30.77

The Clerk of the Senate

Parliament Buildings

P.O. Box 41842 - 00100

NAIROBI

Email: csenate@parliament.go.ke

22 MAR 2018

Please Jacobste

RE: PETITION TO THE SENATE CONCERNING DETERIORATING HEALTH-CARE SERVICES IN WEST POKOT COUNTY

We, the undersigned,

2 2 MAR 2018

Residents of West Pokot County, representing each of the twenty (20) wards of West (20) wards of West (20) wards (20) war

DRAW the attention of the Senate to the following:

THAT, provision of Heath Care Services in West Pokot County is deteriorating at alarming levels undermining the constitutional right of citizens to access quality health care services. We bring to your attention the following underlying issues;

- 1. Theft of hospital equipment and instruments
- 1.1 THAT, there have been incessant theft of key health care instruments and equipment at Kapenguria Referral Hospital the latest being an Ultra sound machine whose whereabouts are not known;
- 1.2 THAT, efforts to commence investigations into the matter have been hampered by the County Government officials who have instead resorted to engaging witch doctors, Sorcerers, Seers and Magicians to cast spells to alleged thieves instead of putting in place adequate security measures and commencing thorough investigations legally;
- 2. Appointment of the Deputy Governor as the CECM in-Charge of Health.
- 2.1 THAT, the recent of appointment the Deputy Governor, Dr. Nicholas Owon Atudonyang as the CECM in charge of health has compromised the health care provision in the county due to the divided attention the Deputy Governor accords to the two roles assigned to him;
- 2.2 THAT, the services of the Deputy Governor have been compromised due to his divided attention on the two roles and conflict of interest with his personal engagements in the United States;
- 2.3 THAT, the Deputy Governor has consistently absconded/deserted his duties to attend to personal matters in the USA at the expense of his national duties.

- 3. Irregular and non-competitive employment of Health and other County workers
- THAT, there are irregular and non-competitive employment of health and other 3.1 County workers by the County Government whereby various appointments of key health and other staff on contract and permanent basis are done without due process/procedure as required by the law;
- 3.2 THAT, this has led to employment of unqualified, novice and incompetent health and other County staff on merit of political affiliation;
- 4. Harassment, Irregular, punitive, malicious transfer and demotion of health staff
- THAT, there has been harassment, irregular, punitive, malicious transfer and 4.1 demotion of key health workers/staff that are being perceived to be loyal to the former County regime;
- 4.2 THAT, the issues raised have led to poor delivery of health services in West Pokot County leading to avoidable deaths, negligence and loss of public resources.
- THAT, youths have been hired under a notorious umbrella organization known as 4.3 New Red Army (NRA) to intimidate, suppress dissenting voices and beat individuals and groups demanding for better health service delivery in the County;
- THAT, upon assumption of office, the Governor, Prof. John Lonyangapuo sent on 5. compulsory paid leave more than 77 County staff among them key health workers who continue to receive full monthly salaries and other benefits for work not done.
- THAT, we have made the best efforts to have these matters addressed by the 6. relevant authorities all of which have failed to give a satisfactory response.
- 7. THAT, none of these issues raised in this Petition is pending in any court of Law, Constitutional or any other legal body.

WHEREFORE, your humble petitioners pray that the Senate-

- 1. Orders a forensic audit and physical count of instruments and equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital;
- 2. Commissions a special team to investigate the loss of Ultra Sound Machine and other equipment in Kapenguria Referral Hospital;



- 3. Recommends that the Deputy Governor relinquishes the position of CECM in Charge of Health as a matter of public interest;
- 4. Establish the cumulative number of days the Deputy Governor has spent in the United States attending to his personal engagements at the expense of serving the people who gave him mandate;
- 5. Establish whether public funds have been incurred to finance the Deputy Governor's notorious piecemeal trips to USA and back and whether he sought clearance from relevant Government authorities as required for state officers;
- 6. Recommends appropriate action to be initiated against the Deputy Governor for abuse of office and other related violations that the Senate may deem fit and necessary;
- 7. Recommends that Human Resource Audit be undertaken on employment of new health and other county staff by West Pokot County Government for period starting 1st October, 2017 to-date;
- 8. Recommends whether it is viable for staff on compulsory leave to continue enjoying salaries and other benefits for work not done;
- 9. Recommends comprehensive job analysis and job evaluation for West Pokot County, Ministry of Health;
- 10. Recommend appropriate action for any form of malpractice during employment of Health and other staff in West Pokot County and/or
- 11. Makes any other order/direction that it may deem fit in the circumstance of this matter.

D	11st		MARRIT	
Dated this	X.I	day of	WITKCH	2018

Presented by:

Dennis Ruto Kapchok,

P.O. Box 136 30600

Kapenguria.

Tel. 0720939269 email: dkapchok@gmail.com

3

DENNIS RUTO	No	NAME	ADDRESS	I.D. No.	SIGNATURE
2. Jath Novilla 307 dapan 24 6/4/13 Trass 3. DORCH MARKET 16 16 A lapage 27 4/6 a/6 Our 1 Sold Novilla Novilla 1 26 8 Republic 27 9/16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 1	,	DEANIS RUTO	136 Kapaguria		
7. DORCH MARICH 4. EVELYPR LOMDINGIA 4. EVELYPR LOMDINGIA 5. EVELYPR LOMDINGIA 5. EVELYPR LOMDINGIA 7. EVELYPR LOMDINGIA 7. EVELYPR LOWER 8. RUTH NYDROK 9. RUTH NYDROK 9. Sally Deany 10. LEEEMAH PLIMAT 11. LEEEMAH PLIMAT 11. LEEEMAH PLIMAT 11. MIRRIN CHERE 12. ARGARIAN 24. 83. 1451 13. DENTIK KEDP 14. SEMIEL KARDO 15. OLGHANTICZ 373 18 71 KARD 16. REGINAM CHERTOM 17. Samuel Solme 18. LEEEMAH CHERTOM 18. KARDO 18. OLGHANTICZ 373 18 71 KARD 19. SEMIEL KARDO 18. OLGHANTICZ 373 18 71 KARD 19. SAMUEL KARDO 18. OLGHANTICZ 373 18 71 KARD 19. SAMUEL KARDO 18. OLGHANTICZ 373 18 71 KARD 19. SAMUEL KARDO 18. OLGHANTICZ 373 18 71 KARD 19. SAMUEL KARDO 18. OLGHANTICZ 373 18 71 KARD 19. SAMUEL KARDO 18. OLGHANTICZ 373 18 71 KARD 19. SAMUEL JAKA 18. OLGHANTICZ 373 18 71 KARD 19. SAMUEL JAKA 18. OLGHANTICZ 373 18 71 KARD 19. SAMUEL JAKA 18. SAMUEL JAKA 20. KARDANIE JAKA 21. KARDANIE JAKA 21. KARDANIE JAKA 22. NICHOLAR KARET 23. NICHOLAR KARET 24. NICHOLAR KARET 25. NICHOLAR KARET 26. NICHOLAR KARET 27. NICHOLAR KARET 28. OLGHANJE 29. OLEL KURGA 21. NICHOLAR KARET 20. NICHOLAR KARET	Q.	JOHN MGUNDAI			
1 12 12 12 12 12 12 12	7.				
265 Kaphal 20 1154 66 6 Extra Lower 124 kaphan 25 1154 66 7 Extra Lower 124 kaphan 25 1154 66 9 RUTH NORSOK HTS KAPARAM 247 124333 Norsod 15 15 15 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16 16	. 4	Everlyne Lomomini	268 Kapengo	27914763	w.
The Kith Chapter 124 kaping 2871682 Ruth Chapter 183 kaping 26040896 Stills Ruth Hydrsok Hts kaping 24124333 Sally Peng 563 kaping 24484777 specy 10 1262m/ah PLIMAT 112 kaping 2983/451 Run 113 kaping 26 83/451 Run 113 kaping 26 83/451 Run 113 Dehlis Krop 270 definite233/18 71 kpp. 13 Dehlis Krop 270 definite233/18 71 kpp. 14 Stmoet Kappe 130 kaping 26 07447 km. 15 Lemone Columb 200 kaping 26 07447 km. 16 Reginary Chertim 128 kaping 26 07447 km. 17 Samuel Pyyrka 162 dephnys 723/3/4 Run 162 kaping 28 20 683 chaptum. 18 Siman Moduli 3067 kaping 262/82 Munti. 19 Siman Moduli 626 kaping 262/82 Munti. 19 Siman Moduli 626 kaping 262/82 Munti. 20 Kaphel Rup. 168 kaping 35846 Aughou 21 Septing 100 186 kaping 35846 Aughou 22 Teoffrey 100 186 kaping 35846 Aughou 23 Achiengarik Runard 128 kaping 35846 Aughou 24 Final Morana 216 kaping 3587487 Stagning 27 Nicholas Kupat 119 kaping 328773 kupat 27 Nicholas Kupat 119 kaping 328773 kupat 27 Nicholas Kupat 119 kaping 35876 kupat 129 Kupat 129 Nicholas Kupat 119 kaping 35876 kupat 129 Nicholas Kupat 123 Kupat 129 Kupat 123	3	Johnson Rungson	263 Kapinger	20115446	M
## RUTH NORSOK ##\$ KAPENARIA 2472433 Notreed 9 RUTH NORSOK ##\$ KAPENARIA 2472433 Notreed 9 Sally Pang 563 Rigeryma 24484773 Cores 10 IEREMIAN PLIMAT 132 KAPENARIA 247333 Notreed 11 MIRRIAN CHERT 132 KAPENARIA 24874873 Cores 12 Mayer 24 8824218 Chur- 13 DENIS KIDP 270 OLOROWINE 233718 71 KAPE. 14 CAMUEL KAPED 130 Kapengur 28824218 Chur- 15 CAMUEL KAPED 130 Kapengur 21261871 Chapted. 16 REGINAN CHETION 128 Kapengur 250 6831 Chapted. 17 Samuel Dyyaka 162 Caspengur 262182 Must. 19 Sinan Musch 2005 Kapengur 262182 Must. 19 Sinan Musch 500 Kapengur 262182 Must. 20 Kapenel Dyyaka 168 Kapengur 262182 Must. 21 Verenica deptod 138 Kapengur 262187 Caspengur	6.		124 Kapezura	287482	the
9. Sally Day 10. IZAEMIAH PLIMAT 11. MIRIAM CHERR 11. MIRIAM 11. MIRIAM CHERR 11. MIRIAM 12. SERGHANGAN 28.24.21.18 Chum 13. DENHI KROP 14. CHARRO 15. DENHI KROP 16. REGINAL CHERTUM 17. Samuel Pyya KG 16. DENGINA CHERTUM 18. Siman Moetha 2085 Kopanya 262.182 Munt 19. Siman Moetha 2085 Kopanya 262.182 Munt 19. Siman Moetha 2085 Kopanya 262.182 Munt 19. Siman Moetha 2085 Kopanya 262.182 Munt 20. Kapanel Denard 16. Kapanya 246.16173 Tank 20. Kapanel Denard 21. Kapanya 246.16173 Tank 22. Achientery Romand 23. Kapanya 35.75.4135 Editor 24. Time Lomoran 25. Haisach Kiraham 26. Rottel Chumba 27. Veop 111. Kapanya 36.42.48.94 Kanap 28. JOEL KURGA 112. Kapanya 36.42.48.94 Kanap 29. JOEL KURGA 113. Lapanyan 36.42.48.94 Kanap 29. JOEL KURGA 114. Kapanyan 36.42.48.94 Kanap 29. JOEL KURGA 115. Lapanyan 36.42.48.94 Kanap 29. JOEL KURGA 116. Lapanyan 36.42.48.94 Kanap 29. JOEL KURGA 117. Kapanyan 36.42.48.94 Kanap 29. JOEL KURGA 118. Lapanyan 36.42.48.94 Kanap 29. JOEL KURGA 119. Kapanyan 36.42.48.94 Kanap 29. JOEL Kuran Kapanyan 20. K			183 Kapegura	26040896	Potter
10. IZAEMIAH PLIMAT 11. MIRIAM CHERR. 12. MERU Chepatry 13. DENIN KROP 13. DENIN KROP 13. OLARANIE KARDO 13. Nagenar 28824218 Chun- 25. SEAFRANCE 2331871 KRP. 14. CAMBEL KARDO 13. Nagenar 21.2 (1871 KARDO) 14. CAMBEL KARDO 15. Nagenar 21.2 (1871 KARDO) 16. REGINAH CHERTUM 17. Samuel Pryaka 18. Sinan Musella 20. Sinan Musella 20. Sinan Musella 20. Kapana 262182 Must. 19. Sinan Musella 20. Kapana 252182 Must. 20. Kapana 2521147 Runto 21. Venonica deptro 22. Herengarth Runard 23. Kapana 35894133 Elfist 24. Cheengarth Runard 25. Friach Horaban 26. Kottel Chunka 27. Just Krop 11. Kapana 36427874 Kong 28. JOEL KURGA 29. JOEL KURGA 19. Nicholas KIRET 20. Nicholas KIRET 20. Nicholas KIRET 20. Nicholas Kiret 21. Kapana 35. 26745 Muse 22. DETERSON CANG 23. Kapana 35. 26745 Muse 24. Dicken DANIEL 25. Nagena 35. 26745 Muse 26. John Territory 27. Nicholas Kiret 28. Nicholas Kiret 29. DETERSON CANG 20. Sirias Kapana 35. 26745 Melan 20. PETERSON CANG 21. Venonis Sirias Region 22. DETERSON CANG 23. References Sirias Region 24. Dicken Kiplenoi Robel 23. Kapana 35. 26745 Melan 25. Peterson Kiplenoi Robel 23. References 35. 26745 Melan 23. References Sirias Region 24. Dicken Kiplenoi Robel 23. Kapana 35. 26745 Melan 23. References Sirias References 24. Dicken Kiplenoi Robel 23. Kapana 35. 26745 Melan 23. References Robel 23. Kapana 343118 Melan 24. Dicken Kiplenoi Robel 23. Kapana 343118 Melan 24. Dicken Kiplenoi Robel 23. Kapana 343118 Melan 24. Dicken Kiplenoi Robel 23. Kapanan 24. Sirias Apana 25. Kapanan 26. Kapanan 27. Kapanan 28. Kapanan 29. Sirias Kapanan 29. Kapanan 29. Sirias Kapanan 29. Sirias Kapanan 29. Sirias Kapanan 29. Kapanan 20. Kapanan 20. Kapanan 20. Kapanan 20. Kapana		RUTH HYDRSOK			House -
11. Milliam citére. 12. Meety Chypahy 258 Kethenger 28824218 Chum- 13. Défilis Ktop 270 definite23331871 KPP. 14. CAMPEL KARDO 150 Kapegor 21361871 CHPTON. 16. REGINAH CHETTON 12.8 Kapegor 28206831 CHPTON. 17. Samuel Pyyaka 16. Dag Definis 723187 Cherton. 19. Siman Mostla 3057 kapegor 28206831 CHPTON. 19. Siman Mostla 3057 kapegor 282182 Must. 20. Kaphal Definis 3057 kapegor 282182 Must. 20. Kaphal Definis 3057 kapegor 282182 Must. 21. Samuel Pyyaka 22. Kapegor 282182 Must. 23. Kapegor 282182 Must. 24. Cherton Too 166 kapegor 282183 Flist 24. Fine Languard 128 kapegor 3537 1837 Flist 25. Final Mostan 218 kapegor 3537 1837 Flist 26. Rotal Chumbs 28 kapegor 3837 1837 Flist 27. Pies Krop 28. Vop 29. Voel Kulgat 119 Kapegor 384787 Kulgat 29. Voel Kulgat 129 Kapegor 388877 Kulgat 29. Nicholak Kiret 101 Kapegor 387877 Kulgat 29. Nicholak Kiret 101 Kapegor 387877 Kulgat 29. Nicholak Kiret 101 Kapegor 387877 Kulgat 29. Nicholak Kiret 101 Kapegor 387878 Parad 29. Peterson Kipilenoi Rotal 238 Karengund. 348718	-		563 Rapergura	24484773	carein
13. Merry Ohepahy 13. DEMIS KROP 13. DEMIS KROP 14. SAMUEL KAPPOD 15. Napogar 21.26 18 TI KROP 16. REGINAN CHERTON 17. Samuel Solmo 18. Simon Moodla 18. Simon Moodla 205 Kapengar 2820 683 I CHERTON 17. Samuel Pryaka 18. Simon Moodla 2065 Kapengar 2820 683 I CHERTON 18. Solan Moodla 2065 Kapengar 2820 683 I CHERTON 19. Solan Moodla 2065 Kapengar 2820 683 I CHERTON 20 Kapollo Rope 21. Solan Moodla 2065 Kapengar 2820 683 I CHERTON 21. Solan Moodla 22. Hollow Rope 23. Teoffrey Too 16. Kapengar 282 1147 Dundo 23. Teoffrey Too 16. Kapengar 282 1147 Dundo 24. Cherton Too 18. Kapengar 282 1147 Dundo 25. Hasal Hordan 26. Rotal Chambs 27. The Krop Mark 28. Rotal Chambs 28. Nicholax Kiret 29. JOEL KURGAT 20. Taket DANIEL 20. Taket DANIEL 20. Taket DANIEL 21. Solandar 3557 6880 Jehan 22. PETERSON CANIG 23. Kapengar 3546 7248 Design 24. DINAL TERIT (17. Kapal 357 6880 Jehan 23. PETERSON CANIG 23. Kapengar 3546 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3546 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3546 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 24. Dickson Kipikewi Robic 23. Kapengar 2828 7443 Berton 24. Kapengar 3746 7248 Design 25. Kapengar 2828 7448 Design 26. Kapengar 2828 7448 Design 27. Napogar 3746 7248 Design 28. Kapengar 2828 7448 Design 29. Dickson Kipike 2828 7448 Design 29. Dickson Kipike 2828 7448 Design 29. Dickson Kipike 2828 7448 Design 29. Dickson					Fru.
13. DENNIE KROP 14. SEMUEL KARDO 15. Napogor 21.26 18 II KARRO 16. REGINAH CHERTUM 17. Samuel Pyaka 18. Simon Macha 305 Kapagon 2820 683 I CHERTUM. 19. Simon Macha 305 Kapagon 2820 683 I CHERTUM. 19. JOHN Varinki 620 Harron 262 182 Munt. 19. JOHN Varinki 620 Harron 262 182 Munt. 20. Kapalo Ropho 128 Kapagon 2521 1147 Rundo 21. Valonica depto 128 Kapagon 2521 1147 Rundo 22. Jeofren Tob 166 Kapagon 3589 4131 Taturo 23. Jeofren Tob 166 Kapagon 3589 4131 Taturo 24. Time I amaran 25. Harron 212569 Comaran 26. Rotal Chamba 216 Kapagon 320 038 Harron 27. Valonica Nordan 28. Rotal Chamba 216 Kapagon 320 038 Harron 29. Die Kupagon 357 26 187 Kupagon 29. Nicholax Kiret 201 Kapagon 357 26 187 Kupagon 20. Tukel DANIEL 125 Napogon 357 26 1880 Rundo 21. Maluselah ye god. 110 Kapagon 357 26 1880 Rundo 22. PETERSON CANIG 357 Maran 23. Rosembry Masket 238 Kapagon 34318 Maran 34. Dienon Kapigon Rotal 233 Kapagon 359 46 1748 Paran 35. Rosembry Masket 238 Kapagon 398 4718	11-				
14 CAMUEL KARDO 130 Kapengur 21 26 18 TI CKAPBO. 16 REGINAH CHERTUM 128 Kapengur 2820 683 I CHERTUM. 17 Samuel Pyyaka 169 Cappur 3872 1711 Pamaka 19 Siman Moetha 3087 Kapengur 262 182 Munt. 19 John Varinki 620 Kapengur 262 182 Munt. 20 Kapchel Dob. 168 Kapengur 262 182 Munt. 20 Kapchel Dob. 168 Kapengur 251141 Rungo 21 Vennaica decotod 128 Kapengur 35 55440 Overtur 22 Jeoffrey Toto 166 Kapengur 35 57 4 133 Fatur 23 Achientruk Benard 128 Kapengur 39 55 4 133 Fatur 24 Amel Jamaran 216 Kapengur 39 57 4 133 Fatur 25 Paiach Horaham 216 Kapengur 39 57 4 133 Fatur 26 Rottel Chumba 314 Kapengur 39 57 7 1 Kulght 27 Just Vrop 111 Kapengur 3288 57 31 Kulght 29 JOEL KURGAT 119 Kapengur 3288 57 31 Kulght 29 Nichtela Kurgat 128 128 135 17 132 Nick 30 Tukel DANIEL 125 Napongur 35 7 26880 Papea. 31 DANIEL TERIT (CIT Kapel 35 7 26880 Papea. 32 PETERSON CANIG 35 7 1000 Papea. 33 Kapengur 35 7 26748 Menard 34 Dicken Kipikenoi Rotal 233 Kapengur 35 46 7248 Papea. 34 BUEMBRY MANKET 238 KAPENGUR 39 25 4433					100 To 10
16 REGINAH CHERTUM 128 KERUGAN 2820 6831 CHERTUM 17 Samuel Pyyaka 189 Chapter 2820 6831 CHERTUM 19 Siman Moodla 3087 Kapelgan 2821 1341 Pum Kar 19 Siman Moodla 3087 Kapelgan 2821 182 Munt. 19 John Navinski 626 Kapelgan 2821 182 Munt. 20 Kapelak Dopp. 168 Kapelgan 2527 1147 Runto 21 Venerica dieptod 128 Kapelgan 3589 4 135 Editor 22 Jeotfrey Toto 166 Kapelgan 3589 4 135 Editor 23 Achiengarotk Danard 128 Kapelgan 3589 4 135 Editor 24 Filme Lamoran 918 Kapelgan 3589 4 135 Editor 25 Grand Moranan 918 Kapelgan 32859 8 Kapelgan 26 Rottel Chamba 314 Kapelgan 32859 8 Kapelgan 27 Just Krop 111 Kapelgan 3642 48 94 Kapelgan 28 JOEL KURGAT 119 Kapelgan 32857 8 Kulgat 29 Nicholas Kibet 128 Japelgan 35 92 6745 Noval 31 DANIEL TERIT (CIT Kapel 3592 6880 Delfan 32 PETERSON CANIG 338 Kapelganan 35 92 6745 Noval 31 DANIEL TERIT (CIT Kapel 3592 6880 Delfan 32 PETERSON CANIG 338 Kapelganan 35 94 7248 Design 34 BUENBRY MAUKET 338 Kapelganan 3543748 Design 34 BUENBRY MAUKET 338 Kapelganan 3843748			1.1		
16 REGINAN CHERTUM 17 Samuel Pryaka 18 Valengen 2820 6831 CHERTUM 17 Samuel Pryaka 18 Simon Moodla 18 Valengen 2820 6831 CHERTUM 18 Simon Moodla 18 Valengen 2820 6831 CHERTUM 19 Simon Moodla 2067 Kapping 262182 Month 20 Kapchol Robin 20 Kapchol Robin 21 Verronica dieptod 21 Verronica dieptod 22 Fofficer Too 166 Kapelgen 3589 4135 Editor 23 Achiengorek Amara 21 Se Kapping 3589 4135 Editor 24 Fame Lomaran 25 Chainel Abraham 26 Kotich Chumba 26 Kotich Chumba 27 Pier Vrop 28 JOEL KURGAT 29 III Kapping 36427894 Vanop 29 JOEL KURGAT 20 III Kapping 36427894 Vanop 29 JOEL KURGAT 20 III Kapping 3592737 Kulght 20 Tikel DANIEL 20 Tikel DANIEL 20 Tikel DANIEL 21 Robing M 35 72 6745 INCH 22 PETERSON CANIG 23 PETERSON CANIG 23 Kapengund 38 43918	14				
17. Samuel Pygks 160 Olaporis 723 134. Pom Kar. 19. Simon Modella 3067 Kapengun 262 182 Munt. 19. John Navinki 625 Kapengun 262 182 Munt. 20. Kapendel Dub. 168, Kapengun 296 161 73 Hamk. 21. Venunica deptod 128 Kapengun 3055446 Austru 20 Jeophyse Too 166 Kapengun 3055446 Austru 20 Jeophyse Too 166 Kapengun 30574 135 Jehns 20 Jeophyse Jenard 128 Kapengun 30574 135 Jehns 20 Jenard 128 Kapengun 30574 135 Jehns 20 Jenard 216 Kapengun 30574 135 Jehns 20 Jenard 216 Kapengun 30574 Jenard 216 Kapengun 30574 Jenard 216 Kapengun 30574 Jenard 27 Just Vrop 111 Kapengun 3042 7874 Kapengun 305 726745 Musch 129 John Nichola Kirel Daniel 129 Hapengun 305 726745 Musch 129 Daniel Terit 129 Hapengun 305 726745 Musch 129 Daniel Terit 129 Hapengun 305 726745 Menan 30 Peterson Kiphenoi Robel 233 Kapengun 305 46 7248 Penan 30 Peterson Kiphenoi Robel 233 Kapengun 305 46 7248 Penan 30 Peterson Kiphenoi Robel 233 Kapengun 305 46 7248 Penan 30 Rosenson Kiphenoi Robel 233 Kapengun 305 46 7248 Penan 30 Rosenson Kiphenoi Robel 233 Kapengun 305 46 7248 Penan 30 Rosenson Kiphenoi Robel 233 Kapengun 305 46 7248 Penan 30 Rosenson Kiphenoi Robel 233 Kapengun 305 46 7248 Penan 30 Rosenson Kiphenoi Robel 333 Kapengun 305 46 7248 Penan 30 Rosenson Kiphenoi Robel 333 Kapengun 305 46 7248 Penan 305 Peterson Kiphenoi Robel 333 Kapengun 305 46 7248 Penan 305 Peterson Kiphenoi Robel 3238 Kapengun 305 746 7248 Penan 305 Peterson Kiphenoi Robel 3238 Kapengun 305 746 7248 Penan 305 Peterson Kiphenoi Robel 3238 Kapengun 305 746 7248 Penan 305 Peterson Kiphenoi Robel 3238 Kapengun 305 746 7248 Penan 305 Peterson Kiphenoi Robel 3238 Kapengun 305 746 7248 Penan 305 Peterson Kiphenoi Robel 3238 Kapengun 305 746 7248 Penan 305 746 745 745 745 745 745 745 745 745 745 745			205 Kaleyar	25014643	
19. John Marinki 306 Kapelyon 262 182 Munter 19. John Kavinki E2 (languari 246 16173 tamk, 20 Kapelyol Doto. 21 Verenica deptod 128 Kapelyon 3527 1147 Runto 22 Jeoffrey Teo 166 Kapelyon 3589 4135 Ethic 23 Achiengrotik Amara 128 Kapelyon 369 4135 Ethic 24 Amelyonik Amara 128 Kapelyon 369 4135 Ethic 25 Freich Hordran 216 Kapelyon 369 458 Ameran 26 Roticl Chumba 314 Kapelyon 3642 7894 Kapel 27 Per Vrop 111 Kapelyon 3288 736 Kulght 28. JOEL Kulgat 119 Kapelyon 3288 736 Kulght 29. Nicholax Kibet 1201 Kapelyon 3592 6880 Runto 30 Tukel DANIEL 125 Languagen 3592 6880 Runto 31 DANIEL TERIT (CIT Katel 3592 6880 Runto 32 PETERSON CAMB 3671 Rosen 3592 6745 Meion 33 PETERSON CAMB 3571 Kopelyon 3546 7248 Panag 34 Dickson Kipilewoi Robil 233 Kapelyond 343718 Marines.		0	178 KG PUNGONS	< 250 0871	,
19. John Varinki E2 Hapagor 24616173 tank. 20 Kaphol Rop. 168 Kaphon 25271147 Runto 21 Venumica deptod 128 Kaphon 25271147 Runto 22 Jeoffrey Too 166 Kapelgon 35874135 Entre 23 Acherogroß Donard 128 Kaphon 35874135 Entre 24 Fame Lomanan 918 Kaphon 36000000000000000000000000000000000000	1				10 - 0
Repended Date. 168, Kapengar 2527 1147 Rundo 118 Kapengar 2527 1147 Rundo 20 Verminica dieptod 128 Kapengar 35 156446 Quentou 21 JEOFFREY Too 166 Kapengar 35 74 175 Entro 22 Acheengarolk Runard 128 Kapengar 36000000000000000000000000000000000000			2067 Kapeligin	262 182	I with.
21 Vermice deptod 128 Kapticus 30,55446 Aceptod 22 JECHTREY TOD 166 Kapticus 30,55446 Aceptod 23 Achernatorok Annard 128 Kapticus 320,000 Comercia 24 Fame Lomaran 915 Kapticus 320,000 Comercia 25 Presach Abraham 216 Kapticus 320,000 Hottod 26 Roticl Chumba 314 Kapticus 320,000 Hottod 27 Plus Vrop 111 Kapticus 3288,773 Kulgat 29 JOEL KURGAT 119 Kapticus 3288,773 Kulgat 29 NICHOLAK KIBET 2011 Kapticus 3288,773 Kulgat 20 TUKEI DANIEL 125 Napoligus 35,926,745 Neck 21 DANIEL TERIT (617 Kapticus 35,926,745 Necas 22 PETERSON CANG 35,726,745 Necas 23 PETERSON CANG 35,726,745 Necas 24 Dickson Kipikuwi Roticl 233 Kapenguna. 343918 Market 35 ROJEMBRY MAJKET 228 KAPENGIRA 2825,4433					Hamki
JEOFFREY TOO 166 Kapelani 3589 4135 Edward 23 ACherengorok Romard 128 Kapelani 3589 4135 Edward 24 Fame Lomard 918 Kapelani 3600 John Alamon 26 Rotal Chumbs 314 Kapegnia 3600 JOSE Harrow 26 Rotal Chumbs 314 Kapegnia 3642 7894 Kapegnia 3642 7897 Kulgart 119 Kapelani 3288 5736 Kulgart 29 Nichtolani Kibet 125 Nagolagin 3592 6746 Jukil 31 DANIEL 125 Nagolagin 3592 6746 Jukil 31 DANIEL TERIT (617 Kalqui 3592 6880 Jayan 35 92 6746 Nelon 32 PETERSON CANIG 3572 Kapegnia 3592 6880 Jayan 35 92 6746 Nelon 32 PETERSON CANIG 3572 Kapegnia 343918 Aperica 31 ROSEMBRY MASKET 238 Kapegnia 343918		• 1 1			0: 1
128 Kgriguri 360147 KT Alegrorits 24 Jame Lonard 918 Kgriguri 360147 KT Alegrorits 25 Ariach Abraham 918 Kgriguri 9180569 Comeran 26 Rotach Chumbs 314 Kaprinis 3209 028 Abraham 27 Just Vrop 111 Kaprinis 36427894 Kgrap 28 JOEL XURGAT 119 Kaprinis 32885736 Kulgat 29 Nicholax Kibet 101 Kaprinis 35551932 Nick 31 DANIEL TERIT 1617 Kagri 35926745 Nick 32 PETERSON CAMIG 3571 Kopeninis 35926745 New 32 PETERSON CAMIG 3571 Kaprinis 35926745 New 33 ROLEMBRY MAUKET 238 KAPENGURA 384354433					and the latest and th
Time Lomanan 25 Chrisch Horahan 26 Rotich Chumbs 27 Plus Krop 111 Kapaguni 36427874 Korop 28 JOEL KURGAT 19 Kapaguni 36427874 Korop 111 Kapaguni 32885736 KURGAT 29 NICHOLAR KIBET 20 TUKEI DANIEL 31 DANIEL TERIT 125 Kapanguni 35 72 6745 TUKET 32 PETERSON CAMB 31 STERSON CAMB 32 ROSEMBRY MAUKET 23 KAPENGUNA 28254433					
26 Kotich Chumbs 27 Plus Krop 111 Kapagum 364278 94 Korop 28 JOEL KURGAT 119 Kapagum 32885736 KURGAT 29 NICHOLAR KIBET 2011Kapandais 35551932 Ninck 20 TUKEI DANIEL 129 Napangum 35 92 6746 TUKEI 31 DANIEL TERIT (617 Kaga : 35926880 Repair 32 PETERSON CAMIG 357 Kobengum 35 46 7248 Period 31 Dickson Kipikemoi Robel 233 Kapangum 35 46 7248 Period 34 Dickson Kipikemoi Robel 238 KAPENGURIA 28254433			28 Keneryunz	34074711	
26 Kotich Chumbs 27 Plus Krop 111 Kapagum 364278 94 Korop 28 JOEL KURGAT 119 Kapagum 32885736 KURGAT 29 NICHOLAR KIBET 2011Kapandais 35551932 Ninck 20 TUKEI DANIEL 129 Napangum 35 92 6746 TUKEI 31 DANIEL TERIT (617 Kaga : 35926880 Repair 32 PETERSON CAMIG 357 Kobengum 35 46 7248 Period 31 Dickson Kipikemoi Robel 233 Kapangum 35 46 7248 Period 34 Dickson Kipikemoi Robel 238 KAPENGURIA 28254433			918 Kanama	325506	Aneran
27. PLUS Krop 28. JOEL KURGAT 119 Kapangun 364278 94 Kanap 26. NICHOLAR KIBET 2011Kapangun 35 92 6746 JUKET 31 DANIEL TERIT 129 Kanangun 35 92 6746 JUKET 32 MEDUSALAN 12 901. 110 Kangan 35 92 6880 Rupan. 32 PETERSON CAMIG 357 Kapangun 35 46 7248 PSWG 34 DICKSON KIPIKEMOI ROBEL 238 KAPENGUNA 28254433					
28. JOEL KURGAT 119 Kapadank 32885736 KURGAT 26. NICHDLAK KIBET 2011Kapadani 35551932 Nick 30 TUKEI DANIEL 129 Nagodigun 35726745 Nick 31 DANIEL TERIT (617 Kage: 35926880 Rupan. 32 PETERSON GAMIG 357 Kapangun 35467248 Person 34 Dickson Kipikemoi Robel 233 Kapangun 35467248 Person 34 Dickson Kipikemoi Robel 233 Kapangun 343918 154 DICKSON Kipikemoi Robel 238 KAJENGUNA 28254433		Pine VxoD	314 Kayagun	3(45733	
26. NICHOLAR KIBET 20 TUKEI DANIEL 125 DANIEL 127 Kapengur 35 72 6745 Menon 22 PETERSON CANG 23 PETERSON CANG 237 Kapengur 35 46 7248 Peron 24 DICKSON Kipikemoi Robil 238 KAJENGURA 2825 4433	20.				
30 TUKEI DANIEL 125 Napolgon 35 72 6745 TUKE 31 DANIEL TERIT (617 Kage). 35 92 6880 JRyan. 32 Meduselah yegol. 110 Kanger. 35 92 6745 Meron. 32 PETERSON CANIG 357 Kapengun 35 46 7248 Person. 34 Dickson Kipikemoi Robil 233 Kapengun 343918 Marios. 31 ROJEMBRY MAJKET 238 KAJENGUN 2825 4433	26.		2011Vaga 1 -15	15 CC 1570	
31 DANIEL TERIT (617 Kage). 35926880 JRyan. 32 Meduselah yegol. 11D Kager. 35926745 Meran. 32 PETERSOH CAMIG 35712 Dongr 35467248 Persong 34 Dickson Kipikemoi Robich 233 Kapenguna. 343918 Market. 31 ROJEMBRY MAJKET 238 KAJENGURIA 28254433	30	-			
32 Meduselah jegol. 112 Kanger 35 926745 Meion. 32 PETERSON CANIG 357 Kapenguna 3546 7248 Persong 34 Dickson Kipikemoi Robich 233 Kapenguna 343918 MAUKET 238 KAJENGURIA 28254433			Kit Kars.	3592 6880	
32 PETERSON CAME 357 Repengend 3546 7248 PSWG 34 DICKSON Kipikemoi Robich 233 Kapengund 343918 MASKET 238 KAPENGURIA 28254433	37				
31 ROJEMBRY MANKET 238 KAPENGURIA 28254433	23.				
31 ROJEMBRY MAUKET 338 KAPENGURIA 28254433	45		233 Kanevound.	343918	1
	,			28254423	FIX.
	36	Andrew lader	/		Ada

Presented by a Dennis Ruto:

On behalf of Residents of West Pokot County

.

No	NAME	ADDRESS	I.D. No.	SIGNATURE
37				-
20	Clerop Peris	106 Keflengvin	2020(25)	Amka.
38	CLOSP Peris ABDIRAHINAM ABDULLAHI	284 Kapangura 136 Keplagura 106 Kapenyung 598-38600 Kes	279 Col 11	Abdirate
HO	Kibet, yadan	106 Kamaula	24/306 (Kul
air	The World	5'98-38500 Noc	25110124	
42	CATHERINE NEORIAKOU	368-KAPENGU4	7705906	Cathel -
43	CHERISE ROTINO	349 Karengu RIA		aul.
44	JEHNA CAMUEL	292 KAPENGO	en 770 ; 934	12
65	Helena Chepwikur			Helleron
46	Moch Splannin	184 Kaperjuna	3/625360	Aprilto
47	Anthony Amnabiwa	193 Kape	24362311	Anthony-
48	Anthony Aminasiwa Charles Plino	21 ORTUM	27372584	E) CUILLE
		,		
				-,-
			. 0	
			-	
4 - 1				
		,		
				х с
0 1		-		
		5	,	
				n 2
				Į.
			,	
				,

Presented by a Dennis Ruto:

On behalf of Residents of West Pokot County

The state of the s

REPUBLIC OF KENYA

	M	A
		ACT STA
Co >	ON THE	- The state of the
· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
la composadad for approve	177	
becommended for approve	لتعندين الم	
for tabling.		-

PARLIAMENT OF KENYA

THE SENATE

TWELFTH PARLIAMENT

THIRD SESSION

THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

REPORT ON PETITION CONCERNING DETERIORATING HEALTHCARE SERVICES IN WEST POKOT COUNTY

PAPERS LAID

DATE 7/8/2019

TABLED BY Claurperan

COMMITTEE Hearth

CLERK AT THE TABLE CM

Clerk's Chambers,
First Floor,
Parliament Buildings,
NAIROBI.

July, 2019

REPUBLIC OF KENYA



PARLIAMENT OF KENYA

THE SENATE

TWELFTH PARLIAMENT

THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

THIRD SESSION

REPORT ON PETITION CONCERNING DETERIORATING HEALTHCARE
SERVICES IN WEST POKOT COUNTY

Clerk's Chambers, First Floor, Parliament Buildings, NAIROBI.

July, 2019

PREFACE

Mr. Speaker Sir,

On 29 March, 2018, a public petition by residents of West Pokot County was tabled before the Senate and committed to the Standing Committee on Health pursuant to Standing Order No. 226(1) of the Senate Standing Orders.

The petition was in relation to deteriorating healthcare services in West Pokot County owing to incessant theft of key health care instruments and equipment at Kapenguria Referral Hospital; neglect of duty by the County Executive Member in charge of Health who was also the Deputy Governor of West Pokot County; appointment of unqualified and incompetent persons to various positions; harassment and irregular treatment of health workers perceived to have been loyal to the former county regime; and, payment of full monthly salaries and other benefits to 77 county staff, among them health workers, who had been sent on compulsory leave.

In conducting its investigations, the Committee met with key parties in relation to the petition including: the Governor of West Pokot County, the Chief Officer of Health, members of the County Health Management Team, members of the Hospital Management Team of Kapenguria Referral Hospital and the petitioners.

The Committee findings and determinations arising from this process are contained in this report.

Mandate of the Standing Committee on Health

The Senate Standing Committee on Health is mandated, under the Second Schedule of the Senate Standing Orders, to, "to consider all matters relating to medical services, public health and sanitation."

Committee Membership

The Membership of the Committee is composed of the following:

1. Sen. (Dr.) Michael Malinga Mbito

Chairperson

2. Sen. (Dr.) Ali Abdullahi Ibrahim

Vice-Chairperson

3. Sen. Beth Mugo

4. Sen. Nderitu John Kinyua

5. Sen. Iman Falhada Dekow

6. Sen. Okong'o Omogeni

7. Sen. Naomi Shinyonga

8. Sen. Petronilla Were Lokorio

9. Sen. Fred Outa

Mr. Speaker Sir,

The Standing Committee on Health wishes to thank the Offices of the Speaker and the Clerk of the Senate for their support during the process of considering this petition.

Mr. Speaker Sir,

It is now my pleasant duty and privilege to present this report of the Standing Committee on Health, for consideration and approval by the House pursuant to Standing Order No. 226(2) of the Senate Standing Orders.

Signed. Date /6-67-2019
Signed Date
SEN. MBITO MICHAEL MALING'A, MP
CHAIRPERSON, STANDING COMMITTEE ON HEALTH

ADOPTION OF THE REPORT OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON HEALTH OF THE SENATE

We, the undersigned Members of the Standing Committee on Health of the Senate, do hereby append our signatures to adopt the Report-

1.	Sen. (Dr.) Michael Malinga Mbito	Chairperson	Blue
2.	Sen. (Dr.) Ali Abdullahi Ibrahim	Vice-Chairperson	ALKO S
3.	Sen. Beth Mugo	Member	Bush
4.	Sen. Nderitu John Kinyua	Member	OK-Train
5.	Sen. Iman Falhada Dekow	Member	fallala
б.	Sen. Okong'o Omogeni	Member	
7.	Sen. Naomi Shinyonga	Member	
3.	Sen. Petronilla Were Lokorio	Member	
).	Sen. Fred Outa	Member	

TABLE OF CONTENTS

EXECU	JTIVE SUMMARY	7
CHAPT	TER ONE: INTRODUCTION	12
1.	Background	12
2.	Summary of Allegations Raised in the Petition	12
3.	Prayers to the Senate	13
СНАРТ	ER TWO: LEGAL AND POLICY PROVISIONS RELATING TO THE PETIT	ION
		15
1.	Role and Mandate of Parliament	15
2.	Right to Petition Parliament	15
3.	Right to the Highest Attainable Standard of Health	15
4.	The County Government Act 2012	16
5.	Values and Principles of Public Service	17
6.	The Public Audit Act	17
7.	The Ethics and Anti-Corruption Act	18
8.	Anti-Corruption and Economic Crimes Act	19
9.	Commission in Administrative Justice Act	19
CHAPT	ER THREE: SUBMISSIONS ON THE PETITION	21
A.	Courtesy Call to the Office of the County Commissioner	21
B.	Joint Meeting with the West Pokot County Assembly Committee	on
Healt	th, the Petitioner, Representatives of the County Health Manageme	ent
Team	and Representatives of the Hospital Management Management Team	21
I.	Submissions by the Petitioners	22
II.	Submissions by the County Health Management Team	25
III.	Meeting with the County Governor	26
CHAPTER FOUR: COMMITTEE DETERMINATIONS		

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

On 29 March, 2018, a public petition by residents of West Pokot County was tabled before the Senate and committed to the Standing Committee on Health pursuant to Standing Order No. 226(1) of the Senate Standing Orders.

The petition was in relation to deteriorating healthcare services in West Pokot County owing to incessant theft of key health care instruments and equipment at Kapenguria Referral Hospital; neglect of duty by the County Executive Member in charge of Health who was also the Deputy Governor of West Pokot County; appointment of unqualified and incompetent persons to various positions; harassment and irrgeular treatment of health workers perceived to have been loyal to the former county regime; and, payment of full monthly salaries and other benefits to 77 county staff, among them health workers, who had been sent on compulsory leave.

In their prayers, the petitioners requested the Senate to:-

- 1. Order a forensic audit and physical county of instruments and equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital.
- 2. Commission a special team to investigate the loss of an UltraSound Machine and other equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital.
- 3. Recommend that the Deputy Governor relinquishes the position of CECM i/c of Health as a matter of public interest.
- 4. Establish the cumulative number of days the Deputy Governor has spent in the United States attending to his personal engagements at the expense of serving the people who gave him a mandate.
- 5. Establish whether public funds have been incurred to finance the Deputy
 Governors notorious piecemeal trips to USA and back and whether he
 sought clearance from relevant government authorities as required by
 state officers.

- 6. Recommend appropriate action be initiated against the Deputy Governor for abuse of office and other related violations that the Senate may deem fit and necessary;
- 7. Recommend that a Human Resource Audit be undertaken on employment of new health and other county staff by West Pokot County Government for the period starting 1st October to date;
- 8. Recommend whether it is viable for staff on compulsory leave to continue enjoying salaries and other benefits for work not done;
- 9. Recommend a comprehensive job analysis and job evaluation for West Pokot County, Ministry of Health;
- 10. Recommend appropriate action for any form of malpractice during the employment of health and other staff in West Pokot County, and/or
- 11. Make any other order/direction that it may deem fit in the circumstances of this matter.

In respect of the prayers made in the petition, the Committee made the following determinations:

1. **Prayer One:** Order a forensic audit and physical count of instruments and equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital.

Committee Response: By the petitioners own admission, the loss of an UltraSound machine from Kapenguria Referral Hospital was the key concern in relation to this prayer. The machine has since been recovered and is currently in use at the hospital. Following a visit to the Kapenguria Referral Hospital, the Committee in respect of this prayer is satisfied that the hospital management has put in place adequate measures to provide for the safe-keeping of all hospital equipment and instruments under its care.

2. **Prayer Two:** Commission a special team to investigate the loss of an UltraSound Machine and other equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer notes that the UltraSound machine was recovered and is in use at the hospital. The key suspect to the loss of the machine was apprehended. Court proceedings are ongoing.

3. **Prayer Three:** Recommend that the Deputy Governor relinquishes the position of CECM i/c of Health as a matter of public interest.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer notes that the Deputy Governor has since relinquished the position of CECM in charge of health.

4. **Prayer Four:** Establish the cumulative number of days the Deputy Governor has spent in the United States attending to his personal engagements at the expense of serving the people who gave him a mandate.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer hereby instructs the Office of the Auditor-General and the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Committee to establish the actual time spent by the Deputy Governor in the United States on official duty, and on his own personal engagements for the period between September, 2017 and March 2018

5. **Prayer Five:** Establish whether public funds have been incurred to finance the Deputy Governors notorious piecemeal trips to USA and back and whether he sought clearance from relevant government authorities as required by state officers.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer hereby instructs the Auditor-General to, in accordance with Section 37 of the Public Audit Act, establish whether any public resources were used to

finance any personal trips to the US undertaken by the Deputy Governor and if so, to recommend options for recovery of the said public resources.

6. **Prayer Six:** Recommend appropriate action be initiated against the Deputy Governor for abuse of office and other related violations that the Senate may deem fit and necessary.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer recommends that the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission investigate the Deputy Governor for abuse of office and other related violations in accordance with Section 11(1) of the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Act.

7. **Prayer Seven:** Recommend that a Human Resource Audit be undertaken on employment of new health and other county staff by West Pokot County Government for the period starting 1st October to date.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer instructs the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission and the Commission on Administrative Justice to investigate whether the County Public Service Board of West Pokot County is liable for abuse of office in its conduct of the process of recruitment and/or promotion of staff to various positions in the health sector; and, whether the suspended staff of West Pokot County have continued to enjoy full salaries and benefits for work not done. And further, to recommend appropriate action as may be required.

8. **Prayer Eight:** Recommend whether it is viable for staff on compulsory leave to continue enjoying salaries and other benefits for work not done.

Committee Response: As provided for under 'Prayer 7' above.

9. **Prayer Nine:** Recommend a comprehensive job analysis and job evaluation for West Pokot County, Ministry of Health.

Committee Response: As provided for under 'Prayer 7' above.

10. **Prayer Ten:** Recommend appropriate action for any form of malpractice during the employment of health and other staff in West Pokot County, and/or

Committee Response: As provided for under 'Prayer 7' above.

In light of the above, the Committee resolves that:

- 1. This report be dispatched to the Office of the Auditor-General for the purposes of establishing the actual time spent by the Deputy Governor in the United States on official duty vis a vis his own personal engagements for the period between September, 2017 and March 2018; and, establishing whether any public resources were used to finance any personal trips to the US undertaken by the Deputy Governor and if so, to recommend appropriate action within 3 months receipt of this report.
- 2. This report be dispatched to the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission and the Commission on Administrative Justice to investigate the alleged abuse of office and other violations in the management of West Pokot County health staff as contained in this report within a period of six months.

CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION

1. Background

On 29 March, 2018, a public petition by residents of West Pokot County was tabled before the Senate and committed to the Standing Committee on Health pursuant to Standing Order No. 226(1) of the Senate Standing Orders.

The petition was in relation to deteriorating healthcare services in West Pokot County owing to incessant theft of key health care instruments and equipment at Kapenguria Referral Hospital; neglect of duty by the County Executive Member in charge of Health who was also the Deputy Governor of West Pokot County; appointment of unqualified and incompetent persons to various positions; harassment and irrgeular treatment of health workers perceived to have been loyal to the former county regime; and, payment of full monthly salaries and other benefits to 77 county staff, among them health workers, who had been sent on compulsory leave.

2. Summary of Allegations Raised in the Petition

A summary of the allegations raised in the petition are outlined below: -

- (a) Theft of hospital equipment and instruments.
 - Incessant loss of hospital equipment and instrument, the latest an Ultra Sound Machine.
 - Frustration of investigative efforts by county government officials.
- (b) Appointment of the Deputy Governor as the CECM in-charge of Health.
 - Reducing health care standards in the county following the appointment of the Dep. Governor as CECM i/c of Health.
- (c) Irregular and non-competitive employment of health and other county workers.
 - Irregular, non-competitive and unprocedural employment of health and other county staff.

- Employment of unqualified and incompetent county staff based on political affiliation.
- (d) Harrasment, irregular, punitive, malicious transfer and demotion of health staff.
 - Harrassment, irregular, punitive, malicious transfer and demotion of staff perceived to be loyal to the former County regime.
 - Poor health service delivery leading to avoidable deaths, negligence and loss of public resources.
 - Intimidation and violence by a youth group known as New Red Army (NRA).
 - Payment of full monthly salaries and other benefits of staff on 77 county staff on compulsory leave.

3. Prayers to the Senate

The petitioners therefore prayed that the Senate -

- 1. Orders a forensic audit and physical county of instruments and equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital.
- 2. Commissions a special team to investigate the loss of an Ultra Sound Machine and other equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital.
- 3. Recommends that the Deputy Governor relinquishes the position of CECM i/c of Health as a matter of public interest.
- 4. Establish the cumulative number of days the Deputy Governor has spent in the United States attending to his personal engagements at the expense of serving the people who gave him a mandate.
- 5. Establish whether public funds have been incurred to finance the Deputy Governors notorious piecemeal trips to USA and back and whether he sought clearance from relevant government authorities as required by state officers.

- Recommends appropriate action be initiated against the Deputy Governor for abuse of office and other related violations that the Senate may deem fit and necessary;
- 7. Recommends that a Human Resource Audit be undertaken on employment of new health and other county staff by West Pokot County Government for the period starting 1st October to date;
- 8. Recommends whether it is viable for staff on compulsory leave to continue enjoying salaries and other benefits for work not done;
- 9. Recommends a comprehensive job analysis and job evaluation for West Pokot County, Ministry of Health;
- 10. Recommend appropriate action for any form of malpractice during the employment of health and other staff in West Pokot County, and/or
- 11. Makes any other order/direction that it may deem fit in the circumstances of this matter.

CHAPTER TWO: LEGAL AND POLICY PROVISIONS RELATING TO THE PETITION

1. Role and Mandate of Parliament

Articles 94 as read together with Article 96 of the Constitution provides for the role of Parliament in general, and the Senate in particular. Generally, the Houses of Parliament exercise the legislative mandate of the people, deliberate on matters of national interest and oversight the exercise of power by other arms of government.

2. Right to Petition Parliament

The right to petition Parliament is provided for under Article 119 of the Constitution, which provides as follows:-

"Every person has a right to petition Parliament to consider any matter within its authority, including enacting, amending or repealing any legislation. Parliament shall make provision for the procedure for the exercise of this right."

Further, Standing Order 226 the Senate Standing Order outlines the procedure for the committal of a petition to a Committee and transmission of its decision to the Petitioner. The Standing Committee on Health is mandated to consider all matters related to medical services, public health and sanitation. Further, the Petition to Parliament (Procedure) Act, 2012 and the Standing Orders of the Senate provide for the procedure to be followed in the submission, processing and consideration of a Petition.

3. Right to the Highest Attainable Standard of Health

Article 43 (1)(a) of the Constitution guarantees every person the right to 'the highest attainable standard of health, which includes the right to health care services, including reproductive health care'.

4. The County Government Act 2012

Section 32 (3) of the County Government Act states that a "governor may assign the deputy governor any other responsibility or portfolio as a member of the county executive committee."

Section 40(1) provides for the removal of a member of a county executive committee from office on the basis of: (a) incompetence; (b) abuse of office; (c) gross misconduct; (d) failure, without reasonable excuse, or written authority of the governor, to attend three consecutive meetings of the county executive committee; \in physical or mental incapacity rendering the executive committee member incapable of performing the duties of that office; or, (f) gross violation of the Constitution or any other law.

Section 40, sub-sections (2-6) provide for the dismissal of a member of a county executive committee as follows:

- 1. A member of the county assembly, supported by at least one-third of all the members of the county assembly, may propose a motion requiring the governor to dismiss a county executive committee member on any of the grounds set out in subsection (1).
- 2. If a motion under subsection (2) is supported by at least one-third of the members of the county assembly—
 - a) the county assembly shall appoint a select committee comprising five of its members to investigate the matter; and
 - b) the select committee shall report, within ten days, to the county assembly whether it finds the allegations against the county executive committee member to be substantiated.

- 3. The county executive committee member has the right to appear and be represented before the select committee during its investigations.
- 4. If the select committee reports that it finds the allegations
 - c) unsubstantiated, no further proceedings shall be taken; or
 - d) substantiated, the county assembly shall vote whether to approve the resolution requiring the county executive committee member to be dismissed.
- 5. If a resolution under subsection (5)(b) is supported by a majority of the members of the county assembly—
 - (a) the speaker of the county assembly shall promptly deliver the resolution to the governor; and
 - (b) the governor shall dismiss the county executive committee member.

That notwithstanding, Section 31 of the CGA 2012 states that a governor "(a) may, despite section 40, dismiss a county executive committee member at any time, if the governor considers that it is appropriate or necessary to do so". Further, a governor is obligated to "dismiss a county executive committee member, if required to do so by a resolution of the county assembly as provided under section 40" of the CGA 2012.

5. Values and Principles of Public Service

That Article 232 Constitution states that the values and principles of public service apply to both levels of government and include-

- (a) responsive, prompt, effective, impartial and equitable provision of services;...
- (b) accountability for administrative acts;...
- (c) subject to paragraphs (h) and (i), fair competition and merit as the basis of appointments and promotions;.

6. The Public Audit Act

Section 37 of the Public Audit Act provides that the Auditor-General may, upon request by Parliament, conduct forensic audits to establish fraud, corruption or other financial improprieties. Further, Section 38 of the Act provides that the Auditor-General may examine the public procurement and asset disposal process of a state organ or a public entity with a view to confirm as to whether procurements were done lawfully and in an effective way. Finally, Section 39 (1) of the Act states that all reports of an audit shall be submitted to Parliament or the relevant county assembly.

7. The Ethics and Anti-Corruption Act

The Ethics and Anti-Corruption Act bestows the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission with the following powers:-

Section 11 (1) of the Act empowers the Commission to-

- a) receive complaints on the breach of the code of ethics by public officers;
- b) investigate and recommend to the Director of Public Prosecutions the prosecution of any acts of corruption, bribery or economic crimes or violation of codes of ethics or other matter prescribed under this Act, the Anti-Corruption and Economic Crimes Act or any other law enacted pursuant to Chapter Six of the Constitution;...
- c) recommend appropriate action to be taken against State officers or public officers alleged to have engaged in unethical conduct;...

Section 13 (2) of the Act also empowers the Commission to conduct investigations on its own initiative or on a complaint made by any person.

8. Anti-Corruption and Economic Crimes Act

Section 45 (2) of the Anti-Corruption and Economic Crimes Act states that a person whose functions concern the administration, custody, management, receipt or use of any part of the public revenue or public property is guilty of an offence if the person-

- (a) fraudulently makes payment or excessive payment from public revenues for— ... (iii) services not rendered or not adequately rendered,
- (b) wilfully or carelessly fails to comply with any law or applicable procedures and guidelines relating to the management of funds or incurring of expenditures;

Further, Section 46 of the Anti-Corruption and Economic Crimes Act states that "A person who uses his office to improperly confer a benefit on himself or anyone else is guilty of an offence."

9. Commission in Administrative Justice Act

Section 8 of the Commission in Administrative Justice Act empowers the Commission to-

- (a) investigate any conduct in state affairs, or any act or omission in public administration by any State organ, State or public officer in National and County Governments that is alleged or suspected to be prejudicial or improper or is likely to result in any impropriety or prejudice;
- (b) investigate complaints of abuse of power, unfair treatment, manifest injustice or unlawful, oppressive, unfair or unresponsive official conduct within the public sector;...

CHAPTER THREE: SUBMISSIONS ON THE PETITION

The Committee visited West Pokot County on 22 October, 2019, where it held meetings with the following parties relevant to the petition-

- a) Representatives of the West Pokot County Executive led by the County Governor
- b) Representatives of the West Pokot County Assembly Committee on health
- c) The County Health Management Team
- d) The Health Management Team of Kapenguria Referral Hospital
- e) The Petitioners.

The Standing Committee on Health was represented by-

- 1. Sen. Mbito Michael Malinga Chairperson
- 2. Scn. Nderitu John Kinyua
- 3. Sen. Petronilla Were
- 4. Sen. Falhada Dekow

A. Courtesy Call to the Office of the County Commissioner

The Committee made a courtesy call to the Office of the County Commissioner where they were well received and briefly appraised of the situation in West Pokot.

B. Joint Meeting with the West Pokot County Assembly Committee on Health, the Petitioner, Representatives of the County Health Management Team and Representatives of the Hospital Management Management Team

I. Submissions by the Petitioners

Mr. Dennis, who spoke on behalf of the petitioners, begun his submissions by introducing the petitioners present.

He confirmed to the meeting that the key issues in relation to the petition were as follows:

- 1. Theft of hospital equipment, instruments and medicines at Kapenguria Referral Hospital.
- 2. Appointment of the Deputy Governor as the CECM in-charge of Health.
- 3. Irregular and non-competitive employment of health and other county workers.
- 4. Harassment, irregular, punitive, malicious transfer and demotion of health staff.

i) Theft of hospital equipment at Kapenguria Referral Hospital

On the matter of theft of hospital equipment at the Kapenguria Referral Hospital, he stated that loss of an ultrasound machine from the hospital had caused the greatest public concern. He alleged that the County leadership's response to the loss of the machine had been to resort to the use of sorcery, witchcraft and traditional means to catch the thieves.

He further alleged that the county health management team had attempted to hoodwink the public into believing that the ultrasound machine and other health equipment had been sourced through the goodwill of the Deputy Governor. Contrary to this, he asserted that the equipment in question had been received from donors in 2015.

Subsequently, following the submission of the petition to the Senate, the county health management announced that the lost ultrasound machine had

been found in a location known as Sakas. Within two days of the announcement, a member of the county health management announced on a public platform that the machine was now in use at the hospital.

No investigations were conducted, nor were any culprits ever apprehended suggesting that the governance, administrative and security mechanisms in place at the hospital were inadequate. He therefore he demanded for an updated inventory of all the hospital equipment.

He also alleged that there had been cases of essential medicines being stolen from county health facilities and ending up in private clinics and in South Sudan.

ii) Appointment of the Deputy Governor as the CECM in-charge of Health

Deputy Governor who was also serving as the CEC of Health was absent from duty. Following the election, he had been to the county only twice, and even them never for more than two to three days at a time. He further alleged that he practices as an Emergency Physician in the US.

He challenged statements by the Governor that the Deputy Governor was in the US on official duty and that he was collecting containers of equipment and medicines worth Kshs.200M. He further alleged that the Governor had attempted to hoodwink the public by alleging that donations received from an NGO known as 'Saving the Mothers' had been sent by the Deputy Governor. Assuming that the Deputy Governor was in the US on official duty, he demanded for the following information:

- 1. Where the equipment was being stored/warehoused and at whose cost.
- 2. Whether the Deputy Governor was receiving any public funds for his activities in the US.

iii) Irregular and non-competitive employment of health and other county workers & Harassment, irregular, punitive, malicious transfer and demotion of health staff.

He alleged that the County Public Service Board of West Pokot had collapsed and was working at the direction and pleasure of the County Governor.

Shortly after the election, the board had issued a special press release (*Annex 1*) indicating that 77 county staff had been sent on special leave. Of the 77 county staff who included former ward and sub-county administrators, the following hospital officials were also sent on leave-

- 1. Mr. John Bitange Hospital Administrator
- 2. Mr. Musa Kavesya Hospital Accountant
- 3. Mr. Jackson Chief Accountant

Since alleged that the three officers had continued to draw full salaries and benefits despite being sent on compulsory leave.

He further alleged that the board had hired the new hospital administrator without following due process. He further alleged that the County Health Administrative Officer did not meet the minimum qualifications necessary for the position.

He further alleged that there had been harassment, demotions and malicious transfer of officers seen to be loyal to the previous county regime. Following the elections, all heads of the health department were transfereed. For example, the former County Public Health Oficer had been maliciously demoted to the ward level to serve under a staff who was on six month contract. He submitted a list of all the officers in the health department who had been maliciously transferred (Annex 2).

He further alleged that there had been intimidation and violence by a youth group known as New Red Army (NRA). 247 members of the NRA were employed to the health sector as casual workers in recognition of the role that they had played during the campaign season.

II. Submissions by the County Health Management Team

The Chief Officer of Health responded to the allegations raised in the petition as follows-

- The allegations was malicious, false and aimed at political gain.
- The County Health Budget was KSHs. 2.5B. However, the health department was operating within a budget ceiling of KShs. 1.37B. This had affected the department's programs and activities.
- To address the issue of theft of hospital equipment, the county had improved the terms of existing security personnel. In addition, elders from the county intervened through traditional means to ensure that the equipment was returned. The culprit had been apprehended and a court process initiated. A copy of court and police documents were submitted to support this (Annex 3). Further, the county has put measures in place to install a CCTV camera in the hospital to reduce incidences of theft.
- The Deputy Governor had successfully sourced for equipment and supplies for the US. The consignments were in Mombasa but were stuck at the port pending clearance of freight charges, and statutory charges to KRA, KEBS etc. The County Health Department had budgeted appropriately to cover for these costs.
- Recruitment of staff had followed due process. Staff from the previous regime had been employed on contract basis. They however demanded to be employed on a permanent and pensionable basis at a cost implication to the county of KShs.
 287M.

- On the question of transfers, the CHMT was informed by the needs
 of the Sub-County Health Management Teams. As such, transfers
 had been informed by actual need and had followed due process.
- On the question of deteriorating health services, the following performance indicators of Kapenguria Referral Hospital were provided for the first half the year-
 - Total: 69,000+ patients
 - 2300 deliveries of which 404 were through c-section
 - 9 maternal deaths which had been fully audited and accounted for.
 - Had successfully conducted one head surgery.
 - Have also served various patients with cleft lip and cleft palate through a peterneship with KNH.

The meeting concluded with an appeal from the Chair of the Senate Health Committee for dialogue and consensus-building in the county.

III. Meeting with the County Governor

The Committee met with the County Governor at his offices. He outlined the county's achievements in the health sector. Further, he defended his decision to appoint and retain the Deputy Governor as his CECM i/c Health. Noting that he was highly qualified, the Governor credited the Deputy Governor with establishing useful networks and connections that had enabled the county to source medical equipment and supplies noting that the county budget would have been too small otherwise to support the county's needs. Further, he assured the Committee that consignments containing various medical equipment and supplies were stuck at the port pending clearance of freight charges, and statutory charges to KRA, KEBS etc. The County Health

Department had budgeted appropriately to cover for these costs and the equipment would be supplied to the county

CHAPTER FOUR: COMMITTEE DETERMINATIONS

In respect of the prayers made in the petition, the Committee made the following determinations:

1. **Prayer One:** Order a forensic audit and physical count of instruments and equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital.

Committee Response: By the petitioners own admission, the loss of an UltraSound machine from Kapenguria Referral Hospital was the key concern in relation to this prayer. The machine has since been recovered and is currently in use at the hospital. Following a visit to the Kapenguria Referral Hospital, the Committee in respect of this prayer is satisfied that the hospital management has put in place adequate measures to provide for the safe-keeping of all hospital equipment and instruments under its care.

2. **Prayer Two:** Commission a special team to investigate the loss of an UltraSound Machine and other equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer notes that the UltraSound machine was recovered and is in use at the hospital. The key suspect to the loss of the machine was apprehended. Court proceedings are ongoing.

^{3.} **Prayer Three:** Recommend that the Deputy Governor relinquishes the position of CECM i/c of Health as a matter of public interest.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer notes that the Deputy Governor has since relinquished the position of CECM in charge of health.

4. **Prayr Four:** Establish the cumulative number of days the Deputy Governor has spent in the United States attending to his personal engagements at the expense of serving the people who gave him a mandate.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer hereby instructs the Office of the Auditor-General and the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Committee to establish the actual time spent by the Deputy Governor in the United States on official duty, and on his own personal engagements for the period between September, 2017 and March 2018

5. **Prayer Five:** Establish whether public funds have been incurred to finance the Deputy Governors notorious piecemeal trips to USA and back and whether he sought clearance from relevant government authorities as required by state officers.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer hereby instructs the Auditor-General to, in accordance with Section 37 of the Public Audit Act, establish whether any public resources were used to finance any personal trips to the US undertaken by the Deputy Governor and if so, to recommend options for recovery of the said public resources.

6. **Prayer Six:** Recommend appropriate action be initiated against the Deputy Governor for abuse of office and other related violations that the Senate may deem fit and necessary.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer recommends that the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission

investigate the Deputy Governor for abuse of office and other related violations in accordance with Section 11(1) of the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Act.

7. **Prayer Seven:** Recommend that a Human Resource Audit be undertaken on employment of new health and other county staff by West Pokot County Government for the period starting 1st October to date.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer instructs the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission and the Commission on Administrative Justice to investigate whether the County Public Service Board of West Pokot County is liable for abuse of office in its conduct of the process of recruitment and/or promotion of staff to various positions in the health sector; and, whether the suspended staff of West Pokot County have continued to enjoy full salaries and benefits for work not done. And further, to recommend appropriate action as may be required.

- 8. **Prayer Eight:** Recommend whether it is viable for staff on compulsory leave to continue enjoying salaries and other benefits for work not done. **Committee Response:** As provided for under 'Prayer 7' above.
- Prayer Nine: Recommend a comprehensive job analysis and job evaluation for West Pokot County, Ministry of Health.
 Committee Response: As provided for under 'Prayer 7' above.
- 10. **Prayer Ten:** Recommend appropriate action for any form of malpractice during the employment of health and other staff in West Pokot County, and/or

Committee Response: As provided for under 'Prayer 7' above.

In light of the above, the Committee resolves that:

- 1. This report be dispatched to the Office of the Auditor-General for the purposes of establishing the actual time spent by the Deputy Governor in the United States on official duty vis a vis his own personal engagements for the period between September, 2017 and March 2018; and, establishing whether any public resources were used to finance any personal trips to the US undertaken by the Deputy Governor and if so, to recommend appropriate action within 3 months receipt of this report.
- 2. This report be dispatched to the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission and the Commission on Administrative Justice to investigate the alleged abuse of office and other violations in the management of West Pokot County health staff as contained in this report within a period of six months.

ANNEXES

1. Minutes

MINUTES OF THE SIXTEENTH SITTING OF THE STANDING COMMITTEE ON HEALTH HELD ON TUESDAY, 16TH JULY, 2019, GROUND FLOOR COMMITTEE ROOM, RED CROSS BUILDING AT 11.30 A.M.

PRESENT

1. Sen. Mbito Michael Malinga, MP - Chairperson

2. Sen. (Dr) Ali Abdullahi Ibrahim, MP - Vice Chairperson

3. Sen. Nderitu John Kinyua, MP

4. Sen. Iman Falhada Dekow, MP

5. Sen. Petronilla Were Lokorio, MP

6. Sen. Okong'o Mogeni, MP

7. Sen. Beth Mugo, EGH, MP

ABSENT WITH APOLOGY

1. Sen. Fred Outa, MP

2. Sen. Masitsa Naomi Shiyonga, MP

IN ATTENDANCE

SENATE

1. Mr. Stephen Gikonyo - Senior Clerk Assistant

2. Ms. Christine Sagini - Research Officer

3. Ms. Lucy Nyasuna - Serjeant-At-Arms

MIN. NO.076/2019

PRAYER

The Sitting of the Committee commenced at 11.45 a.m. followed by a word of prayer by the Chairperson.

MIN. NO.077/2019

ADOPTION OF THE AGENDA

The agenda of the meeting was approved after being proposed Sen. Ali and seconded by Sen. Falhada as follows-

- 1. Preliminaries
 - Prayers
 - Approval of the Agenda
- 2. Confirmation of Previous Meeting Minutes
- 3. Consideration and Adoption of Draft Reports on-
 - (i) Laikipia Doctor's Strike Report,
 - (ii) Pokot Report on deteriorating Health Care Petition
 - (iii) Kitui, Machakos and Kajiado Committee Visit
- 4. Any Other Business
- 5. Adjournment

MIN. NO.078/2019 CONFIRMATION OF PREVIOUS MEETING MINUTES

The Minutes of the meeting of 13th Sitting held on Tuesday, 9th July, 2019 were confirmed as true copy of the meeting proceedings were proposed by Sen. Kinyua and seconded by Sen. Falhada and thereon signed by the Chairperson.

The Minutes of the meeting of 14th Sitting held Wednesday, 10th July, 2019 were confirmed as true copy of the meeting proceedings were proposed by Sen. Falhada and seconded by Sen. Kinyua and thereon signed by the Chairperson.

The Minutes of the meeting of 15th Sitting held on Thursday, 11th July, 2019 were confirmed as true copy of the meeting proceedings were proposed by Sen. Ali and seconded by Sen. Falhada and thereon signed by the Chairperson.

MIN. NO.079/2019 CONSIDERATION AND ADOPTION OF DRAFT REPORTS

- 3	Pokot		-						
(i)	Report	on	Petition	Concerning	Deteriorating	Healthcare	Services	in	West

The draft report of the secretariat was presented to the Committee for adoption and approval in summary form as follows-

That on 29 March, 2018, a public petition by residents of West Pokot County was tabled before the Senate and committed to the Standing Committee on Health pursuant to Standing Order No. 226(1) of the Senate Standing Orders. The petition was in relation to deteriorating healthcare services in West Pokot County owing to incessant theft of key health care instruments and equipment at Kapenguria Referral Hospital; neglect of duty by the County Executive Member in charge of Health who was also the Deputy Governor of West Pokot County; appointment of unqualified and incompetent persons to various positions; harassment and irregular treatment of health workers perceived to have been loyal to the former county regime; and, payment of full monthly salaries and other benefits to 77 county staff, among them health workers, who had been sent on compulsory leave.

In their prayers, the petitioners requested the Senate to order a forensic audit and physical county of instruments and equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital, commission a special team to investigate the loss of an Ultrasound Machine and other equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital, recommend that the Deputy Governor relinquishes the position of CECM i/c of Health as a matter of public interest, establish the cumulative number of days the Deputy Governor has spent in the United States attending to his personal engagements at the expense of serving the people who gave him a mandate, establish whether public funds have been incurred to finance the Deputy Governors notorious piecemeal trips to USA and back and whether he sought clearance from relevant government authorities as required by state officers, recommend appropriate action be initiated against the Deputy Governor for abuse of office and other related violations that the Senate may deem fit and necessary, recommend that a Human Resource Audit be undertaken on employment of new health and other county staff by West Pokot County Government for the period starting 1st October to date, recommend whether it is viable for staff on compulsory leave to continue enjoying salaries and other benefits for work not done; recommend a comprehensive job-analysis and jobevaluation for West Pokot County, Ministry of Health, recommend appropriate

action for any form of malpractice during the employment of health and other staff in West Pokot County, and/or make any other order/direction that it may deem fit in the circumstances of this matter.

In respect of the prayers made in the petition, the Committee was informed could make the following determinations:

1. Prayer One: Order a forensic audit and physical count of instruments and equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital.

Committee Response: By the petitioners own admission, the loss of an Ultrasound machine from Kapenguria Referral Hospital was the key concern in relation to this prayer. The machine has since been recovered and is currently in use at the hospital. Following a visit to the Kapenguria Referral Hospital, the Committee in respect of this prayer is satisfied that the hospital management has put in place adequate measures to provide for the safe-keeping of all hospital equipment and instruments under its care.

2. Prayer Two: Commission a special team to investigate the loss of an Ultrasound Machine and other equipment in Kapenguria County Referral Hospital.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer notes that the Ultrasound machine was recovered and is in use at the hospital. The key suspect to the loss of the machine was apprehended. Court proceedings are ongoing.

3. Prayer Three: Recommend that the Deputy Governor relinquishes the position _____ of CECM-i/e-of_Health as a matter_of_public interest.______

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer notes that the Deputy Governor has since relinquished the position of CECM in charge of health.

4. Prayer Four: Establish the cumulative number of days the Deputy Governor has spent in the United States attending to his personal engagements at the expense of serving the people who gave him a mandate.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer hereby instructs the Office of the Auditor-General and the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Committee to establish the actual time spent by the Deputy Governor in the United States on official duty, and on his own personal engagements for the period between September, 2017 and March 2018

5. Prayer Five: Establish whether public funds have been incurred to finance the Deputy Governors notorious piecemeal trips to USA and back and whether he sought clearance from relevant government authorities as required by state officers.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer hereby instructs the Auditor-General to, in accordance with Section 37 of the Public Audit Act, establish whether any public resources were used to finance any personal trips to the US undertaken by the Deputy Governor and if so, to recommend options for recovery of the said public resources.

6. Prayer Six: Recommend appropriate action be initiated against the Deputy Governor for abuse of office and other related violations that the Senate may deem fit and necessary.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer recommends that the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission investigate the Deputy Governor for abuse of office and other related violations in accordance with Section 11(1) of the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Act.

7. Prayer Seven: Recommend that a Human Resource Audit be undertaken on employment of new health and other county staff by West Pokot County Government for the period starting 1st October to date.

Committee Response: The Committee in respect of this prayer instructs the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission and the Commission on Administrative Justice to investigate whether the County Public Service Board of West Pokot County is liable for abuse of office in its conduct of the process of recruitment and/or promotion of staff to various positions in the health sector; and, whether the suspended staff of West Pokot County have continued to enjoy full salaries and benefits for work not done. And further, to recommend appropriate action as may be required.

- 8. *Prayer Eight:* Recommend whether it is viable for staff on compulsory leave to continue enjoying salaries and other benefits for work not done.

 Committee Response: As provided for under 'Prayer 7' above.
- Prayer Nine: Recommend a comprehensive job analysis and job evaluation for West Pokot County, Ministry of Health.

Committee Response: As provided for under 'Prayer 7' above.

10. Prayer Ten: Recommend appropriate action for any form of malpractice during the employment of health and other staff in West Pokot County, and/or

Committee Response: As provided for under 'Prayer 7' above.

In light of the above, the Committee resolved that:

1. This report be dispatched to the Office of the Auditor-General for the purposes of establishing the actual time spent by the Deputy Governor in the United States on official duty vis a vis his own personal engagements for the period

public resources were used to finance any personal trips to the US undertaken by the Deputy Governor and if so, to recommend appropriate action within 3 months receipt of this report.

2. This report be dispatched to the Ethics and Anti-Corruption Commission and the Commission on Administrative Justice to investigate the alleged abuse of office and other violations in the management of West Pokot County health staff as contained in this report within a period of six months.

Thereon during deliberation the committee approved the report as presented to be tabled in the Senate.

(ii) Report on the Fact-Finding Tour to Kitui, Machakos and Kajiado Counties Health Facilities.

The report was presented as follows-

That the Committee conducted a fact-finding tour of Kitui, Machakos and Kajiado Counties between 27th and 30th April, 2019.

After presentation of the Report the Members were concerned whether the Cuban Doctors were still in place in the hospitals visited and requested a paragraph be inserted on the Cuban doctors.

Further the report recommendation on the KEMSA provision of drugs on the UHC project be redrafted with concrete recommendations. Recommendation on referrals of patients from hospitals from another county with county's Health care cards or under UHC to a hospital in another county should have paragraph of its own.

Thereon the committee approved the report to be tabled in the Scnate.

- 1) The Committee was presented with the printed estimates of the Committee budgets for the FY 2019/2020 as approved by the Liaison Committee as follows
 - a. Domestic Travel budgetary allocation will be Kshs. 17,735,294.12
 - b. Foreign Travel budgetary allocation will be Kshs. 19, 164, 705.88
 - c. Hospitality budget allocation will be Kshs.794,117.65
- 2) The Committee was informed that Biodiversity and Biosafety Association of Kenya had written to request the Committee for a meeting to brief it on issues related to food security, harmful pesticides and the current GMO ban. The Committee resolved to meet Biba during the next meeting.

MIN. NO.081/2019 ADJOURNMENT

There being no other business the Sitting was adjourned at 1.55 p.m.

SIGNED:	Bul
	(CHAIRPERSON)
DATE:	/8/20-19

.