wage up to Sh.100/- per month.		
(c)	On all wages x	25%	1.1.52
	x With a wage adjustment varying from Sh.6/- to Sh.15/- per month on basic wages up to Sh.100/- per month in order to provide wage plus COLA approximately to rates of Kenya Government.		
(d)	On all wages	33-1/3%	1.8.52
(e)	On all wages	40%	1.5.53

II. Tanganyika

(a)	On all wages)	allowance	1.1.51
(b)	On all wages)	determined by Provincial Committee	1.7.51
(c)	On all wages	25%	1.1.52
(d)	On all wages	33-1/3%	1.8.52
(e)	On all wages	40%	1.4.53

/III. Uganda

III. Uganda

	<u>Range of Wages</u>	<u>Rate</u>	<u>With effect from</u>
(a)	On all wages	15%	1.1.51
(b)	On all wages	20%	1.7.51
(c)	On all wages	25%	1.1.52
(d)	On all wages	33-1/3%	1.8.52
(e)	On all wages	40%	1.5.53

Principles of proposed salary structure

601. The Postmaster General recommends to us that, so far as the future salary structure of his Administration is concerned, the following six principles be applied:-

- (a) Salary scales should be irrespective of race or place of domicile.
- (b) Recruitment should be at all levels coinciding with the output of the various educational institutions.
- (c) Opportunities should be available for people recruited at all levels to proceed on merit to higher appointments without any arbitrary limit.
- (d) General conditions of service and prospects of staff recruited to the different departments of the Administration should be broadly comparable for people of the same general educational level.
- (e) The conditions must be such as to attract recruits with adequate basic education and the necessary ability to ensure that the work of the Department can be performed efficiently. It has been recognised that the standards of performance required in Posts and Telecommunications are broadly comparable throughout the world and in many cases are conditioned by the type of equipment in use, or being developed.
- (f) The present European salary scales contain a considerable element in respect of expatriation, but even so they do not attract in sufficient numbers candidates of the required calibre whom it is now necessary to recruit outside East Africa and whom it will be necessary to recruit for some time to come, if the development of Posts and Telecommunications services is to proceed as planned.

These principles are in accord with those we ourselves have enunciated in Chapter IV, and we trust that the salary scales recommended by us will enable the Postmaster General to achieve the aims set out above.

/A and B Scale posts

A and B Scale posts

602. Apart from the professional Engineers and Architects, who are graded on the A Scale, the rest of the staff below the superscale level are either proper to the B Scale or occupy technical or clerical and analogous posts which should be graded on the C or E Scales.

603. We regard as appropriate to the B Scale the grades of Assistant Controllers (both postal and telecommunications), the Inspectors and Assistant Inspectors of Traffic, Establishment and Assistant Establishment Officers and, subject to what we say in paragraph 258, the accounting staff. Engineers promoted to the grade of Executive Engineer without full professional qualifications should also go into this category. In view of the technicalities of grading in these fields, we must leave to the Postmaster General the task of segmenting the B Scales in this Administration as the needs of his services may dictate.

C and E Scale posts

604. In this field we have two main observations to make:-

- (i) The Postmaster General is anxious that recruits to the operational side of his Administration shall have broadly the same conditions of service and prospects of promotion as recruits to the clerical side. We accept this view. Indeed it has already been put forward by us in paragraph 169 as an objective to be arrived at in East African services generally.
- (ii) Owing to the peculiarities of the working of the Post Office, the Administration finds it necessary to make use of rather more sub-divisions of the E Scales, both on the operational and the clerical side, than we ourselves suggest in Chapter X. The Postmaster General has accordingly recommended to us in substitution of the present racial scales the following pattern of organisation - see Statement C - in the operational and clerical fields, which we can accept as being in line with the principles that we recommend. We draw attention, however, to the organisation put forward by us in paragraphs 159 and 169-174, and then leave it to the Postmaster General to consider how far his proposed organisation should be modified to comply with the general pattern set out in those paragraphs:-

/Statement C.

Statement C.PATTERN OF ORGANISATION OF POSTS IN THE NON-PROFESSIONAL ENGINEERING SERVICES AND CLERICAL STRUCTURES

<u>Grading</u>	<u>Clerical Structure</u>	<u>Engineering Structure</u>	<u>Services Structure</u>	
			<u>Postal & Telegraph Group</u>	<u>Telephone Group</u>
C2		Senior Assistant Engineer	Senior Postmaster or Chief Superintendent	
C3		Assistant Engineer Class I	Postmaster Class I or Superintendent	Telephone Supervisor Class I
C5-4 or C6-4 as requisite)	+ Chief Clerk	Assistant Engineer Class II	Postmaster Class II or Assistant Superintendent	Telephone Supervisor Class II
E2-1	Senior Clerical Officer	Senior Technical Officer	Overseer	Senior Telephonist
E3	Clerical Officer Grade I	Technical Officer Grade I or Senior Lineman I	Postal & Telegraph Officer Grade I	Telephonist Grade I
E4	Clerical Officer Grade II	Technical Officer Grade II or Senior Lineman II	Postal & Telegraph Officer Grade II	Telephonist Grade II
E5	Clerical Assistant Grade I	Technical Assistant Grade I or Lineman Grade I	Postal & Telegraph Assistant Grade I	Telephone Assistant Grade I
E6	Clerical Assistant Grade II	Technical Assistant Grade II or Lineman Grade II	Postal & Telegraph Assistant Grade II	Telephone Assistant Grade II

+ NOTE: (i) The clerical staff will also have access to the accountant and establishment posts, which are graded on the B Scale, either through the D Scale or by direct promotion.

(ii) The gradings quoted for the above scales are those for men. It is assumed that women will be placed on the equivalent scales for women.

605. Four further observations suggest themselves:-

Executive or intermediate grade

- (i) The Postmaster General urges that a place be found in the new Posts and Telecommunications structure for an intermediate grade with Higher School Certificate or Intermediate degree qualifications corresponding to the Executive grade which is one of the main grades in the United Kingdom Civil Service organisation.

For the reasons explained in paragraphs 189-190, we do not consider that the time is yet ripe to introduce into East Africa the closely graded structure which, in the United Kingdom, fills the gap between the clerical service and the administrative grades. We do, however, suggest in paragraph 191 that the same ends might be achieved, while preserving the flexibility of organisation which is essential at the present time in East Africa, by using the segments E2-1 for superior individual duties. Moreover, the creation of the Training Grade on the D Scale which we recommend in paragraphs 67-70 will, in itself, go far towards introducing both in the clerical and operational fields an Executive grade resembling that of the British Civil Service. We do not, ourselves, possess sufficient detailed knowledge of the Post Office organisation to enable us to recommend precisely how the segments E2-1 and the D Scale should be used in the Posts and Telecommunications Administration to produce the results described earlier in this paragraph, but subject to what we have said generally in our Report on these points, we feel that detailed solutions can be left to the Postmaster General.

Telephone Supervisors (F) Class I and II

- (ii) These two grades have, at the present time, to be recruited from outside East Africa, where the telephone service is young, and we understand that recruitment is not easy. While we hope that, in due course, the East African telephone service will produce its own telephone Supervisors, we recognise that, so long as recruitment outside East Africa continues, it will be necessary for these two posts to carry the inducement addition which is not normally attached to the C Scales for women except, as we recommend in paragraph 97, where external recruitment is necessary and the basic salary is not adequate to attract candidates.

/iii) Telephonists

Telephonists

- (iii) We have found a variety of gradings for this type of post in most departments of the service throughout the East African territories. These gradings, which range from the minimum of the present clerical and analogous scale, viz. £48(77) to a maximum of £540(729), are to some extent governed by questions of security as well as by the size of the switchboard operated. A uniform grading structure is put forward in paragraph for use in the Posts and Telecommunications Department, and we suggest that the gradings finally adopted by that service should be followed for equivalent duties in other departments, due regard being had to security considerations. We feel confident that the Postmaster General will be happy to give guidance in this matter. In the meantime, we have marked all such posts "Regrade" with a reference to this paragraph.

Entry points and recruitment qualifications

- (iv) We assume that the Posts and Telecommunications Administration will conform to the recommendations on these matters that we put forward for application to East Africa generally.

Zanzibar

The Post Office in Zanzibar is a small department, the telephone service being separated from the Post Office and forming part of the Public Works Department. We have no special recommendations to make in regard to it and the proposals that we put forward with regard to salaries will be found in Appendix .

CHAPTER XXVIIEAST AFRICAN RAILWAYS AND HARBOURS ADMINISTRATIONGeneral

606. Since the Report of the 1947-48 Commission was issued, the East African Railways and Harbours Administration has become a self-contained and self-financing organisation within the East Africa High Commission. The following remarks of the 1947-48 Commission (paragraph 335), indicating their general approach to the question of the salaries of Railways and Harbours staff are no less valid today and have governed our consideration of this organisation:-

"..... we could not fail to recognise that the staff of the Railway stands in a special position as compared with the Kenya civil service generally in that it is laid down in the Railway Ordinance, 1937, that the Railway was to be "administered on business principles, due regard being had to agricultural and industrial development in Kenya and Uganda by means of cheap transport". It will be seen that in some respects our recommendations are at variance with those which we make in regard to the civil services generally. These differences rest on the peculiar circumstances of the Railway."

These "peculiar circumstances" are threefold:-

Short scales

- (i) As an administration organised on commercial lines, the East African Railways and Harbours Administration, while conforming broadly to the general civil service pattern as regards its super-scale posts and its Officer and Assistant Officer grades, finds it necessary to grade its Junior Service in a series of short ascending scales which sharply evaluate the different degrees of responsibility and skill required by the posts in this group.

However, as the Scales in the Junior Service are now on a racial basis (European Scales 9, Asian Scales 11 and African Scales 9, or 29 in all), and as the Railways and Harbours Administration has adopted the principle that racial scales shall be replaced by a system of grading by responsibility rather than by race, the opportunity has been taken to reduce the present 29 racial scales down to 14 non-racial scales, arranged in three divisions, including one scale in each division for Juniors or Probationers, plus three fixed salary points in the Executive or Senior Division. These

/scales, although

scales, although in shorter segments to mark divisions of responsibility, do in fact correspond to the range of scales applied to the public service generally, allowance being made for the point with which we deal in the following sub-paragraph that the staff of the Railways and Harbours Administration enjoy free quarters. That is to say, the minimum salary in Division III, £84, corresponds to the minimum of E6, £90, while the maximum of the Executive Division (£1224) corresponds to the maximum of the Civil Service Scale C1 (£1320), account being taken of the abatement of the Railway scales in respect of free quarters. The incremental jumps in the scales which we have agreed with the Railways and Harbours Administration, although somewhat different from those recommended for the civil service, are roughly equivalent. Generally they are characterised by a jump of one increment between each segment of the two lower divisions and a jump of roughly two increments between each segment in the two senior divisions.

Free quarters

- (ii) As stated above, the staff of this Administration enjoy free quarters or an allowance in lieu. We have accordingly abated the salaries recommended for the staffs of the Administration by an amount equivalent to the revised rent charge recommended by us for the civil service generally.

Pensions and provident funds

- (iii) Present conditions provide for non-contributory pensions for professional staff - that is Assistant Officer, Officer and superscale posts, and contributory pensions involving a contribution of 5% of emoluments in respect of all posts in the present Junior Service except Divisions IIIA, IIIB and IV on Scale C, which are on Provident Fund terms requiring a contribution by the employee equivalent to one-twelfth of salary. These conditions accord generally with the recommendations of the 1947-48 Commission. We recommend, however, in paragraph 487 that the whole of the graded staff in the civil service from the lowest grade (E6) upwards be given non-contributory pension conditions. As it is also our objective to preserve general equivalence in conditions between the Railways and Harbours Administration and the rest of the public services, it follows that either the whole of the Railways graded staff (i.e. Junior Service as well as the Senior Service) must also be given non-contributory pensionable conditions or,

/if not,

if not, that their salaries must be adjusted to allow for the contributions that will be payable. There are arguments in favour of either course, as the 1947-48 Commission points out. On the whole, however, as the Railways and Harbours Administration now considers that uniform pension conditions are very desirable, the balance appears to tilt in favour of non-contributory pensions for all graded staff, and we have constructed our scales on that assumption. Should the Administration, on further consideration, come to the contrary conclusion, then it will be necessary to adjust the scales proposed for the Junior Service to allow for the amount of the contribution (i.e. an increase of roughly one-twelfth in the case of the Grades X and XI and the Junior/Probationer grade of Division III, and an increase of 5% in the case of the rest of the staff up to the top of the Executive Division). So far as the Executive Division and Division I are concerned, an increase of 5% on the basic scales will also involve a corresponding augmentation of the inducement addition.

Cost of living allowances

607. As foreshadowed in paragraph 108, it is necessary to give some account of the history of the cost of living allowances paid by the Railways and Harbours Administration to its staff from time to time. As this staff serve in all three mainland territories in East Africa, the Administration evolved a compromise which was fairly uniform throughout their service and at the same time stood in reasonable relation to the rates paid by the Government of each territory. As regards the higher ranks of the graded staff, the rates since 1952 have been uniform throughout the service and in conformity with the rate of cost of living allowances granted by territorial administrations, i.e.:-

<u>With effect from</u>	<u>Percentage of salary</u>	<u>Maximum allowance per annum</u>
1st January, 1952	25%	£250
1st August, 1952	30%	£300
1st September, 1953	35%	£350

The Administration has, however, since 1952 adopted broadly the principle followed by Kenya of paying a higher cost of living allowance to the lower income groups than to others. This has been effected by the use of the device of a minimum allowance for its lower paid graded staff, viz:-

With effect from 1st January, 1952 - minimum rate of allowance £27 per annum

With effect from 1st August, 1952 - minimum rate of allowance £33 per annum (increased to £36 in Tanganyika from 1st April, 1953 and in Kenya and Uganda from 1st May, 1953).

/In the

In the period before 1952, on the other hand, 15% on all salaries with a maximum of £150 per annum was granted in all three territorial sections as from 1st January, 1951 and 20% with a maximum of £200 per annum as from 1st July, 1951. An allowance of 5% on all salaries with a maximum of £50 per annum was also granted in all three territories to cover all claims in respect of 1950.

608. The history of the cost of living allowances granted to African subordinate staff has been much the same as that of the graded staff, as will be seen from the following table:-

AFRICAN SUBORDINATE STAFF (ALL RANGES)

<u>Rate of Cost of Living Allowance</u>	<u>With effect from</u>
20%	1. 1.1951
20% (Sh.3/- a month added to basic pay in Kenya and Uganda and Sh.4/- in Tanganyika so that cost of living allowance would not form too high a proportion of total emoluments)	1. 7.1951
20% (Further additions varying from Sh.3/- to Sh.11/- a month, according to grade, made to basic pay in all territories because of Kenya's decision to raise to 40% the cost of living allowance payable to this class of staff)	1.12.1951
25%	1. 1.1952
33-1/3%	1. 8.1952
40% (In Tanganyika only - Sh.2/- per month also added to basic rates of Subordinate grades H,G,F, and E)	1. 4.1953
40% (In Kenya and Uganda sections)	1. 5.1953

The main difference lies in the facts that subordinate staff have been granted a rather higher rate of cost of living allowance (5% being the difference at the present time), and that there has also been some upgrading of their basic wages. Our salary proposals take account of the higher rates of cost of living allowance which have been paid to the lowest income groups, and seem to us adequate for the Railways and Harbours staff.

General principles of the recommended
salary structure

609. Although the application of the principle may not always be without difficulty, the Railways and Harbours Administration accepts the principle of abolition of the present racial scales and substitution of grading by responsibility. The Administration further agrees that gradings of posts should be fixed by common standards of responsibility, so that employees of all races may have the opportunity of rising as high in the service as their abilities will take them. It is also agreed that the principle of the inducement addition as enunciated by us in Chapters V and VI shall apply to Railways and Harbours salary scales, so long as it may be necessary to attract staff from outside East Africa. The scale of inducement addition proposed for the Railways and Harbours staff, which is set out in detail in Appendix , is equivalent to that recommended for other services in East Africa, allowance being made for the fact that the Railways and Harbours scales are abated to take account of the free quarters enjoyed by that staff. Certain difficulties, which are inherent in the application of the principle of non-racial scales so far as this Administration is concerned, apply almost entirely to the present Junior Service and we refer to them in detail later when we come to that service in paragraph 616 of this Chapter.

Present structure of salary scales

610. The staff of the Railways and Harbours Administration are at present divided into the four following classifications:-

- (i) Superscale, comprising broadly the General Management, Heads of Departments and their Chief Assistants, and Senior District Officers.
- (ii) Senior Service, comprising Officer and Assistant Officer grades on various segments of a long scale:-

£590(796)x30-710(EB)x35-920x40-1040(1390)

As an exception to the above, Assistant Engineers (Civil) have a slightly different scale which is one year shorter:-

£590(796): 590: 650x30-680: 750x30-790(EB)
x35-920(PB)x40-1040(1390)

A superior segment to both scales runs

£1080(1430)x40-1200(1550)

Officer Grades. District Officers are on the segment £1080(1430)-1200(1550): Senior Port,

Lake Marine,

Lake Marine, Accounting and Stores Officers are on the segment £1000(1350)-1120(1470), while Commanders of Lake Steamers and Harbour Masters have the segment £960(1296)-1040(1390).

Assistant Officer Grades. Assistant Officers normally proceed up the scale to a maximum of £1040(1390) except that Assistant Officers in minor departments, (including Pilots, Marine Officers and Engineers) proceed to a maximum of £920(1242), while Senior Assistant Officers in those Departments are placed on the segment £960(1296)-1040(1390). Chief Engineers, Marine, have a special scale £960(1296)-1000(1350). There has been for many years a Cadet Grade for this service but confined to the Civil, Mechanical and Electrical Engineering and Traffic grades. The present Scale is £500(675)-530-590(796).

(iii) Junior Service

As indicated in paragraph 606(i) above, this service consists of three racial scales:-

Scale A (or the European scale) extending by 9 segments from £325(439) as a minimum to £1100(1450) as a maximum.

Scale B (or the Asian scale) containing 11 different scales from £174(235) as a minimum to £660(891) as a maximum.

Scale C (or the African scale) containing 9 different scales from £72(108) as a minimum to £516(697) as a maximum.

The Junior Service contains all categories of graded staffs, and comprises all types of supervisory and skilled staff from Senior Station Masters and Building Superintendent down to junior artisans, clerks, points headmen and gangers.

The full present scales are given in Appendix -

(iv) Subordinate Service

This service, which ranges from unskilled labourers to semi-skilled artisans, forms approximately 80% of the Administration's total staff, and their wages represent nearly 40% of its total wage and salary bill.

The existing salary scales for this service are as follows:-

/Grade D

	<u>Kenya & Uganda</u> <u>Shillings a month</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u> <u>Shillings a month</u>
Grade D	90(126)x5-115(161)	90(126)x5-115(161)
Grade E	64(90)x4-100(140)	54(76)x3-87(122)
Grade F	55(77)x3-82(115)	54(76)x2-64(90)
Grade G	50(70)x2-66(92)	47(66)x1-53(74)
Grade H	40(56)x2-60(84)	32(45)x1-48(67)

Starting salaries in Grade H vary from place to place, and in large towns may be up to 6/- a month or even more above the minimum of the scale. Local allowances are paid in addition to basic salaries at Mombasa, Nairobi, Dar-es-Salaam, Tanga and a number of other townships in Tanganyika.

Proposed structure of salary scales

Superscale posts

611. Our general recommendations in regard to the salaries of these posts are as follows:-

<u>Group</u>	<u>Grade</u>	<u>Present</u> <u>salary</u> £	<u>Proposed</u> <u>salary</u> £
1.	General Manager	3,500(3850) *	3800
2.	Deputy General Manager	2,600(2950)	3000
3.	Chief Assistant to General Manager Chief Engineer Chief Commercial Superintendent Chief Operating Superintendent Chief Accountant Chief Mechanical Engineer Chief Ports Manager	2250(2600)	2600

* Increased from £3100(3450) in 1953.

<u>Group</u>	<u>Grade</u>	<u>Present salary # £</u>	<u>Proposed salary £</u>
4.	Assistants to Officers in) Group 3) Chief Establishment) Officer) Port Manager (Mombasa)) Ports Assistant to) General Manager) Stores Superintendent) Regional Representative) (Tanganyika)) Construction Engineer) (restyled Assistant Chief) Engineer))	1900(2250) 1700(2050)	2200
5.	Construction Engineer) (Harbour Development)) Works Engineer) Planning Engineer) Senior Marine Officer) Assistant to Chief) Mechanical Engineer) (Technical)) (Present occupant has) personal right to be) graded in Group 4)) Senior Marine Officer) Assistant Stores) Superintendent)	1500(1850) 1300(1650)	2000

/District Officers

<u>Group</u>	<u>Grade</u>	<u>Present salary or scale £</u>	<u>Proposed salary £</u>
6A	<u>District Officers(Grade I)</u>		
	District Engineer I		
	Design Engineer		
	Liaison Engineer		
	Architect		
	District Traffic		
	Superintendent I	1300(1650)	1872
	Assistant Superintendent (Road Services)		
	Senior Marine Engineer		
	Revenue Accountant		
	District Mechanical Engineer I		
	Senior Mechanical Engineer (Motive Power)		
	District Motive Power Superintendent I		
	Works Manager		
	Principal Welfare Officer	1200(1550)	
	Administrative Assistant I		
	Assistant Chief		
	Establishment Officer	1080(1430)-	
	Port Manager (Dar-es-Salaam)	1200(1550)	
	Senior Marine Engineer		
6B	<u>District Officers(Grade II)</u>		
	District Accountant	1200(1550)	
	Administrative Assistant II		
	District Engineer II		1752
	Bridge Engineer		
	Signal Engineer		
	Plant & Workshops Engineer		
	Estates & Rating Surveyor	1080(1430)-	
	District Traffic	1200(1550)	
	Superintendent II		
	Assistant Superintendent (Hotels and Catering)		
	Road Motor Engineer		
	District Mechanical Engineer II		
	District Motive Power Superintendent II		
	Works Manager II		
	Electrical Engineer		
	Engineer i/c. Lake Kioga		
	District Stores	1000(1350)-	
	Superintendent I	1120(1470)	
	Senior Harbour Master		

<u>Group</u>	<u>Grade</u>	<u>Present salary or scale</u> £	<u>Proposed salary</u> £
6C	<u>District Officers(Grade III)</u>		
	Engineering Accountant	} 1000(1350)- 1120(1470)	} 1632
	Works Accountant		
	Senior Accountant		
	District Engineer III		
	District Traffic		
	Superintendent III		
	District Motive Power		
	Superintendent III		
	Commander (Marine)	} 960(1296)- 1040(1390)	}
	Harbour Master		
	Administrative Assistant III	1080(1430)- 1200(1550)	}

Note: The principle of inducement pay will not operate in connection with the above superscale salaries (see paragraph 418), but they will carry a cost of living allowance equivalent to 10% of the top of the long scale as applied to the Railways and Harbours Administration, viz. £152. 8. 0 per annum. Allowance has been made in the salaries recommended for these grades that rent free housing is provided by the Railways and Harbours Administration.

612. The main point for remark on the recommendations above is that we have accepted the recommendation of the Administration to take out of the long Scale the Officer grades described in paragraph 610(ii), and have proposed the creation of three grades of District Officer at the superscale level:-

- (1) Senior District Officer. -
At present superscale at £1300(1650)
- (2) District Officer - Now on the segment
£1080(1430)-1200(1550)
- (3) Minor District Officer - Now mainly on the
segment £1000(1350)-1120(1470)

The principal reason for this recommendation is that the rapid development of the Railways and Harbours organisation has increased the responsibilities of both the Officer and the Assistant Officer grades to such an extent as to

/necessitate in

necessitate in the Management's view the extension of the scale for Assistant Officers to the present maximum of the District Officer grade and the consequential elevation of the District Officer grade to superscale rank. The proposal conforms to Railways practice elsewhere in Africa, and is calculated to remove recruitment difficulties which the Administration has experienced under the present system.

613. The opportunity has also been taken to upgrade certain posts mainly in the Lake Marine and Port sections which, in the view of the Management, are at present undergraded. The grade of Administrative Assistant, which is now on the top segment of the long scale should, in the view of the Administration, be upgraded and divided into three grades corresponding to the three grades of District Officers. We concur in these proposals.

Group A (formerly Senior Service)

614. This group of posts, which covers the professional grades of the service will, as stated above, in future comprise only the present Assistant Officer grades. The long scale is broken into four segments, including that for Cadets or Junior Assistants, but as there is one common establishment the risk of stagnation is averted. This group is at present designated the Senior Service, the non-professional group being called the Junior Service. As there is a certain amount of overlapping between these services, the maximum salary of both being identical, the Management recommend the abolition of the present method of nomenclature and suggest that the Senior Service be restyled Group A and the Junior Service Group B. We support this recommendation.

615. It is the intention of the Administration that the Cadet or Junior Assistant scale shall apply to all Departments, and that it shall be used either for training serving staff recommended for promotion to Senior Officer status or for training candidates recruited for Senior Officer posts from outside the service. Direct entry to the cadet grade will not be confined, as at present, to Europeans, but will be open to Asians and Africans - in particular graduates of Makerere University College - with suitable qualifications. Candidates from the United Kingdom for appointment to the Cadet grade will continue to be selected by the Secretary of State. Local candidates whether from within the service or from outside will be selected by a special committee to be constituted within the Railways & Harbours Administration.

The present and proposed scales are as follows:-

/Assistant Officers

PRESENT SALARY SCALES

Assistant Officers in Major Departments	£590(796)x30-710(EB)x35- 920(PB)x40-1040(1390)
Assistant Officers in Minor Departments	£590(896)x30-710(EB)x35- 920(1242)
Assistant Engineers (Civil)	£590(796): 590: 650x30-680 £750x30-780(EB)x35- 920(PB)x40-1040(1390)
Cadet-Engineer	£500(675): 530: 560: 590(796)

PROPOSED SALARY SCALES

<u>Assistant Officers</u>	<u>Basic</u>	<u>Inducement Pay</u>	- <u>Total with inducement pay</u>
Segment I	£1089(1198)x45- 1224(1346)	£282(310)x6- 300(330)	£1371(1508)x51- 1524(1678)
Segment II	£927(1020)x39- 1044(1148)	£252(277)x6- 270(297)	£1179(1297)x45- 1314(1445)
Segment III	£789(868)x33- 888(977)	£228(251)x6- 246(271)	£1017(1119)x39- 1134(1247)
Cadet or Junior Assistant	£579(637)x30- 729(802)	£186(205)x6- 216(238)	£765(842)x36- 945(1040)

Group B (formerly Junior Service)

616. The present scales and our detailed recommendation for the new salary structure of this Group are set out in Appendix . As stated in paragraph 606 (i) we have replaced the 29 racial scales now prevailing in this service by 14 non-racial scales arranged in three Divisions, including one scale in each Division for Juniors or Probationers, plus three fixed salary points in the Executive or Junior Division. In order to fit in with organisational requirements this Service is graded into a series of short ascending scales which closely evaluate the different degrees of responsibility and skill demanded of the posts in this Group.

617. The classes of posts to which these scales apply demand many different kinds of qualifications and experience and cover a wide variety of duties, comprising all categories of supervisory, technical and skilled staff from Senior Station Masters, Building Superintendent, Works Assistants, Workshops Foremen, Inspectors and Senior Clerks, to locomotive staff, guards, ticket examiners, points headmen, gangers and artisans.

618. The Administration contemplates that there will be two means of advancement for serving staff, either:-

- (a) through the grades in the normal way, or
- (b) by selection for accelerated promotion from Division I to the Cadet Grade or from Division II or III to Division I or II, via the trainee/probationer grade.

We welcome this system of advancement, which is in line with that which we recommend for the civil service.

619. Educational qualifications for direct entry into the various Divisions are in line with those recommended by us for the civil service; in particular, the normal educational qualification for direct entry into Division II will be the Cambridge School Certificate, and into Division I the Higher School Certificate or a high standard pass in the School Certificate, or a Makerere College degree of a standard not considered sufficiently high for the Cadet Grade in Group A. In view of their special requirements the Administration will set up its own Selection Boards for direct entrants into the higher ranges of this service, in order that full weight may be given to qualities of character and personality as well as to academic qualifications.

Difficulties in the application of non-racial salary scales

620. As pointed out in paragraph 609, there will be some transitional difficulties in the present stage of development in East Africa in the application of the principle of non-racial scales. Although in certain fields (e.g. Clerks and Station Masters), reasonable channels of promotion are present in all the three present scales A, B and C, and these channels are readily convertible into appropriate segments of the new scales, in other fields the present scales B and C do not include provision for semi-supervisory or supervisory posts. It will, therefore, be necessary to make provision for proper channels of promotion to such posts, even though it has not hitherto been the practice to employ non-European staff in supervisory capacities in these fields. It has for example not been the practice to employ non-European locomotive drivers as Locomotive Inspectors, non-European clerks or Station Masters as Traffic Inspectors, Asian artisans as Foremen or African artisans as Leading Artisans, Chargehands or Foremen; and although in other cases provision has been made for non-European supervisory posts, (e.g. permanent way staff, where provision exists for Asian and African posts of Permanent Way Inspector, etc.), this, in some instances, has been done more to provide for staff serving in those grades at the time of the last salaries revision than to provide definite channels of promotion for staff serving in lower grades. The adjustment of establishments, so as to create these channels of promotion and the training of non-European staff in the technique of

/supervision, will

supervision, will take time; and it is important, if the experiment of a non-racial structure is to succeed without detriment to the development of the Railways and Harbours and their safe and efficient operation, that the process of adjustment should not be hurried unduly.

Driving staff and Ticket Examiners and Collectors

621. Special difficulties will apply to these grades owing to the desire of the Administration to maintain, for the time being at any rate, the policy of employing a proportion of each of the racial groups in East Africa on its driving and ticket examining staffs. As long as this policy is maintained it will be necessary for the Administration to offer starting salaries at the levels required to attract candidates of all races. It is the intention of the Administration, however, to ensure that non-Europeans as well as Europeans shall obtain accelerated promotion to the higher grades in each of the above fields if their work and ability justify such a step.

622. The salary scales for the above staffs which are set out in Appendix while identical in amounts with those recommended for the rest of the Railway, differ as regards arrangement into divisions. This modification arises from the different methods of recruitment and the types of training experience and skill required of these staffs.

Artisans below the supervisory level

623. The different channels of recruitment and types of training and experience required for artisans necessitate some modification of the salary structure and recruitment and promotion arrangements proposed for the normal Group B posts. While the standard salary scales are applied to artisan grades, the scales are not grouped into divisions in the same way as for the rest of Group B - see Appendix

As far as promotions are concerned it is intended to adopt, in the case of artisans below the grade of Leading Artisan, a system of promotion based on individual skill in view of the difficulty of classifying posts of artisan according to responsibility. The general outline of this system will be:-

- (a) trade tests will be laid down for each grade of artisan in each trade which will be keyed in to the standard trade tests now being evolved on an East African basis by the Labour Departments;
- (b) promotions from grade to grade within the artisan scales will be determined by

/(i)

- (i) the employee passing the trade test for the next higher grade, and
- (ii) the employee's past record and his ability, as assessed by past performance, to maintain the standard of output and accuracy required in the grade to which he is to be promoted.

It will be seen that promotions will not be solely dependent on the passing of trade tests, as these do not always accurately measure the employee's ability to maintain the required degree of skill at the rate of output required in actual work. In addition trade tests can only be framed in a general way, and cannot always take into account the many, and varied kinds of skill required in a major industrial undertaking like the Railways and Harbours Administration. For these reasons it is essential in considering promotions of artisans to pay regard to the individual's past record and performance as well as to the passing of trade tests.

624. Recruitment of artisans will continue to be effected, as now, either direct or through the apprenticeship schemes. Staff recruited direct as skilled artisans from outside the service may be placed at a point in the scales appropriate to their degree of skill, which will be established partly from the trade testing certificates, if any, which they hold, partly from references and partly by tests applied before they are offered appointment which would be on the lines of the suggested trade testing procedure. Recruitment through the apprenticeship schemes may be a little more difficult to administer than under the present arrangements, since, if all apprentices were brought in at the salary levels applicable to the lowest level of apprentices, there would be no possibility of obtaining candidates with higher educational qualifications whom it will still be necessary to recruit.

For this reason it appears necessary to have three classes of apprentice, on the lines of the three classes of trainee/probationer for Divisions I, II and III respectively in the clerical and general service. The lowest class of apprentices will be equivalent to the Division III trainee/probationer, the educational standard required being as it is for the present African apprentices. Such apprentices on completing their training will be placed in the artisan scales at a point commensurate with the degree of skill they have obtained. Above this there will be a class of apprentice whose position might be taken as equivalent to the Division II trainee/probationer and for whom similar educational qualifications, i.e. the Cambridge School Certificate, will be laid down. The training for this class of apprentice would be of a rather higher standard with a view to their attaining a degree of skill sufficient to justify placing them on completion of their training into one of the intermediate grades of artisans or into comparable technical posts, e.g. in the Drawing Office.

625. The highest class of apprentice would be equivalent to the Division I trainee/probationer, and the training in this would be primarily designed to produce fully qualified artisans in particular trades who were capable of filling supervisory posts or technical posts such as draughtsmen. Suitable candidates of all races would be considered for this type of training, both those applying from outside the service and those already serving in one of the lower categories of apprentice or artisan. As far as direct recruitment is concerned, however, it is doubtful whether higher educational qualifications could be insisted on than are proposed for the intermediate class of apprentice, and selection would, therefore, have to depend almost entirely on the candidate's personal qualities as assessed by interview. On successful completion of their training, apprentices in the highest category would normally be placed in the Leading Artisan scale, their line of promotion then being through the grades of Chargehand and Foreman, but those who showed aptitude for design work would be posted to Drawing Office or similar work and would progress in the service through the grade of Draughtsman.

Group C (Subordinate Service)

626. As a result of our enquiries, we are satisfied that the range of remuneration proposed at paragraph 147 for subordinate employees in East Africa generally will adequately meet the needs of the subordinate service in the Railways and Harbours organisation. We recommend therefore that the ranges of remuneration proposed at paragraph 147 shall apply to the Railways and Harbours subordinate employees subject to the following points:-

- (i) The standard ranges, which run from a minimum of Sh.60/- a month with quarters (Sh.69/- without quarters) to a maximum of Sh.189/- a month with quarters (Sh.198/- without quarters) plus the local allowance where applicable, will need segmentation into four or five segments on the lines of the present subordinate grades D to H. This task we leave to the Administration, but as we are advised that the present overlapping system of segmentation tends to blur the fact that progress from one grade to another is a promotion because the employee at times fails to receive a reasonable increase in promotion, we wish to record our support of the Administration's view that at this level a sensible increase of pay on promotion is generally desirable. In this connection we also invite attention to our remarks at paragraph 138.

/(ii)

- (ii) Subject to our observations in paragraph 133, we see no objection to the standard minima of Sh.60/- or Sh.69/- a month being lowered in very remote areas at the discretion of the Railways and Harbours Administration.
- (iii) The local allowance which we recommend is tapered off from Sh.16/- a month at the minimum until it disappears when the wage reaches Sh.135 a month with quarters (Sh.144/- without quarters). Subordinate grades in the Railways and Harbours Administration now receive a local allowance, varying from Sh.6/- a month at Nairobi or Mombasa to Sh.5/- at Dar es Salaam and Tanga and Sh.3/- a month at a number of townships in Tanganyika. There is no upper salary limit for the existing allowances, which may be held as an addition to the maximum of Grade D, i.e. Sh.115/- a month (161/-).

The existing local allowances should, of course, be replaced by the new allowances; the disappearance of the new allowance at and after the Shs.135/-(basic with quarters) point in the new range is more than compensated by the total increase in remuneration. This increase is, in our view, adequate for the Railways and Harbours subordinate service as well as for the corresponding grades in East Africa generally.

- (iv) We understand that the Railways and Harbours Administration intends to increase its minimum house allowance to Shs.10/- a month in Kenya and Uganda and to Shs.8/- a month in Tanganyika. In that event, our recommendations in paragraph 137 will apply.

Retiring benefits, leave and other conditions of service

Retiring benefits

627. Allusion has already been made to one facet of this question in paragraph 606(iii) of this Chapter, where we recommend a uniform system of non-contributory pension conditions for the whole of the graded staff of the Railways and Harbours Administration - a recommendation which is in line with our proposals for the public services generally in East Africa. The Railways Administration, while strongly supporting a uniform system of pension conditions for all their graded staff, had under consideration a scheme of contributory pensions for that staff, the intention being that the salary scales of those grades for which non-contributory pensions are now provided should be increased by an amount equivalent to the contribution which the officers concerned would be required to make. The effect of this would clearly be to give these officers the advantages of a contributory pension scheme at no cost to themselves; and since their salary scales are related,

/account being

account being taken of the provision of free quarters, to the scales of officers of corresponding grades in the civil services, to give them superannuation advantages over the latter. This we are not prepared to recommend.

628. To those grades now on Provident Fund terms who would change to a non-contributory pension scheme under our proposals, our recommendations in this context as set out in paragraph 478 of Chapter XXII would apply.

629. For the rest, we take the view that in the conditions prevailing in East Africa there is no good ground for differentiation in retiring benefits as between Railways and Harbours staffs and other Government staff. Our recommendations on this matter as set out in Chapter XXII should apply also where applicable to the Railways and Harbours organisation, and in particular our proposals for the improvement of the terms under which gratuities for subordinate service staff are calculated.

Leave and passages

630. Our general recommendations on this subject as set out in Chapter XXII are in line with the desire of the Railways Administration for uniform leave conditions throughout its organisation, subject to minor variations to meet differences in climatic conditions. We see no reason why these recommendations should not apply to the staff of the Railways and Harbours and have, therefore, no special recommendations to make here as regards the amount of leave allowed or the length of tour or the conditions under which the cost of passages are allowed.

631. A claim was made to us that as civil servants generally do not retain quarters while on long leave outside East Africa, and therefore escape any deduction from their salaries on account of rent, the Railways and Harbours staff are at a relative disadvantage in that their salaries are abated in respect of free quarters while on long leave and no compensatory allowance is granted to them. It must, however, be remembered that the value of free quarters in the case of the Railways staff is at present reckoned at 15% of salary for purposes of calculation of pension, whereas their salaries as recommended by us have been generally abated for free quarters by only about 8%. At present the abatement, as compared with civil service salaries, is of the order of 10%, and we have to this extent increased the advantage which the Railways and Harbours officer enjoys over his confrere in the civil service as a result of the privilege of

/rent-free quarters.

rent-free quarters. Clearly in these circumstances there is no case for removing the existing disadvantage which he suffers as a result of his enjoyment of this privilege, but on the other hand there would appear to be a good case for reviewing the value at present given to free quarters in the calculation of superannuation benefits, at least in so far as new recruits to the service are concerned. We might add that while we have accepted the status quo in so far as the provision of free quarters for the staff of the Railways and Harbours Administration is concerned and have constructed our proposed scales of salary for its staff on that basis, we are not ourselves convinced that the Administration should not fall in line with the practice obtaining in the civil service generally in that respect, and consider that the ultimate solution will probably lie in that Administration paying the same levels of salary as the civil service (though differently segmented to meet departmental requirements) and charging rent for quarters on the basis that we suggest in Chapter XXIII. Grievances on the subject of abatement of salary in respect of free quarters during long leave would not then arise.

CHAPTER XXVIIICONVERSION ARRANGEMENTS

632. We recommend that every serving officer should have the option of remaining on his present terms or of accepting new terms in full as from the date or dates of implementation. The option should be exercised at the date of implementation and should be irrevocable.

633. It is our intention that no officer's net emoluments on conversion under the new conditions shall be less than those which he draws at present, account being taken in both cases of addition to salary by way of cost of living allowance and deduction for rent and Widows' and Orphans' contribution. We have endeavoured to secure this by the rules proposed in this Chapter, but if in any case the result is otherwise, we suggest that the difference should be adjusted by the grant of a temporary allowance as may be appropriate.

General Rules for Conversion

634. Some new scales are of the same length as the old; not infrequently the new scale is shorter than the old. In a few instances the new scale is longer. Our general method of conversion in each of these three cases is as follows:-

A. Where the new scale is of equal length to the old.

A point for point conversion has been made according to years of service in the grade.

B. Where the new scale is shorter than the old.

(i) We have calculated the gross gain at the base point of the two scales and at the topmost points, and have graduated the conversion between these two points in an upward or downward progression, as the case may be. Where the new scale contains an incremental jump and the old one does not, we have taken, as the base point for this purpose, not the initial salary of the new scale but the increment at which the jump is received. Where the old scale also contains a jump, but at a later year than the new, the corresponding year on the new scale is taken as the base point.

(ii) In order to fit the old scale within the shorter length of the new scale, pairs of incremental points in the former have been bracketed against one point in the latter in such a way as to preserve the progression as closely as possible. The formula governing the future incremental dates in a bracket (which is adapted with acknowledgements from the report of the Northern Rhodesian Salaries Commission of 1952) is as follows:-

Where two points in the old scale convert to a single point in the new scale and such points are marked with a bracket in the Conversion Tables, officers will convert to the new scale at the salary shown in the Table but their incremental dates will be varied in accordance with the following rules:-

(a) An officer who at 1st January, 1954 was receiving the lower of the two old salary rates which convert to one new point will, as at 1st January, 1954 convert to the revised salary shown, and one-half of

/his service

his service on that old salary prior to 1st January, 1954 will count towards his first increment in the revised scale.

(b) In the case of an officer who at 1st January, 1954 was receiving the upper of the two old salary rates which convert to one point, he will be deemed to have served for one year at the lower of the two old salary points. To this one year will be added the actual period of service prior to 1st January, 1954 on the upper of the two points and one half of the resulting total period will count towards his first increment in the revised scale.

Examples

(a) An officer who received £670(904) per annum on the old scale £550-900 with effect from 1st July, 1953, will at 1st January, 1954 convert to £948(1043) per annum. At 1st January, 1954 he has served for six months at the lower of two old salary points converting to one point; one half of this period is three months, which is the credit due to him for incremental purposes and he will proceed to £984(1082) per annum on 1st October, 1954.

(b) An officer who received £690(931) per annum on the old scale £550-900 with effect from 1st July, 1953 will at 1st January, 1954 convert to £948(1043) per annum. He will be allowed one year for service at £670 per annum (or service he must be deemed to have had at that salary); to this will be added the period of six months served on the upper of the two old salary points (i.e. £690) giving a total of 1 year 6 months; one half of this total is nine months, which is the credit due to him for incremental purposes and he will proceed to £984(1082) per annum on 1st April, 1954.

C. Where the new scale is longer than the old

(i) The base point has been fixed in the same way as in B above. The upper point has been fixed by making the year on the new scale corresponding to the final year of the old scale, and the conversion is graduated between these two points.

(ii) Where an officer has served at the date of conversion for more than a full year on the maximum of the old scale, and is certified as fit to proceed higher, the formula by which he comes onto the additional points at the top of the new scale (again with acknowledgements to the Northern Rhodesian Salaries Commission) is as follows:-

/An officer who,

An officer who, on the 1st January, 1954 had been on the maximum of his old scale (or a fixed salary) for more than one year and would convert, in accordance with the appropriate conversion table, to a point lower than the maximum of his new scale, will be allowed to count one half of the period in excess of one year towards his next increment in the new scale, but in no case will he be given more than one increment on this account.

635. We have assumed that every serving member is entitled, subject to passing bars, to proceed to the limit of his present expectations; that is to say, to the point beyond which movement is a promotion to a higher post or grade as distinct from advancement over a bar within his grade. Promotion to a higher post or grade includes, for the purpose of this definition, promotion to a higher grade the cadre of which is fixed as a percentage of a lower one or of the establishment as a whole. Where a serving member's expectation as thus defined, is less under the new scale of his grade than under the old scale (i.e. where the new scale ends at a lower point, account being taken of cost of living allowance in each case, than the old), we have provided "shadow" scales for conversion purposes above the top point of the new scale. The principles of these shadow scales are:-

- (a) Enough conversion points are provided to cover the gross deficiency between the top points of the new and old scales.
- (b) The incremental rate provided for these additional points is that which exists at the top point of the new scale; the officer will not be entitled to any superior rate of increment which may occur in the salary scale next above his present grade unless and until he is actually promoted to that grade.

636. In cases where we have marked an appointment or grade to be regraded, shadow scales are provided to enable an interim conversion rate to be paid pending the appointment of serving officers to posts or grades under the new grading.

637. A serving member whose salary is converted in the first place to a shadow scale, and who is subsequently allocated to a post or grade the salary scale of which has a maximum which is less than his present expectations as defined above, should have the right to continue to serve on the shadow scale and to earn increments on it until he is promoted to a post or grade in a superior scale, or until he retires from the service, whichever is the earlier.

Special Rules for Conversion

638. Contract Appointments. In the Appendices to this Report we have not suggested new salaries for appointments which are on contract or agreement. We suggest that where the salary of such an appointment is based on existing salary levels for the pensionable establishment, the salary should normally be converted in accordance with the conversion table applicable to the relevant scale. In other cases, whether the salary is expressed as a fixed figure or otherwise, we must leave it to the administration to decide in each case whether any change should be considered in the existing terms of the contract. We see no reason, however, for revising contract terms which have been fixed on existing market rates in the United Kingdom or elsewhere.

639. Conversion of present "expatriate" scales. The great majority of the present scales which fall to be converted onto our C, B or A Scales were devised by the 1947-48 Commission as suitable for recruits from overseas (see quotation from paragraph 91 of that Commission's Report in paragraph 50 of this Report). They contain, therefore, the "expatriation" or, as we have called it, the "inducement" element. We are of opinion that there is no other practical course than to convert every officer at present serving on these scales to the appropriate salary point on the new scale inclusive of the inducement addition, and to recommend that the officer shall continue to be paid at the inducement rate until such time as he passes out of the range in which it operates. If the alternative of converting the locally-born officers onto the basic scales were adopted, the principle that no officer's emoluments shall be decreased on conversion would involve their being given shadow scales high up in the basic salary range, with a mass of complications in the Staff Lists and Estimates for some years; and the sorting out of officers into the two categories would add to the considerable amount of work which the implementation of this Report will cause. Whichever alternative is adopted, the result in terms of the officer's new emoluments would be very much the same; we have, therefore, chosen the simpler course.

640. We must add, however, that there are some present salary scales which in our opinion cannot be regarded as containing the expatriate element. Instances are:-

Kenya and High Commission

£575 x 25 - 700,

The Clerical A Scales for men and women.

Tanganyika

£550 x 20 - 630 (Junior Service Superscale)

Uganda

Local Civil Service - Special Division (all grades)

/We regard such scales

We regard such scales as having been devised essentially for local officers; moreover, all of them fall into the category for which we have recommended regrading. The shadow scales allotted to them in the meantime are expressed in terms of the basic salary range; but in effect this method of conversion gives them broadly the same as would conversion to a lower basic salary plus inducement addition, and their future salary position is safeguarded by the provision in paragraph 637 above.

Conversion of officers on
three-fifths salaries.

641. We have given special consideration to the case of these officers. As we see it, the position is that although the Government have announced their intention to abolish the Three-Fifths Rule, they have not yet stated what is to replace it; the officers will, therefore, still be serving on their existing scales when this Report comes to be implemented. We think that it would be inconsistent with the fundamental principles of our Report to make any other recommendations than that they should be converted onto the appropriate new basic scale of their grade as if all their service in the grade had been on that scale. For instance, an officer serving on the starting point of the Three-Fifths professional scale £330(446) - 792(1067) would convert to the starting point of the basic Scale A, i.e. £630(693) and so on year for year; at the tenth point £540(729) on the old scale he would convert to £960(1056) on the new.

642. We are aware that in consequence of the Kenya Police Commission's Report two Asian Assistant Superintendents of Police serving on a three-fifths scale are likely to have been converted to the full scale recommended by the Commission for that rank. If this is so, the position from our point of view is that these officers will be serving on an expatriate scale at the time of implementation of our Report, and will, therefore, have the benefit of the arrangement proposed in paragraph 639 above. But we cannot regard this as a ground for recommending that all officers now on three-fifths scales should convert to the full inducement rate.

643. Conversion of women's scales. The rules which we have adopted for the conversion of women's scales which are four-fifths of the corresponding men's scales at present are as follows:-

(i) In respect of conversion to the A(W) or B(W) Scales, the present base point of the scale is laid alongside the base point of the new scale, and conversion then proceeds in accordance with the general rules in A, B and C of paragraph 634 above. For instance, the present four-fifths professional scale for women is £496(670) - 1056(1406). For conversion purposes £496 is laid alongside £630(693), and conversion proceeds from that base up the A(W) Scale.

/(ii) Salaries converted

(ii) Salaries converted to the A(W) and B(W) Scales are deemed to contain the expatriation element, and are converted with the inducement addition.

(iii) We think it equitable that any woman officer at present serving on an unabated scale should convert to the A(W) or B(W) Scale as may be appropriate, subject to the proviso that she suffers no loss in emoluments thereby (see paragraph 633 above).

(iv) In respect of conversion to the C(W) Scale, conversion is to the basic scale without inducement addition, the appropriate segments of the C(W) Scale being applied to the present scale.

Conversion of Nursing Sisters and Matrons to the N Scale is in accordance with the general rules, inducement addition being included.

644. Conversion to the B Scale. Grades now serving on the broken professional scale £550-1050 and £1095-1230 (see paragraph 224), and gazetted Police Officers, have been converted to the new B Scale in accordance with the general rules.

We have considered the case of serving officers in services now remunerated on the full professional scale to which we have assigned the B Scale (see paragraphs 228-9). Our recommendation is that these serving officers should be converted to the B Scale. The latter is twenty-one years long as compared with the twenty years of their present scale; by the omission of one salary point in the conversion, we have provided a conversion table which is in accord with the general rules of conversion in this Chapter and gives them an appreciable benefit from the new scale(*).

645. Conversion of the Scale £340-520 or beyond In Kenya and the High Commission this scale is a nine-year one, with annual increments of £22.10.0d. The outlet is into the common grade £550 x 20 - 690 x 25 - 840 x 30 - 900. In the High Commission the former scale is known as J1. In Tanganyika the scale is known as M12, and extends to £840 as follows:-

£340: 340: 365 x 25 - 840. It is therefore superior, in increments up to £690, to the common grade £550 x 20 - 690 x 25 - 840.

In all three administrations we have marked this scale "Regrade", and we assume that Kenya and the High Commission will replace it in future by a Training Grade (to which it seems to approximate at present), and that Tanganyika will in future turn the lower part into a Training Grade leading on to the appropriate grades on the C Scale. On these assumptions, we have confined ourselves to providing a shadow scale for serving members. The disproportionately high increments at the lower end of the scale present a difficulty; we have had to overcome this by taking

£462(508) as the comparative base point for £340(459), and £660(726) as the comparative top point for £520(702), or £515(695) in Tanganyika. (+)

Operation of bars

646. If our recommendations in paragraphs 84-89 are accepted and implemented, it will take the administrations some time to set up the machinery to operate bars of the kind which we propose. They may find it convenient, therefore, to lay down that until a date to be appointed in the future, an officer shall continue to be subject to bars of the existing kind at the points on the new scales corresponding to those at which they are now placed on the old. From the appointed date, the new bars would be substituted for the old in every scale.

Incremental dates

647. The incremental date of an officer will not normally be changed by the conversion process except under the rules laid down in paragraph 634 above. We suggest, however, that administrations which do not already follow the practice may wish to avail themselves of the opportunity of this conversion to fix all incremental dates at the first day of a month. This practice saves a good deal of calculation for odd periods of the month. We suggest that at the time of conversion, all incremental dates be fixed at the first day of the month in which they now fall due, or will fall due under the adjustment in paragraph 634.

Lay-out of Appendices.

648. The Appendices to this Report contain detailed schedules of each head of the Expenditure Estimates (except for the Railways and Harbours Administration), giving present and proposed salary scales together with reference to the relevant paragraphs of the Report and to the Conversion Tables. The Conversion Tables are grouped as much as possible, but the Commission have endeavoured to provide separate Tables or shadow Tables in every case where a particular scale does not fall into a common group. Should there be any omission, they hope that the administration will find no difficulty in constructing a table from the material already available in the Appendices.

CHAPTER XXIXDATE OF IMPLEMENTATION AND FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

649. We are particularly charged under our terms of reference with the duty of making a recommendation on the question of the date from which the new salary scales and other conditions of service which we recommend should take effect.

650. One obvious objection to the back-dating of any salaries revision is that it involves the reopening on a very large scale of transactions which have already been settled, and in consequence much additional work for the establishment and accounting officers of departments and also for the audit. To mention but a few of the concomitant disadvantages, new salary vouchers with their necessary book entries have to be prepared for all public servants, and their net remuneration under the old system deducted from whatever net remuneration may be due to them under the new system. These vouchers have all to be checked and payment made. In addition, pension computations of officers who have retired during the period of back-dating have to be altered, and if the revision is carried back into a previous income tax year, assessments may need revision. For these reasons alone we should have preferred to recommend for the implementation of our proposals some date in the future which would have allowed time for consideration of our Report by the administrations and the legislatures concerned before decisions on them were put into force.

651. There are, moreover, in this Report a number of proposals which cannot possibly be back-dated. For instance, a very substantial amount of regrading of posts is involved which will, in many cases, result in a redistribution of duties. This process of regrading will take time, and it would clearly be wrong for an officer to draw the salary appropriate to certain duties for a period during which he did not perform them, or receive remuneration appropriate to a particular grade for a period during which that grade did not, in fact, exist. Again, our rent proposals cannot be put into operation until Government quarters have been classified under our proposed platforms.

652. With all these considerations in view we made it clear to representatives of the administrations concerned immediately after our arrival in East Africa that, in our view, it should be the task of the administrations to maintain, by means of cost of living allowances, the relation between the cost of living and the general level of remuneration of the public services during the period of our deliberations in order to prevent our having to recommend the back-dating of our proposals on this account. We understood that this principle was accepted by the administrations, and in fact the rate of cost of living allowance was raised in all the East African territories in the second half of 1953.

653. Against these arguments, however, we have regretfully to admit that the completion of this Report has taken us considerably more time than we had originally hoped. Further, the public service had asked for a general revision of salaries some considerable time before we were appointed. Again, it has been urged on us with some force during our hearing of evidence that there has been, in the past, too much delay between rises in the wage adjustment index and the implementation of increases in the rate of cost of living allowance to meet these rises, and that some compensation is due to the public services on this account. Some delay in this matter is clearly inevitable (though we have recommended in paragraph 117 of this Report a way in which

/it should be reduced

it should be reduced to a minimum), and we reject any claim that we should recommend a calculated amount of compensation on this account. Finality must be reached at some time. claims for back-dating of increases in the rate of cost of living allowance should be dealt with at the time of the award. But all these considerations taken together lead us to the conclusion that it would be unfair to the public service for us to recommend that the implementation of all our proposals should wait for some date still further in the future.

654. We have, therefore, decided to recommend to the administrations concerned that, from the point of view of implementation, our proposals should be divided into two parts. This will, in any case, probably be more convenient, as many of our proposals will, no doubt, require a substantial period for consideration. So far as salaries, in which we include the inducement addition and our proposed cost of living allowance, are concerned we recommend implementation as from the 1st January, 1954. In all cases where regrading of posts will be necessary we have provided salaries for purposes of immediate conversion, and there should be no difficulty in introducing new salaries while at the same time, temporarily retaining other conditions of service under existing regulations, e.g. rental deductions in the form of a percentage of salary. But as regards all our other recommendations we consider that they should be brought into force with effect from some future date, after the necessary approval has been given to them and such other preliminary work as may be required for their implementation has been done. In this connection we would remark that it will not be necessary for the same date to apply to all our recommendations regarding future conditions of service. For example, there is no reason why the same date should apply to our suggested system for rental of quarters and to our proposed leave and passage conditions. But we would press strongly that it be arranged by inter-territorial discussion that the same change in conditions of service should become effective in all four East African territories from the same date. This would also be desirable in principle in the case of the major changes of structure resulting from the regrading of posts, but may not in practice be possible, as the regrading process may take different periods in the three mainland territories, and there is no reason why one territory should wait a long time to implement its new structure after regrading is finished because the process is not complete in another territory.

655 Before we leave this subject, we should wish to restate in other words what we have already said in paragraph 46 of this Report. All our recommendations in the Report form a balanced whole; and although we have recommended, in the interests of the public service, that our proposed salaries should be introduced respectively from the 1st January, 1954, and that our other recommendations should be implemented from dates in the future as and when it may be possible to do so, our proposals cannot be deemed to have been implemented until all are in operation.

Financial Implications

656. Although we are not specifically required to do so, we should have wished to give in this Report some approximate figures of the cost of our recommendations to the various administrations with which we are concerned. Cost in this connection can, of course, be interpreted in different ways. It can, first of all, mean the difference between the cost of remunerating the public service at the rates we propose and at the existing rates during the period immediately following the implementation of our Report, i.e. the cost of conversion to our proposed salary scales. Alternatively it can mean the difference in cost some years ahead when all our proposals are fully in effect. In both cases the financial liabilities arise on account of superannuation benefits, leave-earning rates, etc. should be taken into account.

657. We have tried to frame estimates of the cost of our proposals under the first interpretation, but the existing differences in the present practice under the various administrations make any rough and ready basis of calculation of the cost of conversion unreliable. For instance, the greatest increase in salary scales under our proposals lies in the lowest paid ranks. The Government of Kenya, however, pays a higher cost of living allowance at this level than the other territories, and the increased cost on conversion on this account is likely, therefore, to be proportionally lower in Kenya than in other territories. The Zanzibar Government, on the other hand, at present pays a lower cost of living allowance over a considerable portion of its service than the other territories, and therefore the cost falling to it is likely to be proportionally higher in this range. Again, the non-self-contained Services of the High Commission, owing to their nature, employ proportionately less lower paid staff than the territorial Governments, and the incidence on them of our recommendations so far as increased cost on conversion is concerned will be different. In order to work out reliable estimates of increased cost on conversion in such widely varying circumstances a great deal of detailed calculation would be necessary, and for us to undertake this work would result in our delaying the completion of our Report still further. The Treasuries of the various territories would no doubt check our calculations in any case when they received our Report. In these circumstances, we feel that it would be better to leave the task of accurate computation to them and the departments concerned, rather than to include in this Report our own overall estimates which may not be entirely reliable. We have no wish either to alarm the taxpaying public by pitching the figure too high or to deceive them by suggesting too low a figure.

/While

658. While the figure of cost of conversion is mainly a matter of computation, it is impossible to form at this stage at any rate a reliable estimate of additional cost under the second interpretation, since much depends on the grading assigned to the large number of posts for which we have recommended regrading, and also on the segmentation of the scales that we propose for the subordinate services and the grading of posts within that segmentation. There are, however, in our Report a number of recommendations which, when fully implemented, should produce considerable economies. For instance, increased emphasis on the training of locally recruited officers for higher posts, in connection with which we have recommended the establishment of a Training Grade, should result in savings both on salaries and on passage costs as compared with the recruitment of officers from overseas. Again, we have commented in paragraphs 159 and 405 on what we consider to be the very high cost at present paid for clerical services in Kenya. This no doubt also applies to departments of other administrations, such as the Income Tax Department of the High Commission. A closer regrading of clerical posts in relation to the value of the work performed should, in due course, eliminate this. Finally, our recommendation that the administrations should dissociate themselves from any liability to house all their employees should result in a saving of a very large capital expenditure of an unremunerative kind from revenue.

659. While, therefore, a substantial increase in expenditure on conversion of the public service to the salaries which we recommend is inevitable, our hope is that, when our recommendations are in full effect - which must, of course, take a considerable period of time - there should be economies which will, in part, offset this.

CHAPTER XXXSUMMARY OF CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Paragraph numbers	<u>CHAPTER III - STRUCTURE AND SOURCES OF RECRUITMENT OF THE EAST AFRICAN SERVICES</u>
----------------------	--

- 42 The East African territories are not yet in sight of being able to staff their public services entirely from their own resources.

45	<u>CHAPTER IV - GENERAL PRINCIPLES OF THE RECOMMENDED SALARY STRUCTURE</u>
----	--

- 45 The recommendations of the Commission are framed on the understanding that uniformity between the administrations is desired.

- 46 The recommendations of the Commission are a carefully balanced whole and rejection of some part of them may result in the balance being disturbed.

- 47 - 49 The Commission have endeavoured to revise the salary structure in such a way that racial distinctions shall disappear and that grading by responsibility of duties shall replace grading by race where it exists. The Commission aim to provide the foundations for a public service which will ultimately be recruited wholly within the East African territories.

CHAPTER V - THE THREE-FIFTHS RULE

- 54 The basic salary scales which are being recommended are based on the assumption that they are intended for local candidates.

- 55 If East Africa wishes to recruit its fill of candidates from external markets some inducement additional to basic salary must be offered.

- 56 The receipt of such an inducement addition should not confer on the recipient any superiority in status or seniority within a grade.

- 58 The scale of inducement pay which is being recommended is a common one for all the grades in which it is applicable, although the time may come when it may have to vary for different classes of appointment in accordance with the changes in market conditions.

CHAPTER VI - THE APPLICATION OF THE
INDUCEMENT PRINCIPLE

- 59 The inducement addition should apply to all grades to which overseas officers have to be recruited to supplement local resources, except where the basic salary offered is clearly enough to attract overseas recruits.
- 62 The four East African territories and the High Commission should be regarded as a unit for the operation of the inducement principle and the external recruitment fields in which inducement pay forms part of an offer of employment should be scheduled.
- 65 Where a candidate of local origin obtains appointment by the Secretary of State to the administrative or professional services, and certain other specified services, he should receive the inducement addition to basic salary even if posted for service in his country of origin.
- 66 Recruitment of local candidates in other categories of posts will be made through the Public Service Commission with due recognition of the market value of practical experience of East Africa.
- 67 - 70 A Training Grade should be instituted as an avenue of entry to the Executive and higher technical grades.
- 73 The inducement addition to salary should be pensionable and should count as part of salary for the purpose of reckoning any cost of living allowance which is payable in addition to salary.

CHAPTER VII - OTHER STRUCTURAL PRINCIPLES
OF THE NEW SCALES

- 78 The time has not yet come for the general adoption of a broken scale system; but the kind of salary structure best suited to each branch of the service is recommended.
- 79 Scale A, which is recommended for the administrative and professional services, is a long scale. Scales B and C,

/which

which are recommended for other categories of posts, are expressed each in five segments which in suitable cases are linked so as to form a long scale; in others the scales are broken so as to constitute a graded hierarchy without stagnation.

- 81 A sensible increase in salary at a relatively early stage in a public servant's career is recommended. The point of increase has been placed generally in the revised scales at the completion of five years' service after the normal age of entry; in the junior clerical and analogous grades it appears as a smaller increase at two different points.
- 83 The practice of imposing a standstill in salary in certain grades during a probationary period should cease.
- 86 It is assumed that the Public Service Commission will be called upon to advise regarding movement from segment to segment in a broken scale, when this is in fact promotion to a post of greater responsibility. In a long scale, there should be only one kind of check on an officer's progress in addition to the annual incremental certificate, and that check should be a bar which should be an effective extra-departmental examination of the officer's performance. This examination should be undertaken by Service Boards of adequate weight and impartiality.
- 88 This examination should operate before the incremental jump recommended after five or six years' service mentioned above, and thereafter at intervals of not less than five or more than nine years.
- 90 - 92 Accelerated promotion within the timescales has proved difficult to work in East Africa and should be left in the fields where it can operate under recognisable standards i.e. promotions to a higher grade, where the criteria are clear.
- 93 - 96 The practice at present followed in East Africa of paying women on the basis of four-fifths of that of men in the same grade is more severe than that obtaining either in the United Kingdom or in other Colonial territories. Women should not receive the triple or other incremental jump recommended in paragraph 81 to provide for increased domestic responsibilities, but in other respects should receive the same pay as men. Superscale salaries should be the same for men and women.

- 97 Inducement addition is not necessary as a matter of course for women recruited outside East Africa to posts in the field of the C Scales where the basic salary is in itself adequate.
- 98 - 99 Members of His Highness's Zanzibar Service should in future draw the salary of the grade or post in which they serve, and salary scales should cease to be attached to the divisions of His Highness's Zanzibar Service.

CHAPTER VIII - THE COST OF LIVING
FACTOR IN SALARIES

- 105 The same general level of remuneration is recommended for adoption both on the mainland and in the whole of Zanzibar Protectorate.
- 111 The overall level of emoluments recommended by the 1947-48 Commission is assumed to have been adequate, and so far as the cost of living factor is concerned, the Commission's recommendations are based on the rise in the cost of living since the end of 1947.
- 113 - 14 Consolidation in pensionable salaries of the whole of the present cost of living allowance is not recommended and 10% of the revised remuneration should be left floating as a non-pensionable allowance to provide a buffer against the possibility of a future general fall in prices.
- 115 The ceiling on cost of living allowances should be raised to the top of the revised timescale with inducement addition (i.e. £1620), leaving £162 per annum as the maximum allowance.
- 117 - 18 1st January, 1954 should be taken as the base date for the indices to be used for the consideration of any future variation in the cost of living allowance. Certain measures are suggested in these paragraphs to provide for early and uniform action in the event of any future substantial change in the cost of living.

/119 The cost of living
allowance

- 119 The cost of living allowance paid to public servants should not vary in accordance with marital status and family commitments.

CHAPTER IX - THE SUBORDINATE SERVICES

- 132 - 133 The minimum should be raised to Sh.60 a month for this class of employee where provided with Government quarters in the normal outstations, and Sh.69 where he is not. These amounts should attract 10% cost of living allowance. This minimum might be reduced at the discretion of administrations in very remote areas.
- 134 The corresponding maxima should be Sh.189 a month with quarters and Sh.198 without.
- 136 Superannuation benefits should be calculated on the 'without quarters' range.
- 137 Housing allowance should be added to the 'with quarters' range subject to the proviso that not less should be paid than the corresponding point on the 'without quarters' range.
- 138 Within the range represented by these minima and maxima segmentation is suggested, with four or five segments into which administrations should at their discretion fit the various grades of employees. Segmentation and grading should be co-ordinated throughout East Africa and Establishment officers should act in concert on this matter.
- 143 - 146 In addition to the basic rates mentioned in paragraphs 132-134 a local allowance is recommended, tapering off from Sh.16 a month as the minimum of the range to nothing at Sh.144 a month (without quarters - Sh.135 with quarters) - this allowance to be paid in the urban areas of Nairobi, Mombasa, Dar-es-Salaam and Kampala, and either in whole or in part in any other urban or semi-urban area to which Governments may wish to extend it.
- 147 Ranges of remuneration for subordinate services are set out in tabular form.
- 150 Zanzibar and Pemba are treated as an urban area so far as the local allowance is concerned, and the salary ranges for subordinate services proposed for the whole of the Zanzibar Protectorate represent basic ranges and the local allowance added together.

- 153 Conversion procedure for existing employees to new ranges.

CHAPTER X - CLERICAL AND ANALOGOUS SERVICES

- 156 A uniform pattern of salary scales (labelled E Scales) rising from £90(99) to £480(528) and divided into six segments is recommended for these services.
- 158 £480(528) is the upper limit beyond which the salary range of the main body of the services should not extend. Posts worth a higher salary should be classified on the C Scales - see Chapter XI.
- 159 In accordance with the principle that grading by responsibility of duties should replace any grading by race, segments 6 and 5 of the E Scales should be used for minor clerical work and segments 4-3 for more important clerical duties.
- 160 Entry points to the new scales should depend on the standard of education reached at the time of first appointment.
- 163- 164 Recommendations are made on the regulation of establishments in the grades placed on the E Scales.
- 168 - 174 Regrading of analogous grades in accordance with the principles recommended in these paragraphs is left to administrations, but it is advised that the regrading of these grades should follow the pattern of scales laid down for the clerical structure, and that grade for grade the pay and prospects should be at least as good, if not better

CHAPTER XI - THE EXECUTIVE AND TECHNICAL SERVICES

- 180 A uniform pattern of salary scales (labelled C Scales) rising from £498(548) to £1320(1452) and divided into six segments is recommended for these services. These scales will attract the inducement addition where appropriate.
- 181 - 187 The C Scale is a broken scale but the linkage of certain segments is recommended in appropriate cases. A top segment equivalent to that of the administrative and professional A Scale is recommended for use when an administration considers that a grade at such a salary is required.

- 190 - 194 Recommendations are made as regards regrading of higher posts in the clerical and analogous services.
- 195 Uniformity in regrading and designation is necessary.
- 196 - 203 Recommended structure for stenographers and secretaries.
- 204 The scale recommended for the Training Grade is the D Scale £408(449) - 480(528).
- 205 - 213 Recommendations as regards entry points into the C Scale.
- 214 Recommended grading for Assistant District Officers.
- 217 The aim is a non-racial structure extending from E6 grade at £90(99) comprising the clerical and 'office' executive classes and extending through the C Scale into its highest segments. A similar structure parallel with this is recommended for the present 'analogous' grades and the higher technical and executive grades. There should be ladders of promotion for the zealous and efficient public servants in both structures.
- 219 It is suggested that administrations should discard the present separation of their services by nomenclature into divisions or into Senior and Junior Services.
- 220 The readmission of Asians to permanent and pensionable status in the lower and middle grades of the public service in Uganda is supported.

CHAPTER XII - ADMINISTRATIVE AND PROFESSIONAL SERVICES

- 223 - 229 A salary scale called the B Scale is recommended intermediate between the A and C Scales. It starts at £588(647) and rises to £1320(1452) and is divided into 5 segments. It will attract inducement addition where appropriate.
- It applies to Accountants, Auditors, Collectors and Senior Collectors of Customs and Excise, gazetted Police Officers,, and to officers recruited direct into senior grades of Community Development, Social Development, Welfare Departments, and Labour Departments - also to some Administrative Secretaries in major departments and to Assistant Secretaries or Establishment Officers in Secretariats.

- 231 Segments B5-2 should have a common establishment for the Assistant Officer and Officer grades. Segment B1 should be reserved as a separate establishment for the Senior Officer grade.
- 233 Women Administrative Assistants are graded in the appropriate segments of the Women's Scale B5-2.
- 235 The long A Scale runs from £630(693) to £1320(1452) with bars after the fifth and fourteenth years. It will attract inducement addition where appropriate.
- 239 - 241 Special non-pensionable allowances at three different rates varying according to the responsibility of the district are recommended for District Commissioners or District Officers in charge of a district.
- 242 - 247 A similar allowance at a single rate is also proposed for professional officers in charge of provinces where Government considers that the responsibility involved justifies the allowance.
- 248 The scale for Medical Officers should be extended for the present beyond the maximum of the normal long scale by three biennial increments.
- 250 The same course is recommended for certain scientist grades on the professional long scale.
- 253 The A Scale should be restricted to the Administrative service and professional services with a prescribed professional qualification at the time of recruitment

CHAPTER XIII - CLASSES COMMON TO SEVERAL DEPARTMENTS

- 256 - 277 Recommendations in regard to Accountants, Draughtsmen, Laboratory Technicians, Librarians, Storekeepers, Surveyors, Computers.

/CHAPTER XIV

CHAPTER XIV - THE EDUCATION DEPARTMENTS

- 284 The full A Scale should be paid to Education Officers with full professional qualifications, but the cadre of such officers should ultimately be reduced to requirements of organisation, inspection and administration.
- 285 Appointments for teaching duties with present qualifications should be on the B Scale, the normal expectation being segments B5-2, with the segment B1 reserved for more senior posts.
- 287 The same gradings will apply to African and Asian Education Officers, provided they have the prescribed qualifications.
- 288 - 293 Technical teaching staff should be placed on the segments B5-2 or B1 if they have the Higher National Certificate of the United Kingdom or its equivalent. Otherwise they should be graded on the C Scale.
- 294 - 298 A new scale - T - £462(508) - £684(752) is recommended for teachers with the Makerere Diploma or Degree, graduates of Asian Universities, and holders of the Higher School Certificate who have qualified in the Nairobi Teacher Training course.
- 301 - 302 A pattern of organisation is recommended for teachers with lower qualifications based on E Scales. As in the Clerical Service, the entry point for School Certificate holders will be £162(178) in Uganda and £180(198) in the other territories.
- 306 There should be an avenue of promotion from the E Scale to the T Scale and from the T Scale to appropriate segments of the B Scale.

CHAPTER XV - THE MEDICAL DEPARTMENTS

- 310 The scale recommended for Medical Officers with United Kingdom qualifications is the A Scale plus an extension of three biennial increments. The entry point should be £1074(1181) for Medical Officers recruited in the United Kingdom and £690(759) for locally-recruited Medical Officers with these qualifications.

/319-321 Medical Officers

- 319 - 321 Medical Officers with qualifications registrable in East Africa should be placed on the Scale B5-1.
- 322 Medical Officers licensed to practice in East Africa should be placed on appropriate segments of the C Scale.
- 323 - 324 Nursing Sisters and Mental Nurses with S.R.N. or M.R.N. qualifications are placed on the Scale N5 - £540(594) - £804(884), but certain free services now enjoyed (value £100-£110 a year) should be withdrawn.
- 325 - 327 Higher scales are recommended for Sister Tutors, Health Visitors, Physiotherapists, Occupational Therapists and Matrons.
- 329 & 335 Review and regrading in order to ensure a properly graded structure is recommended for subordinate grades.
- 330 - 334 Recommendations in regard to Hospital Superintendents, Pharmacists, Health Inspectors, Radiographers, Orthopaedic Technicians and Entomological Field Staff.

CHAPTER XVI - POLICE, PRISONS AND CUSTOMS

- 338 - 342 Scales for uniformed grades of the Kenya Police are recommended after discussion and agreement with the Kenya Police Commission.
- 345 Scales recommended for Kenya Police should also apply to Police of other East African territories subject to variations in rank structure.
- 346 - 347 Recommendations in regard to Tanganyika Police.
- 348 - 350 Recommendations in regard to Uganda Police.

- 351 Recommendation in regard to Zanzibar Police.
- 353 Officers below the rank of Assistant Commissioner in charge of Provinces should be eligible for the provincial allowance recommended in paragraph 245.
- 354 Separate salary scales recommended for Superintendents and Assistant Superintendents.
- 355 Similar salaries recommended for uniformed staff of Prisons and Customs Departments as for Police but allowances to be subject for inter territorial discussion.
- 356 - 357 Re-organisation of uniformed Prisons grades on uniform basis for East Africa is suggested.
- 358 Proposals for Kenya Prisons Department under present structure.
- 359 Proposals for Tanganyika Prisons Department under present structure.
- 360 Proposals for Uganda Prisons Department under present structure.
- 361 Proposals for Zanzibar Prisons Department.
- 362 Rent on quarters in Police and Prisons Departments.
- 367 Proposals for uniformed staff in Customs Department of the High Commission.
- 368 Proposals for Zanzibar Customs staff.

CHAPTER XVII - PUBLIC WORKS DEPARTMENT

- 370 - 372 Present variety of titles and scales throughout the territories should be replaced by a uniform pattern and recommendations are made with this in view covering the main technical posts.
- 373 Recommendation in regard to Senior Supervisors, Uganda.
- 374 Recommendation in regard to Engineering Assistants, (Kenya and Uganda) and Technical Assistants (Tanganyika)
- 375 Grading of lower ranges of technical staff is left to administrations subject to recommendations made in paragraphs 159, 169-174 and 194-5.

- 376 Works staff in Tanganyika have recently been re-organised and may be held to be outside the recommendations of the Commission.
- 377 Recommendations in regard to Mechanical Section.
- 378 Recommendations in regard to Electrical Branch.

CHAPTER XVIII - COMMENTS ON OTHER DEPARTMENTS

- 379 - 413 Comments on posts common to several administrations.

CHAPTER XIX - SUPERSCALE SALARIES

- 415 - 416 Existing multiplicity of superscale salaries should be replaced by a few broad bands of salary covering posts of roughly equal responsibilities without regard to minor differences. There should normally be a difference of £400 per annum between the Head of Department and his Deputy and £200 between the Deputy and the next level of responsibility, decreasing to £120 between the lowest super scale salary and the top of the long scale.
- 417 An incremental scale is recommended for the lowest range of superscale salaries.
- 418 The inducement addition is consolidated into the salaries recommended, which should be paid irrespective of place of birth or domicile.
- 419 Women's superscale salaries should be the same as for men.
- 422-424 The levels of superscale salaries recommended are:-
- (1) Lowest superscale level
£1740(1902)x60-1860(2022)
(2162)
 - (2) £2000 - Deputy or Assistant Directors and Heads of smallest Departments.
 - (3) £2200⁽²³⁶²⁾ Deputy Directors and Smaller Departments
 - (4) £2400⁽²⁵⁶²⁾ - Heads of medium Departments.
 - (5) £2600⁽²⁵⁶²⁾ - Heads of major Departments
 - (6) £2800-3800⁽²⁹⁶²⁾⁻⁽³⁹⁶²⁾ - Covers the highest posts at different levels of responsibility.

- 425 Detailed proposals for superscale posts
- 426 Notes on individual superscale grading.

CHAPTER XX - COMMENTS ON GENERAL POINTS AFFECTING SALARIES

- 427- 429 Incremental credit for War Service should now cease, but credit for post-war compulsory military service should continue.
- 430 - 434 Recommendations in regard to initial entry points on the Professional scale, including proposals to retain some element of market value enhancement in respect of Legal, Medical and Veterinary officers.
- 435 - 438 Additional increments for 'approved' experience should only be applied where definitions of initial qualifications and subsequent experience are clear. They should normally be granted only where recruitment is to the lowest grade of the service. The present limitation of increments for experience is accepted but should not be a rigid rule.
- 439 - 440 Assistance is recommended to public servants in Kenya who educate their children outside East Africa.

CHAPTER XXI - TRAINING

- 442 - 450 Recommendations for the creation of a Training grade under the control and regulation of Establishment branches. The Public Service Commission should be asked to advise on selection and the course of training should normally be completed within five years.
- 451 - 455 A Standing Committee on Training should be set up in each administration to review and regulate the training system throughout the public service.
- 456 Organisation and Methods branches should be established in the larger administrations after a visit, if it can be arranged, of an adviser from the Organisation and Methods Division of the United Kingdom Treasury.
- 457 The status and staffing of Establishment Branches should be reviewed so that they may be able to handle the additional work involved by our proposals.

CHAPTER XXII - BENEFITS OF RETIREMENT AND THE RETIRING AGE.

- 462 The age qualification for pensionable service should be lowered to 18 years but otherwise no change is recommended in the present pensions structure.

- 463 Increases of pensions to officers already in retirement are not within our terms of reference, but where an officer's emoluments are averaged for pensions purposes, it is recommended that pre-revision emoluments shall be taken as the total of salary plus cost of living allowance for the period minus 10% of this total.
- 464 Death gratuities in respect of pensionable officers might be made payable to dependants at the discretion of Chief Establishment Officers.
- 465 - 469 No change is recommended in the present pension arrangements for officers with 'mixed' service in the United Kingdom and East Africa.
- 470 - 472 War service and periods of courses of training prior to appointment to Government service should not now have any pension value.
- 478 When Provident Fund service is followed by pensionable service, the officer concerned should either surrender to Government his interests in the Fund and count all his Provident Fund service for pension, or, if he retains his interest in the Fund, that service should not count for pension. Alternatively, if he retains his own contributions plus interest on them only, then half that service might count for pension.
- 486 Gratuities for minor employees should be improved and reckoned at one-twelfth of a month's salary for each completed month of service without limit as to the amount that can be earned on this basis.
- 487 - 488 Posts of which the minimum salary is £90 should be eligible to be declared pensionable.
- 494 - 496 The recommendations of the Kenya Police Commission in regard to Kenya Police Pensions are supported except that the rate for gratuities should be one month's pay for each year of service.
- 499 - 502 Widows and Orphans Pensions schemes should be set up on actuarial basis and actuarial advice obtained on the practical application.

510 - 512

It is left to Governments to decide whether to withdraw present experimental scheme for optional retirement at 45 years of age, but, if it is withdrawn, adequate notice should be given and the present rule should be made permanent with the substitution of 50 years for 45 years of age. Retirement, except in special cases, should be compulsory at 55 years.

CHAPTER XXIII - HOUSING

513 - 514

Governments should not accept an unlimited liability to house their staffs. So long as officers have to be recruited overseas quarters must be provided for them. Quarters may also have to be provided in remote stations and at Government institutions. Apart from these cases, Government efforts should be directed to the provision of houses for the population in general, and not for Civil servants as such. A strictly economic rent system is impracticable in Government service.

518

The rent to be charged for Government quarters should be related to the size and amenities of the quarters, which should be classified into seven grades according to type and accommodation. The annual rents proposed vary from £6 for the smallest to £78 for the largest. Quarters should be allotted on a non-racial basis, according to the seniority and grading of the officers concerned.

521

The principle is not favoured whereby where no quarters are available for a Government officer, Government pays the difference between the rent actually paid for a suitable house and that of a corresponding Government quarter, but in present housing conditions there is no suitable alternative.

527 - 528

Furniture should be supplied at a rent related to the cost of furniture supplied and varying with the size of house.

530

Furniture should be supplied to officers of any race who apply for it, provided they pay the economic rent for it.

CHAPTER XXIV - LEAVE AND PASSAGES

534 New regulations are recommended which will be suitable for an indigenous service on the principle of graduating leave by seniority and status.

544 For locally born or domiciled staff, one kind of leave should replace the present differentiation into vacation and local leave. Leave should be accumulable only in any two consecutive years.

545 Sabbatical leave once in every five years, with passage privileges, is recommended for local officers who have reached a salary of £810 per annum. This leave may be taken in the United Kingdom or elsewhere in the Commonwealth.

547 Existing rights of serving Asian officers should be preserved, but they should have the option of electing for the new terms on reaching a salary above £480. Superscale officers should enjoy identical leave and passage privileges irrespective of domicile.

552 The leave-earning rate of all officers recruited from scheduled territories should be inclusive of voyage time.

553 The normal rate should be 5 days per month of duty, with a variable table for Kenya and the High Commission in accordance with climatic differences

The normal tour of duty should be that in which an officer earns 180 days' leave during his first ten years of service, and 150 days thereafter, with special rates for the Northern Province of Kenya.

Leave, including leave prior to retirement, should be limited to 8 months at any one time.

555 - 557

Local or casual leave up to 12 working days in any year (accumulable for two consecutive years) is recommended for Officers from scheduled territories and Asian officers retaining their existing rights to vacation leave and passages.

561 - 562

Administrations would be best advised to introduce a short tour system by degrees, from the top of the service downwards. Serving officers should not be required to accept an obligation to serve short tours as a condition of receiving the new scales or other conditions recommended by us, but administrations might publish a regulation whereby they reserve the right in the public interest to call upon any officer to take his leave before the completion of his normal tour of duty, provided no additional expense by way of passages is imposed upon him.

566

An officer on overseas leave should ordinarily be at liberty to travel by air or sea, as he prefers, both after a short and after a normal tour.

CHAPTER XXV - ALLOWANCES AND OTHER
CONDITIONS OF SERVICE

575 - 576

The extension of the system of payment of fixed amounts of entertainment allowance is not recommended, particularly as there is an existing system of claiming reimbursement of the cost of occasional entertainment.

577 - 578

Recommendations in regard to expenses on transfer from one station to another. The general principle should be that an officer should be able to recover all reasonable expenses in excess of his normal living expenses.

580 - 581

The revision of rates of travelling and subsistence allowances should be undertaken on an inter-administration basis.

585 - 590

Recommendations in regard to acting allowance.

591 - 596

The extension of medical and dental benefits is not recommended.

CHAPTER XXVI - POSTS AND TELECOMMUNICATIONS
ADMINISTRATION

595

Recommendations in regard to Superscale salaries.

603

The B Scale is recommended for Assistant Controllers, Traffic and Establishment Officers, and Accountants.

604

A pattern of grading is recommended for the consideration of the Postmaster General for operational or technical grades placed on the C or E Scales.

605

Telephonists in other Departments should be graded on the lines generally fixed for the grading of Telephonists in this administration, with due allowance for security considerations.

CHAPTER XXVII - RAILWAYS AND HARBOURS
ADMINISTRATION

606

Scales proposed for this Administration differ from those for the Civil Service, owing to the following facts:-

- (a) the undertaking is organised on commercial lines,
- (b) the salaries have been abated to allow for free housing,
- (c) the junior staff contribute towards their pensions.

609

Non-racial basic salaries plus inducement addition, where appropriate, are recommended for this service also.

611 - 613

Recommendations in regard to Superscale salaries.

614 - 615

Recommendations in regard to Group A or Assistant Officer grade posts.

616 - 625

Recommendations in regard to Group B (formerly Junior Service) posts.

626

Recommendations in regard to Group C (formerly Subordinate Service) posts.

627 - 629

A uniform non-contributory pension scheme is recommended for all graded staff, and the terms under which gratuities for subordinate staff are calculated should be improved.

630

Our general recommendations as regards leave and passages should apply to the Railways and Harbours staff.

CHAPTER XXVIII - CONVERSION ARRANGEMENTS

- 632 Every officer should have the option of remaining on his present terms or accepting the new terms in full.
- 633 No officer's net emoluments on conversion should be less than his present ones.
- 634 - 637 General rules in regard to conversion.
- 638 Revision of contract salaries must be left to the administration to decide in each case.
- 639 - 640 There is no other practical course but to convert every officer at present on an 'expatriate' scale to the appropriate point on the new scale inclusive of the 'inducement' element. Instances are given of some scales which cannot be regarded as containing the expatriate element.
- 641 - 642 Officers at present on 'three-fifths' scales should be converted to the appropriate new basic scale.
- 643 Recommendations in regard to conversion of women's scales.
- 644 Recommendations in regard to conversions to the B scale.
- 645 Conversion to the scale £340-520 or beyond.
- 646 Operation of bars in the new scales.
- 647 It is suggested that the practice of fixing incremental dates at the first day of a month should be followed.

CHAPTER XXIX - DATE OF IMPLEMENTATION AND FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

- 654 1st January, 1954 is recommended as the date of implementation so far as salary proposals are concerned. Other recommendations should be brought into force with effect from some future date after approval, and after any other necessary preliminary work
- 657 - 659 A close estimate of the cost of our proposals would be unreliable at the present time, but there should be economies which will, in part, offset the inevitable increased expenditure.

D.J. LIDBURY, Chairman
D.G. Godsall, Member
L.H. Gorsuch, Member.

J.H. Gould, Secretary
Majorie Ryley, Assistant Secretary

30th April, 1954.

APPENDIX

C.O. Ref: 21203/5/A.

DESPATCH

CIRCULAR 833/53

THE CHURCH HOUSE,
GREAT SMITH STREET,
LONDON, S. W. 1.

31st August, 1953.

Sir,

COLONIAL REGULATIONS PART I - PUBLIC OFFICERS

I have the honour to address you in respect of a revision of those provisions in Part I of the Colonial Regulations which deal with the control by the Secretary of State of appointment to vacant posts and with disciplinary procedure. You are aware that it is my view that the time has now come for these provisions to be revised so as to conform with the post-war pattern of the Colonial Service and to carry out the implications of paragraph 21 (ix) of the pamphlet Colonial No. 197 "Organisation of the Colonial Service".

2. Constitutional developments have already gone far in some Colonies and these developments may be expected to extend. It is therefore both necessary and desirable that the present regulations should be replaced by new arrangements which are related to the changed circumstances of the present day.

Control of Appointments

3. The existing Chapter III A of the Colonial Regulations replaced an earlier version in which the Secretary of State controlled appointments to all offices with initial emoluments of £400 a year or over and had a nominal veto on local appointments to offices whose initial emoluments were between £200 and £400. In the existing version, the control of the Secretary of State extends to

- (a) any post scheduled in one of the Unified Services;
- (b) any other post with initial emoluments of £600 a year or over. A higher limit has been fixed in some territories.

4. The underlying principle of these rules is clear. It was a logical consequence of the setting up of the Unified Services that the Secretary of State should control both the selection of persons for appointment to those Services and the filling of posts to which members of the Services were entitled to look for promotion. This was reasonable so long as recruitment for the bulk of professional and administrative posts was from outside the Colonies themselves, and so long as the Secretary of State was able to prescribe and maintain suitable salaries and terms of service.

/5. In many Colonies

5. In many Colonies that phase is passing or beginning to pass. Local candidates are becoming available in increasing numbers for higher grade appointments, and there is natural pressure to give them first consideration. Local Public Service Commissions are being set up to advise on the selection of such candidates, and it would be a needless formality to require that the recommendations of those bodies must in all cases be confirmed by the Secretary of State, or that the consent of the Secretary of State should be obtained before a local candidate is appointed.

6. On the other hand, there can be no question of the Secretary of State abrogating his control entirely. The need is to define the sphere in which he must retain control and to justify the definition by recognisable considerations of the public interest, so as to reduce, if not eliminate, the likelihood of political controversy over the filling of particular posts.

7. It must be remembered that by recruiting officers into the Colonial Service the Secretary of State has incurred certain clear obligations to the persons whom he has selected. It is not only that he has by implication guaranteed that the terms of the offer made by him on behalf of a particular Government will be honoured by that Government. Officers who have entered a Unified Service have been furnished with a list of posts which, they have been told, will normally be filled by members of that Service. They have been supplied with the present Colonial Regulations which state that the Secretary of State will control the filling of such posts and that in selecting officers for promotion he will not confine himself to those serving in or recommended by the Governor of the Colony in which the vacancy occurs. Finally, they have been told that the appointment, confirmation, promotion, retirement and transfer of members of the Unified Services will be governed by the directions of the Secretary of State.

8. I have reached the conclusion however that in the circumstances of today it is no longer necessary or appropriate that the Secretary of State should retain an exclusive right to select candidates for initial appointment to the higher grades of the public services in all territories (i.e. Administrative Cadet, Medical Officer, Agricultural Officer, etc.). If the Governor is advised by a Public Service Commission or other competent authority that a suitable local candidate is available for such posts, the Governor should be empowered to appoint that candidate without reference to the Secretary of State. The Secretary of State will, however, continue to select candidates for such posts at the request of the Governor, and it is clearly essential to lay down that the Governor has full discretion to ask the Secretary of State to select, and that, unless the Secretary of State's concurrence has been obtained, candidates from outside the Colony concerned are not to be recruited through any other channel (except, of course, the Crown Agents within the sphere in which they operate).

9. The procedure indicated in the previous paragraph may be suitable for first appointments but it is essential for the Secretary of State to retain some control of the filling of vacancies to which officers whom he has recruited in the past are entitled to look for promotion. Otherwise he cannot carry out his explicit and implicit obligations to these officers. Furthermore, unless the Secretary of State can give officers

/whom he may recruit

whom he may recruit in the future some assurance of promotion, he cannot expect to be able to meet the recruiting needs of the Colonial Governments either in quantity or in quality. It may be that some of the larger and more popular Colonies could in practice secure recruits on the basis of the attractions which they offer within the four walls of their separate public services. But even they would stand to lose much if they sacrificed the appeal which the idea of a Colonial Service makes to the potential candidate, particularly in the numerically smaller branches of the Service, in which even the largest Colonies do not have enough posts to provide a full career for every officer appointed. For the smaller and less sought after Colonies the appeal of the widespread Service not limited to one territory is undoubtedly a major factor in satisfactory recruitment.

10. It is not intended to imply, however, that all promotions are to be reserved to officers originally recruited by the Secretary of State. It would be unrealistic not to recognise that, as locally recruited officers work their way up, there must be an increasing tendency to approve a local candidate who is well qualified for a promotion post even though someone with longer service or better qualifications could be obtained on transfer from outside. Nevertheless, promotions must continue to be made on the established basis of "official qualifications, experience and merit"; and it is clearly desirable that, for as long as possible in all territories, promotion posts should continue to be filled by selection from amongst all members of the Colonial Service meriting consideration for them, wherever they may be serving at the time. At the very least, it must remain with the Secretary of State, in the exercise of his general responsibility for the good government of the Colonies as well as his particular obligation to officers whom he has recruited, to satisfy himself in any given instance that the officer appointed to any vacant post is fully qualified for the duties of the post.

11. Taking all the above considerations into account I consider that the provisions of the existing Colonial Regulations in regard to the control of appointments are no longer entirely appropriate and that the present needs are for rules which provide that

- (a) in general, the selection of candidates for appointment or promotion to vacancies in the Public Service of a Colony rests with the Governor, subject to the exercise of his discretion in seeking the advice of the Public Service Commission, if there is one;
- (b) the Secretary of State's approval shall be required for appointments to posts the initial basic salary of which is not less than £1000 a year (or such smaller sum as shall be prescribed in relation to particular territories);
- (c) where the Governor is of the opinion that there is no suitable local candidate for any vacant office the initial basic salary of which is less than £1000 a year or that it is in the public interest that candidates from outside the Colony should be considered for such a vacancy, he may either request the Secretary of State to select a candidate or instruct the Crown Agents for the Colonies to engage a suitable candidate.

/Accordingly

Accordingly, Colonial Regulations Nos. 23-29 are revoked and replaced by three new Regulations, the precise provisions of which are set out in the enclosed amendment slip. Nothing in these new Regulations should, however, affect the present arrangements for appointment to, or promotion in, the Colonial Audit Service, to which special considerations clearly apply.

12. It will be observed that the device of a salary limit has been retained. Consideration was given to the designation of specific posts, appointment to which would still require the Secretary of State's approval. The salary criterion however would appear to be simpler and less objectionable than the designation of posts, which would have to be worked out separately for each Colony and might involve a measure of controversy. As regards the precise salary limit, a figure of £1000 a year would give all that is needed for practical purposes, since for some time at any rate, the initial basic salary of all posts in the junior grades of the Unified Services is likely to remain below that figure. In a number of Colonies the adoption of a basic salary as high as £1000 a year would include a number of promotion posts for which it would be desirable for the Secretary of State to retain a measure of responsibility and I am addressing the Governors of these territories separately, indicating the appropriate figure in each case.

13. I should wish to make it quite clear that while powers are now given to Governors to appoint suitable candidates to posts which have been included in the schedules of the Unified Services, it is not intended that these powers should be construed as including the power to admit any officer so appointed to membership of such a Service. This power is still reserved to the Secretary of State as provided by the Special Regulations of the various Services and will continue to be exercised only by him. It may well be that some of those officers who will be appointed under the powers now given to Governors may wish to apply for Unified Service status. If they can be recommended to the Secretary of State as entirely suitable for membership and have the requisite qualifications (where these are a condition of membership) there will be no bar to admission. I think, however, that local officers will as a rule rightly look to the Public Service of their own Colony to offer the status and the career to which they may normally aspire.

14. I have taken the opportunity to re-state in the preceding paragraph the position in respect of admission to membership of the Unified Services, since it may be thought that the deletion of any reference in the new Regulations to appointments to offices normally filled by members of those Services conferred powers on Governors to admit officers after the introduction of the new provisions. Further, when the new Regulations are made public officers may think that appointments to an office scheduled in a Unified Service would automatically convey membership of the appropriate Service. It is clear, I hope, from what has been said above that the existing position in this respect remains unaltered.

15. You will observe that the definition of "local candidates" includes persons resident in any other part of the Commonwealth who are recruited by the Colonial Government under arrangements approved by the Secretary of State. Provision already exists (Colonial Regulation No. 29) by which Governors may be authorised to recruit for certain posts in places other than the colony in which the vacant office exists, and authority to do so has been given in some cases. The exercise of the extended powers provided by the new regulations should, I consider, be subject to some limitation, having regard to the general responsibility laid upon the Secretary of State. To meet this, I consider it desirable that such recruitment should be through approved recruiting machinery, where that exists, and that any dispensation previously granted, or to be granted in the future, to a Colonial Government to recruit outside the Colony, should not in practice be exercised in respect of vacancies in the Administrative, Audit and (gazetted) Police Services.

.

18. It would be an advantage to bring these new arrangements into force with effect from a specified date and I therefore direct that the revised Regulations should be regarded as in force with effect from 1st October, 1953.

.

I have the honour to be,
Sir,
Your most obedient,
humble Servant,

(Signed) OLIVER LYTTLETON

Amendment Slip

CHAPTER III OFFICERS

'A' Appointments

For Colonial Regulations 23 to 29 inclusive,
substitute as follows:-

23. Except as provided in the two following Regulations, the Governor may select suitably qualified local candidates for appointment or promotion to vacant offices in the Public Service. In making his selection the Governor shall take account of any advice tendered by the Public Service Commission, if such a Commission has been established in the Colony. The claims of meritorious officers in the Public Service will generally take precedence over those of persons not already in the Public Service.

For the purpose of this Regulation the term 'local candidates' means persons resident or serving in the Colony and includes persons resident in any other part of the Commonwealth who are recruited by the Colonial Government under arrangements approved by the Secretary of State.

24. The selection of a candidate for any appointment the initial salary of which is not less than £1000 a year, or such lesser sum as the Secretary of State may prescribe, shall be subject to the approval of the Secretary of State.

When a vacancy occurs in such a post, the Governor shall report it to the Secretary of State. The Governor may recommend a candidate to fill the vacancy, but it shall be clearly understood that the Secretary of State may select another candidate.

25. If the Governor is of opinion that there is no suitable local candidate for any vacant office the initial salary of which is less than £1000 a year or that it is in the public interest that persons other than local candidates should be considered for such vacancy, he may either request the Secretary of State to select a candidate or instruct the Crown Agents for the Colonies to recruit a suitable person.

APPENDIX II

PROPOSED SCALES

Sections

- A Schedule of Basic Scales A, B & C
- B Inducement formula
- C Schedule of Scales A, B & C, showing
 inducement additions.
- D Schedule of Scales D, E, N, P & T
- E Operation of Bars within all Scales

o o o

SECTION(A)

(ii)

SCHEDULE OF BASIC SALARY SCALES PROPOSED FOR THE PUBLIC SERVICES
 (Excluding the East African Railways and Harbours Administration)

MEN	WOMEN
<u>A Scale</u> A3 £630(693)x30-750(825) A2 £810(891)x36-918x42-1128(1241) A1 £1176(1294)x48-1320(1452) <u>Medical/Scientific extension-</u> £1374(1511)x54 biennially - 1482(1630)	<u>A Scale</u> (W) A3 £630(693)x30-750(825) (W) A2 £780(858)x30-810x36-918x42-1128(1241) (W) A1 £1176(1294)x48-1320(1452) Medical/Scientific extension - £1374(1511)x54 biennially - 1482(1630)
<u>B Scale</u> B5 £588(647)x24-684(752) B4 £762(838)x30-852(937) B3 £882(970)x30-912x36-984(1082) B2 £1020(1122)x36-1128(1241) B1 £1176(1294)x48-1320(1452)	<u>B Scale</u> (W) B5 £588(647)x24-684(752) (W) B4 £708(779)x24-732x30-792(871) (W) B3 £822(904)x30-912(1003) (W) B2 £948(1043)x36-1128(1241) (W) B1 £1176(1294)x48-1320(1452)
<u>C Scale</u> C6 £498(548)x18-516(568) C5 £540(594)x24-636(700) C4 £714(785)x30-804(884) C3 £834(917)x30-924(1016) C2 £954(1049)x30-984x36-1092(1201) C1 £1128(1241)x48-1320(1452)	<u>C Scale</u> (W) C6 £498(548)x18-516(568) (W) C5 £540(594)x24-636(700) (W) C4 £660(726)x24-634x30-744(818) (W) C3 £774(851)x30-864(950) (W) C2 £894(983)x30-984x36-1092(1201) (W) C1 £1128(1241)x48-1320(1452)

(iii)

Section(B)

STATEMENT OF INDUCEMENT FORMULA

Scale C

- (a) £150 at basic salary point £498.
Then by increases of £6 at each incremental point to £684.
- (b) £198 at basic salary point £714.
Then by increases of £6 at each incremental point to £1320.

Scale B

- (a) £174 at basic salary point £588.
Then by increases of £6 at each incremental point to £732.
- (b) £210 at basic salary point £762.
Then by increases of £6 at each incremental point to £1320.

Scale A

- (a) £186 at basic salary point £630.
Then by increases of £6 at each incremental point to £1320.
- (b) For the points beyond £1320 in the extension of the A Scale the inducement addition is fixed at £300.

SECTION (C)

(v)

SCHEDULE OF A, B & C SCALES (WOMEN) SHOWING INDUCEMENT ADDITION AT EACH POINT

						C (W)			
						Basic	Inducement	Total	
						498 (548)	150	648 (713)	
						516 (568)	156	672 (739)	
									
						540 (594)	162	702 (773)	Nursing Sisters
						564 (620)	168	732 (805)	
						588 (647)	174	762 (838)	
						612 (673)	180	792 (871)	
						636 (700)	186	822 (904)	
						660 (726)	192	852 (937)	
						684 (752)	198	882 (970)	
						708 (779)	204	912 (1003)	
						732 (805)	210	942 (1036)	
						762 (838)	216	972 (1069)	
						792 (871)	222	1008 (1109)	
						822 (904)	228	1044 (1148)	
						852 (937)	234	1080 (1188)	
						882 (970)	240	1116 (1228)	
						912 (1003)	246	1152 (1267)	
						948 (1043)	252	1194 (1313)	
						984 (1082)	258	1236 (1360)	
						1020 (1122)	264	1278 (1406)	
						1056 (1162)	270	1320 (1452)	
						1092 (1201)	276	1362 (1498)	
						1128 (1241)	282	1404 (1544)	
						1176 (1294)	288	1458 (1604)	
						1224 (1346)	294	1512 (1663)	
						1272 (1399)	300	1566 (1723)	
						1320 (1452)	300	1620 (1782)	
						1374 (1511)	300	1674 (1836)	
						1428 (1571)	300	1728 (1890)	
						1482 (1630)	300	1782 (1944)	

(Inducement

addition not

normally payable-

see paragraph 97)

1049T

(1A)

Section D Schedule of Scales D, E, N, P AND T

<u>E SCALE</u>		
<u>D Scale</u> <u>Men and Women</u>	<u>Men</u>	<u>Women</u>
£408(449)x18-480(528)	E6-£90(99)x6-120(132) E5-132(145)x6-156(172) E4-162(178)x9-180x12-228(251) E3-252(277)x12-300x18-318(350) E2-336(370)x18-390(429) E1-408(449)x18-480(528)	E(W)6-£90(99)x6-120(132) E(W)5-126(139)x6-156(172) E(W)4-162(178)x9-180x12-228(251) E(W)3-240(264)x12-300(330) E(W)2-318(350)x18-390(429) E(W)1-408(449)x18-480(528)
<u>N Scale</u>	<u>'N' Scale with inducement addition</u>	
N5-£540(592)x24-684x30-804(884) N4-588(647)x24-684x30-864(950) N3-864(950) N2-954(1049) N1-1128(1241)	N5-£702(772)x30-912x36-1020(1122) N4- 762(838)x30-912x36-1092(1201) N3-1092(1201) N2-1200(1320) N1-1404(1544)	

Section D

(vii)

P Scales

P16A	£72(79)x2/8s-84x3(biennially)-96(106)	with free quarters
P16	£78(86)x2/8s-90x3(biennially)-102(112)	without free quarters
P15A	£84(92)x2/8s-96x3(biennially)-108(119)	with free quarters
P14A	£72(79)x2/8s-96x3(biennially)-108(119)	with free quarters
P14	£78(86)x2/8s-102x3(biennially)-114(125)	without free quarters
P13A	£84(92)x2/8s-96x4/16s-120: 132x6-168(185)	with free quarters
P12A	£96(106)x4/16s-120(132)	with free quarters
P12	£102(112)x4/16s-126(139)	without free quarters
P11A	£132(145)x6-144(158)	with free quarters
P11	£138(152)x6-150(165)	without free quarters
P10B	£150(165)x6-162(178)	with free quarters
P10A	£150(165)x6-168(185)	with free quarters
P10	£156(172)x6-174(191)	without free quarters
P9A	£174(191)x6-186(205)	with free quarters
P9	£180(198)x6-192(211)	without free quarters
P8A	£192(211)x6-204(224)	with free quarters
P8	£198(218)x6-210(231)	without free quarters
P7	£180(198)x12-228: 252x12-276(304)	without free quarters
P6A	£210(231)x12-270(297)	with free quarters
P5	£288(317)x12-336x18-480(528)	without free quarters
P4	£462(508)x18-516x24-564(620)	without free quarters
P3	£462(508)x18-516x24-636(700)	without free quarters
P2	£498(548)x18-516x24-636: 714x30-894(983)	without free quarters
P1	£540(594)x24-636: 714x30-954(1049)	without free quarters

T Scale for Men and Women

£462(508)x18-516x24-540: 588x24-684(752)

SECTION EOPERATION OF BARS WITHIN ALL SCALES
(See paragraphs 84 & 88 of Report)

The bars here referred to apply only to movement within a long scale or within a series of linked segments constituting a scale. Where movement to a higher segment is in effect a promotion to a superior post or grade, the machinery of the Public Service Commission would operate (see paragraph 86)

Where successive segments in a Scale cover a combined establishment, movement into the higher grade segment should be controlled by bar system e.g. in the proposed grading:-

Assistant Officer	B5
Officer	B4-2
Senior Officer	B1

B5 and B4-2 cover a combined establishment (see para. 231) In this case the bar at the top of the B5 segment would operate, and the appropriate Board would adjudicate.

The bars which we recommend are indicated by the symbol // in the table following.

<u>Scale A</u>	£630-750//810-1128//1176-1320
<u>Scale A(W)</u>	£630-750//780-918//960-1128//1176-1320
<u>Scale B</u>	£588-684//762-984//1020-1128//1176-1320
<u>Scale B(W)</u>	£588-684//708-912//948-1128//1176-1320
<u>Scale C</u>	£498 or 540-636//714-924//954-1092//1128-1320
<u>Scale C(W)</u>	£498 or 540-636//660-864//894-1092//1128-1320
<u>Scale E</u>	£90-120//132-156//162-228//252-318//336-390:408-480
<u>Scale E(W)</u>	£90-120//126-156//162-228//240-300//318-390: 408-480
<u>Scale T and T(W)</u>	£462-540//588-684

P Scales We have not attempted to insert bars in these scales, as their placement must depend on the organisation and promotion structure in the Police and other Departments which use the P Scales. We suggest that the placement of bars should be decided by consultation between administrations regard being had to our general principles that a bar should occur after the first five years of service and thereafter at intervals of from five to more years.

APPENDIX III (Paragraph 162)

ENTRY POINTS INTO THE E SCALES FOR THE CLERICAL AND ANALOGOUS SERVICES

	<u>Kenya</u>	<u>Tanganyika</u>	<u>Uganda</u>	<u>Zanzibar</u>
<u>Entry point</u> <u>£</u>	<u>Educational and training standard</u>	<u>Educational and training standard</u>	<u>Educational and training standard</u>	<u>Educational and training standard</u>
E6 - 90(99)	Kenya African Preliminary Examination (Standard VIII)	Territorial Examination Standard VIII plus entry examination	Junior Secondary III Examination	Standard VIII
E6-108(119)	Kenya African Preliminary examination plus two years departmental training	Territorial Examination Standard VIII plus two years departmental training		
E6-120(132)		Territorial Examination Standard VIII plus three years departmental training		
E5-132(145)	Kenya African Secondary School Examination (Standard X)	Territorial Examination Standard X		
E5-144(158)		Territorial Examination Standard X plus one year's departmental training		
E5-150(165)			Junior Secondary III Examination plus three years departmental training	
E4-162(178)		Territorial Examination Standard X plus two years departmental training	School Certificate	

Kenya (contd.)Tanganyika (contd.)Uganda (contd.)Zanzibar (contd.)

^E E4-180(198)	School Certificate	School Certificate. Standard XII plus one year's departmental training.	School Certificate
E4-192(211)		Territorial Examination Standard X plus three years departmental training	
E4-204(224)	School Certificate plus one year departmental training	School Certificate plus one year departmental training Standard XII plus two years departmental training	
E4-228(241)	School Certificate plus two years departmental training	School Certificate plus two years departmental training	School Certificate plus three years departmental training
E2-252(277)		Higher School Certificate or intermediate degree if not selected for the Training Grade	Higher School Certificate or intermediate degree if not selected for the Training Grade
E2-336(370)	Graduates if not selected for the Training Grade	Graduates if not selected for the Training Grade	Graduates if not selected for the Training Grade